ORGAN DONATION DAY 2016
THE ETHICS OF ORGAN DONATION

Dr Ruth Bromley
Lead for Ethics and Law
Manchester Medical School
Would you...?

...give a friend a pint of your blood?
...give a relative part of your liver?
...give a complete stranger one of your kidneys?
...give bone marrow to a child with leukaemia?
...give your heart to someone after you die?

With thanks to Graham Brushett from www.dteg.org
Today, we will mostly be...

discussing the ethical complexities of blood & organ donation
Questions...Questions

Are we inherently altruistic?

Is altruism a desirable aspiration?

Should we endeavour to give blood?

Are we obliged to donate our organs after death?

Should we be allowed an organ if we aren’t ultimately prepared to donate our own?

Should donation be opt-in or opt-out?

Should families be able to consent on a patient’s behalf, or over-ride their preferences?

Should we have ‘elective ventilation’ where patients are kept alive when the only motivation for this is to harvest their organs?

Is it the state’s responsibility to legislate for patient choice?

What would be the ‘best fit’ solution to the current shortage of blood and organs for donation?
In 2008 a 21 year old, Laura Ashworth, requested a controversial direct donation to her mother Rachel Leake who was receiving dialysis for end stage renal failure. Laura tragically died from an asthma attack before plans for the donation could take place. As she was registered on the donor register, her organs were taken and transplanted into two strangers, following her death. The matter was referred to the Human Tissue Authority which issued a statement confirming the decision.

Rachel Leake very sadly subsequently died.

The outcry created a catalyst for the policy document “Requested Allocation of a Deceased Donor Organ” March 2010. The policy document still enforces unconditional donation but allows discretionary exemptions in specific circumstances such as the death of a potential living donor or where the organ might benefit a family member or friend. The policy also calls for it to be clearly communicated that deceased donations are unconditional, and allows greater decision-making powers to the NHS Blood & Transplant Authority.
We are NHS Blood and Transplant. We stand for hope. We stand for life. We stand for helping ordinary people to do something extraordinary, save and improve the lives of others.

As an essential part of the NHS we take pride in playing our part to make the most of absolutely every donation - from blood and organs to tissues and stem cells.

NHSBT Careers

NHSBT Careers - Saving Lives Together

Looking for a rewarding role in an impressive organisation? Join NHS Blood and Transplant and discover real job satisfaction. We can save lives together.

Information for Patients

Information for Patients

Blood Transfusion and Therapeutic Apheresis Services

Platelet Donation

Read Our Corporate Blog

Read our blog with latest news and views from the CEO and colleagues, blood and organ donation and developments within the organisation.

http://www.nhsbt.nhs.uk/
Ada Litmanen

Ada has a renal transplant five years later. Ada reflects after she has had her renal transplant, and says to a friend:

“now that I have had my kidney transplant, I feel guilty that I was never on the organ donor register.”
Sarah’s dad was a blood donor. However, it was when her brother needed to have a blood transfusion that Sarah (18) decided to give blood.

Sarah was well known for helping people and, prompted by an advert in the Student Union, she went to a Blood Donor drive.
Based on 2013 data...

• There were 193 people waiting for heart transplants in the UK, including 17 children
• There were 19 people on the register waiting for a heart and lung transplant
• In 2012, 101 transplants were carried out
• On average 15 in every 100 patients die while on the waiting list for a heart transplant
• Although waiting times vary hugely, heart patients wait on average 253 days for a transplant

Myths

You do not take on the characteristics of your donor. Such stories have included:

• A man in Leicester claimed he gained a love of baking, shopping and dogs (an animal he previously did not like) after receiving a kidney from his wife
• A woman from Lancashire claimed her literary tastes changed radically after a kidney transplant, swapping celebrity biographies for Crime and Punishment
• An American man was suddenly able to paint after receiving the heart of an artistic young man killed in a car crash

Some of the oldest organ donors have been:

- Pancreas – 64
- Heart – 65
- Lung – 68
- Kidney living - 83
- Kidney deceased – 85
- Liver - 85
- Cornea - 104

Transplants and donors in numbers (2013)

The total number of people on the Organ Donor Register is 19,320,264
Up to 1,000 people die every year due to a shortage of organs for transplant, that is 3 people every day
There are currently 7,410 people on the national waiting list for an organ transplant
There are currently 139 children on the national waiting list for an organ transplant
Last year only 3,068 organ transplants were carried out in UK hospitals
Although 90% of people say they support organ donation, just 30% of the UK population are on the NHS Organ Donor Register
Each year 500,000 people die in the UK, but only 3,500 die in circumstances where they can donate
In 2011-12 A total of 125 families overruled the wishes of someone on the organ donation register
You are more likely to need a transplant than become a donor
More women (54%) than men (46%) have signed up on the NHS Organ Donor Register
(SOURCE: NHS BLOOD & TRANSPLANT)

Organ donor rate worldwide
Selected countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Rate per million population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N Ireland</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wales</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

IRODaT 2014 and NHS Blood and Transplant 2014/15

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-wales-34932951
81. If a patient is close to death and their views cannot be determined, you should be prepared to explore with those close to them whether they had expressed any views about organ or tissue donation, if donation is likely to be a possibility.

82. You should follow any national procedures for identifying potential organ donors and, in appropriate cases, for notifying the local transplant coordinator. You must take account of the requirements in relevant legislation and in any supporting codes of practice, in any discussions that you have with the patient or those close to them. You should make clear that any decision about whether the patient would be a suitable candidate for donation would be made by the transplant coordinator or team, and not by you and the team providing treatment.
Whose body is it?
Do people have the right to decide what shall be done with their body after they are dead?

[Do people have the right to donate their organs to save lives?]

Organ Donation and Retrieval: Whose Body is it anyway?
From Bioethics an Anthology (Blackwell)
Eike-Henner W. Kluge
Think...

...Autonomy

...Informed Consent

...Mental Capacity Act
The Law: Human Tissue Act 2004

Living versus Cadaver

Risk to Donors
Child Donors who can consent (court approval)

Patients who can’t consent
Pre-Human Tissue Act

Re Y

Connell J granted lawful donation of bone marrow from severely disabled 25yo woman to her 36yo sister was dying from leukaemia

See...Medicine, Patients & the Law Margaret Brazier & Emma Cave 6th edition (p527)
HUMAN TISSUE ACT 2004

• Any adult or child aged 12 and over, who is able to make their own decisions, can give permission for their organs or tissue to be donated.

• If you want to donate organs or tissue, this will be done in preference to any other requests which are made, for example leaving your body to medical science.

• A person’s own decision is the most important thing. A relative does not have the right to change this decision after the person has died.

• Children under the age of 12 cannot give permission themselves. For a child under the age of 12, only their parent or guardian can give permission.

www.organdonationscotland.org/uk-transplant-laws
So where (& why) do families fit in?
Proxy Consent Hierarchy

1. Spouse or partner
2. Parent or Child
3. Sibling
4. Grandparent or Grandchild
5. Nephews or Nieces
6. Step-parents
7. Half-siblings
8. Friend of long-standing
Defining Death


Heart vs Brain Death
Heart-beating versus non-beating donors
Use of ventilation

The Coroner
Religion

Faith leaders
Definition of death

For more info...https://organdonation.nhs.uk//about-donation/what-does-my-religion-say/
To PAY or not to PAY?

How much would you need to be paid to consider sharing your organs:

(a) Whilst alive?

(a) After death?
To PAY or not to PAY?

Libertarian Arguments

Utilitarian Arguments

Financial markets

Cheapest option best?
Obstacles
Disincentives
Profit
Voluntariness
Coersion

How should the system look?

Is the current system fair?
Altruism versus Obligation

Free-will versus Social Contract
How Spain Became the World Leader in Organ Donations

What has changed?

On 1 December 2015, Wales became the first UK country to introduce a soft opt-out system for organ and tissue donation.

The new system will make it easier for people in Wales to become organ donors.

If you haven't registered a decision to opt-in or opt-out of organ donation, you will be treated as having no objection to being an organ donor. This is called deemed consent.

Your choices

Your choices are:

If you know you want to be a donor then you can:
One year since the automatic organ donation law came into force - has it made a difference?

39 organs from patients whose consent was deemed have been transplanted. Credit: Soeren Stache/PA

Health officials in Wales are celebrating the one-year anniversary of a landmark change in the law on organ donors.

Has an opt-out donation process made a difference in Wales?

The number of organs transplanted has increased from 120 between the 1 December 2013 & 31 October 2014, to 160 between 1 December 2015 & 2016

- Latest figures show that 39 organs from patients whose consent was deemed have been transplanted to people in need of replacement organs.
- Figures from the Organ Donation and Transplantation Activity Report shows the number of Welsh patients whose lives were saved or improved by an organ transplant increased by 24%.

“No other country in the rest of the UK is doing what Wales is doing when it comes to organ donation. We're extremely proud of what we've achieved so far. Donating an organ is an act of great generosity and due to this progressive legislation policy, there are more organs available to those who are desperately in need of a transplant. The people of Wales who donate organs are potentially giving people the gift of life. On the anniversary of the start of this landmark legislation I want to thank those who have donated, and want to urge people who've not discussed their organ donation wishes, to have that conversation with their loved ones.”

FIRST MINISTER CARWYN JONES AM
Bits n’ Bobs...
HIV-infected organs transplant success

5 May 2016

The first organs from HIV-positive donors have been transplanted into HIV-infected patients in the UK.

In total, two kidneys and two livers were donated after death to seriously ill people who also had the virus.

NHS transplant experts said the breakthrough would help reduce the shortage of donor organs and they hoped more people with HIV would join the organ donor register.

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/health-36211039
Patients given kidneys rejected 'unfit' by other hospitals

O 18 November 2014 | Wales

Robert Stuart and Darren Hughes received organs from a donor infected with meningitis-causing parasitic worms.

Two transplant patients died after receiving kidneys which had been rejected as "unfit" by other hospitals, an inquest has heard.

Robert Stuart, 67, from Cardiff, and Darren Hughes, 42, of Bridgend, were given organs from a donor infected with meningitis-causing parasitic worms.

Doctors knew the alcoholic donor of the kidneys had died from meningitis. Cardiff Coroner's Court heard.
Pathologist's findings

The coroner heard there have only been five known cases like this worldwide in humans - all of which had proved fatal. Pathologist Fouad Alchami said the primary cause of death for both men was meningoencephalitis, a form of meningitis, caused by the presence of the worms.
This was the first known case of human-to-human infection and the first case in the UK, the inquest heard. He said the men had a "heavy infestation" of nematode worms in their brains.

Dawn Chapman, a specialist transplant nurse at UHW, told the inquest that five transplant centres had declined the donor's kidneys before they were offered to them under a fast-track scheme which happens when five or more centres reject an organ, or it has been out of the body for more than six hours.

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-wales-30086735
Drugs addict could have op and then face charge of murder

A DRUG addict who is dying from cystic fibrosis could face a murder trial if she ever has a successful lung transplant.

Linda Hargin, who is terminally ill in hospital, is accused of killing a drug dealer by driving off with him hanging out of the passenger window of her car.

Her illness led to the prosecution at Manchester Crown Court taking the highly unusual step of asking for the murder charge to lie on the file and it will not be re-instituted without leave of the Crown Court or the Court of Appeal.

But Judge Rhys Davies, Manchester's top judge, said the prosecution could ask for 24-year-old Hargin to be tried for murder if her medical condition ever changes.

Her condition is deteriorating daily and is permanent and

by court staff

her life expectancy is described as precarious," the judge was told by Anthony Gee QC, for the Crown. "The only possible treatment would be a lung transplant. "But she is addicted to hard drugs and the decision not to transplant would be reviewed only if she can convince the medical authorities that she can completely withdraw from her condition, because a lung transplant is extremely rare and expensive," he added.

Mr Gee said Hargin was "wholly unfit to stand trial because the court appearance charge should lie on the file not to be proceeded without leave of the court or the Court of Appeal. "But if there should be a change in the medical position then clearly it may be open to the Crown to seek to make another application," he told the judge.

Judge Davies said in the highly unusual and almost unique circumstances the murder

Sparrow hawk has pupils in a flap

by John Jeffrey

P.E. LESSONS at a Stockport school were cancelled this week — as pupils took cover from a bird of prey! The sports hall at Priestnall School, Heaton Mersey, was declared out of bounds for more than 24 hours as staff desperately tried to attack her.

Beautiful Bedrooms...
**HaPPY ThuRsDASY**
References

Human Tissue Act: Donation of Solid Organs (July 2014)

A CODE OF PRACTICE FOR THE DIAGNOSIS AND CONFIRMATION OF DEATH

Law Reform on Conditional Consent: Whose Choice is it Anyway?
http://www.barcouncil.org.uk/media/61889/_45__joseph_opara.pdf