Research Report

Background

The Changing Teacher Roles, Identities and Professionalism (C-TRIP) seminar series was developed in response to a call from the ESRC’s Teaching and Learning Research Programme. The TLRP’s aim in establishing ‘thematic activities’ was to synthesise existing research from across and beyond the TLRP in order to deepen understandings of a range of themes that it had identified as being important, including changing teachers’ work and professionalism. This is a topic of major social, political and practical significance and we developed the C-TRIP series in order to deepen understandings of both how policy and social change is impacting on teaching and teacher professionalism and, given this, how teachers might improve their practice.

Professionalism is commonly conceptualised in two ways: as a mode of social coordination and as a set of values and dispositions. The former conceptualisation is based on the idea that professions serve an important social function in that they enable particular forms of occupational expertise and standards to influence the allocation of social goods. Professionalism in this sense, therefore, means that people who have expertise in an area have some say over what happens in that area. Trust becomes key, for in the contract between professionals and the wider society, professional groups provide relevant expertise and standards in exchange for being trusted to do their job. Professionalism as a mode of coordination exists alongside, and to varying degrees in tension with, other modes of coordination, notably state control and market forces.

The other way in which people use the idea of professionalism is to refer to the range of attributes that underpin the expertise and standards that are thought to comprise good professional practice. Professionalism in this sense is often associated with a list of character traits. The following extract from the General Teaching Council for England’s (2004) *Statement of Professional Values* illustrates this idea of professionalism:

> Teachers demonstrate the characteristics they are trying to inspire in pupils including a spirit of intellectual enquiry, tolerance, honesty, fairness, patience, a genuine concern for other people and an appreciation of different backgrounds.

Over the past thirty years there have been significant changes in the policy context of teaching, including an increase in the central regulation of teachers’ work and a greater role for quasi-markets. These changes have substantial implications for both senses of professionalism. As the influence of these alternative modes of coordination has increased, so the scope for professional influence on policy and practice has diminished. In addition to demands stemming from state regulation and competition, teachers have also had to respond to a range of other demands stemming from broader social changes including greater public scepticism towards professional authority, growth in cultures of consumerism, and demands for public services that are more responsive to diverse cultural and social identities.
C-TRIP was based on the premise that in order to understand and construct policy responses to these changes in teacher professionalism it is necessary to bring together two broad approaches to researching this theme. The first approach examines ways in which teachers’ work, roles and identities are constructed within particular political and social contexts. Included are historical, philosophical and sociological analyses of: the shifting ethical terrain within which professionals have to operate; the changing relationships amongst the state, public-sector organisations, the professionals who work in them and the people who use them; struggles around discourses of professionalism; and changes in the lived experiences of teaching. The second approach is concerned to explore how teachers’ professional practices might be enhanced. This approach draws on and combines a wide range of disciplines and research methods. These include intervention studies, involving experimentation with different approaches to teacher development, and philosophical and critical analysis of the qualities that make up good teaching and the political and organisational conditions that promote it.

Objectives

The overall aim of the seminar series was to draw together TLRP and non-TLRP research findings in order to deepen and broaden analyses of teachers’ professional practice in relation to changing contexts, roles and identities, in ways designed to inform the enhancement of teachers’ learning and professional practice. The objectives were to:

1. organise research-informed presentations and discussions on the major themes emerging from TLRP and non-TLRP research projects. These were: the current contextual framing of teachers’ work and professional lives; developing professional identities across the career and life-span; conceptions and enactments of professionalism; social difference and professionalism; effective professional development; conceptualising pedagogies in the learning society; research and developments in professional practice; professional development across the professions, over time and in different national contexts;

2. ensure wide participation by including appropriate representatives from relevant user groups and through notification of the seminars to a broad and diverse audience;

3. contribute to the development of educational research capacity through research-based presentations and discussions from multi-method and multi-disciplinary approaches, which bring together established and neophyte researchers and research users;

4. disseminate the outcomes of the seminar series as widely as possible, including through a dedicated website, an annotated bibliography on the website and in CD-ROM form, and an edited collection of papers.

The project addressed and successfully met all four objectives (see Methods and Results sections, below).
Methods

Seminar series design (addressing objectives 1, 2 and 3)

The series consisted of nine seminars, each focussing on a different theme. These themes were generated by a preliminary review of relevant research within and beyond the TLRP and were agreed in consultation with the project planning and advisory group. Approximately one third of the presentations were based on TLRP research. The planning of the content and structure of each seminar was undertaken by the project team, informed by feedback from TLRP critical friends, the project advisory group and seminar participants.

Each seminar was a whole day event and consisted of five or six papers designed to stimulate reflection and discussion on the sub theme of the day. Seminars 1-4 drew on critical policy, sociological and philosophical analysis to explore how teachers’ roles and identities and conceptions of professionalism are constructed in the interactions between teachers as active, socially differentiated agents and the political, institutional and social contexts within which they operate. These seminars consisted of contributions which looked across the phases of education mainly within the four national UK systems. Seminars 5 and 6 examined what can be learnt from recent research on professions other than teaching and cross-national comparative study. Insights from material presented at Seminars 1-6 were used to inform Seminars 7 and 8 on models of effective professional learning and the relationship between research and professional practice. In Seminar 9 leading figures reflected on, and helped consolidate, the empirical and theoretical contribution of the series to the understanding and development of teachers’ professional learning and practice.

Planning consultations with advisory group members took place throughout the project and a formal meeting was held in December 2005, after Seminar 6, to review progress and advise on the construction of advice for presenters at Seminars 7, 8 and 9, as well as on the production of the annotated bibliography and the edited collection.

In planning the seminars, care was taken to ensure that the speakers reflected a wide range of relevant constituencies as well as diverse disciplinary and methodological perspectives. (See Annex 1 for full seminar programme.) An invitation list was compiled by identifying a list of users and researchers working in the area, supplemented by the existing circulation lists of the project team and planning group. The name of anyone expressing an interest in the series at any time was added to the invitation list. Each seminar event and the series as a whole was advertised on the King’s, Roehampton and TLRP websites. Places were allocated to participants on a first come, first served basis.

The format of the seminars was designed to facilitate participation from all seminar attendees. Clusters of papers were followed by structured discussion in smaller groups, informed by – and building on – seminar papers, followed by a plenary session to reflect on and draw together the work of the day. Rapporteurs from the smaller groups contributed notes on the day which were written up as seminar reports and placed on the website. These were circulated at, and used to frame, the introduction to subsequent
seminars. This method was designed to ensure that the contributions of the participants fed directly into the construction of the seminar series. The structuring of the seminars was also designed to support research capacity building (see part 3 of the Results section, below).

Dissemination (objective 4)

The project dissemination strategy had four components: a project website, the production and circulation of an annotated bibliography, the development of a proposed edited collection and the writing and presentation of conference papers. Each of these components is discussed in part 4 of the Results section, below.

Results

1. Content of series and contribution to knowledge

The seminar series, which was concerned with teachers across all sectors both as learners and as agents of students’ learning, was innovative in bringing together analyses of the changing policy and social contexts of teachers’ work and research that is centrally concerned with enhancing the quality of professional practice and learning. In practice, these dichotomies between what are sometimes called critical and problem-solving paradigms easily break down and many papers combined both perspectives. This combination resulted in rich and contextually sensitive analyses of the opportunities and barriers to effective professional practice and learning generated by contemporary policy and social conditions. It also resulted in a range of concrete recommendations for policy and practice that are sensitive to what is feasible and desirable at different levels of intervention ranging from national government level to the classroom. Thus the series placed a strong emphasis on both theory and practice. It included original theoretical contributions from within different disciplinary perspectives, e.g. philosophy, sociology and psychology. The structuring of the seminars not only achieved cross-fertilisations between these different perspectives but anchored them in a concern for the demands of practice and for the representation of a range of subject positions and voices thereby promoting high levels of practice-relevant theoretical discussion. E.g. theories of professionalism were discussed alongside, and compared with, diverse lived experiences of professionalism and debates about how to build expansive learning environments explored the dialectic between policy analysis, theories of learning and practical exigencies.

In this report it is impossible to do justice to the range, depth and complexity of all that was learned from the 49 papers presented within some 50 hours of seminar activity. Nor are we able to capture here the full range of voices and the richness of the debates and disagreements that characterised the series. Rather, in an effort to present an account that is relatively systematic, we have chosen to present a synthesis of key insights in relation to three main themes: the changing policy and social contexts of teachers’ work; the consequences of these changes for teachers’ lives and identities and for teachers’
professional practice and learning; and what might be done to enhance the professional practice of teachers.

Changing policy and social contexts of teachers’ work

Analysis of the policy and social contexts of teachers’ work at the seminars underlined the importance of applying a historical perspective to discussions about the nature of contemporary professionalism in order to avoid the perils of ‘present-dayism’. Historical reflection shed light on the ways in which teacher autonomy has long been a focus of struggle. Arguably, teachers’ autonomy reached a high point in the post-WWII period and has subsequently become increasingly eroded since the 1970s through a combination of centralised managerial forms of control and the introduction of quasi-markets in education. In all four UK jurisdictions, government has exerted increased control over the content of teachers’ work (e.g. school curriculum, research training programmes) and in England control has extended to pedagogy in some sectors. Allied to this have been new regimes of audit, quality assurance and inspection and an increased tendency towards ‘fast policy’ in which multiple policy initiatives are tumbled out simultaneously or in quick succession with limited time for debate. However, these policies and their enactments differ significantly across the four UK nations, reflecting: social and economic differences; a range of discourses about educational purposes, values and the nature of teacher professionalism; and the contrasting nature of the national policy communities, e.g. in terms of size, degree of intimacy and ideological commitments. These discussions usefully remind us that debates about globalisation and ‘policy-borrowing’ need to be conducted with sensitivity to such differences.

Feeding into the changing policy context are social changes that have important implications for the work of teachers, e.g. the emergence of a range of user and social developments around welfare and education policies and practices; forms of populism that have made the ‘voice of ordinary people’ more valued; and the rise of a culture of consumerism. Such tendencies have informed policies of marketisation and privatisation, designed to challenge ‘producer capture’ and rebalance the education system in favour of consumers or users. But these tendencies also ‘act on’ teachers as independent forces in their own right.

Consequences of these changes

These changes are having effects both on teachers’ subjectivities and on conceptions of ‘professionalism’ – e.g. the growth of ‘soft’ privatisation of schooling is reconfiguring relationships between schools/teachers and parents/students. In addition, given the highly differentiated nature of teachers’ work and of the teaching workforce (in terms of experience, age, ethnicity, gender, class, region, sector, position and role), we need to exercise caution in making generalisations about how policies are experienced by teachers. However, one important commonality is the way in which teachers continue to construct their identities against frequently oppressive gendered, classed and racialised landscapes. As well as these general points, key themes addressed were: professional autonomy; professional practice; values and ethics; teachers’ wellbeing; and professional learning.
Consequences for professional autonomy

The starting point for discussion here was the recognition that autonomy is important in teaching because teachers need to make independent judgements based on their knowledge and understanding of the unique contexts within which teaching and learning take place as well as their own educational values and beliefs. According to some contributors, highly prescriptive initiatives, like the Literacy and Numeracy Strategies in England, have curtailed teacher autonomy and positioned teachers as recipe-following operatives whose role is to ‘deliver’. However, others argued that, rather than being completely eroded, autonomy is being exercised, albeit within new parameters that are productive as well as destructive. Contributors pointed to different forms of teacher response including compliance, non-compliance and mediation with some of the mediators adopting a stance of ‘principled infidelity’.

Consequences for professional practice

Some of the contributions analysed the negative effects of recent developments – e.g. schools taking up the same or similar combinations of current learning models (like ‘multiple intelligences’) in relatively uncritical ways and rushing through the curriculum to meet targets and performance levels using a standard three- or four-part lesson ‘delivery’ format. In some cases, these analyses shed light on the ways in which changes in language (e.g. using terms like ‘providers’ and ‘users’) change the way we think about teaching and learning. Other participants argued that the indeterminate spaces generated by policy change create new opportunities for the exercise of teachers’ agency.

Consequences for professional values and ethics

A theme emerging very strongly in the series was the centrality of values and ethics to professional practice. Teaching is an activity which is grounded in values and expressive of them and teachers are active ethical agents who continually have to reconcile conflicting ethical commitments. At the same time, concerns were expressed as to how far the current policy climate provides the time, space and resources for teachers to effectively reflect on values and ethics. The introduction of markets into education has also led to concerns about the risk of ‘ethical drift’.

Consequences for teachers’ wellbeing

A number of contributors developed empirically grounded analyses of the impact of change on teachers’ emotions and other aspects of their wellbeing. There were accounts of both positive and harmful consequences for teachers, including the substantial personal costs of the combination of ‘fast’ and ‘performative’ policies. E.g. some contributors pointed to the deep levels of exhaustion reported by teachers across education sectors, with teachers continually struggling to work within what they saw as fragmented, results-driven systems. It was argued that these factors were not sufficiently taken into account by policy-makers. However, other contributors pointed to new opportunities for recognition, self-affirmation and enhanced status for teachers.
Consequences for professional learning

There was substantial discussion about the impact of new demands for professional accountability on the nature and understandings of, and opportunities for, professional learning and the enhancement of teachers' professionality. Official definitions of effectiveness in professional learning and the importance attached to measurable standards and targets were contested. E.g. emphasis on narrow conceptions of effectiveness was thought to squeeze out opportunities in initial teacher education for developing the philosophical and social scientific understandings needed to evaluate the quality and usefulness of educational research. This gap between restrictive and rich understandings of effectiveness was seen to pose particularly acute problems where the policy focus was on the use of student outcomes as criteria in evaluating professional learning. Time constraints and funding were frequently referred to as major inhibiting factors for the effective professional development of teachers and concerns were expressed that, where resources are available, these are usually tied to activities that match government or institutional priorities. Another inhibiting factor identified in the presentations was the relative lack of a tradition of fostering educational reflection or critical pedagogy in the UK compared with other countries. However, it was pointed out that these interpretations were not equally applicable across sectors or jurisdictions as evidenced by recent initiatives in Scotland (see below).

What might be done to enhance the professional practice of teachers?

Considerable emphasis was given, in the later seminars, to scholarship with the potential to enhance practice. Here we will briefly summarise these debates under four broad headings:

Creating new forms of dialogue for a revitalised education system

Participants argued for a revitalised education system in which: inclusive civic spaces are created for public debates about the aims of education and the moral bases of professional practice; all stakeholders take responsibility for helping to shape climates of policy construction and enactment; the ‘policy community’ takes notice of research; academics report findings in accessible ways (to policy-makers, teachers, academics and the wider community); and communications improve between agencies responsible for policy formulation, development and implementation.

Adopting more temperate approaches to policy-making and management

The high profile of education on the UK political agenda has increased the risk associated with policy failure. This is incurred by politicians at the macro level but borne by teachers at the micro level. The political impulse for educational change is often steered by relatively reductionist and short-term concerns, generating resentment amongst the teaching profession. ‘Fast policies’ were viewed by many participants as difficult to comprehend and implement, badly tested for feasibility, inadequately evaluated by the wrong people around the wrong questions and potentially leading to the emergence of a ‘restricted’ professionalism which leaves little time or resources for meaningful professional self-
development or growth. There was broad agreement that the more detailed the prescription, the more insensitive it becomes to contextual contingencies, and the more likely it is to fall prey to unintended consequences. Professionals need more scope to act responsibly, creatively and sensitively to context. Monitoring and accountability mechanisms need to be ‘unobtrusive’ and ‘mild’ in a policy process underpinned by dialogue and trust.

Rethinking assessment, pedagogy, curriculum and inspection

A number of contributors suggested that creating more effective professional practice needs to involve challenging some of the taken-for-granted assumptions underpinning current policy on the curriculum, pedagogy, assessment and inspection. This provides an important opportunity and challenge for policy-makers who need to be alive to what happens in other countries and prepared to revisit and adapt examples of good practice from the past. For example, the Queensland reforms involved new pedagogic and assessment practices using ‘rich tasks’ which transcended disciplinary boundaries allowing students to develop higher order thinking, depth of knowledge and understanding and ‘substantive conversation’. Such reforms entail giving teachers time and space to reflect on their classroom practices. In addition, academics and teachers who have been ‘cast out of the curriculum field’ need to be allowed to re-enter it. Finally, there were calls for a more democratic form of inspection that is less hierarchical, authoritarian and blame-led and based more on openness, dialogue, trust and collegiality.

Creating more expansive professional learning environments

Contributors identified some of the ways in which learning environments could be made more ‘expansive’. Recommendations included: calls for more collaborative, supportive and collegial institutional relationships; more cross-boundary working within and across institutions; and an explicit recognition of the centrality of professional learning. This shift would require governments to reduce the focus on restricted, pre-specified learning objectives, and to direct funds towards, for example, teacher learning through everyday working practices. As exemplified in Scotland, HE-school collaborations can contribute to: transforming local practice; greater interaction, networking and communication between groups; and the development of a more dynamic, ‘activist’ form of teacher professionalism. Professional organisations can also play a key role in establishing and supporting a community of practice which values research, and there were calls for teachers to be able to attend extended courses to allow them to debate new ideas and rethink their assumptions. As noted above, a recurrent theme was the need to resume debates over values. Such debates, participants argued, need to occupy a central place in professional learning.

2. Participation in the seminar series and user engagement

All nine seminars were well attended (with an average of 40 participants per seminar) by a wide range of participants whose feedback on content and organisation was consistently positive. The seminars included presentations given by a headteacher, a former Assistant Chief Inspector for Northern Ireland and representatives from the TDA and UNISON. In
addition to doctoral, early-career and experienced researchers, policy officers from teacher
unions and from GTCs across the UK jurisdictions regularly attended. Users participating
in the series included: Meryl Thompson (ATL), Nansi Ellis (ATL), Jacque Nunn (TDA),
Anne Jasman (GTCE), Sarah Stephens (GTCE), Emma Westcott (GTCE), Rosa Murray
(GTCS), Tom Hamilton (GTCS), Rebecca Rylatt (DfES), Patrick Roach (NASUWT), Ross
Hendry (UNISON), Erica Pienaar (Prendergast School), Vivian McIver (former Assistant
Chief Inspector for Northern Ireland), Indra Dewan (Highgate Woods School) and Sarah
Tough (IPPR). The annotated bibliography, which has been widely disseminated (see
below), was designed for user groups as well as students and academic researchers.

3. The development of research capacity

The seminars, constructed around research-based presentations and discussion groups,
contributed to research capacity building by enabling leading national and international
researchers, early-career researchers and research students to share perspectives,
experiences and expertise in relation to contemporary analyses of teaching and learning.
The format of the seminars, in particular the generous time allocated for discussion, and
the broad mix of disciplinary perspectives and participants, facilitated vibrant and
analytically productive discussions in which experiential and empirical evidence was used to
interrogate theory and vice versa. These discussions thus provided opportunities for
participants to reflect on and think across broadly critical and problem-solving research
perspectives. Methodological discussions were rich and contributed to the professional
development of the project team and, we hope, all seminar participants.

4. Dissemination

In the initial weeks of the project we established a project website
(http://www.tlrp.org/themes/seminar/gewirtz/) which included full details of the seminar
programme. After each seminar, abstracts, summaries of discussions, and all submitted
papers were posted on the website.

An annotated bibliography has been compiled. Consisting of annotations to 100 scholarly
texts published since January 2000, the bibliography is designed to enable practitioners,
researchers and user organisations to access the latest research about teachers’ lives and
professional practices. It also includes an annex summarising the history of research on
teachers’ work and professionalism. The format of, and inclusion criteria for, the annotated
bibliography were determined in the first year of the series through an iterative process in
which a range of different searches were compared. Among the main sources we used to
generate the references (in addition to the British Education Index and the Social Sciences
Citation Index) were the generous suggestions made by speakers at the seminars, each of
whom was asked to nominate their ‘top ten’ references in the field. In addition, we
included key references cited in the seminar paper contributions. The bibliography - which
was published and made available on the C-TRIP website in March 2007 with CD-ROM
versions available on request - has been widely disseminated via TLRP, British Educational
Research Association (BERA), European Educational Research Association (EERA),

C-TRIP Research Report 23
University Council for the Education of Teachers (UCET) and King’s mailing lists.

We have developed a detailed proposal for an edited collection, based on a selection of the papers presented at the seminars and amended as requested by the publisher, which is currently being reviewed by Routledge (see Annex 2).

In addition to the above outputs, which we had signalled in our initial proposal for funding, the project team also produced five conference papers (see Activities and Outputs sections, below). Some of these sought to synthesise the key substantive themes of the series whilst others were concerned to critically engage with – and advance thinking on - the key methodological issue of working across the critical/problem-solving divide.

Activities

A condition of the award was that the project team should engage with other TLRP projects. Engagement with TLRP projects was achieved before, during and after the series. As noted above, a review of TLRP studies was used to inform the design of the series and approximately one third of the papers presented at the seminars were based on TLRP research. Three of the six speakers at Seminar 9 and three of the four advisory group members were TLRP award holders. A poster was presented at the TLRP Annual Conference in Cardiff (2004) and papers were presented at the TLRP Annual Conferences in Warwick (2005) and Glasgow (2006) in addition to papers presented at the BERA and EERA Annual Conferences in 2006.

The C-TRIP series informed the establishment of the Teacher Education Reference Group (TERG). TERG will contribute to TLRP’s capacity building project by producing resources on research methods and a bibliography on teacher education, including texts on researching teacher education. This is being funded by the TLRP, BERA, ESCalate and UCET. In addition, a new TLRP seminar series, ‘Learning to teach in post-devolution UK’ builds on C-TRIP, developing the comparative theme raised in Seminar 6.

Outputs

Here we list the details of the project team’s publications arising from the seminar series. Details of all seminar papers are available on the C-TRIP website (http://www.tlrp.org/themes/seminar/gewirtz/).

Conference papers:


Impacts

In evaluations conducted after seminars participants reported that the sessions promoted reflection-on-practice and were useful as well as intellectually stimulating. Moreover, feedback from users over the course of the series was consistently enthusiastic and included considerable anecdotal evidence of ideas and insights from the series feeding into discussions in a range of communities of practice. See section on Dissemination, above, for a list of users involved in the series. Widespread dissemination of the annotated bibliography by, e.g., TLRP, UCET and BERA, indicate that C-TRIP is achieving high impact with this output. Within the first twelve weeks of publication, the bibliography was downloaded 1147 times from the TLRP website alone.

Future Research Priorities

Given the breadth of the series, and the substantial number of projects represented, it is perhaps unsurprising that many priorities for further research were identified. However, we would want to single out the following as particularly important:
• Given the current policy emphasis on mechanisms for effecting change and the comparative neglect of questions of purposes and values, the series has drawn attention to an urgent need for research that can support analyses of values, help resume debates about values and explore ways of making these debates central to the professional learning of teachers.

• Linked to the above, there is a need to research new ways of supporting teachers and other policy stakeholders to reflect on, and possibly rethink, taken-for-granted approaches to curriculum, pedagogy, assessment and inspection.

• The series also pointed to the need for further research on the characteristics of, and means of developing, expansive professional learning environments which allow teachers to engage in collaborative, extended and intellectually rich learning.
Annex 1

ESRC Teaching and Learning Research Programme:

Changing Teacher Roles, Identities and Professionalism (C-TRIP)
Seminar Programme

An indication of the themes, topics and timing of each of the nine seminars proposed is set out below. These themes have been generated from our preliminary review of TLRP projects and non-TLRP research; and they are subject to change in the light of our ongoing review of TLRP and non-TLRP research. Seminars 1-4 draw on critical policy, sociological and philosophical analysis and organisational theory to explore how teachers’ roles and identities and conceptions of professionalism are constructed in the interactions between teachers as active socially differentiated agents and the political, institutional, emotional and social contexts within which they operate. These seminars will consist of contributions which look across the phases of education mainly within the four national UK systems. Seminars 5 and 6 will go on to examine what can be learnt from recent research relating to: professions other than teaching and cross-national comparative study. Insights from material presented in Seminars 1-6 will then be used to inform Seminars 7 and 8 on models of effective professional learning and the relationship between research and professional practice. A final seminar will be arranged which will consist of contributions from a selection of core participants and other leading figures who will be asked to reflect on and help to consolidate the empirical and theoretical contribution of the series to the understanding and development of teachers’ professional learning and practice.

Each seminar will be a whole day event and will normally consist of five or six papers designed to stimulate reflection and discussion on the sub theme. Clusters of papers will be followed by 10 minute responses and by plenary discussion. At the end of each day time will be devoted to structured discussions in small groups, informed by – and building on – the day’s seminar papers, followed by a plenary/panel session to reflect on and consolidate the work of the day.

Seminar 1. Identity, agency and policy in teachers’ professional lives (Jan. 20th 2005)
This seminar will explore the changing policy context of teachers’ work and how teachers actively construct their identities in relation to this changing context.

Pat Mahony: Welcome and introduction to the series
Kevin Brehony: The changing role of teachers: a historical account
Helen Gunter: Remodelling the school workforce: challenges in the formation and fracturing of roles and identities
Gert Biesta: The role of educational ideals in teachers’ professional work

Gemma Moss: The impact of literacy policy and performance pedagogies on primary schoolteacher identities

Denis Gleeson: The making and taking of professionalism in the further education workplace

Seminar 2 Professional identities and teacher careers (Mar. 15th 2005)
This seminar will examine recent changes in teachers’ attitudes to teaching as a career, the shifting nature of teachers’ professional identities over the course of their careers, the key career moments that shape professional identity, and the gendered and racialised nature of identity construction over the career course.

Elizabeth Burn: “Working with the ankle biters”: constructing the male Early Years teacher

Lorna Roberts: Racialized identities in Initial Teacher Training

Dona Daly & Meg Maguire: Becoming a Black Manager

Pat Sikes: Working in a ‘new’ university: in the shadow of the RAE?

Chris Day: Conceptualising the role of identity in variations in teachers’ work, lives and effectiveness

Seminar 3 Conceptions of professionalism and professional knowledge (May 16th 2005)
This seminar will consider the contested concepts of professionalism and professional knowledge, the diverse ways in which they are conceptualised by teachers and the implications of workforce remodeling and new roles in schools for conceptions of professionalism and professional knowledge.

Chris Winch & Lorraine Foreman-Peck: What do we mean by teachers’ professionalism and professional knowledge? How useful are these concepts?

Helen Colley & David James: Un-becoming tutors: towards a dynamic notion of professional participation
Judyth Sachs: *Activist teachers: a professional responsibility for a responsible profession*

Jon Nixon: *Good Teachers? The integrity of academic practice*

Jacquie Nunn: *Remodelling the workforce: implications for teacher expertise and professional preparation*

Michael Young: *The assault on professional knowledge*

---

**Seminar 4. Enactments of professionalism: classrooms and pedagogies (Jul. 5th 2005)**

Here the focus will be on how conceptions of professionalism are played out in schools and classrooms and how teachers’ and leaders’ conceptions of professionalism influence and are influenced by classroom practices, relationships and student experiences.

Hiroko Fumoto: *Making professional identities through relationships between teachers and learners in early years settings*

Bob Lingard: *Productive schooling and productive pedagogues: lessons from one Australian research study*

John MacBeath: *Supporting innovative pedagogies: the role of school leadership*

Mike Wallace: *Towards effective management of a reformed teaching profession*

Alan Smith: *The role of teachers in integrated school environments in Northern Ireland*

Jenny Reeves: *Inventing the Chartered Teacher: exploring the fractures opened in schools and authorities by enacting a ‘new professionalism’*
Seminar 5. What can be learnt from other professions? (Oct. 19th 2005)
This seminar will consider recent research on professional identities, knowledge and constructions of professionalism in professions other than teaching and explore its implications for understanding teachers’ work.

Michael Eraut: *What can be learnt from a range of professions about professional knowledge and learning that is relevant to teachers’ learning?*

Alan Cribb: *Education and health: professional roles and the division of ethical labour*

Janet Newman & John Clarke: *The rise of the citizen-consumer: implications for public service professionalism*

Ross Hendry: *Workforce remodelling in the public services: a union perspective*

Julia Evetts: *The management of professionalism: a contemporary paradox*

This seminar will consider the insights that cross-national comparison can offer understandings of changing teacher roles and identities in UK contexts.

Ken Jones: *Peculiarities of the English? International policy orthodoxy and ‘national cultures’ of teaching*

Clive Harber: *Teacher Roles, Identities and Professionalism: lessons from the comparative study of Africa*

Agnes van Zanten: *The new generation of teachers in France: views on professionalism in a changing policy context*

Ian Menter: *Tradition, culture and identity in the reform of teachers' work in Scotland and England*

Jo-Anne Dillabough: *Symbols of Domesticity and the Work of Women Teachers in Global Times*
Seminar 7. Models of effective professional learning (Feb. 21st 2006)
This seminar will explore how professional learning can best be promoted within the various political, organisational, social and emotional contexts within which teachers work.

Heather Hodkinson: Improving schoolteachers professional learning: workplace practices and cultures, organisational structures and government policy

Mary James & Robert McCormick: How can networks support the professional learning of teachers?

Harry Daniels & Anne Edwards: Learning new ways of working for inter-professional collaboration

Paul Black: Making teacher change happen

Mike Askew & Jeremy Hodgen: Relationships with/in primary mathematics: learning and working with primary teachers

Seminar 8. The impact of research on professional practice and identity (Apr. 26th 2006)
This seminar will consider the range of ways in which research can be used to influence teachers’ practice and their students’ learning. Proposed topics include:

Mark Goodrham: Using research to enhance professionalism in further education: what conditions of labour are conducive to practitioner research?

Jonathan Osborne: Science education practitioners’ views on research and its influence on their practice

John Elliott: Research-based teaching

Jim McNally: Loose threads of research in a ‘seamless garment of professional development’

Geoff Troman: Dissemination or Dissimulation? Issues in reporting ethnographic research findings to participant ‘user’ groups
For the final seminar, speakers have been invited to reflect on what has been achieved by the series, what other work in the area needs to be done and on possible implications for policy and practice. The morning is designed to enable reflection on the lessons of the seminar series. It will begin with a paper from the project team which will pull together some of the threads of the series. This will be followed by three responses from colleagues representing a range of national professional and personal perspectives which will include critical reflection on what they think might have been missed by the series as well as on what has been achieved. In the afternoon we will address the question, 'What next?' Here speakers are invited to look forwards and present their ideas on the future of research and/or policy and practice in relation to the themes of changing teacher roles, identities and professionalism.

Morning: Pulling together the threads
With contributions from Sharon Gewirtz, Pat Mahony, Ian Hextall & Alan Cribb, Ivor Goodson, Vivian McIver and Jane Salisbury.

Afternoon: What next?
With contributions from Erica Pienaar, Geoff Whitty and Mary James.
EXTRACTS FROM BOOK PROPOSAL

Title: Changing Teacher Professionalism
Editors: Sharon Gewirtz, Pat Mahony, Ian Hextall and Alan Cribb
Series/discipline: The proposed book is a product of the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC)’s Teaching and Learning Research Programme (TLRP) and reflects the TLRP's core aim of ‘performing and promoting excellent educational research and ensuring that it is used to enhance learning’ …

RATIONALE
The aim of this collection is to make a substantial contribution to understanding the changing nature of teacher professionalism. This is a topic of major contemporary social, political and practical importance and we believe that the work represented in this book makes a unique and internationally relevant contribution to understanding both how change is impacting on teaching and how teachers might change their practice for the better …

Over the past thirty years or so there have been significant changes in the policy and social context of teaching that have had substantial implications for [teacher] professionalism. This period has seen both an increase in central regulation of the work of teachers and an increased role for quasi-markets centred on the ideas of choice and competition. As the influence of these alternative modes of coordination has increased, so the scope for professional influence on policy and practice has diminished. However, as well as facing demands that stem from state regulation and competition, teachers have also had to respond to a range of other demands stemming from broader social changes. …

This book is based on the premise that in order to understand and construct policy responses to these changes in teacher professionalism it is necessary to bring together and draw out the complementarities between three broad approaches to research on this theme. The proposed book takes on this synthesising task and thus represents a unique and ground-breaking collection of work by leading figures in the field.

The first approach, which draws on various combinations of historical, critical policy, sociological and philosophical analysis, is concerned to examine the changing political and social context of public-sector professional work and practice. Those working in this tradition are concerned to map and analyse changes in the policy, social and ethical climate that public-sector professionals have to confront. …

The second – largely sociological - approach is concerned to understand the working lives and lived experiences of teachers, including the ways in which teachers’ work and their roles and identities are constructed within particular political and social contexts. …

The third approach is concerned to explore how things might be different, in particular how teachers’ professional practices might be enhanced. This approach draws on and combines a wide range of disciplines and research methods. These include intervention studies, involving experimentation with different approaches to teacher development, and philosophical and critical analysis of the qualities that make up good teaching and the political and organisational conditions that are most conducive to enhancing teachers’ practice.

The way the book is structured will make evident to readers the importance and power of bringing these three research approaches together, and the first chapter will serve to underline this further and to illuminate in some detail the continuities and complementarities amongst the three approaches and the value of combining them.

READERSHIP
The book includes a number of authors whose work in relation to teacher professionalism has been ground breaking. Therefore, we would expect the book to attract a wide readership drawn from all sections of the education community and from the wider fields of social and public policy and the sociology of the professions.
Although several of the chapters draw upon empirical research conducted in the UK, the book has an international appeal both because of its focus on policy contexts whose features are shared across the advanced economies, and because it explores specific differences between countries that are used to illuminate general issues relating to changing teacher roles, identities and professionalism. Specifically, the book’s treatment of the international dimension of teachers’ work is achieved through: a) the contributions to Part 1 of the book on the policy context looking beyond and/or across specific national settings; b) the contributions to Parts 2 and 3 of the book drawing on research conducted in a range of national settings – i.e. Australia, China, England, the Netherlands, Scotland and the US - and drawing out theoretical and practical implications which have broader international relevance; and c) featuring a preface by Professor Michael Apple, an internationally distinguished US theorist who will highlight the global relevance of the themes the book considers.

In our view three factors underpin the book’s broad appeal. First, it gathers together in one place a range of perspectives and issues around teacher professionalism and changing professional practice; second, it will be perceived as capturing the major debates around these concepts at a time of radical restructuring; and third it will be seen as representing the very latest work within a substantial literature on professionalism.

We envisage the book being used by a wide range of education academics and we also envisage that students on initial teacher training, undergraduate, Masters and doctoral programmes, many of which contain modules on professionalism, will find this collection very useful. There is a substantial body of scholars engaged in the study of education. International education research associations, for example, the American Educational Research Association (AERA), the European Educational Research Association and the Australian Association for Research in Education, each have thousands of members with the AERA alone having 25,000 members. The themes of the book are fundamental to many of the special interest groups and divisions within these associations. For example, they relate to more than half of the divisions in the AERA (specifically: Administration, Organization and Leadership; Learning and Instruction; Social Context of Education; Education in the Professions; Teaching and Teacher Education; Education Policy and Politics; and Post-Secondary Education). There is an even more substantial body of students engaged in the study of Education. Within the UK alone, most of the 80 University Departments of Education offer the full range of courses from Foundation degrees, through Masters and EdD, to PhD (Universities’ Council for the Education of Teachers’ 2006 Annual Report). As well as the research associations mentioned above, there are a number of professional groups, scholarly societies, and other organisations who would have a particular interest in the book including teacher unions and professional associations, the General Teaching Councils, the national and international sociological and social policy associations and policy makers. …

SYNOPSIS

The book will consist of a Preface by Michael Apple … and a substantial introduction by the editors followed by three parts, each of which represents work related to one of the three approaches outlined above. We envisage a total length of approximately 220 printed pages.

Preface

Michael Apple

Chapter 1 Policies, professionalism and practices: understanding and enhancing teachers’ work Sharon Gewirtz, Pat Mahony, Alan Cribb and Ian Hextall

This introductory chapter sets out the scope and rationale of the book. The authors begin by outlining the three broad approaches to research on teacher professionalism that the book brings together and around which it is structured - research on the changing political and social context of public-sector professional work and practice, research on the working lives and lived experiences of teachers, and research on how teachers’ professional practices might be enhanced. They go on to explain why it is important to see these three approaches as complementary, arguing that if research is going to be helpful in improving professional learning and the quality of teachers’ practice, the full
potential of all three approaches needs to be brought to bear on these issues. The chapter concludes by showing how the key themes of the book are developed in the chapters that follow.

Part 1  The changing context of professionalism

Chapter 2  The management of professionalism: a contemporary paradox  Julia Evetts

The concepts of profession and ‘professionalism’ are increasingly applied to work and workers in modern societies. Yet the conditions of trust, discretion and competence, which historically have been deemed to be necessary for professional practice, are continually being challenged, changed or ‘regulated’. This represents a contemporary dilemma or paradox which it is important to address and try to clarify. The chapter argues for a change in focus of analysis away from the concepts of profession (as a distinct and generic category of occupational work) and professionalisation (as the process to pursue and maintain occupational closure) and instead a return to the concept of professionalism. …

Chapter 3  Professional roles and the division of ethical labour  Alan Cribb

In this chapter Alan Cribb asks how the domain of professional ethics is constructed through the division of labour and explores the ways in which aspects of policy change have reconstructed the division of ethical labour in education and health care. … In particular, the chapter illustrates and asks questions about the fact that values and ethics are embodied in, and not merely enacted within, professional and occupational roles. In other words, it addresses questions about the ways in which different occupational roles produce different ethical spaces and positions for individuals to occupy. The chapter thus invites teachers and other professionals to question whether, when and why ‘doing my job’ is the same as ‘doing the right thing’.

Chapter 4  The rise of the citizen-consumer: implications for public service professionalism  John Clarke and Janet Newman

In this chapter Clarke and Newman examine the rise of the hybridised figure of the citizen-consumer and its significance for public service reform. The idea of citizens as consumers can be located in a set of transnational political and policy tendencies: the linked rise of marketisation, privatisation and managerialisation sometimes described as neo-liberalism. Clarke and Newman trace some of these international dynamics and their connections to the New Labour programme of reform in the UK. … The authors then consider some of the implications of this consumerist turn for service providers. In particular, they are interested in the intersections between consumerism and public service managerialism, given the increasing salience of managerialism for the occupational and organisational institutionalisations of public service professionalism. They draw on examples from a recent ESRC-funded study …

Chapter 5  Peculiarities of the English? International policy orthodoxy and ‘national cultures’ of teaching  Ken Jones

Post-1945 educational cultures in England are internally more diverse than those of Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland: radical and conservative elements are alike accentuated. These cultures have shaped, and been shaped by, the practices of teachers – both at the level of organised trade union activity and at that of the associational practice that has contributed to curricular and pedagogic change. International policy orthodoxy – ‘travelling policy’ – seeks to remake both the work of teachers and the social relationships characteristic of wider professional activity. But orthodoxy is not, as it were, inscribed on blank and receptive surfaces: it is modulated by local circumstance, and takes different forms in different places. The chapter explores the varying modulations of teacher-related
policy orthodoxy in British context(s). In doing so, it intends – through comparison with Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland – to establish the specificities of the embedded cultures of teaching in England, and of the ways in which they have been subject to policy-directed change.

Part 2  Living professionalism

Chapter 6  Neo-liberal reform and teachers’ work: the case of Chicago  Pauline Lipman
This chapter explores the changing social, economic, cultural and education policy contexts of ‘metro region’ education in the US and their implications for teachers’ work and teacher professionalism. Using the city of Chicago as a paradigmatic case of neo-liberal reform, Lipman draws on qualitative data to show how globalisation processes, increasing social inequality and education reforms that are informed by a corporate rationality and that emphasise high stakes standardised testing, markets, competition and the privatisation of provision transform teachers’ work in complex ways. … The analysis in this chapter … indicates the possibilities for agency within what the author sees as an overall retrograde erosion of Chicago’s public schools.

Chapter 7  Pedagogising teacher professional identities: beyond care  Bob Lingard
In this chapter Lingard argues that the nature of pedagogical practices is one contributory factor which helps define teacher professional identities. Drawing on a large empirical study on pedagogies conducted in Queensland, Australia, the chapter demonstrates the caring nature of teacher pedagogies found in the research classrooms and at the same time the failure of these pedagogies to deal with differences of various kinds, to connect classroom practices to the world beyond the classroom, and to make substantial intellectual demands upon students. These findings are interrogated in terms of changing policy frames, their logics and effects, the gendered nature of policy production and the gendered nature of the teaching profession. Implications are also drawn for a positive thesis about pedagogies and teacher identities, which accepts care as a necessary but not sufficient condition for a progressive teacher professionalism.

Chapter 8  Becoming a black manager  Dona Daley and Meg Maguire
This chapter explores the professional experiences of a cohort of thirty African-Caribbean managers in the British education system set against and alongside the shifts in the social and political arena as well as in educational policy and practice over the last thirty years. The chapter will focus on two main themes. First, the 'choices' and progression of these teachers will be explored and it will be argued that these teachers' career decisions are not so much self-made but contextually and structurally informed. Second, the chapter will argue that, over time, three distinct cohorts of black managers can be identified: the 'pioneers' who arrived in the UK in the mid to late 1950s; the 'settlers', some of whom may have been pupils of the pioneers; and the 'inheritors' who took up posts after 1988. …

Chapter 9  Inventing the Chartered Teacher: a clash of professionalities?  Jenny Reeves
This chapter explores the effects of enacting a more activist and collaborative model of teacher professionalism … The McCrone Agreement, *A Teaching Profession for the 21st Century*…, introduced new pay and working conditions for teachers in Scotland. As part of re-structuring the profession, it created the status of ‘Chartered Teacher’ to enable excellent classroom practitioners to earn a higher salary without having to move into a management post. … This chapter looks at some of the conceptual and practical difficulties faced by teachers and their tutors on one of the accredited Chartered Teacher programmes as they try to enact this new ‘status’. It argues that those with an interest in the professional development of teachers need an understanding of the complex systemic and political aspects of changing practice in schools and to position themselves as knowing agents in this process.
Chapter 10 On the making and taking of professionalism in the further education workplace

Denis Gleeson

This chapter examines the changing nature of professional practice in English Further Education. It draws on findings from the ESRC/TLRP project 'Transforming Learning Cultures in Further Education' (2001-2005). At a time when neo-liberal reform has significantly impacted on this 'invisible', under researched and over market-tested sector, little is known about who its practitioners are and how they construct meaning in their work. Sociological interest in the field has tended to focus on FE practitioners as either the subjects of market and managerial reform or as creative agents operating in the spaces and contradictions of audit, managerial and inspection cultures. In challenging such dualism, which is reflective of wider sociological thinking, the chapter examines the ways in which agency and structure combine to produce a more transformative conception of the FE professional. …
Chapter 11 Working in a ‘new’ university: pressures and possibilities, identity and culture
Pat Sikes

What is it like to be an academic working in a ‘new’, post-1992 university in the 2000s? There is no one commonly applicable answer since so much depends upon specific contexts and individual biographies. … This chapter explores the work-related perceptions and experiences of a group of staff working in a UK School of Education at a ‘new’ university with a view to gaining some sense of their understanding of what it means to be an academic. These people who had, initially, been hired essentially as teachers, were facing increased demands to become ‘research active’ in order to enable their institution to compete in the national Research Assessment Exercise. Not only did these demands lead to increased workloads, they also had implications for professional and personal identities and, consequently, for how people felt about, and enacted, their work.

Part 3 Enhancing professionalism

Chapter 12 Making teacher change happen
Paul Black

The chapter describes two very different initiatives for teachers’ professional development in which the author was personally involved, and discusses the contrasts between them. The first, dating from 1968 to 1972, was a Nuffield project to develop a radically new course for A-level physics. … This was professional learning, motivated by subject commitment, and implemented by a top-down and expertly designed systemic provision. The project drew upon and made use of materials from two major US projects, and the chapter will discuss the subsequent adoption and influence of the Nuffield and the US initiative in the light of the different national contexts. The second, dating from 1999 to 2002, was a collaborative project, between King’s College London and two local authorities … to develop formative assessment with 48 teachers in six schools. The project aim was to see if broadly-based research evidence could encourage change in teachers’ pedagogy. … Quotation from teachers’ own writing illustrates our success in developing pedagogy through provocation and support, leading to knowledge creation by teachers. A related project, developed by a group at Stanford University in collaboration with King’s, has shown how the same ideas were explored in the context of teachers in California, and wider adoption in the US has exposed problems of superficial adoption which will be compared with similar problems of dissemination in the UK.

Chapter 13 Improving schoolteachers’ professional learning: workplace practices and cultures, organisational structures and government policy
Heather Hodkinson and Phil Hodkinson

This chapter is based mainly on findings from research for the ESRC/TLRP conducted between 2000 and 2003. The project was looking at the learning of secondary school teachers, as part of a network of five projects investigating workplace learning in different settings. Insights from workplace learning literature and from the findings of the other projects in the network allowed the authors to gain a wider perspective on teacher learning, extending the understandings of the teacher development literature. They identified several dimensions which interact to influence the nature of teachers’ learning. The most significant of these are the dispositions of the individual teachers, the practices and cultures of the subject departments they work in, and the management and regulatory frameworks at local and national policy levels. In this chapter, Hodkinson and Hodkinson argue that policy approaches to teacher development in the UK at the time were over-focussed on measurable learning outcomes, short-term gains, and priorities external to the teachers. They also sought to impose a counterproductive uniform approach. The findings reported in this chapter suggest that instead teacher learning is best improved through a strategy that both increases learning opportunities (in terms of number and scope), and increases the likelihood that teachers will want to take up those opportunities.
Chapter 14  Research-based teaching  

This chapter begins by examining the abortive ‘teachers-as-researchers’ movement in the US during the 1950s. The US notion of research-based teaching viewed teachers as the handmaidens of a positivistic social science whose task was to practically validate findings cast in the form of means-ends rules. It was therefore shaped by an instrumentalist and objectivist rationality that gave teachers little space in which to reflect about educational aims and values. … In contrast, the UK version of research-based teaching, inspired by the work of Stenhouse, emerged independently of the methodological discourses of social science. It embraced a more pragmatic, deliberative and democratic rationality. … Within the prevailing policy context of education in the UK and US, research-based teaching has become increasingly viewed as small-scale research that at best tests the validity of the findings of larger scale ‘scientific’ inquiry. However, Stenhouse’s notion of research-based teaching has spread to countries where curriculum reform policies are shaped by conceptions of the aims of education that are not simply reducible to the economic purposes that education may serve and where the teachers are viewed as the primary agents of change. The author provides examples from an international curriculum development network in the field of environmental education that has been operating in OECD countries since the late 1980s, and from countries in the Asian Pacific region, particularly Hong Kong. The chapter shows through its international examples how Stenhouse’s model has been reinterpreted and adapted to accommodate different national and cultural contexts.

Chapter 15  The role of educational ideals in teachers’ professional work  

… In this chapter, Biesta explores a particular dimension of teachers’ professional judgement, focusing on the role of educational ideals, i.e., ideas about good learning, good teaching, worthwhile education, etc. Such ideals play an important role in the work of teachers. … The chapter is based on findings from an action research project conducted in the Netherlands … The overall aim of the project was to support teachers in making their educational ideals more explicit in order to enhance the normative dimensions of their professional judgement and action. … The project not only revealed particular ways in which teachers can enhance the normative dimension of their professional judgement and action, but also provided a much better understanding of the conditions which enable, hinder or even obstruct this. This chapter argues for the importance of including the normative dimension in our understanding of what it means to be an educational professional. The discussion of this particular project also raises questions about the extent to which national educational policies and a particular professional ‘culture’ impact on the opportunities for teachers to include normative issues in their thinking and doing.

Chapter 16  Good teachers? The integrity of academic practice  

This chapter focuses primarily on teachers operating within the higher education sector. It argues that universities need to reclaim a public and inclusive language for education that reflects the moral ends and purposes of academic practice. It claims that there are certain moral goods implicit in the activities - of research, scholarship and teaching – that comprise such practice; and it defines these goods in terms of virtuous dispositions towards truthfulness, respect and authenticity. The moral conditions of academic reconstruction necessarily include a commitment by academic practitioners to the development, in themselves and others, of these goods of learning.

Chapter 17  Towards effective management of a reformed teaching profession  

A normative argument will be developed advocating a more temperate approach towards leading and managing the teaching profession - and so more temperate policy-making and implementation - than has prevailed for decades. This argument will be framed by an ironic perspective applied to professional and managerial practice and change. It offers one way to harness the mutually informing potential of ideas and evidence derived from partially incompatible intellectual projects: producing ‘knowledge-for-understanding’ through organisation theory; focusing on professional learning to
develop ‘knowledge-for-action’; and sociological studies of teachers’ workplace learning towards ‘knowledge-for-critical evaluation’. This stance points to unintended ironies of managerialism - excessive leadership and management - which threaten to become self-serving rather than serving education, inhibit professional practice to make reforms work in contingent circumstances, and stimulate their covert mediation. But the stance draws on professional learning and organisation theory in suggesting how leaders, managers and policy-makers could do better. …