Review

Oxalate production by fungi: significance in geomycology, biodeterioration and bioremediation

Geoffrey Michael GADD\textsuperscript{a,b,}* , Jaleh BAHRI-ESFAHANI\textsuperscript{a,c}, Qianwei LI\textsuperscript{a}, Young Joon RHEE\textsuperscript{a}, Zhan WEI\textsuperscript{a}, Marina FOMINA\textsuperscript{a,d}, Xinjin LIANG\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a}Geomicrobiology Group, College of Life Sciences, University of Dundee, Dundee DD1 5EH, Scotland, UK
\textsuperscript{b}Laboratory of Environmental Pollution and Bioremediation, Xinjiang Institute of Ecology and Geography, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Urumqi 830011, People’s Republic of China
\textsuperscript{c}The James Hutton Institute, Invergowrie, Dundee DD2 5DA, Scotland, UK
\textsuperscript{d}Institute of Microbiology and Virology, National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, Zabolotnogo St. 154, Kiev 03680, Ukraine

\textbf{A R T I C L E   I N F O}

Article history:
Received 27 May 2014
Accepted 28 May 2014

Keywords:
Biodeterioration
Bioremediation
Fungi
Geomicrobiology
Geomycology
Oxalate

\textbf{A B S T R A C T}

Oxalate is a key metabolite that plays a significant role in many metal and mineral transformations mediated by fungi. Metal and mineral transformations are central to geomycological processes including nutrient and element cycling, rock, mineral and metal transformations, bioweathering and mycogenic biomineral formation. Some fungal transformations have potential applications in environmental biotechnology, e.g. metal and radionuclide leaching, biorecovery, detoxification and bioremediation, and in the production or deposition of biominerals or metallic elements with catalytic or other properties. Metal and mineral transformations may also result in adverse effects when these processes result in biodeterioration of natural and synthetic materials, rock and mineral-based building materials (e.g. concrete), biocorrosion of metals, alloys and related substances, and adverse effects on radionuclide speciation, mobility and containment. Oxalate is ubiquitous in all these contexts. This paper seeks to draw together salient information from environmental and applied research to emphasize the importance of oxalate in geomycology, biodeterioration, environmental biotechnology and bioremediation.

© 2014 The British Mycological Society. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

\section{1. Introduction}

In the biosphere, oxalic acid, \((\text{COOH})_2\), or more commonly its oxalate salts, are found in plants, animals and microbes, as well as in soils and rocks, and in rock and mineral-based cultural artefacts, building materials and structures (e.g. Graustein et al., 1977; Wilson and Jones, 1983; Pinna, 1993; Arnott, 1982, 1995; Dutton and Evans, 1996; Gadd, 1999; Nakata, 2003; Arvaniti et al., 2010; Perez-Rodriguez et al., 2011; Aragno and Verrecchia, 2012). It is a substance that has
long fascinated scientists in many disciplines. Oxalic acid is the simplest organic di-acid and oxalate is the most oxidized carbon compound after carbon dioxide. Calcium oxalate crystals were among the first objects to be observed using light microscopy (van Leeuwenhoek, 1675) while detection of oxalate may be used as a biosignature for pre-existence of life in extreme environments, cultural heritage and astrobiology (Gorbushina et al., 2002; Frost, 2004; Kolo and Claeyts, 2005). Oxalic acid is produced by a wide variety of fungi, including saprotrophic, symbiotic and pathogenic species (Wilson et al., 1980; Arnott, 1982; Wilson and Jones, 1984; Whitney and Arnott, 1987, 1988; Birkby and Preece, 1988; Lapeyrie, 1988; Lapeyrie et al., 1987, 1990; Jones et al., 1992; Horner et al., 1995; Dutton and Evans, 1996; Arvieu et al., 2003; Gadd, 2007; Purvis et al., 2008). Although often regarded as a waste metabolite, it has many functional roles and effects that range from metal detoxification, increasing plant susceptibility to fungal infection, acting as an electron donor in lignocellulose degradation and the reduction of certain metals, e.g. Mn(IV), as well as many other roles in geomycology including bioweathering and cycling of metals, P, S, and other elements, mineral dissolution and mineral formation (e.g. Dutton and Evans, 1996; Gharieb et al., 1998; Gadd, 1999, 2006, 2007, 2011; Landeweert et al., 2001; Purvis et al., 2008; Rosling et al., 2009; Gadd and Raven, 2011). Oxalate production is also involved in biodeterioration of rock and mineral substrates, lignocellulosic materials, and the alteration and decay of cultural heritage (Pinzari et al., 2010, 2013). This review outlines oxalate production by fungi, surveying its roles in the context of geomycology, the scientific study of the role of fungi in processes of fundamental importance to geology (Sterflinger, 2000; Gadd, 2006, 2007, 2008, 2011), and the applied significance of oxalate in biodeterioration, bioremediation and environmental biotechnology. The significance of oxalate in lignocellulose degradation and plant pathogenesis will not be covered in detail.

2. Metal chemistry of oxalate

Oxalic acid is a relatively strong acid and of central significance to its chemical properties is the ability of the oxalate anion to complex metals, resulting in formation of metal-oxalate complexes and/or precipitation of insoluble metal oxalates depending on the metal and chemical conditions (Arnott, 1995; Gadd, 1999). Most simple oxalates are sparingly soluble in water except alkali metals [e.g. Li, Na, K], NH₄⁺ and Fe(II). Divalent metal oxalates are also insoluble, the most soluble being magnesium oxalate and the least soluble being calcium and lead oxalate. Most metals of interest to biological and other scientists form simple and complex oxalates including those of Mg, Ca, Sr, Ba, Cr, Mn, Co, Ni, Cu, Zn, Ga, Ag, Cd, Sn, Hg, Pb as well as actinides and lanthanides (Figs 1–3). Many oxalates are crystalline or amorphous solids, and solubility products for simple metal oxalates generally lie between 10⁻¹ and 10⁻¹⁵. It is thought only simple metal oxalates can occur in living organisms as excess oxalate is toxic. Precipitation may follow the simple equation:

Mn⁺ⁿ⁺ + n/2C₂O₄²⁻ + xH₂O → M(C₂O₄)ₙ₋₂ · xH₂O

Thus, oxalate production can result in metal mobilization from solid substrates, e.g. rocks and minerals, by acidolysis (proton-mediated dissolution) and complex formation (ligand-promoted dissolution) or metal immobilization by the formation of insoluble oxalate minerals. These properties are central to all the contexts discussed in this article.

Calcium oxalate is the most abundantly found oxalate, and in living organisms and the environment, main forms are the monohydrate (whewellite) and the dihydrate (weddellite). The monohydrate generally exhibits monoclinic crystals (a rectangular prism with a parallelogram as its base) and the dihydrate tetragonal crystals (rectangular prism with a square base), although a wide variety of other crystalline forms can occur including needles, biconcave disks, dumbbells, and druses (carnation flower shape) (Arnott, 1995). A classic crystal shape of the dihydrate is the eight-face bi-pyramid, often seen in solid fungal growth media (Figs 1 and 4). The monohydrate is the least soluble form but calcium oxalate solubility is increased at pH values < 5. Calcium oxalate precipitation can be represented by the simple equation:

Ca²⁺ + C₂O₄²⁻ + xH₂O → Ca(C₂O₄)₂ · xH₂O

The initial precipitation is the trihydrate which loses water of crystallization to form the monohydrate or dihydrate, depending on environmental conditions. Calcium oxalate is ubiquitously associated with fungi (Cromack et al., 1979; Jones et al., 1992; Arnott, 1995; Dutton and Evans, 1996; Gadd, 1999; Tait et al., 1999; Jarosz-Wilkolazka and Gadd, 2003; Arvieu et al., 2003; Jarosz-Wilkolazka and Graz, 2006; Burford et al., 2006; Pinzari et al., 2010; Guggiari et al., 2011) (Figs 1 and 4), but other metal oxalate complexes and crystals can also be produced, including those of Ca, Cd, Cu, Mn, Mg, Ni, Sr, Pb and Zn, according to similar chemical principles (Murphy and Levy, 1983; Sutter et al., 1983; Sayer et al., 1995; Sayer and Gadd, 1997; Magyarosy et al., 2002; Adeyemi and Gadd, 2005; Gadd et al., 2005; Fomina et al., 2005a, 2007a; Gadd, 2011; Wei et al., 2012, 2013) (Figs 2, 3, 5 and 6). It is often stated that metal oxalate formation may confer protection from the potentially toxic effects of such metals (Murphy and Levy, 1983; Sutter et al., 1983; Purvis and Halls, 1996; Clausen et al., 2000; Jarosz-Wilkolazka and Gadd, 2003; Meharga, 2003; Green and Clausen, 2003; Johansson et al., 2008).

3. Oxalate biosynthesis

Biosynthesis of oxalic acid and the formation of oxalates, especially those of calcium, is a property found in a wide variety of free-living and symbiotic fungi. Calcium oxalate can be associated with hyphae, as well as strands, cords and rhyzomorphs, fruiting bodies, lichen thalli, and mycorrhizal systems in soil, decomposing plant biomass, and rocks as well as in the built environment and rock and mineral-based or mineral-containing cultural heritage (Graustein et al., 1977; Arnott, 1982, Whitney and Arnott, 1987, 1988; Wilson and Jones, 1983; Birkby and Preece, 1988; Ascaso et al., 1990; Lapeyrie et al., 1990; Jones et al., 1992; Yang et al., 1993; Horner et al., 1995; Wilson, 1995; Oyarbide et al., 2001; Landeweert et al., 2001; Bjelland et al., 2002; Arvieu et al., 2003; Burford et al., 2006; Schilling and Jellison, 2007; Court
et al., 2010; Pinzari et al., 2013) (Figs 1, 4, 5, 7–9). Oxalate formation has been suggested as a taxonomically-useful character although this is highly debatable given its ubiquity and dependence on growth and environmental conditions. Earlier reports of intracellular deposition of calcium oxalate appear dubious, with many observations likely to be the result of artefacts of preparation for microscopy. Some misinterpretations may have arisen due to dehydration and shrinkage of extracellular polysaccharide or other mucilaginous material containing deposited oxalate, interwoven hyphae, or precipitation reactions occurring within dead biomass (Connolly and Jellison, 1995; Connolly et al., 1995; Gadd, 1999). The hydrated extracellular matrix of fungal mycelium also provides a good microenvironment for geochemical reactions, such as oxalate precipitation, to occur (Fomina et al., 2005a).

In Aspergillus niger, oxalic acid biosynthesis occurs exclusively by conversion of oxaloacetate (arising from the action of pyruvate carboxylase on pyruvate produced by glycolysis) to oxalate and acetate by a cytoplasmic Mn²⁺-dependent oxaloacetate acetylhydrolase (OAH), with optimal production in the pH range of 5–8 (Kubicek et al., 1988; Pedersen et al., 2000a). This tricarboxylic acid (TCA) cycle independent pathway was confirmed using an A. niger mutant lacking OAH that did not produce any oxalate (Ruijter et al., 1999; Pedersen et al., 2000a,b), and also in Botrytis cinerea by disruption of the oahA gene encoding OAH (Han et al., 2007). This pathway may be widely distributed in fungi (Magnusson and Lasure, 2004). As well as the cytoplasmic route of oxalate formation via OAH, oxalate can also be formed in other fungi, e.g. the wood-rot Fomitopsis palustris, via the glyoxylate (GLOX) cycle by the action of glyoxysomal glyoxylate dehydrogenase on glyoxylate, and this can be coupled to the TCA cycle and coordinated with acetate recycling routes (Munir et al., 2001a,b; Sakai et al., 2006; Hattori et al., 2007). Oxaloacetate cannot pass across the membranes of mitochondria and glyoxysomes, and malate may flow out from the TCA or GLOX to be oxidized to form oxaloacetate. The TCA and GLOX cycles are replenished with succinate and glyoxylate, respectively meaning the GLOX and TCA cycles are anaplerotic to each other to keep both cycles coupled (Munir et al., 2001a; Sakai et al., 2006). This metabolic coupling system may serve for oxalate biosynthesis accompanied by energy production. Therefore it has been proposed that F. palustris acquires energy for growth by oxidizing glucose to oxalate, and this may be a general feature of both brown- and white-rot fungi during wood degradation (Munir et al., 2001a). This therefore means a direct link between oxalate biosynthesis and the biogeochemical cycling of carbon, and indeed all other elements in wood. Oxalate production can be affected by many factors including carbon and nitrogen source, and environmental pH (Akamatsu et al., 1994; Dutton and Evans, 1996). Oxalate is potentially toxic and so needs to efflux from cells or be broken down. A novel oxalate transporter (FpOAR) has been identified in F. palustris (Watanabe et al., 2010). The other means of oxalate detoxification is by degradation and this is a common property, especially in wood-degrading fungi (Watanabe et al., 2010).

4. Oxalate degradation

There are a number of enzymes involved in oxalate degradation with the most prevalent in fungi being oxalate decarboxylase (ODC), a manganese-containing cupin family protein (Mehta and Datta, 1991; Dutton et al., 1994; Dutton and Evans, 1996; Micales, 1997; Kathiara et al., 2000; Svedružić et al., 2005; Zhu and Hong, 2010, Makela et al., 2002, 2009, 2010, 2014; Hastrup et al., 2012). This breaks down oxalate to CO₂ and formate:

Fig. 1 — Calcium oxalate crystals produced after growth of Beauveria caledonica on 0.5 % (w/v) CaCO₃-containing medium for 24 d at 25 °C. Some very large crystals resulted as well as smaller crystals that have nucleated around fungal hyphae. Bar markers = (a) 100 μm (b) 50 μm (c) 10 μm (Li Q and Gadd GM, unpublished data).
(COOH)₂ → CO₂ + HCOOH

The formate may be broken down by formate dehydrogenase also yielding CO₂ and NADH (Watanabe et al., 2005, 2008). Oxalate decarboxylase expression may be induced by the presence of oxalate, low pH, and other environmental factors (see Dutton and Evans, 1996; Gadd, 1999; Tang et al., 2013).

Another oxalate degrading enzyme is oxalate oxidase (OXO) which cleaves oxalic acid into CO₂ and hydrogen peroxide:

(COOH)₂ + O₂ → 2CO₂ + H₂O₂

This is not as widespread as ODC but is found in some white-rots (Aguilar et al., 1999; Graz et al., 2009; Moussatche et al., 2011).

It has been found that Saccharomyces cerevisiae expresses a novel oxaryl-CoA synthetase capable of catalyzing the conversion of oxalate to oxalyl-CoA. The enzyme appears to catalyze the first step in a novel pathway of oxalate degradation that offers protection from the inhibitory effects of endogenous or exogenous oxalate. A similar enzyme was shown to catalyze the first step in an oxalate catabolic pathway discovered in plants (Foster et al., 2012; Foster and Nakata, 2014).

Degradation of oxalic acid by the mycoparasite Coniothyrium minitans may improve mycoparasitism on Sclerotinia sclerotiorum by stimulating production and/or activity of β-1,3-glucanase by C. minitans and might also be a mechanism by which it can protect plants from infection by S. sclerotiorum (Ren et al., 2007).

5. Oxalate in geomycology

(1) Oxalate in bioweathering

Bioweathering is the erosion, decay and decomposition of rocks and minerals mediated by living organisms, and takes

Fig. 2 – Scanning electron microscopy images of mycogenic metal oxalates. (a) Copper oxalate hydrate (moolooite) precipitation around and associated with hyphal strands of Beauveria caledonica after growth in media containing copper phosphate (b) Single moolooite crystal proximal to a hyphal strand of B. caledonica grown in presence of copper phosphate (c) hyphal tunnels, some with exopolymeric material, in a large formation of moolooite produced by B. caledonica grown in the presence of copper phosphate (d) Hyphae of B. caledonica growing across a large formation of zinc oxalate dihydrate formed during growth on zinc phosphate (e) lead oxalate formed after growth of B. caledonica on lead tetraoxide (f) cadmium oxalate formed after growth of B. caledonica on cadmium phosphate. Bar markers = (a, f) 500 μm (b, c, d) 10 μm (e) 100 μm. Adapted from Fomina et al. (2005, 2010) and unpublished.
place through physical and chemical mechanisms (Gadd, 2007). Microbial organic acids are important bioweathering agents of stone, minerals and related structural materials including such cultural heritage as monuments, statues, rock paintings, friezes and frescoes (Gadd, 1999; Warscheid and Braams, 2000; Lisci et al., 2003; Adeyemi and Gadd, 2005; Sverdrup, 2009; Rosling et al., 2009; Bonneville et al., 2009, 2011; Cutler and Viles, 2010; Wei et al., 2011; Smits et al., 2012). Oxalate can have a significant role in bioweathering, whether produced by free-living or symbiotic fungi, coupled with biophysical effects caused by hyphal penetration of the substrate (Lisci et al., 2003; Lian et al., 2008a,b). This arises through the metal complexing and dissolution effects on minerals mentioned previously (Gadd, 1999) as well as physical damage caused by expansive formation of the secondary oxalate biominerals (Chen et al., 2000; Fomina et al., 2009b) (Figs 7, 9 and 10).

The origin of fungal tunnels within weatherable soil minerals has been explained as a result of dissolution and “burrowing” within the mineral matrix—the “rock-eating fungi” hypothesis (Jongmans et al., 1997; Smits, 2006). An additional hypothesis for tunnel formation may depend on biomineralization by “rock-building fungi” which highlights fungal involvement in mineral formation (Fomina et al., 2010). In natural limestone microcosms, calcium oxalate monohydrate (whewellite) and dihydrate (weddellite) formed as a result of oxalic acid excretion by Penicillium corylophilum, and this formed a substantial biomineralized crust of secondary precipitates and hyphal coating. Beauveria caledonica also formed crusts and precipitated a mixture of whewellite and weddellite and copper oxalate (moolooite) when grown on media containing calcium carbonate and copper phosphate, respectively. Cryo-preservation and cryo-fracturing of these mycorrhizal crusts revealed an intimate relationship between the fungal hyphae and the secondary mycogenic minerals. Tunnel formation was observed within the mineral matrix which resulted from extensive precipitation of secondary mineral on living hyphae followed by hyphal death resulting in a tunnel in the mineral of similar diameter and shape as the fungal hyphae (Fomina et al., 2010) (Fig. 2).

Mycorrhizal fungi can exhibit considerable mineral bioweathering properties with effects on metal mobility (Landeweert et al., 2001; Martino et al., 2003a,b; Hoffland et al., 2004; Bonneville et al., 2009, 2011; Smits et al., 2012; McMaster, 2012). For many tested ericoid mycorrhizal and ectomycorrhizal fungi grown with ammonium as nitrogen source, the main mechanism of dissolution of toxic metal phosphates was acidolysis (Fomina et al., 2004, 2005b). However, if the fungus was capable of excreting large amounts of oxalate, the mechanism switched to ligand-promoted dissolution and became much more efficient than acidolysis, especially evident for pyromorphite (Pb₅(PO₄)₃Cl) (Fomina et al., 2004, 2005a,b). It has been shown that the main compounds originating from extramatrical mycelium of Hebeloma crustuliniforme (in association with Pinus sylvestris) were oxalate and ferricrocin. The exudation rate for oxalate was 19 ± 3 fmol per hyphal tip h⁻¹ or 488 ± 95 fmol hyphae mm⁻² h⁻¹. These results clearly indicate that oxalate excretion can alter the chemical conditions of soil microsites and affect mineral dissolution (van Hees et al., 2006). In six different ectomycorrhizal fungi (Hebeloma velutipes, Piloderma byssinum, Paxillus involutus, Rhizopogon roseolus, Suillus bovinus and Suillus variegatus) and two saprotrophic fungi (Hypholoma fasciculare and Hypholoma capnoides) exposed to Pb, Cd and As stress, it was found that oxalate exudation increased

![Manganese oxalates produced after fungal growth](image)
significantly in response to both low and high Pb and Cd concentrations (Johansson et al., 2008). Oxalate was the dominant low molecular weight organic acid (LMWOA) produced (>90% of total LMWOAs) and generally, the ectomycorrhizal (ECM) species produced more oxalate than the saprotrophic fungi studied (Johansson et al., 2008).

Lichens are significant bioweathering agents (Jones et al., 1980; Wilson et al., 1980; Purvis, 1984; Chisholm et al., 1987; Wilson and Jones, 1983, 1984; Jones and Wilson, 1985; Wilson, 1995; Viles, 1995; Banfield et al., 1999; Adamo and Violante, 2000; Stretch and Viles, 2002; Purvis et al., 2008) and can penetrate rock substrates to over 1 cm depths (Lisci et al., 2003). The ubiquity of oxalate production in lichens, as well as other metal-complexing or solubilizing/precipitating metabolites, including H⁺ and respiratory CO₂, has long been appreciated (Edwards et al., 1997; Chen et al., 2000; Purvis and Pawlik-Skowronska, 2008). A series of different oxalate minerals may be formed depending on the substrate, calcium oxalate being the most common, and these may form at the rock–thallus interface, within the thallus or be deposited on thallus surfaces (Ascaso et al., 1990; Bjelland et al., 2002; Giordani et al., 2003) (Fig. 5). Calcium oxalate may precipitate at concentrations < 0.1 mM (Eick et al., 1996) and may form even in low Ca environments (Chen et al., 2000). Metal oxalates are the most frequently occurring bioweathering products of lichens and all divalent metal oxalates may be found (Na, K, Al, and Fe oxalates are soluble) (Chen et al., 2000). It has been suggested that oxalate patinas on ancient monuments may have arisen from prior lichen activities (Del Monte and Sabbioni, 1987; Pinna, 1993; Caneva, 1993), and these may have a protective effect because of their insolubility (Lisci et al., 2003). Oxalates have been implicated in Fe, Si, Mg, Ca, K and Al mobilization, as well as other elements, from e.g. sandstone, basalt, granite, calcareous rocks and silicates, leading to alterations in the substrate and other secondary mineral formations (Johnston and Vestal, 1993; Chen et al., 2000; Wei et al., 2012). Other secondary oxalates that have been associated with lichen growth are glushinskite (magnesium oxalate dihydrate), manganese oxalate dihydrate (lindbergite), copper oxalate (moolooite), and ferrous oxalate (humboldtite), the formation of which is dependent on the metal composition of the rock substrate (Wilson et al., 1980; Purvis, 1984; Wilson and Jones, 1983, 1984; Jones and Wilson, 1985; Chisholm et al., 1987; Wilson, 1995; Purvis and Halls, 1996; Frost, 2004; Purvis and Pawlik-Skowronska, 2008; Purvis et al., 2008) (Figs 3, 5 and 6). In some cases, lichen bioweathering may occur by biophysical means and/or from effects of other metabolites in the absence of oxalate (Scarciglia et al., 2012).

(2) Oxalate in metal and mineral transformations

Fungal oxalates have significant effects on minerals, both in mineral dissolution and in mineral formation, and this can have important consequences for component metal mobility (Gadd, 1999; Gadd and Fomina, 2011) (Fig. 7). Biomineralization refers to the processes by which living organisms form minerals, and biomineral production by fungi is an example of biologically-induced mineralization (BIM) where the organism modifies the local microenvironment creating conditions that favour extracellular precipitation of mineral phases (Gadd, 2010; Gadd et al., 2012). Mycogenic oxalates are one important example of fungal biomineral formation
Oxalate is common in many soils and may range from 25 to 1000 μM (Fox and Comerford, 1990, 1992). Average organic acid concentrations in soils are generally <1 mM, but high concentrations may occur in local microenvironments (Cromack et al., 1979; Banfield et al., 1999; McMaster, 2012). Fungi produce other metal oxalates besides calcium on interacting with a variety of different metals and metal-bearing minerals, including those of Ca, Cd, Co, Cu, Mg, Mn, Sr, Zn, Ni and Pb (Sayer and Gadd, 1997; Gadd, 1999, 2007; Sayer et al., 1999; Adeyemi and Gadd, 2005; Fomina et al., 2005a, 2007a; Wei et al., 2013) (Fig. 7). The formation of toxic metal oxalates may contribute to fungal metal tolerance (Gadd, 1993; Clausen et al., 2000; Jarosz-Wilkolazka and Gadd, 2003; Green and Clausen, 2003). Mycogenic oxalate minerals produced by free-living fungi include glushinskite (MgC2O4·2H2O) (Burford et al., 2003a,b; Kolo and Claeyss, 2005, Gadd, 2007), moolooite (Cu(C2O4)·0.4H2O) (Fomina et al., 2005a, 2007a), and lindbergite (MnP2O7·2H2O) (Wei et al., 2012) (Figs 2, 3, 5 and 6).

The significance of low molecular weight organic acids in mineral dissolution and bioweathering is increasingly appreciated, as discussed earlier, and oxalic acid can mediate acid-olysis (arising from H+), ligand-promoted dissolution (arising from metal complexation by oxalate) and reductive mobilization of metals from minerals (Gadd et al., 2012; Wei et al., 2012). For montmorillonite, oxalate did not catalyze the dissolution reaction between pH 2 and 4 and dissolution took place through protonolysis. However, oxalate markedly enhanced montmorillonite dissolution at pH 4–8, with dissolution taking place through a ligand-promoted mechanism (Ramos et al., 2014). Oxalate production by A. niger and S. himantioides has been shown to induce the dissolution and conversion of both rhodochrosite and Mn oxides to Mn oxalate minerals (Sayer et al., 1997; Wei et al., 2012) (Fig. 3). Oxalate can act as a reductant of Mn(IV) oxides, and this can result in mobilization of Mn(II), which can then precipitate. Both A. niger and S. himantioides were capable of solubilizing the insoluble manganese oxides MnO2 and Mn2O3, mycogenic manganese oxide (MnO4) and birnessite [(Na0.3Ca0.1K0.1)(Mn4+,Mn3+)2O4·1.5H2O]. Precipitation of insoluble manganese oxalate occurred and manganese oxalate trihydrate was detected after growth of S. himantioides with birnessite which subsequently was transformed to manganese oxalate dihydrate (Wei et al., 2012) (Fig. 3). Ligand-promoted dissolution of uranium oxides was much more significant than proton-promoted acidification. Uranium oxide solubilization

![Fig. 5 — Crystalline inclusions of (a) moolooite (copper oxalate hydrate) and (b) whewellite (calcium oxalate monohydrate) within the medulla of the lichen Acarospora rugulosa (R). Bar markers = 3.8 μm. Images adapted from Purvis (1984) and Chisholm et al. (1987), with permission.](image-url)
and accumulation of mobilized uranium from uranium oxides and depleted uranium correlated with the amount of excreted oxalate (Fomina et al., 2007c). Accumulated uranium was bio-mineralized as uranyl phosphate minerals of the meta-autunite group with abundant uranium precipitates encrusting the hyphae (Fomina et al., 2007c, 2008; Gadd and Fomina, 2011). New biominerals resulted from fungal interactions with zinc silicate and zinc sulfide ores. Zinc oxalate dihydrate was formed through oxalate excretion by the test fungi and the mineral surfaces showed varying patterns of bio-weathering and biomineral formation. In addition, calcium oxalate was formed from the calcium present in the mineral ore fractions, as well as calcite (Wei et al., 2013) (Fig. 7).

Mineral dissolution may result in release of toxic (Sayer et al., 1999) or essential metals like K (Lian et al., 2008a,b) as well as nutrients like P or S (Gharieb et al., 1998; Gharieb and Gadd, 1999; Smits et al., 2012). Oxalic acid can leach those metals that form soluble oxalate complexes, including K, Al and Fe (Strasser et al., 1994; Lian et al., 2008a,b) as well as toxic metals. The latter may biomineralize as oxalates or other secondary minerals, including phosphates, depending on the local microenvironment (Gadd, 2010, 2011). Novel mycogenic phosphates resulted on fungal transformations of uranium oxides, depleted uranium (Fomina et al., 2007a,c, 2008) and metallic lead (Rhee et al., 2012, 2014). Fungal dissolution of pyromorphite (Pb₅(PO₄)₃Cl) resulted in lead oxalate formation (Sayer et al., 1999). Organic acid excretion may be inter- and intra-specific, and can be strongly influenced by pH, nutrition, and the toxic metals and minerals present (Sayer et al., 1995; Rosling et al., 2004a,b; Fomina et al., 2004, 2005b; Sayer and Gadd, 2001; Arvieu et al., 2003; Jarosz-Wilkolak and Graź, 2006; Johansson et al., 2008; Li et al., 2011).

(3) Oxalate-carbonate cycle

Degradation of calcium oxalate by oxalotrophic bacteria resulting in CaCO₃ formation is part of the oxalate-carbonate cycle (Verrecchia et al., 2006; Martin et al., 2012). In semi-arid environments, this process may act to cement pre-existing limestones by filling pores with recrystallized calcite (Verrecchia, 1990; Verrecchia et al., 1990, 1993). Oxalate oxidation by oxalotrophic bacteria increases alkalinity and media can reach pH 9, enabling calcite precipitation (Braissant et al., 2002, 2004). Salient steps in the oxalate-carbonate cycle are degradation of oxalate-containing plant biomass and biodegradation of the oxalate, followed by precipitation of calcite above pH 8.5 accompanied by release of 1 mol CO₂ for each mol oxalate oxidized (Aragno and Verrecchia, 2012). Overall equations are as follows:

\[
\text{CaC}_2\text{O}_4 + \text{½O}_2 \rightarrow \text{CaCO}_3 + \text{CO}_2
\]

Fungi may participate in the oxalate-carbonate cycle by oxalate synthesis and formation of calcium oxalate, but also by plant biomass and oxalate degradation (Verrecchia et al., 1993; Guggiari et al., 2011; Martin et al., 2012). It has been concluded that interactions between bacteria and fungi are essential to drive the oxalate-carbonate cycle in soil (Martin et al., 2012). The formation of oxalate and carbonate has

---

**Fig. 6** – Moolooite (copper oxalate hydrate) formation within the lichen Lecanora polytropa. (a) L. polytropa sampled from schistose rocks Folgefonn Peninsula, Norway (b) Turquoise-coloured L. polytropa sampled from a psammite boulder of a retaining wall supporting mine spoil at Riddarhyttan Kopparverket, Bergslagen District, Sweden (c) Section through L. polytropa fruit showing the internal turquoise region (sub-hymenium) above the irregular algal layer. Vivid blue inclusions (copper oxalate) are present in the medulla below. (d) Back-scattered electron image of crystalline aggregate of copper oxalate in association with fungal hyphae within the lichen medulla. Bar markers = (a, b) 2 mm; (c) 200 μm (d) 6 μm. Adapted from Purvis et al. (2008) with kind permission of the author and the Mineralogical Society of Great Britain and Ireland.
6. Oxalate in biodeterioration

Fungi are important biodeterioration agents of natural and synthetic substances and oxalate commonly features in the decay and spoilage of rock and mineral based structures and building components, including cultural heritage, concrete, cement and mortars, metals, and lignocellulosic materials, such as wood and paper (de la Torre et al., 1991, 1993; Gadd, 1999; Gadd et al., 2005; Schilling and Jellison, 2007; Lian et al., 2008a,b; Sterflinger, 2000, 2010; Cutler and Viles, 2010; McMaster, 2012; Sterflinger and Pinzari, 2012) (Figs 4, 9 and 10).

(1) Cultural heritage

Calcium oxalates (whewellite and weddelite) occur widely in patinas on the surfaces of marble and limestone buildings and monuments, as well as on sandstone, granite, plasters, cave and wall paintings and sculptures (Del Monte and Sabbioni, 1986; Garcia-Valles et al., 1997; Sterflinger et al., 1999; Sterflinger, 2000; Monte, 2003). It has been stated that this kind of attack is the most important weathering process affecting historic monuments (Del Monte et al., 1987). The oxalate patina represents a record of such alteration, and this subsequently results in protecting the underlying marble and limestone (Del Monte et al., 1987). Because of their widespread occurrence in such cultural heritage, and in natural rock outcrops, weddelite and whewellite must therefore not be considered rare minerals, as asserted in the mineralogical literature, but as widely distributed in nature (Del Monte et al., 1987). Black crusts are often found on stone and mortar surfaces exposed to atmospheric deposition and reflect transformations of materials in the substrate: oxalate seems nearly always to be present (Sabbioni et al., 1998, 2003).

For marble or limestone artefacts, the surface calcium oxalate patinas can form a relatively uniform thickness of around $80\text{--}150\mu m$ (Doherty et al., 2007). These calcium oxalate films are very stable, and both whewellite ($\text{CaC}_2\text{O}_4\cdot \text{H}_2\text{O}$) and weddelite ($\text{CaC}_2\text{O}_4\cdot 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$) may be present (Monte, 2003; Perez-Rodriguez et al., 2011). Copper(II) oxalate [$\text{Cu(C}_2\text{O}_4\cdot x\text{H}_2\text{O}$] has been found in patinas on copper metal (de la Fuente et al., 2008).

Some have suggested that the oxalate films originate from degradation of past surface treatments (Rampazzi et al., 2004; Perez-Rodriguez et al., 2011) although this must be mediated by microbes and, as described earlier, oxalate may be produced from organic degradation. However, this hypothesis is considered unlikely by others especially in view of patina occurrence on untreated surfaces (Del Monte et al., 1987). Both standpoints may be reconciled by the need for an organic substrate for oxalate biosynthesis however, and all rock surfaces receive organic deposition in rainwater, animal wastes, etc. as well as from microbial biofilm exudation and decay (Burford et al., 2003b). It should be noted that another oxalate source may be atmospheric deposition, although oxalate has been detected in locations regardless of local climate, and generally concluded to be of biogenic origin (Sabbioni et al., 2003).

Lichens are also significant biodeteriorative agents of stone monuments, buildings, cements and mortars and oxalate is again often implicated in the process (Seaward et al., 1989; Viles, 1995; Seaward, 1997; Arino et al., 1997; Edwards et al.,...
Fungal growth in wall murals and frescoes can cause structural damage, and calcium and other oxalates may be produced from the calcite or metal-containing pigments (which may be mineral-based) in the paint used. This can cause efflorescence, expansion cracking, peeling and spalling of outer layers, as well as colour changes and stains in the paintings (Krumbein et al., 1989; Nevin et al., 2008; Rosado et al., 2013). Interestingly, radiocarbon dating of calcium oxalate coatings of rock paintings can provide a method for testing chronological models, and define, with acceptable accuracy, the time period during which pictographs were produced (Ruiz et al., 2006; Rowe, 2009). As long as the stratigraphic relationship between oxalate crusts and a painting event can be established, minimum and maximum ages for pictographs can be obtained (Ruiz et al., 2012).

Medieval stained glass often shows corrosion, patina development, and mineral crust growth, which has caused serious damage to many Central European stained glass windows (Pinar et al., 2013). Such glass biodeterioration arises from complex microbial communities, including bacteria, fungi and lichens, with oxalate again being commonly found (Pinar et al., 2013).

Fungal biodeterioration of ivory was investigated regarding the possible origins of the surface damage observed on early medieval sculptures made largely from walrus tusks, ‘the Lewis hoard of gaming pieces’. Colonization of ivory and/or exposure to fungal activity lead to extensive secondary bio-mineral formation, mainly as calcium oxalate monohydrate (whewellite) concomitant with leaching of apatite from the ivory (Pinzari et al., 2013) (Fig. 9).

(2) Paper

Modern and ancient paper can contain large amounts of calcium carbonate. This originates from ground natural calcium carbonates, such as limestone, dolomite, marble, chalk and seashells, and chemically precipitated calcium carbonates (Pinzari et al., 2010). Other metals can arise from impurities, while Cu and Fe are found in inks (Sterflinger and Pinzari, 2012). Fungal interaction with the carbonate substrates in paper results in replacement of the original minerals with calcium oxalate with both the fungal hyphae and cellulose fibrils providing preferential sites for precipitation of calcium oxalate dihydrate and monohydrate (Pinzari et al., 2010) (Fig. 4).

Paper machine water circuits have pH, temperature and nutrients favourable for microbial growth which can cause biodeterioration and biocorrosion problems. It was found that large amounts of thiosulfate, sulfite and oxalate were generated from sulphate and sheets of chemical pulp in a splash area simulator fed with artificial paper machine white water. Stainless steel coupons placed in the simulator developed significant corrosion pits within 4 weeks, and this was most extensive proximal to patches where large amounts of thiosulfate and oxalate (the latter presumably of fungal origin) accumulated in the pulp sheet (Uutela et al., 2003).

(3) Concrete and nuclear decommissioning

Cement and concrete are used as barriers in all kinds of nuclear waste repositories. Despite the service life of concrete supposedly reaching up to 1 M years, biodeterioration and

Fig. 8 – Alteration of the surface of rock phosphate (RP) by fungal activity and production of whewellite (calcium oxalate monohydrate). (a) Control RP surface (b) RP after incubation with Trametes versicolor for 6 d (c) RP after incubation with Serpula himantioides for 7 d. Bar markers = 20 μm. The crystalline formations in (b) and (c) were identified as whewellite. RP was incorporated into malt extract agar to 0.3 % (w/v) and all incubations were at 25 °C in the dark (Bahri-Esfahani J, George TS, Gadd GM, unpublished data).
biocorrosion are important factors to take into account yet this, as well as bacterial processes, are almost completely ignored by the nuclear industry. Many studies have shown that fungi can play an important role in biodeterioration of concrete (Perfettini et al., 1991; Gu et al., 1998; Nica et al., 2000; Fomina et al., 2007b; George et al., 2013). Complexolysis appears to be the main mechanism of calcium mobilization (Gu et al., 1998) and this can be followed by calcium oxalate precipitation (and secondary calcite) (Fomina et al., 2007b; George et al., 2013). Several fungi exhibit radiation-resistance and can colonize concrete barriers even under severe radioactive contamination such as that which occurred after the Chernobyl accident in 1986 (Zhdanova et al., 2000). Fungi from the genera Aspergillus, Alternaria and Cladosporium were able to colonize concrete used as the radioactive waste barrier and leached iron, aluminium, silicon and calcium, precipitating calcium oxalate in their microenvironment (Olishhevskaya et al., 2004; Fomina et al., 2007b). Fungi are, of course, also important members of microbial communities (including lichens) that colonize and deteriorate ‘normal’ concrete and cement used in buildings and other structures (Perfettini et al., 1991; George et al., 2013).

4 Other building materials

Biodeterioration of ceramic roof tiles by lichens has been identified as being caused by oxalic acid excretion, causing ceramic matrix deterioration (Radeka et al., 2007). Incorporation of a Cu-slag (10 %wt) into model tiles caused retardation of biodeterioration presumably because of Cu toxicity (Radeka et al., 2007).

Oxalic acid is implicated in lichen biodeterioration of asbestos roofing material, which attacks the cement matrix over time (Favero-Longo et al., 2009). Lichens have been shown to colonize and weather chrysotile asbestos-bearing rocks (Favero-Longo et al., 2005) with their metabolites modifying the surface activity of the fibres (Martino et al., 2003a,b, 2004) Calcium oxalate monohydrate was detected at the lichen-asbestos interface and it has been suggested that oxalate is the agent responsible for depletion of MgO from chrysotile and that of Na2O and FeOtot from crocidolite (Favero-Longo et al., 2005, 2009). Lichen cover on asbestos may therefore have some positive benefits in stabilizing the surface and preventing asbestos detachment and dispersal, as well as chemically modifying the asbestos, particularly decreasing Fenton activity, an important factor related to asbestos toxicity (Daghino et al., 2005; Favero-Longo et al., 2005, 2009).

7 Oxalate in environmental technology

1 Bioprotection

Precipitation of calcium oxalate monohydrate (COM) within the pore spaces of concrete has been investigated as a waterproofing material to enhance hydraulic properties as well as minimize water leakage (Arveniti et al., 2010).

Biomineralization phenomena also provide a biotechnology applicable to the conservation or protection of stone surfaces in heritage structures (Cezar, 1998; Webster and May, 2006). Artificial calcium oxalate treatment to protect marble sculptures and a mural facade has been reported (Doherty et al., 2007). This artificially-produced calcium oxalate layer is based on transformation of surficial calcium carbonate by application of an ammonium oxalate poultice (Cezar, 1998; Doherty et al., 2007). Beauveria spp. have been

Fig. 9 – Calcium oxalate formation during fungal attack of ancient ivory. (a) Aspergillus niger colonizing the surface of a boar tusk fragment and development of a biomineralized surface crust of calcium oxalate monohydrate (whewellite) below the mycelial mat (b) calcium oxalate crystals and (c) oxalate deposition and tunnelling on the surface of walrus tusk after incubation with Serpula himantioides for 14 d at 25 °C. Bar markers (a) 500 μm (b, c) 10 μm. Image (a) adapted from Pinzari et al. (2013), and unpublished.
well described in their ability to overproduce oxalate, especially in the presence of toxic metals such as Cu (Fomina et al., 2005a). In a biotechnological attempt to produce protective oxalate films, oxalate patinas were investigated for various metals incubated with Beauveria bassiana, with the best results obtained for ancient and modern copper metal (Joseph et al., 2012).

(2) Bioleaching and bioremediation of metals

Chemoorganotrophic bioleaching of metals by fungi from industrial wastes and by-products, low grade ores and metal-bearing minerals is relevant to recycling and biorecovery of valuable metals, and bioremediation of contaminated solid wastes (Burgstaller and Schinner, 1993; Strasser et al., 1994; Gadd, 1999, 2001, 2007, 2010; Brandl, 2001; Brandl et al., 2001; Mulligan and Galvez-Cloutier, 2003; Fomina et al., 2005b; Asghari et al., 2013). It may also be relevant to release of, e.g. phosphate from mineral sources such as rock phosphate (Fig. 8). Fungi such as Aspergillus and Penicillium spp., have been used to leach metals such as zinc, copper, nickel and cobalt from a variety of solid materials, including low-grade mineral ores, spent refinery catalysts, fly ash and electronic waste (e-waste) (Burgstaller and Schinner, 1993; Brandl, 2001; Brandl et al., 2001; Mulligan and Galvez-Cloutier, 2003; Wu and Ting, 2006; Cui and Zhang, 2008; Xu and Ting, 2009; Asghari et al., 2013). While citric acid is commonly implicated in fungal bioleaching because of its ability to form many soluble metal complexes, oxalate has some relevance for those metals forming soluble oxalate complexes. Oxalic acid production by fungi can be manipulated to over 400 mM for solubilization of Al or Fe that form soluble oxalate complexes (Strasser et al., 1994). A spent refinery processing catalyst was physically and chemically characterized and subjected to a one-step and two-step bioleaching process using a high-yield oxalic acid producing strain of A. niger (Santhiya and Ting, 2005). Metals may be recovered from leachates by a variety of processes including cementation, solvent extraction, activated carbon, and ion exchange (Cui and Zhang, 2008) with biotechnological processes, including biomineralization, being potential options (Gadd, 2007, 2010; Gadd et al., 2012).

Soil washing is one of the few permanent treatment alternatives to remove metal contaminants from soils (Dermont et al., 2008). Oxalate has had limited attention in this technology for obvious reasons, though was more effective than EDTA to remove metals associated with soil Fe–Mn oxides due to attack on the oxides (Elliot and Shastri, 1999). Chemical and hydrometallurgical processes based on vacuum pyrolysis, oxalate leaching and precipitation have been applied to recover cobalt and lithium from spent lithium-ion batteries and zinc plant residue (Wang and Zhou, 2002; Chen et al., 2011; Sun and Qiu, 2012). Oxalate acts as a leaching and precipitation reagent, precipitating cobalt from LiCoO₂ and CoO as CoC₂O₄·2H₂O with 1.0 M oxalate solution at 80 °C, and separating Co and Li (Sun and Qiu, 2012). Selective oxalate precipitation was used to separate Ca and Mg oxalates from mixed-metal brine. K and Li could be removed by washing, and a high purity magnesium oxalate

---

Fig. 10 – Lichens are important geochemical agents and oxalate is produced by many species, contributing to physical and chemical biodeterioration of the substrate. This can lead to profound changes that are especially evident in cultural heritage. The figure shows successive images of a gravestone taken over an approximate seven-year period, showing phases of lichen colonization and also areas of detachment of biomass with resulting loss of underlying substrate. Images recorded (a) 07.07.2007 (b) 23.01.2010 (c) 04.05.2014.


(MgC_2O_4·2H_2O) obtained which is an important precursor for MgO production by roasting (Tran et al., 2013).

The precipitation of actinide (III) and actinide (IV) oxalates is widely used as a method for the precipitation and recovery of actinides in the reprocessing of spent nuclear fuel (Abraham et al., 2014). Crystalline lead oxalate and aqueous lead complexes may be important in nuclear waste isolation, as oxalate is present in waste streams and metallic lead is present as radiation shielding. Crystalline lead oxalate could be a potentially important solubility-limiting phase for lead, or oxalate, or both. Further, aqueous lead oxalate complexes are strong and soluble Pb can therefore compete with actinides for dissolved oxalate, lowering the total soluble fraction of actinides such as Am and Np (Xiong et al., 2013).

8. Oxalate in nanotechnology

Oxalates are extremely important industrial substances, because of their chemical properties outlined previously, and are used in, e.g. nuclear reprocessing, nanotechnology, catalysis, superconductor and laser technology, as precursors for other industrially-important substances and in the development of hybrid-chemical structures (Aimable et al., 2011; Behnoudnia and Dehghani, 2013; Abraham et al., 2014; Vimal et al., 2014). The precipitation of various oxalates is also often used to make precursors of high-quality ceramic materials (Bharagava et al., 1995; Van Herle et al., 1997).

Cobalt oxalate synthesis is an important component in cobalt hydrometallurgy (Zhang et al., 2012). Copper oxalate has unusual antiferromagnetic properties and is also a precursor material for the production of CuO and Cu nanoparticles (Zhang et al., 2008; ul Haq and Haider, 2009). CuO has potential applications in various fields, such as gas sensors, solar energy and catalysis (Aimable et al., 2011). High surface area CuO has been produced most successfully via the decomposition of nanostructured copper oxalate precipitates (Soare et al., 2006; Aimable et al., 2011). Copper oxalate has also been used to produce Cu(OH)_2 and CuO nanostructures (Behnoudnia and Dehghani, 2013). Chemical research seeks to find better ways of producing nanosized particles of copper oxalate by precipitation under different conditions (ul Haq and Haider, 2009; Singh et al., 2012). Zinc oxalate is frequently used in organic synthesis reaction as a catalyst, and is also a precursor for the preparation of zinc oxide particles (Kim and Kim, 2010; Shamsipur et al., 2013). Zinc oxalate nanoparticles can be produced by an electrochemical process (Shamsipur et al., 2013). Other nanoscale oxalates to receive attention include MgC_2O_4·2H_2O and some rare earth elements (Reddy et al., 2014). Rare earth oxalates are of particular importance because of their applications in the fields of molecular based magnetic materials, luminescent materials, as a precursor for superconducting oxides, and solid state lasers (Vimal et al., 2014). Nanostructured samarium oxalate crystals have been synthesized (Vimal et al., 2014). Some rare earth oxalates have been found in natural environmental locations (Rouse et al., 2001). It is interesting to speculate whether any future biotechnology based on fungal systems could be developed to contribute to the physical and chemical technologies outlined above. Bimineral technology and production of new biomaterials is a growing field although microbes are often given scant attention in this regard, most attention being given to more advanced biologically-controlled biminer-alization processes (Chen et al., 2012). It is clear that novel metal oxalate formation may be mediated by fungal systems, but whether particle size and properties can be adequately controlled for nanoscience applications is a matter for conjecture at present.

9. Conclusions

Oxalate is a key fungal metabolite although it is clear there are still gaps in knowledge regarding biosynthesis and biodegradation, particularly in organisms not considered to be traditional fungal model systems. Oxalate production is a widely distributed property in free-living and symbiotic fungi (mycorrhizas, lichens) with a multiplicity of biotic and abiotic factors affecting production. Central to the effects of oxalate is the ability of the oxalate anion to complex and/or precipitate metals as secondary biominerals which can result in mineral dissolution (bioweathering) or metal immobilization, as well as the ability to act as a metal reductant, e.g. Mn(IV) to Mn(II), all of which influence metal speciation and mobility. Metal solubilization and immobilization mechanisms are relevant to biorecovery, bioleaching, and bioremediation approaches for metal-rich liquid and solid matrices. Oxalate is frequently associated with fungal-mediated rock and mineral transformations and seems ubiquitous in the context of biodeterioration of rock and mineral-based structural materials and cultural heritage. Oxalate is widely-found in wood-rotting fungi and has other important roles in lignocellulose degradation and plant pathogenesis. Oxalate production by mycorrhizal fungi can affect essential and toxic metal bioavailability as well as phosphate, thus influencing plant productivity. Metal oxalates have important chemical properties and are of industrial importance in a variety of processes: novel mycogenic oxalates may have potential applications in bimineral technology. Oxalate may therefore be concluded to be one of the most important fungal metabolites in terms of geomycology and of considerable economic significance in view of its roles in biodeterioration, biocorrosion, bioweathering, plant pathogenesis and productivity, and with potential applications in bimineral technology, such as bio-protection, synthesis of novel biomaterials, metal bioleaching and biorecovery.

Acknowledgements

The author gratefully acknowledges financial support from the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council, the Natural Environment Research Council, British Nuclear Fuels plc. and the College of Life Sciences, University of Dun-dee, for some of the research detailed in this article, as well as an award under the 1000 Talents Plan with the Xinjiang Institute of Ecology and Geography, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Urumqi, China. Grateful thanks are due to Flavia
Pinzari (Istituto Centrale per il Restauro e la Conservazione del Patrimonio Archivistico e Librario, Rome) and William Purvis (Natural History Museum, London) for kind permission to include some images from their research in this article. Qianwei Li gratefully acknowledges receipt of a China Scholarship Council PhD studentship award. Jaleh Bahri-Esfahani gratefully acknowledges receipt of support through a NERC postgraduate research studentship and the James Hutton Institute/University of Dundee joint PhD studentship scheme. Martin Kierans (Central Imaging Facility, College of Life Sciences, University of Dundee) is gratefully acknowledged for expert assistance with scanning electron microscopy.

REFERENCES


Sun, L., Qiu, K., 2012. Organic oxalate as leachant and precipitant for the recovery of valuable metals from spent lithium-ion batteries. Waste Manag. 32, 1575–1582.


