THE INFLUENCE OF CULTURE ON EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP IN ZAMBIA: A CASE STUDY OF THE PHIRI SCHOOL.

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Education at the University of Leicester

by

Mthulisi Matshakaile
School of Education
University of Leicester

November 2019
Abstract

Mthulisi Matshakaile

The influence of culture on Educational Leadership in Zambia: a case study of the Phiri School.

This study explores the influence of culture on educational leadership (EL) as perceived by teachers and school leaders at a Zambian school. Culture is increasingly recognised as a significant influence on EL; consequently, studies have been conducted in this area, primarily in East and South East Asia. The African context lags in this regard, resulting in assumptions that African EL is predisposed towards western cultural and leadership practices. This study begins to correct these assumptions and proposes an alternative view. It was guided by three research questions; 1) what cultural values, beliefs and practices influence EL in the school, 2) how these values influence the enactment of EL and 3) how far the concept of Ubuntu influences EL.

The study is based on the interpretive paradigm, combining in-depth interviews with focus group discussions to gather rich, descriptive, contextualised narratives and accounts of leadership. Inductive analysis develops a formulation of theory grounded in the perspectives and practices of educational leaders in the Zambian context.

The findings reveal the far-reaching importance of the African cultural and societal concept of Ubuntu, which is based on communalism and recognition of humanness in others. Ubuntu influences EL through values like care, support, peaceful coexistence, reverence for age, respect for authority, collectivism and harmony. African traditional practices of patriarchal leadership and paternalism are evident in hierarchical structures and the preponderance of male educational leaders and the resultant gender disparity among Zambian educators. The colonial legacy along with socialist influences have influenced EL through an enduring adherence to bureaucratic leadership structures and authoritarianism. Ethnocentrism and an over-reliance on aid are historical influences which also affect the enactment of EL in Zambia.

In summary, there are some uniquely African cultural values, beliefs and practices influencing EL, whilst others have been identified in other cultures like Chinese society.
Acknowledgement

This thesis would not have been possible without the support and enthusiasm of Professor David Pedder, who encouraged me all the way. I will forever be in his debt. As a family man, it is impossible to put in the amount of work that resulted in this thesis without the support of my wife; Nceby, you are my light and my life. I would like to express my gratitude to my children, Reabetswe and Kelebogile who patiently allowed me to get on with it. I also extend my gratitude to Andrew Whittall, the CEO of Educore Services for helping with the sponsorship of my studies.

My heartfelt thanks go out to my participants, the teaching staff and management at the ‘Phiri School’, without whom this project would not have been possible. I may have changed your names and the school’s name to protect you my friends, but you are the spirit of this project.

Most importantly all glory and honour go to the Almighty, with whom all things are possible.

I dedicate this thesis to my mother and father, who unfortunately could not be here to see me get to this stage.
Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... 1
Acknowledgement ............................................................................................................................. 2
Tables ............................................................................................................................................... 9
Figures ............................................................................................................................................. 9
Abbreviations .................................................................................................................................. 10
Chapter 1: Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 12
  1.1 Background ............................................................................................................................... 12
  1.2 The Significance of the Research ............................................................................................. 13
  1.3 Zambian EL and Culture ......................................................................................................... 15
    Table A: Database Search Results for EL in Zambia ................................................................. 16
  1.4 The Research Problem, Aims and Questions ........................................................................... 16
  1.5 Maintenance of Confidentiality and Anonymity ..................................................................... 17
Chapter 2: Literature Review ........................................................................................................... 18
  Part 1 ............................................................................................................................................ 18
    2.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................................. 18
    2.2 A Historical Background of Zambia and its Southern African Neighbours ...................... 18
      Figure 1: The Spread of British Colonialism from South Africa to Zambia is in Red .......... 19
      Figure 2: Distribution of African Language Families and Groups ......................................... 20
    2.3 The Zambian Education System ............................................................................................. 22
      Table B: The Structure of Primary and Secondary Education in Independent Zambia ...... 23
    2.4 Teacher Training and Elevation to Headship ...................................................................... 23
    2.5 Educational Governance in Zambia .................................................................................... 24
    2.6 Research on EL in Zambia .................................................................................................... 24
    2.7 Conclusion .............................................................................................................................. 26
    2.8 International Aid and Zambian Education ............................................................................ 26
    2.9 African Culture ...................................................................................................................... 28
      2.9.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 28
3.7 The School ........................................................................................................... 91
3.8 The Participants .................................................................................................... 91
3.9 In-Depth Interviews and Grounded Theory ..........................................................92
3.10 Focus Group Research with the Teachers ............................................................ 95
   Table C: Focus Group Participants ....................................................................... 96
3.11 Ethical Considerations ..........................................................................................98
Chapter 4: Findings ...................................................................................................101
  4.1 Introduction ...........................................................................................................101
  4.2 An introduction of each school leader .................................................................101
     4.2.1 Mwanza: Head-teacher ............................................................................. 101
     4.2.2 Bupe: Deputy Head .................................................................................. 102
  4.3 A Strong Hierarchical System .............................................................................102
  4.4 A Bureaucratic and Autocratic System ...............................................................103
  4.5 Power, Position and Responsibility .....................................................................108
  4.6 Political Clout and Societal Status .....................................................................109
  4.7 Face ......................................................................................................................110
  4.8 Who Influenced Them? ....................................................................................... 111
  4.9 Age and Gender .................................................................................................. 112
  4.10 Idea Generation and Decision-Making ............................................................. 113
  4.11 Community ........................................................................................................ 114
  4.12 Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 116
Focus Group Findings ...............................................................................................116
  4.13 Planning, Idea Generation and Decision-Making ............................................. 116
  4.14 Change ............................................................................................................... 119
  4.15 Management Styles .......................................................................................... 121
  4.16 Apprehensions about Public Perception ...........................................................122
  4.17 Leadership Ideals ............................................................................................... 123
  4.18 Age ..................................................................................................................... 124
4.19 Gender .................................................................................................................. 127
4.20 Tribal Tension ...................................................................................................... 129
4.21 Pull Him Down! .................................................................................................... 130
Chapter 5: Discussion .................................................................................................. 133
5.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 133
      Table D: A Summary of the Findings ...................................................................... 133
5.2 Reverence for Age and Respect for Authority .................................................... 133
5.3 Gender Inequality and Patriarchy ......................................................................... 136
5.4 Paternalism ............................................................................................................ 138
5.5 Colonial Influences ............................................................................................... 140
5.6 Political Influences ............................................................................................... 143
5.7 Collectivism and Communalism ........................................................................... 145
5.8 Ethnocentrism and Tribalism ............................................................................... 146
5.9 Worshipping Traditions ....................................................................................... 148
5.10 Face, Shame and Embarrassment ....................................................................... 150
5.11 Patronalism ......................................................................................................... 152
5.12 Over-Reliance on Aid ......................................................................................... 153
5.14 Ubuntu ................................................................................................................ 155
Chapter 6: Conclusion .................................................................................................. 158
6.1 Summary of Findings ............................................................................................ 158
6.2 My Contribution to Knowledge from this Thesis ............................................... 159
6.3 Additional Issues Found in The Study ................................................................ 161
6.4 What understandings about culture are reflected in my findings? ...................... 163
6.5 Evaluation of the Research .................................................................................. 164
6.6 Utilising Findings from This Thesis ..................................................................... 166
6.7 Suggestions for Further Research ...................................................................... 166
6.8 End Note: Current Developments at Phiri School .............................................. 167
Appendix A (Interview Schedule: Mwanza) .............................................................. 168
Appendix B (Interview Schedule: Bupe).................................................................169
Bibliography ........................................................................................................170
Tables

Table A: Database Search Results for Educational Leadership in Zambia
Table B: The Structure of Primary and Secondary Education in Independent Zambia
Table C: Focus Group Participants
Table D: A Summary of the Findings

Figures

Figure 1: The Spread of British Colonialism in Sub-Saharan Africa
Figure 2: The Distribution of African Language Families and Groups
Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APEC</td>
<td>Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AU</td>
<td>African Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BESSIP</td>
<td>Basic Education Sub-Sector Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSAC</td>
<td>British South Africa Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIE</td>
<td>Cambridge International Examinations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNE</td>
<td>Christian National Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>Chinese Communist Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEB</td>
<td>District Education Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEBS</td>
<td>District Education Board Secretary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL</td>
<td>Distributed Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EL</td>
<td>Educational Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLOBE</td>
<td>Global Leadership and Organisational Behaviour Effectiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPE</td>
<td>Global Partnership for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GT</td>
<td>Grounded Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA</td>
<td>Japan International Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MK</td>
<td>Umkhonto we-Sizwe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOGE</td>
<td>Ministry of General Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NQT</td>
<td>Newly Qualified Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OOSC</td>
<td>Out of School Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Pan Africanist Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAGE</td>
<td>Programme for the Advancement of Girls’ Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEO</td>
<td>Provincial Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRC</td>
<td>People’s Republic of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTA</td>
<td>Parent Teacher’s Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTSS</td>
<td>Post Traumatic Slave Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADE</td>
<td>South African Department of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBCPD</td>
<td>School Based Continuous Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGB</td>
<td>School Governing Body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIP</td>
<td>School Improvement Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMT</td>
<td>School Management Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TaRL</td>
<td>Teaching at the Right Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THRASS</td>
<td>Teaching Handwriting Reading and Spelling Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOC</td>
<td>Target Oriented Curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNZA</td>
<td>University of Zambia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USSR</td>
<td>Union of Soviet Socialist Republics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANLA</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANU</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African National Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZAPU</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African People’s Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZIPRA</td>
<td>Zimbabwe African People’s Revolutionary Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZNUT</td>
<td>Zambia National Union of Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZANEC</td>
<td>Zambia National Education Coalition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Background

The notion of studying school leaders is not a new one; Ribbins and Gronn (2000) date the genesis of the idea back to England in the nineteenth century. However, specific investigations into the roles of principals and their impact on school effectiveness only gathered impetus in the latter part of the twentieth century (e.g. Edmonds, 1979; Bossert et al, 1982; Hawley & Rosenholtz, 1984). Subsequently, a significant body of knowledge has been generated, with the study of principals and headship even being labelled a growth industry (Ribbins and Gronn, 2000).

Considering the substantial amount of literature that this field has since generated, especially in the drive towards school improvement, the question arises as to whether more research is justified. Ribbins and Gronn (2000) contend that more research is necessary for two reasons. Firstly, they maintain that the headship is still very important, citing Hallinger & Heck’s (1998) assertion that principals are critical to the process of improving educational outcomes by providing high quality professional and administrative leadership. This justification is echoed by Fullan (2010) who notes that the speed and quality of change in a school are dependent on the power of the principal to lead organisational and systemic transformation. The second justification arises from aspersions being cast on the efficacy of what is currently known about school leadership. Bush and Glover (2003) support this position, pointing to many gaps in current understanding in the field of EL despite contemporary interest. They highlight the dearth of empirical studies about school leadership practice and strategies to justify some of the opinions- masquerading as theories- that have been advanced so far. As one of the implications for further research, emerging from their review of leadership literature, they advocate further studies into the impact of different contextual factors on the nature of school leadership. Such factors could include school types, location and socio-economic status.

A contextual factor that has come to the forefront is societal culture. Dimmock and Walker (2000) admit that a gap exists in the study of the relationship between societal culture and EL. Hallinger and Leithwood (1998) call societal culture an unseen force,
which needs to be addressed if school leadership is to be better understood internationally. However, Dimmock & Walker (2000) are quick to point out that this call for more research is not aimed at defaming existing work, but at challenging the narrowly conceived cultural basis through which EL is currently viewed, - the western perception. For that reason, research must be contextualised to take account of culture.

1.2 The Significance of the Research

Public educational systems worldwide owe their organisational structures to strong European (e.g. British, German & French) and American (Hallinger & Leithwood, 1998) influences. It is the globalisation of education along with its attendant EL culture which has led to questions about the fit with host countries outside these regions. This has especially been the case where nations have begun to reform their education systems. With accelerated development, – as is the case with Singapore and Malaysia- these imported systems of education and EL have been interrogated as to their efficacy for the local context. Host countries question whether western educational practices are appropriate to national goals and whether national cultural practices can survive the advent of foreign educational systems. Additionally, they question whether national traditions as well as indigenous approaches to education and cultural transmission may be subsumed by the dominance of global educational values, initiatives and leadership styles (Bajunid, 1996).

This ‘cross-cultural cloning’ (Dimmock & Walker, 2000) risks certain assumptions about education within the destination country. Steingard & Fitzgibbons (1995:31) caution against globalisation being accepted ‘as a value-free, natural phenomenon catapulting the world into a pristine state of progress’ whilst Whitty et al (1998) warn against the ‘false universalism’ that could ensue from adopting policies across cultures without taking that country’s history and cultural dimensions into account. Dimmock & Walker (1998), critical of policy borrowing, further point out that seemingly similar societies cannot assume that educational policies can be unthinkingly imported, citing Seddon (1994:4) who remarks upon ‘Australia’s dependence and subservient preoccupation with developments in the UK and the USA.’ Bush & Haiyan (2000), drill down to local authority level and point out that, even schools in the same vicinity may have different values, beliefs and symbols.
Such questions and arguments have given rise to a proliferation of studies that emphasise the importance of national cultures in shaping EL in different societies (e.g. Bush & Haiyan, 2000; Dimmock & Walker, 2005; Hallinger & Leithwood, 1998; Fidler, 2000). The establishment of Asian offshore branches by prominent British private schools and universities has contributed to the bulk of such studies being initially undertaken in South and South East Asia. Harrow and Dulwich, for example, have branch campuses in Thailand and China whilst Nottingham University is at the forefront of British universities establishing overseas campuses. In 2018, the number of overseas campuses of British independent schools increased from 57 to 72 (Santry, 2018; Turner, 2018).

Dimmock & Walker (2000) explain that their interest in societal culture and school leadership stemmed from their personal experiences as academics working in South East Asian universities. They realised that they were culturally incompatible with their students as they attempted to share information and views that simply did not resonate culturally with the students.

Thus, progress has been rapid in Asia since the 1990s and into the twenty-first century, because academics there have realised the differences in context and culture and the impact on education and EL.

Zambia and its Southern African neighbours share a similar colonial history with many of these Asian countries. Figure 1, in the next chapter shows the determined incursion of the British colonisers from South Africa, through Zimbabwe to Zambia and Malawi. Therefore, comparable systems to those of Singapore and Malaysia would exist. Moreover, educational globalisation has come to Zambia through international curricula such as the Cambridge International Curriculum, the International Primary Curriculum and the International Baccalaureate. These curricula are typically taught by expatriate teachers; however, a significant proportion of the students taught are Zambian. International aid organisations are also instrumental in bringing international educational initiatives to schools across the country.

However, unlike the Asian scenario, in Zambia and the region, it appears that the insurgency of these international educational systems has been largely and uncritically
accepted, if not welcomed; the educational systems in the former British colonies and protectorates remain largely unchanged, - in fact private international education is highly desired by the country’s elite for its prestige. The government also welcomes international educational initiatives, which are normally accompanied by an injection of much-needed educational resources and funds.

Therefore, this study is significant in that it will begin to shed light upon indigenous cultural influences on EL in Zambia, in much the same way as has been undertaken in Asia. I believe that there are some uniquely African cultural beliefs, values and practices that influence educational management in schools in Zambia. In similar vein that the recognition of these cultural influences has contributed towards understanding in Asia, it is my hope that a better understanding of African culture’s influence on EL will do the same for Zambia and its neighbours. I hope too, that this case study will serve as a stepping stone towards more research interest in this field and geographical sphere.

1.3 Zambian EL and Culture

Upon arrival in Zambia to take up my position as headmaster of an international school in a burgeoning town, I became involved with a foundation engaged in teacher and school leader training within the district. This is a fulfilling endeavour which I continue to do to the present day. I did however, find that there were challenges to the implementation of many initiatives within the schools. Having completed a master’s dissertation on the challenges of adopting distributed leadership in South African schools, I hypothesised that some challenges may have been related to societal culture. This heralded the birth of this study.

Searches for Zambian EL literature revealed that universities and colleges of education used western literature to inform their knowledge base on school leadership. A comprehensive body of knowledge from the local context does not exist electronically. A brief review of available literature can be found in Section 2.6 (page 24) of the literature review.

A search of international academic databases returned the following results;
Table A: Database Search Results for EL in Zambia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Search terms</th>
<th>Results</th>
<th>Relevant?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ERIC</td>
<td>Educational+leadership+Zambia</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERIC</td>
<td>Leadership+Zambia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERIC</td>
<td>Zambia+culture</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEI</td>
<td>Educational+leadership+Zambia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEI</td>
<td>Leadership+Zambia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEI</td>
<td>Educational+leadership+Zambia</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEI</td>
<td>Leadership+Zambia</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEI</td>
<td>Zambia+culture</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Where there were results, I printed off the titles and abstracts of the articles for further review about school leadership and found no relevance to the study of EL, or culture in Zambia. Because of this scarcity of contextualised material, I sought to establish the connections between Zambia, Zimbabwe and South Africa since their histories, people and cultures are very closely related; I reviewed literature from these countries as an alternative. Chinese culture was reviewed because my reading of Chinese culture and educational studies showed some similarities with the Southern African context. Furthermore, China has and continues to have a marked influence on Southern African culture, political ideology and economics.

1.4 The Research Problem, Aims and Questions

This study aims to investigate the influence of societal culture on school leadership within a school in Zambia. This will be achieved by endeavouring to answer the following questions;

1. What cultural values, beliefs and practices influence EL in the school?
2. How do these cultural values, beliefs and practices influence the enactment of EL in the school?
3. How does the concept of Ubuntu influence EL in the school?

The purpose of the study is to tentatively propose a contextualised model of societal culture and EL as presented by the findings from the case study. The model may then provide relevant and appropriately contextualised conceptual resources to perhaps inform future research investigations related to the study of EL in the Zambian scenario.
1.5 Maintenance of Confidentiality and Anonymity

This research project was conducted at one school in Zambia with 9 participants. In the interest of non-malfeasance, to protect the identities of my participants, I have assigned them pseudonyms and codes. Focus group participants have been assigned codes, - T1 to T7 in place of names - and the two school leaders’ names have been anonymised. Furthermore, to avoid deductive disclosure, the names of the province and town have been anonymised, as have the names of all mentioned in the report. The name of the ‘Phiri School’ is also a pseudonym used to protect the true identity of the school. All individuals have been anonymised and assured confidentiality. Furthermore, to reduce the risk of disclosure of participants or other individuals referred to in the study, I have taken steps to remove all biographical information, other than that which are pertinent to my study and essential in explaining findings. Confidentiality is thus ensured in this study.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

Part 1

2.1 Introduction

Part 1 of this literature review briefly examines the history of Zambia and its neighbours directly to the South, - Zimbabwe and South Africa. These countries share, not only a similar traditional heritage, but a colonial one. I will also review the Zambian education system, focusing on educational governance, a brief review of the literature on EL in Zambia, teacher training and elevation to headship and the influence of international aid on Zambia’s education system. I will then look at African culture, with emphasis on the concept of Ubuntu as shared by many sub-Saharan people and how it influences EL. The colonial legacy will then be studied to understand its enduring influence on EL. I will conclude Part 1 by examining Chinese culture and EL.

2.2 A Historical Background of Zambia and its Southern African Neighbours

To begin with, it is important to contextualise the relationship between South Africa, Zimbabwe and Zambia since they are closely related in culture, heritage and history. This is because, in many cases, African contextual literature will derive from South Africa and Zimbabwe because of the dearth of studies from Zambia.

Limiting attention to the incursion of the British South Africa Company (BSAC) directly North from South Africa into Zimbabwe and then Zambia serves to contextualise the arguments that will be forwarded later in this thesis. Briefly, the BSAC first demarcated the area now called Zimbabwe as it moved North from South Africa in 1888, when Charles Rudd and his associates were granted mining rights by the Ndebele King Lobengula. A royal charter granted to the BSAC resulted in this land being colonised and named Rhodesia after Cecil John Rhodes, the company’s founder. In 1890, the BSAC crossed the Zambezi River; the seeds of Northern Rhodesia were planted and came to fruition in 1911. Figure 1 illustrates the spread of British colonial incursion from South Africa to present day Zambia.
The inter-relationship between the peoples of Southern Africa transcends borders; the division of the sub-continent in 1888 and later years resulted in families being split and, in many cases, being unable to reunite for long periods of time, if ever again. An example is the case of the Tonga people of Southern Zambia/Northern Zimbabwe, who found themselves in different countries in December 1963 when Northern Rhodesia became the independent nation state of Zambia, leaving Southern Rhodesia as a colonised nation thereafter known simply as Rhodesia. Figure 2 on the following page, illustrates the preponderance of different ethno-linguistic groups across the Africa continent, with a disregard for the artificial borders imposed by colonialism.
Despite the imposition of these borders, Southern Africans continued to mix through migration, mostly for labour purposes. A prominent agent of southward migration was the Witwatersrand Native Labour Association, popularly known as Wenela, which transported people from as far afield as Tanzania to the goldfields of Johannesburg and the diamond mines at Kimberley. These “tours of duty” to South Africa were not taken voluntarily but as a response to the colonial power’s introduction of a “hut tax” which required payment in cash, labour, grain or stock. Since most natives were subsistence farmers, they could ill afford to give of their crops or stock; thus, most chiefs preferred...
to send some able young men from their villages to work in South Africa through Wenela, to return with the required funds.

Whilst some migrants returned home, many stayed on and made new lives for themselves all over the region. It is therefore commonplace in South Africa, Zimbabwe, Botswana and Zambia to find different branches of the same family. This inter-relationship had the effect of devolving and spreading cultural beliefs and practices across the region. It also strengthened ties between the indigenous peoples of these countries in their respective struggles against imperialism. As shown in Figure 1, the colonisers were the British, although this changed for South Africa in 1948 when the Afrikaner-led National Party assumed power.

The ensuing liberation struggles across Southern Africa were characterised by collaboration and mutual support between the various pro-independence political parties and armed wings from the respective countries. For example, following Zimbabwean independence in 1980, both the Pan Africanist Congress’ (PAC) armed wing Poqo and the African National Congress’ (ANC) Umkhonto We Sizwe (MK) were welcomed by Robert Mugabe’s fledgling government to set up bases in Bulawayo and Harare. The same had been done for the two main liberation movements from Zimbabwe, - ZAPU’s (Zimbabwe African People’s Union) armed wing ZIPRA (Zimbabwe People’s Revolution Army) was based in Zambia and ZANU’s (Zimbabwe African National Union) armed wing ZANLA (Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army) operated out of Mozambique. In 1960, the ANC was banned from South Africa and relocated its headquarters to Lusaka, Zambia; this is where Oliver Tambo and Jacob Zuma were based for over 30 years.

Zambian independence was won relatively peacefully compared to its neighbours. Its first president, Kenneth Kaunda, whilst supporting the various liberation movements, was wary of communist China establishing training bases within his borders, to avoid his country becoming a centre for liberation intrigue (Taylor, 2006). Training camps were thus set up in neighbouring Tanzania and Mozambique, away from the areas of conflict. However, this did not halt the radicalisation of the ZIPRA and ZANLA rank and file who would return to their bases in Zambia before deployment across the border. It is believed that their radical ideas, learned from their Chinese trainers, were spread into
the local populace. Raymond Mhlaba, a contemporary of Nelson Mandela at Robben Island, received his training in China and writes in his memoirs how enamoured he was of the Maoist philosophy (Mhlaba & Mufamadi, 2001).

Kaunda himself took a leaf from Mao’s book when he declared Zambia a one-party state in 1972, effectively silencing any opposition and the democratic process in the country. Zimbabwe has been ruled by the same political party for the last 40 years and South Africa has also known rule by one party since independence in 1994.

2.3 The Zambian Education System

Before Zambian independence in 1964, educational provision for Africans was almost exclusively the preserve of mission schools. The BSAC attempted to gain control of the Northern Rhodesian education system in 1918 but was rejected by the churches running the mission schools. This led to the Phelps-Stokes Commission, which recommended to the Colonial Office that participation in native education was mandatory for development.

The first African secondary school was established in 1939; it produced the first generation of independent Zambia’s leaders. However, the slow development of secondary education was evident at independence, when the country had just 100 African university graduates, 1500 secondary school-leavers and 6000 junior secondary school-leavers for a country of 3.5 million people. There was a critical manpower and skills shortage for the development of the new nation (Henkel, 1989). Kaunda’s government also inherited a divided educational system; well-funded, well-resourced European schools on one hand and neglected, over-crowded, poorly staffed African schools on the other.

Four development plans were implemented during the first republic (1964-1972) to address these imbalances. The current three-tier structure as illustrated in Table B below was introduced in 1999.
Primary school lasts 7 years; an additional two years to grade 9 constitutes basic education, which ostensibly prepares a student for vocational pursuits and three more years past grade 9 take students to school-leaving level at the end of grade 12, which is roughly the equivalent of Cambridge ‘O’ Levels, after which students are deemed ready for tertiary education.

2.4 Teacher Training and Elevation to Headship

Until recently, Zambia had three teacher qualification programmes; a two-year college programme resulting in the award of a teaching certificate, a three-year diploma programme and a four-year degree in education (Banda, 2007). The Ministry of General Education (MOGE) abolished the certificate programme in 2013 and has encouraged certificate-holders to pursue diploma courses (The Zambia Education Curriculum
Framework, 2013). From that point onwards, the accepted minimum teaching qualification was the diploma. UNESCO (2016) estimates that there are 93,000 registered teachers and that the teacher-pupil ratio is 48:1, higher than the SADC average of 38:1.

Progression into headship in Zambia requires no formal qualifications except general teaching qualifications, - in line with other African countries (Bush & Oduro). Headteacher appointment is done centrally by the Teaching Service, usually based on experience or a successful teaching record and a recommendation from the Provincial Education Office (PEO). Some teaching colleges offer professional development for school leaders, such as master’s degrees in EL; however, these have not been recognised as prerequisites for promotion to headship.

2.5 Educational Governance in Zambia

There are three levels of educational governance; the national headquarters and its various agencies in Lusaka, nine provincial education offices (PEOs) and 72 district education boards (DEBs). This current form of decentralisation is in response to a situational analysis by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP, 2012), which found a gap between public expectations and inclusive governance of education, resulting in sub-optimal service delivery. The main priorities are de-concentration, delegation and devolution; however, Mukwena (2011) argues that these are political gambits, not driven by the need to improve administrative performance. Furthermore, the three-tier structure is an oversimplification because central government is comprised of several agencies and bureaucratic levels that contribute to operational bottlenecks.

2.6 Research on EL in Zambia

With digital searches having returned very little, I visited the library at the University of Zambia (UNZA) and conducted a search of the digital repository for studies on EL since independence. A recent review of research into EL by Kalabo (2017) helped to focus the search. I found 16 studies on EL; two were journal articles (Kabeta et al, 2015; Mulundano, 2015) with the remainder being master’s dissertations or doctoral theses.
70%, focus on urban areas, 30% are on instructional leadership and 25% examine school leadership effectiveness.

Gender is addressed in four studies, three of which (Chonya-Mfula, 2006; Halyonda, 2008; Salukatula, 2010) state that female head-teachers are more effective than their male counterparts. Salukatula (2010) adds that female principals are more likely to display democratic and consultative management styles than males. Mwanza’s (2004) investigation of EL practices in Lusaka reveals that ineffective heads tend to be autocratic and adopt laissez faire styles of leadership, a sentiment echoed by Chafwa (2012) and Mwape (2013) who add that authoritarianism impacts negatively on teacher performance, motivation and school climate.

Sikayile’s (2011) investigation of decentralisation in the North Western Province for his master’s dissertation, is cited extensively in the UNESCO (2016) Education Policy Review, in which he finds that the process has not reached its full potential due to the following reasons;

- Weak institutional capacity, which includes poor organisational support, realignment and implementation capacity, thereby frustrating actors at school level,
- Insufficient organisational support, especially personnel capability, coordination and operational guidelines. Respondents admitted to being hung-up on old operational systems where central government dictated all actions,
- Weak organisational realignment; respondents complained of haphazard decisions and random interventions from central government officers who were equally ill-informed about new frameworks,
- Weak implementation capacity relating to insufficient funding and lack of skilled personnel to implement new frameworks,
- Inadequate accountability mechanism; the study found inadequate sharing of responsibilities at district level and excessive administrative control from central government.


2.7 Conclusion

Clearly there is a paucity of EL studies in Zambia; the few existing studies tend to focus on similar issues and report similar findings. Ultimately, there are no studies on EL and culture; this thesis begins to address this.

2.8 International Aid and Zambian Education

A small number of Zambian educational development initiatives have recorded successes; this is especially the case with projects aimed at increasing access to education for girls and the rural poor. However, many areas still require improvement, such as improving the quality of education, raising progression rates in primary literacy and provision of professional development for teachers (USAID, 2018). Poor quality of education is attributed to a lack of trained teachers, poor educational infrastructure, inadequate sanitary conditions as well as pupil and teacher absenteeism (Mwanza, 2013).

The country’s economic woes since independence have resulted in inadequate funding for all these shortcomings, despite increases in national budgetary allocations for education. In 2015, 4.3% of GDP was devoted to education, a figure which the UNESCO (United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation) Education Policy Review (2016) suggests needs to be further increased. The resultant shortfall is mostly covered by aid agencies to address such issues as identified by Mwanza (2013).

The Global Partnership for Education (GPE, 2018), reportedly disbursed US $78 million from 2013 to 2019 in Zambia. It counts among its successes, an increase in the number of students completing grade 9 (68.8% in 2016), an increase in pupils transitioning from primary to secondary school (49% in 2015) and a total of 13,073 teachers receiving Early Years, Primary or Secondary teaching qualifications.

Doubtless, these examples illustrate some successes of aid; however, there are caveats. For example, Riddell & Nino-Zarazua (2016) are concerned about the continued slump in the quality of education despite aid received; they acknowledge the short-term benefits of capacity-building but warn against treating such aid missions as unsustainable short-term projects. Furthermore, aid donors on their own cannot be the drivers of change in education. Recipient countries must have a driving desire to see
development and contribute towards their success through a combination of top-down and bottom-up participatory management systems of implementation; failure will result in low overall system improvement. Furthermore, the design of intervention projects must factor in social norms to be successful; supply-side interventions alone are less effective (Masino & Nino Zarazua, 2016; Riddell & Nino-Zarazua, 2016).

There are those who believe Zambia’s dependence on aid is detrimental (e.g. McPherson, 2004; Moyo, 2009). Moyo (2009) bluntly questions what Zambia’s government is doing if education, healthcare and infrastructure are provided by foreign donors; after all, the country continues to have high levels of poverty, contrary to the notion that aid has a positive impact on national development as posited by Arndt et al (2015). McPherson (2004a) concurs, asserting that Zambia’s per capita GDP has not increased at the rate that aid has flowed in; rather, aid has not helped in stimulating the economy and much of it has been wasted. He further argues that the Zambian government has become hooked on foreign aid to the distortion of its approach to economic management (McPherson, 2004b).

The following disadvantages of aid have been cited by its critics (e.g. Moyo, 2009; Easterly, 2003, 2006, 2009; McPherson, 2004a, 2004b; Bauer, 1975; Langdon & Draman, 2005; Brantigam & Knack, 2004; Whitfield & Fraser, 2008).

- It enlarges government bureaucracies whilst enriching the elite without spurring growth or reducing poverty,
- Aid contributes to bad governance through negative impact and lack of transparency on political and administrative accountability,
- It reduces incentives for governments to implement democratic reforms,
- Donors dominate the decision-making process by dictating processes and imposing conditionalities such as staffing and procurement,
- Aid flows are often used for purposes other than what they are intended for.

Beuran et al (2011) suggest an overhaul in aid design and delivery as well as the incentives of donor agents, if systemic aid dependency is to be overcome.
2.9 African Culture

2.9.1 Introduction

This section seeks to contextualise African culture in a manner that will support analysis of EL and culture in the Ntshonalanga Province of Zambia later in this thesis. Whilst some literature does exist that examines African culture, there is a dearth of studies into specific cultures. A reason could be as Shizha (2014) suggests, that culture in indigenous sub-Saharan Africa is heterogeneous, thus making the study of a common culture almost impossible. He does, however, concede that some particularistic cultures do exist in areas where common cultural and linguistic characteristic are found. This is the case with many people of Southern Africa, from the Great Lakes down to the Cape of Good Hope. The similarities in culture from Zambia to South Africa are quite marked due to inter-relatedness of the people, - the Bantu, - and the migration amongst them.

The values in Nigeria for example, do not differ much from those in Zimbabwe. Blake (1993) opines that sub-Saharan societies share certain fundamental values that guide the day to day life of inhabitants. He identifies the following; i) respect for elders, ii) acceptance of the supremacy of hierarchical structures, iii) reverence for ancestors and iv) the performance of rituals for various occasions such as weddings and harvests. Awoniyi (2015) draws on West African culture to list the following African values; i) respect and honour for elders, ii) regard and appreciation for family and benefactors, iii) self-control and courtesy, iv) virtues of forgiveness, harmony and peaceful co-existence, v) diligence and industry, vi) truth and honesty and vii) unity and cooperation.

2.9.2 Ubuntu: Communality

The community plays a central role in African value structures (Mbigi, 2005), stemming from the understanding that all lives are inextricably linked and interdependent. The Southern African Nguni people are credited with coining the now much-used word, Ubuntu, which, literally translated, means “humanness” (Lutz, 2009). It is the basis of African communal cultural life (Tambalasi & Kayuni, 2005) and functions as a unifying factor that brings people together without regard for background or wealth (Sithole, 2001). However, to assume that Ubuntu is a Southern African concept would be erroneous. The word itself has cognates in other Bantu languages; certainly, the values that it represents can be found in almost every sub-Saharan culture (Lutz, 2009). The
fundamental construction of traditional African existence depends on communal living and the belief that one is truly human only as a member of a community. In the Zulu language, the saying goes, “Umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu” which translates to, “What makes us human is our recognition of the humanity in others.” (Luhabe, 2002). A Kenyan proverb goes, “I am because we are; and since we are, therefore I am.” (Mbiti 1969). In Nigeria, a Yoruba maxim states, “One hand cannot lift a heavy load to the head.” (Falade et al, 2009).

These maxims prove the importance of a sense of community across African cultures; by extension, the concept of Ubuntu is representative of communal mores in African culture. Tutu (1999) describes a person that is imbued with Ubuntu as being, “generous, hospitable, friendly, caring and compassionate.” (p.34); Luhabe (2002) adds respect, trust, compassion, mutual sympathy and empathy. These are all values that by their very nature must be applied to others within a community and therefore require a community within which to be applied.

Sense of community as a value perhaps emanates from the human need for support, cooperation and communalism (Koster, 1996), - the pragmatic realisation that, as human beings, we crave the company of others for companionship. At an ideological level, the sense of community as espoused by Ubuntu, means, “caring for each other’s well-being and a spirit of mutual support…” (Republic of South Africa, 1996), in the knowledge that one belongs to a greater whole, which is diminished when others are reduced in any way (Tutu, 1999). However, Lutz (2009) warns that African communal culture does not mean the subordination of one’s welfare for the benefit of the collective, as is espoused by Maoist collectivism, but rather that the individual pursues his own good through the pursuit of the common good. Gyekye (2002) illustrates this through the analogy of a forest, which looks huddled from afar but reveals individual trees at closer inspection. Thus, communality in Africa does not obliterate individuality.

2.9.3 Ubuntu: Reverence for Elders

The respect for elders in African society is easily related to the attendant values of courtesy, politeness, dignity, respect and acceptance of the supremacy of hierarchical structures. Conton (1966) writes of African respect for elders and authority,
Africans generally have deep and ingrained respect for old age and even when we find nothing to admire in an old man, we easily forget that his grey hairs have earned him the right to courtesy and politeness. (p. 21)

There is a suggestion in this quotation that ideally there should be a reason, beyond age, for which an elder person warrants respect. Nonetheless, Joshua (2013) writes that respect for elders in Africa is divine, cultural and therefore mandatory. This norm is found in many cultures across the globe. In Greece, the term “Old Man” is a term of endearment and not a derogatory one, with extended families living as several generations under one roof (Huffington, 2006).

Furthermore, elderly people are accorded a special place in African society because they are responsible for passing on the traditions and values of Ubuntu to the community through various media such as oral retellings of folklore and proverbs. The expectation is that this will continue from generation to generation (Gumbo, 2014). The ancestor in African culture is not necessarily the spirit of a dead relative but rather, an elderly person within the community. Masango (2006) elucidates, An ancestor is someone who has reached a great age and maturity in life, who during his or her lifetime has acquired vast experience of life, including deep spirituality. Hence, they share their rich experiences and spiritual life with other young villagers. (p. 936)

Respect for elders manifests itself in the humble and respectful way that the elderly and superiors are greeted and addressed by the young. In most Southern African cultures, the greeting of elders or superiors by younger or lower placed members of the community is usually accompanied by kneeling and the deferential clapping of hands. In Ndebele culture, a child will refer to an elder or parent in the plural rather than the singular, which would be considered disrespectful.

However, this respect is not unidirectional; there is an expectation of reciprocity from the elders or those in authority. Onwubiko (1991) avers that elders have a corresponding responsibility to return respect to those giving it to them, based on the reciprocal exercise of duties of the old-young relationship. The reverence given to elders is viewed as maintenance of tradition and custom, since the young will age as well and
expect to be respected by their young. Care for the aged in Africa is primarily the premise of the family, hence the very small number of nursing homes across the continent.

2.9.4 Ubuntu: Respect for Authority and Hierarchical Structures

Hierarchical authority within Africa society is commonplace. The basic hierarchy would place a chief at the top, followed by his headmen or sub-Chiefs, the heads of families and then the rest of the community. Whilst this may appear like a top-down approach to leadership and may suggest autocratic rule, the Ubuntu practice of *legkotla* suggests a participatory approach to decision-making within the community. *Legkotla*, a SeSotho word meaning “meeting circle” or “tribal management” ensures that all members of the community can participate in the management of their society. De Liefde (2003) lists the principles of *legkotla* as follows: i) everyone has the right to attend, ii) everyone’s voice counts, iii) there is trust in dialogue, iv) there is respect for others, v) stories are a means of communication, vi) everyone shares the truth, vii) people listen observantly, and viii) a decision is always taken.

The chief and his advisors still play an integral function in the *legkotla*. He occupies a central place in the meeting place due to his elevated position within the community and performs the function of taking the final decision after the deliberations are complete. In the interim, though, the truth is shared, and everyone’s voice is heard, thereby altering the paralysing function of the hierarchical. The chief’s authority derives from the esteem in which the tribe holds him. The people expect a person in this position to be persuasive, compassionate and visionary. He is also expected to trust them, and they will in turn repay this trust through hard work and inventiveness (de Liefde, 2003).

2.9.5 Ubuntu: A Sense of the Sacred and Religious

Traditional African society may not base its beliefs on recognised deities, but a suggestion that Africans are atheists or agnostic would be a mistaken one (Mbiti, 1969). Religion forms an integral part of the culture; the values contained therein inform society’s morality and philosophical attitudes to life. Louw (1998) suggests that Ubuntu serves as the spiritual foundation of many African communities and should not be underestimated; it has been a source of inspiration to theologians and clergy alike. In
today’s modern setting, parallels are being found between Ubuntu and Christian values. Hailey (2008) writes of “Ubuntu theology” emanating from the works of Tutu (2004), Louw (1998) and Battle (2000), which argue that ethical responsibility comes with a shared identity. Even before the arrival of Judeo-Christianity and Islam, there would have been a system of social morality which depended on religion and was seamlessly connected to the other value systems within the society. Okafor (1974) elucidates on the inseparability between religion and morality,

_Ancient Africa was far from being an abode of laissez-faire morality. There were strict moral principles and determined codes of conduct. Custom laid down the code of law which established the nature of right-doing, and custom established penalties and taboos against malefactors. Moral sanctions were mainly religious sanctions and these metaphysical sanctions were truly effective._ (p.25)

Jan Christiaan Smuts, twice a prime minister of South Africa (1919-1924 and 1939-1948), recognised the importance of African customs as a means of moral and hierarchical administration of principles. He said the following on the matter,

_The natives of Africa have from time immemorial been subject to a stern, even ruthless discipline, and their social system has rested on the despotic authority of their chiefs._ (Cook, 1930: 226)

Drawing on the spiritual transition of the village elders, Masango (2006) notes that they become good leaders, then good teachers and ancestors as they approach the end of their life journey. He points out that those who are good in life by passing on their knowledge and wisdom to others, “become good ancestors when they die.” (p. 930)

What follows is an examination of how Ubuntu has been amalgamated into EL within the African context and a brief look at the challenges and limitations of Ubuntu.

2.9.6 Ubuntu and EL

Ubuntu is viewed as an attractive underpinning philosophy for school leadership in Africa, primarily because its fundamental values are globally appealing and because one main practice of Ubuntu, the _legkotla_, is perceived as a democratic method of
leadership. Prinsloo (1998) identifies various values within Ubuntu that are equally familiar to western thinking, namely sharing, dignity, brotherhood and trust.

At the dawn of the new South Africa, the notion of dismantling apartheid’s leadership structures in schools found a champion in the concept of Ubuntu, which not only was epitomised by positive values centred around the community but had as a leadership structure, the *legkotla*, a participative framework that worked on the premises of truth, respect and a voice for all. To replace the autocratic structures of the past, the new laws introduced devolved management in the form of school-based management through the school management team (SMT) and school governing bodies (SGB). These laws are enshrined in the South African Schools Act of 1996.

Msila (2008), citing Prinsloo (1998), avers that Ubuntu leadership refers to the management and nurturing of growth within an organisation characterised by a departure from hierarchically structured management relations and the introduction of cooperative and supportive forms of leadership in which collective solidarity of the group is employed and respected. Mbigi (2004) attributes such responsibility to leaders who must be tasked with the role of bringing hope and meaning into a confusing world.

A search across a variety of databases reveals limited studies into Ubuntu and school leadership. Msila (2008) conducted a case study into the assimilation of Ubuntu in a South African township school. The head-teacher inherited a failing school, condemned by the community around it. Teachers were unused to being included in any decision-making and being delegated to take on certain duties and expressed surprise when asked to do so. The new principal’s attempts to change school leadership culture using the principles of Ubuntu were met with resistance. Participatory leadership strategies were viewed as laziness on the part of the head-teacher, of whom one interviewee said, “We think this lady wants us to run the school for her.” (p. 75) However, with the passage of time and perseverance on the part of the principal, teachers began to grasp the basics of the new leadership strategy.

Msila (2008) concludes, based on this case study, that Ubuntu models of school leadership are not cut and dried solutions, adding that, unless teachers are prepared to embrace change and to be change agents, the concept of Ubuntu will not take root in
South African schools. He also cautions on the approach to Ubuntu leadership that focuses just on processes, stressing that it is important to focus on people instead.

### 2.9.7 Some Challenges of Ubuntu

Lutz (2009) highlights one of the main criticisms of the concept of Ubuntu as its vagueness. Six theoretical interpretations of the concept are forwarded by Metz (2007) with four of them being rejected in favour of one that approves of actions that promote harmony and reduce discord and another that champions actions aimed at positive relationships. Whilst Hankela (2014) acknowledges the central role played by Ubuntu in academic and ethical discourses in South Africa, she too comments on the contestation of the precise content of the concept. An article in The Economist aptly encapsulates this quandary over the definition,

_The trouble is that Ubuntu seems to mean almost anything one chooses._

*Ubuntu and Other Management Tips, 1995:68*

A question has also been raised as to whether Ubuntu exists, given the prevailing wars and other conflicts on the African continent. Louw (2010) highlights certain negative features of some African countries such as corruption, mismanagement, self-enrichment and disease and asks the question, “Do Africans in fact adhere to Ubuntu?” (p. 122)

Lutz (2009) points out that a potential vice of Ubuntu is nepotism, since love of neighbour is often limited to a relatively small circle of neighbours. Opio (1996) notes that, “the African manager or employee will often put the interests of his or her cousins before that of the organisation. Occasionally, this can mean placing close relatives in the organisation regardless of their suitability for the post in question” (p.99). This practice is a corruption of Ubuntu, states Lutz (2009), who further argues that tribalism is akin to racism in the sense that others are denied their due because they differ in a morally irrelevant aspect.

The defective communalism that can come about when a group of people are deeply involved in a cohesive in-group, is called “groupthink” (Lutz, 2009). In the African context, collectivism can prevent individuals from acting without group consensus, regardless of what their personal positions may be. Nnadozie (1998) observes that such
practices may lead to frustration in the process of negotiation, thus making the initiation of change or expansion time-consuming and inefficient. Sono (1994: xiii) adds that this extreme emphasis on community may be used to legitimise, “the constrictive nature or tyrannical customs of a derailed African culture.”

Closely related to the above, is the discouragement of individual initiative, not unlike the Chinese encouragement of the “we” mentality described by Head & Sørensen (1993), which frowns upon self-promotion. In the African context, a high-achiever may find themselves and their motives viewed derogatorily,

*One often hears, ‘Akhufuna akhale ndani?’ (What does he/she want to be?) and ‘Akudziyesa kuti ndi ndani?’ (Who does he/she think he/she is?) These commonly heard phrases signal social disapproval of the individual who places himself/herself above his or her fellow human beings, for example through self-promotion in business or at work. (An Afro-centric Alliance, 2001: 60)*

Louw (2010) cautions against the dark side of the Ubuntu desire for consensus; mainly that it demands an oppressive conformity and loyalty to the group. Sono (1994:7, 11, 17) says failure to conform may result in harsh punitive measures, further arguing that, “this group psychology, though parochially and narrowly based...nonetheless pretends universality,” and is “stronger on belief than on reason; on sameness than on difference.” Lutz (2009) argues that communality is about commonality of interest and not opinions.

Another unfortunate abuse of Ubuntu has been its use for political advancement and self-aggrandisement by some politicians. In Malawi, for example, Tambulasi & Kayuni (2005) found that former president Muluzi would hand out cash and food to the crowds at political rallies and gatherings, earning himself the honorific, “Opand Nkhanzi”, which means “the kind one”. When challenged about this, he responded that he was alleviating the plight of the people in direct opposition to the regime of the former president Hastings Kamuzu Banda. The Centre for Social Concern (2003) found mystery surrounding the origins of the grain and money which the president had been handing out; even the relevant government agencies mandated to distribute relief knew not where the food and money had come from. The president was intransigent in the face
of calls for transparency and insisted that he was practising the principles of Ubuntu (Daily Times, 25 June 2003).

Gumbo (2014) observes that the Bantu people occupy an area that amounts to a third of sub-Saharan Africa, from South Cameroon and South Eastern Nigeria to Zimbabwe, Botswana and South Africa. Muzvidziwa & Muzvidziwa (2012) add that the word “Ubuntu” has cognates in such diverse languages as Yoruba (Ajobi), Shangaan (Numunhu) and Swahili (Utu). However, as a concept, studies of Ubuntu are curtailed for the interim to Southern Africa (e.g. Msila, 2008 (South Africa); Louw, 2010 (South Africa); Tambulasi & Kayuni, 2005 (Malawi); Muzvidziwa & Muzvidziwa, 2012 (Zimbabwe)). There are sparse studies to be found further North, such as Brubaker’s (2013) exploration of Ubuntu, servant leadership and leadership effectiveness in Rwanda. Based on this small body of knowledge, to label Ubuntu as an African concept could be considered premature and raises questions about the applicability of the concept to all sub-Saharan Africa.

Many factors have contributed to the state of African culture as it is today. The encroachment of other cultures through media such as television and the internet are important contributors. Before that, the arrival of Europeans as missionaries to spread the Christian message and a new way of life, was a major contributory factor. African customary practices were maligned and labelled as hedonism or simply unchristian. Newly converted African Christians had to leave their way of life and embrace western concepts of life as a “good” way of living.

Colonialists also brought their value systems and ways of life, undermining indigenous knowledge systems to such an extent that contemporary practices are still influenced by this bygone era. The following section looks at how colonial practices and values eclipsed African values and leadership practices to such an extent that the re-introduction of Ubuntu has been an arduous task.

2.10 Colonial Legacy

De Gruy Leary’s (2005) exploration of the legacy of slavery and the residual effects of that dark period on today’s African Americans suggests that African Americans are suffering from what she terms Post Traumatic Slave Syndrome (PTSS), a condition that
she argues has not and will not end for yet a while. One reason for these vestiges of slavery after close to 300 years, she suggests, is the reaction by the non-African public, when the subject is brought up as a causal factor to African American behaviour today.

Although slavery affected Southern Africa, the greater influence was colonialism whose impact can be felt to this day. In the same way that some West African chiefs sold slaves to European traders, traditional rulers in Southern Africa collaborated with colonisers to collect hut taxes (Cloclough & McCarthy, 1980; Tlou & Campbell, 1984), thus in effect enslaving their people and forcing some into exile to earn these taxes. The financial gains from this collaboration turned chiefs into willing agents of colonialism, blinding them to the plight of their people. This flow of able-bodied men to Southern Rhodesia and South Africa, primarily through Wenela had Northern Rhodesian district commissioners alarmed at one point about the denudation of their territories of the menfolk (Gann, 1958). It was estimated that by 1938, more than half the African male population was working away from home for wages (Roberts, 1976). Consequently, this forced migration of men to work in the mines and on the farms in the South left mostly women and young children at home, negatively affecting agricultural productivity. Some homes were permanently broken as many men failed to return, further exacerbating poverty, as those who remained resorted to selling livestock and produced less on the land (Tlou & Campbell, 1984).

Colonialists also exercised the divide and rule stratagem to subdue and control the indigenes (Cockerham, 1995; Brass, 1985) by favouring one ethnic group over others, to secure their loyalty and to foster rivalry thus preventing unity, - a threat to colonial rule (Mulinge & Lesetedti, 1998). In Nyasaland (present-day Malawi), the British elevated the Ngonde above other groups (Kalunga, 1985); they did the same for the Shona in Zimbabwe, - previously Southern-Rhodesia- (Day, 1980) and the Tutsis enjoyed superiority over the Hutus in Belgian Rwanda (Mamdani, 2001; Mazrui & Tidy, 1984). In Zambia, the Bemba enjoyed privileged status as choice employees on the Copperbelt mines (Posner, 2003). The resultant state-sponsored economic disparities exacerbated existing tribal tensions and resentments (Moyo, 2009; Mulinge & Lesetedti, 1998). In the power vacuums that remained when colonialism ended, eruptions of genocidal proportions ensued. Hutus massacred a million Tutsis in Rwanda and Shona-led forces
participated in the genocide of thousands of Ndebele people in Matabeleland, Zimbabwe (Compagnon, 2011). With three thousand ethnic groups across sub-Saharan Africa, there is a higher probability of tribal tension and conflict (Moyo, 2009; Collier & Hoeffler, 2002).

Compared to discussions about the Jewish Holocaust and the genocide of the Aboriginal Americans, which are treated with reverence, reactions to discussions of the ideology of African American contemporary behaviour based on multi-generational trauma are met with visceral responses amounting to “Get over it!” The same has been found to be the case when colonialism is discussed as a causal factor of some of Africa’s present-day woes, sometimes from unlikely sectors. Nelson Mandela told a delegation of African leaders in Ghana to stop blaming colonialism for Africa’s ills and rather to consider themselves to find the solution to their problems (Attah, 2001). A victim of apartheid herself, Mercer (2011) asserts that blaming a generation of white males for the sins of the past should not be countenanced. And Peron (1999), an American who exiled himself to live in independent South Africa, criticises placing the blame for all South Africa’s ills on apartheid,

*That’s the problem. Everything that goes wrong is a ‘legacy of apartheid.’ The violence in the rest of Africa is a ‘legacy of colonialism.’ It’s a legacy that has gone on for almost 40 years. Every time something goes wrong (and that happens constantly), the same litany of excuses is recited. ‘We inherited this problem from the corrupt apartheid regime.’ (p.3)*

However, the evidence is overwhelming that colonialists had an agenda to eradicate African culture and replace it with their own. Gumbo (2014) suggests that apartheid was a conscious attempt to destroy everything African and to impose westernisation through government institutions and programmes. He relates how education was used as a medium for this agenda,

*Western ideologies and culture were being hammered into the African child at the expense of African values and culture to ensure the deadness of African-ness and the implantation of western-ness. (p. 68)*
Shizha (2014) agrees further lamenting how sub-Saharan education systems, “mirror colonial hegemonic paradigms that are disruptive to African cultural practices.” (p.301) He also notes that indigenous knowledge in Africa is a victim of colonial education that has resulted in discord between the, “cultural and socio-specific contexts of cultural education and the pedagogical practices taking place in schools.” (p.301)

The eradication of African culture becomes clearer when the purpose of colonialism is examined. During colonial times, Africans were used as unskilled or semi-skilled labour to aid in the pillaging of their own homeland, for the benefit of the ruling minority both in the home country and in Africa itself (Addo, 2004). They (Africans) were developed only to the extent of performing menial labour and low-level administrative tasks, whilst higher level skills were reserved for the colonisers (Nkomo, 2011). Armah (2006) encapsulates this forced move from an indigenous existence to one created for Africans for the benefit of their colonial masters,

They (colonisers) administered Africa as a series of occupied territories, relying on help from Africans able to accept the world the slavers made, as a reasonable world, and eager to integrate into it for pay. (p. 39)

This imposition of a ceiling on African aspirations was achieved primarily through tight controls on their education (see Mungazi, 1989; Steyn, 2003). In Rhodesia (present day Zimbabwe), Mungazi (1989) writes that commissions of enquiry into native education were used to enhance the government’s control of education and society. The resultant reports served to inform the increment of state legislative control over the development of Africans and their access to education and other social services. They were simply pushed towards manual labour under the guise of respecting their cultural values,

The Victorian beliefs that the Africans could advance themselves better by engaging in a programme of practical training rather than by any other form of education was consistent with the Africans’ cultural practices, merely camouflaged the fact that the ultimate purpose of colonial educational policies was to train the colonised as labourers. (Mungazi, 1989: 468)

Rhodesian Prime Minister Ian Smith’s (1964-1979) spokesman, Andrew Skeen, announced the government’s intention to retard the advancement of African political
aspirations by denying them an advanced education “until time and education made it a safe possibility” (Mungazi, 1985). This timeline extended up to the 18th of April 1980, when Zimbabwe gained independence.

Across the Limpopo River, in South Africa, the inequalities of colonialism lasted a further fourteen years. Hendrick Verwoerd, the architect of apartheid, speaking at the time as Minister of Native Affairs (1950-1958), stated the following,

There is no place for the Bantu in the European community above the level of certain forms of labour...What is the use of teaching the Bantu child Mathematics when it cannot use it in practice? That is quite absurd. (Giliomee, 2009: 190)

Jan Christian Smuts shared the same sentiments, albeit in a less confrontational manner, aimed at justifying racial segregation in South Africa,

These children of nature have not the toughness and persistence of the European, not those social and moral incentives to progress which have built up European civilisation in a comparatively short period. (Cook, 1930: 230)

Thus, the provision of education was racially unequal by design. White schools had all the resources they needed, while the ones serving the black communities were deprived of qualified teachers, physical resources and stationery (Fiske & Ladd, 2005). In 1982, for example, per capita spending for education on white children was 1,211 Rand, compared to 146 Rand for black children. Such policies ensured that quantitative educational attainment differentials in average years of education completed between black and white South Africans were marked. In 1950, a black person attained 6.0 less years of school than a white person (Van Der Berg, 2007).

The education system was a natural extension of the highly authoritarian apartheid regime; the education philosophy was based on Fundamental Pedagogics, which in turn was informed by Calvinistic Christian principles (Enslin, 1984). This philosophy used corporal punishment as a tool for children to see the error of their ways and encouraged an overweening respect and status for teachers but contributed to a perverted view of
education. Christian National Education (CNE) formed the context within which teachers were tightly controlled within a system of structured compliance (Prew, 2006).

The prevailing reality in South Africa, even today, is that a significant proportion of black teachers and school leaders began their careers under the apartheid regime, where they worked in racially prescribed settings (Mattson & Hosley, 2002). During their training, this category of teachers would have attended colleges of education managed by Afrikaners, placed there by the state to ensure that black schools would eventually under-teach their pupils and work within the CNE framework (Prew, 2006). During this era, black school leaders and teachers worked in a system characterised by bureaucratic leadership styles, with the department of education governing and determining all decisions. The principals’ roles were those of managers who conducted administrative tasks and had little to do with teaching duties. In their positions of overseeing the delivery of the oppressors’ curriculum, in the oppressors’ language, educational norms and culture, the principals were a legitimate target by those in the liberation struggle (Naidoo, 1992). Perhaps because of this situation, many principals in these positions resorted to even more authoritative leadership methods, adding to the draconian, top-down management system that already prevailed at the time (Steyn, 2003; Prew, 2006).

At independence, South Africa immediately set about restructuring all state agencies in a bid to address the inequalities of the colonial era; moving towards democratic methods of administration and away from the exclusive autocratic rule redolent of the erstwhile dispensation. This was epitomised by an increased focus on the relationship between management in all sectors and Ubuntu elements of the national transformational agenda (Makgoba, 1999). Within the school system, site-based management was introduced to decentralise administration of schools. This included the implementation of such initiatives as the School Management Team (SMT), the School Governing Body (SGB) and the Learners Representative Council (LRC) in a bid to engender participatory leadership (Van Der Mescht & Tyala, 2008). These initiatives draw on the values of Ubuntu such as the legkotla as guiding principles, which engender an inclusive approach towards school administration.

However, all these well-meaning strategies have met with the notorious resistance to change that is typical of schools across the globe, especially when the intent behind the
change and the actual impact are at variance (Fertig, 2000). The SGB’s all-ranging powers (e.g. setting school policy over uniform, language, admissions, school infrastructure) have challenged many principals, resulting in turf wars between the SMTs, the SGBs and the principals. Some principals use their unique positioning to abuse their positions; realising that they are the common factors in both the SGB and the SMT, they manipulate either body to control the school in their desired directions (Brijraj, 2004). The South African Department of Education (2004) has recorded cases of principals using their positions in the SGB to run the school without conferring with the school staff, - a practice reminiscent of the apartheid era. Additionally, in some patriarchal, traditional communities, the pressure has been on principals to remain male, continue to administer corporal punishment, maintain strict discipline and act in every sense “in loco parentis” (Education Rights Project, 2005; SADE, 2000b), - practices that prevailed during the previous regime.

Prew (2006) laments the insistence of principals in state schools on continuing to employ the authoritarian approach reflective of South Africa prior to 1994. He endeavours to explain that this behaviour is because of the introduction of a system which does not favour the cultural heritage of the recipients, thereby forcing them to revert to the former structure. Gumede (2012) adds that state mechanisms in post-colonial Africa remained unchanged with the new dispensations. The top-down structure was hierarchical and entailed teachers being told what to do and what not to do, - a culture which has been blamed for the teachers’ resistance to change, in addition to the fact that they were schooled in apartheid ideology (Reeves & Ralph, 1994). Democratisation of the school system has not been easy to accept by this generation of teachers, a condition that Mohammed (1999) suggests has been brought on by four to five decades of a top-down culture and passive acceptance of instructions. Bhatt et al (1988:150) elucidate further whilst describing a situation in an English school as “white construction and interpretation of black reality” pervading all levels of the system, resulting in “an alienating ethos where rules are not related to the culture.”

In South Africa, there are publicly proclaimed, concerted efforts at addressing the prevailing school leadership culture, which stems from an undesirable legacy (Ngcobo, 2008; Moloi, 2007; Prew, 2006, 2007; Steyn, 2003). School based leadership is not an
option; it forms part of the Schools Act (1996) and related legislation to ensure systemic adherence to decentralised decision-making.

The Ubuntu driven new system of leadership and governance in South African state schools has proven an alien concept to teachers and school leaders. For the most part, principals have continued with their ingrained practices of the past whilst putting on a façade of inclusion and participatory leadership. The reality is that they still dominate all aspects of the school administration, so that tensions akin to those of the apartheid era still prevail (Thurlow, 2003; Prinsloo et al, 2006; Mnisi & Prew, 2001).

It would therefore seem that the former colonially engineered political dispensation has had a profound effect on schools in Southern Africa. The consequence is that, even well-meaning initiatives to transform this culture are taking longer than anticipated to become effective, giving credence to Hartshorne’s (1993) statement on the slow progress of building up a good educational culture,

*While it does not take a long time to break down a healthy learning environment, it will take a dedicated strenuous effort to build it up.* (p.340)

The next section in this chapter investigates Chinese culture, the similarities it shares with African culture and how it influences EL.

### 2.11 Chinese Culture and EL

#### 2.11.1 Introduction: Why China?

I include an in-depth examination of Chinese culture and go further to explore its influence on EL for the following reasons;

A major reason is the marked similarities that the Chinese and African cultures share. The reference here is to Confucianism, Maoism and contemporary Chinese culture as it relates to African culture. For example, traditional versions of both cultures are collectivist in character, placing the interests of the collective over those of the individual, and valuing strong cohesive communities. The African sense of community as epitomised in different ways across different parts of the continent, carries essential continuities with values promoted and sustained in the Chinese cultural context. Falade et al (2009), focusing on the Yoruba culture in Nigeria, note that unity and cooperation
are strongly held values within this society. Lutz (2009) remarks that sub-Saharan cultures are non-individualistic and states that an “African is not a rugged individual but a person within a community.” (p.314) In Chinese culture, the individual’s needs and interest are subordinate to those of the community (Hsu, 1985).

Chinese culture is an excellent example of an enduring culture. It has survived for a long time and has the distinction of having been well documented in the same language for a significant part of that history. Chinese scholars claim that their history stretches back some five thousand years, although modern revolutionaries view this ancient history with some ambivalence because of its “slavish and feudal mentality” (Duara, 2009:46).

This review will also show that a significant number of studies about culture and education emanate from China than any other country (e.g. Cheng, 2000; Law, 2012; Bush & Haiyan, 2000; Dimmock & Walker, 2005). Due to the Chinese importation of western educational systems, a great number of western academics have migrated to Chinese universities and schools and engage in research there. The website, The Expat Info Desk (2013) lists five East Asian countries amongst the top six destinations for expatriate teachers with China topping this list. In addition, some western universities have established campuses in China, drawing academics from the west; the universities of Liverpool, Newcastle and Nottingham have opened campuses in China. Consequently, collaborations abound within the field of culture and EL between western scholars and their Chinese counterparts (e.g. Bush & Haiyan, 2000; Morris & Lo, 2000; Huang & Wiseman, 2011).

The Chinese influence on Southern Africa, is an integral part of recent African history. African revolutionaries in sub-Saharan Africa embraced China’s aid as well as its Maoist principles and ideology. China won the hearts and minds of African freedom fighters by likening the anti-colonial conflict to proletarian revolutions. Shubin (2008: 232) notes that, “many African leaders were steeped in Maoist revolutionary thought and liberation politics…”

A significant reason for focusing here on Chinese culture, is the comprehensive example provided by the Chinese scenario, of the integral role played by the prevalent political ideology in China in influencing EL and the leadership of other organisations within the
country. A growing body of research shows that Maoist and communist ideology constitute a significant element of Chinese culture and influence the leadership and administration of organisations in the country. As has been noted, this ideology was promulgated throughout Southern Africa through China’s aid of revolutionary groups in their fight for independence.

2.11.2 Chinese Culture, Education and EL

Fan (2000), whilst endeavouring to classify Chinese culture, notes as a caveat, that there exist great differences in terms of political, social and economic dimensions between mainland China and other places where Chinese culture dominates. However, she states that it is still possible to identify certain core cultural values that are common to all Chinese people, - no matter where they live-, which give them their basic identity. It must be stressed that this exploration of Chinese culture focuses primarily on mainland China.

In the People’s Republic of China, contemporary culture is made up of traditional culture, communist ideology and western values, which are a relatively recent addition (Bush & Haiyan, 2000; Fan, 2000; Law, 2012). Traditional Chinese culture is diverse and includes Confucianism, Taoism, Buddhism and other regional cultures. However, it is Confucianism which is the representation of the core of traditional Chinese culture (Wang & Mao, 1996; Gong, 1989). It is deemed to have the most pervasive influence on Chinese culture, having been in existence for over 2500 years, with the master’s notion of education for the betterment of men (Cleverley, 1991) remaining at the heart of the purpose of education to date. Chinese traditional culture is comprised of the following elements;

2.11.3 Worshipping Traditions

This element emphasises the basic human relations and principles of Confucius (Gong, 1989) but above all, upholds patriarchal clan systems linked to the “rigidities of ancestral worship” (Cleverley, 1991:7). In the Chinese education system, the recitation of Confucian classics is given priority and has led to rote-learning becoming the traditional pedagogical style (Wang & Mao, 1996).
2.11.4 Respect for Authority

In China, respect for authority is deeply connected with the rigid social stratification of the clan system in feudal society and links to filial piety which requires absolute obedience and devotion to parents (Wang & Mao, 1996; Cleverley, 1991). A common adage in Chinese society is one that states, “If you do not listen to your elders, you’ll soon come to grief” (Gong, 1989: 367). In Chinese society, one remains a child if his parents are alive. It is not uncommon for parents to intervene in the lives of their adult children, extending to such matters as the approval of marriages. This respect for authority extends naturally to the school environment, where the teacher-student relationship is hierarchical. Children in China are expected to “respect their teacher without precondition,” (Wang & Mao, 1996: 148). A further extension within the school refers to the relationship between teachers. In Chinese schools, the principal has positional authority within a bureaucratic system, – a structure which Moyles & Lin (1998) describe as being deeply rooted in Chinese culture. At systemic level, Si (1997) notes the strong bureaucratic structure of the education system, where there are five administrative levels external to the school, - a large and cumbersome system.

Dimmock & Walker (1998) draw on Hofstede’s element of power-distance to assess the distribution of power in educational systems like the Chinese one,

...children are educated towards obedience to parents, whose authority is rarely questioned; in schools, teachers are respected, learning is conceived as passed on by the wisdom of the teacher, and teacher-centred methods tend to be employed; and in the workplace, hierarchy means existential inequality; subordinates expect to be told what to do and the ideal boss is a benevolent autocrat or a kind father figure. (p.574)

However, this traditionally embedded practice is increasingly inharmonious with Chinese educational reforms. Suzhi jiaoyu, - translating to “quality education”-, is the guiding principle of Chinese educational reform, which entails a holistic style of education, centred on the whole person and includes school-based management, increased school autonomy and student participation (Carney, 2008). These strategies, while rhetorically accepted in China, are inharmonious with traditional practices of respect for authority and teacher-centred pedagogy (Walker, 2012).
2.11.5 Maintaining and Saving Face

The concept of face was originally articulated in Chinese culture (Lu, 1934; Lin, 1935) and has gained traction as an integral social construct (Ho, 1976; Pan & Zhang, 2004; Joo & Sang, 1998, Xin-An et al, 2011). It gained international recognition because of Asia’s growth as an appealing market for foreign investors. Many investors have faced cross-cultural management challenges in their dealings with Asian counterparts; in fact, some of the failures faced by cross-national companies originate from their neglect of cultural differences, - face is one significant dimension.

Face is defined as an image of one’s self, delineated in terms of social attributes (Goffman, 1967). Lin & Yamaguchi (2007) add that face is an individual’s concern for their public image. The Chinese distinguish between lien and mien-tzu; the former is a representation of society’s confidence in the moral integrity of an individual and the latter considers a person’s prestige, gained through success and ostentation.

In Asian society, the word ‘face’ is frequently used in idiomatic expressions. If someone says their face has been wrinkled or blackened with ink, it means they have been disgraced and thus lost face (Kim, 1993). Embarrassment occurs when a person feels their face has been discredited, resulting in any social intercourse being disrupted; hence the vested interest for all concerned to maintain face, for a smooth encounter (Goffman, 1955; Miller, 1987).

Brown & Levinson (1978, 1987) and Goffman (1955, 1967) have taken the concept of face beyond Asia and recognised it as a universal phenomenon. Consequently, studies into shame and embarrassment have emerged from the rest of the world (e.g. Modigliani, 1968, 1971; Miller, 1978).

However, searches of various academic databases have revealed very little in the study of face and related social constructs in the African context. Brown & Levinson’s theory of politeness receives attention in South African linguistic studies; Gough (1994) and De Kadt (1992) examine politeness phenomena in IsiZulu and IsiXhosa respectively. In Uganda, Lwangu-Lumu (1999) investigates politeness and indirectness in Uganda.

However, face, shame and embarrassment are powerful driving forces for behaviour in Africa. Amaoko-Agyei (2009) lists saving face as an integral part of sub-Saharan culture,
illustrating how loss of face may occur in the business world during performance management, where an employee’s shortcomings are discussed openly. She adds that African business settings are primarily collective environments where group conformity and commitment are valued above personal interests. Jackson (2016) concurs, citing an Afriland First Bank case study, in which a model like the _legkotla_ is used to analyse shortcomings,

_This is the model here. Every month people gather without consideration of rank to discuss internal matters._

Disregarding face as a social construct can have far-reaching consequences. Michael Antonucci (Japan Times Weekly International Edition, 1995, cited in Pan & Zhang, 1998) points out that more lives could have been saved at the site of the Japan Airlines Flight 123 crash, if efforts had been made to avoid embarrassing Japanese authorities.

Because of the hierarchical nature of African society, it would therefore stand to reason that a person’s public image is very important and needs to be treated with circumspection to avoid them losing face.

**2.11.6 Communalism and Collectivism**

In Chinese society, the term for self, “wo” is used exclusively in a social context and is a relative concept, where the smaller self, “xiaowo”, could be an individual, a family or a village, which must always submit to the larger self, “dawo”. Thus, individuals are always expected to submit to the collective (Hsu, 1985). Viewed from a communist perspective, the concept of collectivism resonates with the Confucian one (Gong, 1989). Collectivism is characterised by tight social controls and frameworks in which people are brought up to be loyal and integrate in strong cohesive groups (Head & Sorensen, 1993) which are characterised by a strong “we” mentality (Dimmock & Walker, 1998).

In schools, collectivism, - as embodied in the traditional value system with collective benefits - is more important than individual needs (Wang & Mao, 1996). One way in which this is manifested is through the “jiaoyanzu”- groups of teachers, usually subject based, focusing on teaching and research and operating under the assumption that, “teachers should work together in virtually every aspect of their work” (Paine & Ma, 1993:676). This collegiality, although reminiscent of the way that teachers work in
western countries, must still operate within the parameters of the bureaucracy of the school (Bush et al, 1998).

2.11.7 Ethical and Moral Self-Cultivation

Traditional Chinese culture has a strong emphasis on a person building themselves up to be morally and ethically perfect, as manifested through modesty, the encouragement of friendly cooperation and prioritising relationships with people above all else (Bush & Haiyan, 2000). In schools, education has the aim of shaping every individual into a harmonious member of society and restraint of personality in favour of the collective is encouraged (Wang & Mao, 1996).

Self-restraint is a primary requirement for children at home and at school, where they are taught to obey, not only their parents but all elders. Modesty is taught from early childhood and praise is denied if the commendation is false. A commonly quoted proverb aimed at teaching people to avoid prominence reads, “Exposed rafters are the first to rot.” As Gong (1989: 367) aptly puts it, “Being outstanding is dangerous, so the best way is to restrain one’s individuality and to hide behind others.”

2.11.8 Socialist Culture

Socialism is an integral element of Chinese culture in the People’s Republic of China (PRC) and has a profound effect on education and EL. Whilst Confucius dominates traditional culture in China, Mao Zedong is the central figure of Chinese socialist culture. His writings are now considered to be as sacrosanct as the Confucian canons (Hayhoe, 1984). Mao saw much in common between Confucianism and communism (Cleverley, 1991) such as collectivism, which is shared by both Maoism and Confucianism. Moral education is also a blend of Confucian and communist ideals (Bush & Haiyan, 2000). Confucius taught care for others above oneself and Mao similarly advocated the exercise of “utter devotion to others without any thought of self.” (Gong, 1989: 366).

In schools, the influence of socialism is primarily enforced by the communist party secretary, who exists, along with the school branch, to ensure that the party’s educational policy is followed (Si, 1993). The communist party central committee insists on school-based branches to act as the political core of school leadership and management (Article 40, 1993), ensuring that socialist politics is never far from
influencing school leadership and management. The relationship between principal and party secretary can be a complicated one in Chinese schools because of the phenomenon of the non-professionals leading professionals, which has led to educational quality suffering in some schools (Lewin et al, 1994). There are tendencies of the party organisation to intervene in the daily running of the school. Moreover, the appointment of school principals and regional educational leaders is done centrally, although stricter controls have been introduced (Huang et al, 2016).

Walker et al (2012) citing Jia (2007), An (2006) and Hu (2007) concur that politics influences leadership philosophies and practices of Chinese principals; in fact, it is a requirement that head-teachers adhere to dominant political ideology. Principals are essentially government officers tasked with implementing centrally promulgated educational policies (Zhu, 2008; Chen, 2007). Moreover, schools are structured in similar hierarchical ways to government departments; consequently, principals’ decisions are framed by central government (Walker & Qian, 2012). This causes tensions between existing bureaucratic cultures and new democratic practices, causing inconsistencies for principals’ empowerment. State influence is a constant reality for Chinese principals, with recent reforms in school management structures and human resource management barely receiving lip service (Walker & Qian, 2012). The state still selects and promotes principals (Qian & Walker, 2011) and leadership development, - despite policy changes - is still controlled by the state (Zheng et al, 2013).

Chinese students are required, according to school rules, to love their homeland, the people and the Communist Party; they are also told to support the leadership of the CPC, study Marxism, Leninism and Maoism. The same is required of head-teachers as contained in their conditions of service (Sun, 1999). Courses on political education are compulsory (Wang & Wang, 1999).

However, communist education is increasingly falling on sceptical, disillusioned ears, especially among the young. Some school leaders have had changes of heart after witnessing the degenerate behaviour of some political leaders. Many have turned to current communist philosophers like Jian Zemin and Deng Xiaoping, whilst others have been attracted to Falun Gong, a Chinese philosophy considered to be heretical.
2.11.9 Guanxi

Guanxi is a Chinese term meaning ‘connections’ or ‘relationships’; it operates through personalised networks of influence, for a person to secure a better position or gain a competitive edge in business (Brunn, 1993; Chen, 2001). Davidson et al (2017) add that guanxi is a supervisor-subordinate relationship. Chinese principals attach significance to establishing and maintaining guanxi with influential school stakeholders (Walker et al, 2012). It operates on two dimensions; one emphasises affective connections between subordinate and supervisor, along with the obligations of mutual care, understanding and altruism (Davidson et al, 2017; Chen et al, 2014). Second is the hierarchical nature of the relationship, whereby the supervisor is obligated to show paternalistic consideration towards the subordinate, who in turn shall show deference, obedience and loyalty to the supervisor (Chen et al, 2014).

Through guanxi, head-teachers gain such benefits as additional funding and other allocations of resources. They allocate time and effort to cultivating these relationships to strengthen their guanxi with relevant officials (Yau, 2006; Li, 2005). At a fundamental level, guanxi involves exchange of property, wealth, movable and immovable goods and other economically useful things (Mauss, 1990) but goes beyond that to acts of politeness such as banquets, rituals, military services and other services in which the passing on of wealth is but one element of a much more enduring contract. Thus, gift-giving is a significant practice of guanxi, with gifts ranging from fruit or a bottle of wine to elaborate ones such as works of art (Millington et al, 2005). Ultimately, the most important aspect of guanxi is the establishment of relationships based on familiar connections such as family, friends or colleagues or finding a basis of familiarity that builds a way to establishing connections (Yin, 2017).

Sylla (2014) suggests that pre-colonial Africa was based on values that precluded corrupt practices. He maintains that gift-giving was a common practice underpinned by cultural and social foundations not commensurate with corruption. Mulinge & Lesetedi (1998) similarly argue that gift-exchange was not considered corruption since it wasn’t conducted at the expense of the public good and furthermore, not a violation of established rules and ethical considerations.
Nevertheless, the lines between *guanxi* and corruption are blurred, with some opinions being forwarded that the two are synonymous. Han (2016) argues that Chinese officials abuse the concept of *guanxi* to engage in illegal activities, thus rendering it and corruption inseparable. Yin (2017) adds that in countries where the term *guanxi* exists, corruption exists too. However, Harding (2014) is at pains to make a distinction between this Confucian cultural practice and corruption, arguing that *guanxi* does not lead to corruption; rather, it is institutional and structural flaws that are exploited, regardless of *guanxi* culture.

In Arab countries, a similar practice to *guanxi* is termed *wasta* and loosely translates to nepotism, - the ‘who you know’ relationship (Lall, 2017). Hale (2015) investigates similar patronal relationships in Russian politics, in which the leader serves as chief patron atop a pyramid of lower-level machines, connected to one another through networks of mutual interest. A further description of patronal relationships is the distribution of services ‘by big men on behalf of favoured clients’ (Downs, 2011: 5).

However, following the mores of *guanxi* or patronalism has its disadvantages; head-teachers may find themselves pressured into granting favours which go against their principles. For example, principals of key schools are often pressured into admitting the children of influential people into their schools (Zhang & Gu, 2005).

### 2.11.10 Patriarchal Culture

One of the basic human relations propounded by Confucius is the one between husband and wife, where the husband is expected to provide for his wife and she is expected to submit to her husband (Fan, 2000). Women are thus cast into the position of dependents, who are subordinate to whichever male is in the role of paterfamilias. Women are expected to be obedient to their fathers, their husbands and, — when the husband dies - to their sons (Cleverley, 1991). Such doctrines account for paternalism within the Chinese family and paternalistic management styles in Chinese organisations (Hsiao et al, 1990). Bush (2004) adds that patriarchal leadership dominates in many spheres, including government, education and the Communist Party itself.

Communists doctrine casts women as equal to men in politics, culture, society and the economy as laid out in the Constitution of the People’s Republic of China (1999).
However, the reality is, the traditional hegemony of men continues unabated (Bush & Haiyan, 2000). In Chinese schools, most leadership positions are held by men. Huang & Wiseman (2011) point out that there is an extremely low number of female school principals in China. Ribbins & Zhang (2006) found just one female head-teacher out of forty in their Chuxiong study. This under-representation of women is attributed to the patriarchal attitudes of traditional Chinese society which continues to have a strong influence despite the need to modernise society. A male principal in one school claimed, “females in this school lack the ability to be good leaders,” (Coleman et al, 1998: 146).

In another study, male respondents acknowledged women’s ability to teach but cast aspersions on their physical and professional fitness for leadership. Some felt women should not be prepared for leadership because they are troublemakers (Ribbins & Zhang, 2006).

Three main reasons were found in this study for the prevailing situation. Firstly, in addition to professional work, women continue to perform the bulk of domestic tasks at home. Secondly, traditional mores dictate that the man achieves in his career whilst his wife is accorded the nurturing role. Thirdly, there is a belief that women are unsuited for professional leadership roles because of their innate qualities such as the nurturing quality, which paradoxically, makes them good teachers (Coleman et al, 1998).

2.11.11 Paternalism

Studies into Chinese EL (e.g. Cheng et al, 2002; Bush & Qiang, 2002) suggest that principals tend towards paternalistic leadership styles. The Collins Dictionary (2010: 598) defines paternalism as “authority that limits individual responsibility,” a definition that is commensurate with dominant western views of paternalism. It has been called an outdated approach to management (Jackman, 1994), an anachronism (Padavic & Earnest, 1994) and Jermier (1998) adds that it has no place in democratic society. This attitude from democratic societies has contributed to the dearth of literature on paternalism (Martinez, 2003).

This view of paternalism is contextual. In Taiwan, Chou et al (2015) find mostly morality and benevolence in paternalism, with authoritarianism constituting just a small part. Lu et al (2017) find benevolent paternalism to have an attenuating influence on negative relationships caused by inter-cultural diversity in China. In Mexico, it has been proposed
that management there is a benevolent authoritarian system of paternalism, predicated by Mexican cultural values of respect, hierarchical relations, family and personal relationships (Martinez, 2003; Morris & Pavett, 1992).

Origins of paternalism differ by country; for example, Turkish paternalism is based on nomadic history, military coup d’etat, economic instability and complicated bureaucracy. Chinese paternalism is primarily based on Confucianism and economic crisis (Cakar & Kim, 2013).

Findings from Chinese schools show leadership to be the sole right of the principal, who will normally employ top-down management systems (Wang, 2007; Lu, 2007; Wong, 2007). Democratic leadership practices, introduced through suzhi jiaoyu, are largely viewed as false collegiality whilst principals continue to exert decisive authority, with staff behaving deferentially towards this authority (Ryan et al, 1998).

2.11.12 Conclusion

Clearly, Chinese and African cultures share many similarities, from the reverence for elders to collectivism. The individual is subordinate to the collective and is discouraged in both societies from placing themselves before the community. In the absence of a comprehensive body of literature on African literature, this section serves to illustrate some characteristics of African culture.

Recently, studies also show that western ideals, particularly those related to educational reform, have an influence on Chinese EL (Walker et al, 2012; Law, 2011, 2012). EL models are imported and translated verbatim into Chinese (Wang, 2007; Fen, 2002) with perfunctory suggestions on contextual application (Wei, 2006; Gou, 2001). As part of suzhi jiaoyu, some western leadership models have been deemed necessary for improved headship (Walker et al, 2012). Varying concepts such as instructional leadership (e.g. Zhao, 2007; Peng, 20060, transformational leadership (e.g. Zhan, 2008; Shi, 2007) and distributed leadership (e.g. Feng, 2004; Hu, 2005) are present in the literature. Thus, the dichotomies between Chinese and western EL are not absolute (Gu, 2011). Law (2012, 2013) also warns against over-emphasising this separation.
Part 2

2.12 Introduction

In the second part of this literature review, I explore the meaning of culture by looking at some of its myriad definitions. I briefly describe the evolution of studies into societal culture and EL, followed by a review of two dated but relevant models in this area. I also examine Hofstede’s studies into culture and leadership and his findings on Zambia; I compare these findings to those of the GLOBE project, a study which analyses organisational norms, values and beliefs of leaders in over 60 different countries including Zambia. The implementation of distributed leadership (DL) in educational settings is heavily influenced by cultural beliefs; therefore, I conduct a critical discussion of it in this part of the literature review, as well as how gender egalitarianism in EL is influenced by culture. I also look at some studies that have been conducted into culture’s influence on EL, including specific reviews of EL literature in Singapore and Vietnam. I conclude by reviewing some recent literature on cross-cultural studies into EL.

2.13 The Meaning of Culture

A primary reason for the complexity of culture stems from the numerous disputed definitions of the word itself. Culture itself is perceived on several levels which vary; at the individual level, a person’s beliefs, values and experiences contribute to what they may construe as their culture. At societal level, the group dynamic becomes integral as suggested by Kluckhorn & Kroeberg (1952), cited in Black & Mendenhall (1990). They argue that culture refers to those patterns of behaviour acquired and generally shared within a group that function as a guide for future actions. Understandings of culture along similar lines abound. Tierney (1996: 372) defines culture as “those informal codes and shared assumptions of individuals who participate in an organisation” and stresses the inter-relatedness and mutual reliance that an organisation and its culture have. A sociological conceptualisation by Giddens (1989) defines culture as the values held by members of a given group that distinguish it from other groups.

Closer to a focus on my topic of EL, - Mitchell & Willower (1992:6) view culture as “the way of life of a given collective, particularly as reflected in shared values, norms, symbols
and traditions.” Dimmock & Walker (2005) simplify and exemplify culture as including the way a people dress, what they eat, their marriage customs, family life, religion, leisure pursuits and even art as expressed through language, thought and action as well as physical objects and representations such as books and paintings. Significantly though, culture is expressed through social interaction, as typified by how people relate to one another, make decisions and share experiences.

At societal level, a broader definition of culture allows for a wide-ranging analysis that includes attention to the operation of and relationships between such contextual factors as political, economic and religious influences. This contestation as to whether the notion of culture should incorporate these concepts enhances the complexity of and interest in studying culture. Dimmock & Walker (2005:8) argue that “since basic values constitute the essence of culture and both politics and religion are underpinned by such values, then a strong case can be made for claiming that culture underpins them both.” Furthermore, in line with the dynamic character of culture, they ponder over the possibility of including more contemporary societal changes. Sharpe & Gopinathan’s (2000) study of high achieving schools in Singapore, for example, develops an understanding of culture as traditional but encompassed by modernising influences. In similar vein, Bush & Haiyan (2000) view societal culture in China as a mixture of traditional, socialist, enterprise and patriarchal elements. The evolving nature of society may well be the reason why such unremarked influences are gaining prominence in the study of societal culture. Dimmock & Walker (2000) assert that cultures are dynamic entities that are always shifting and changing in response to various stimuli such as environmental conditions and advances in technology; therefore, some elements of culture may endure whilst others change or fade away. They agree that a broader definition of societal culture may be necessary if there is to be more accurate identification of why leaders do what they do.

In relation to my doctoral study of culture and EL, the question remains as to which definition of culture should guide analysis; the challenge affects conceptual and methodological decisions for the research.

At a micro level, further complexities abide, especially in relation to the individual within the society of organisation. In the enactment of EL, an individual’s personality, their
interpretation of societal values and beliefs and how this interacts with societal culture is an important factor that must be considered. Sharpe & Gopinathan (2000) acknowledge that, although school leaders in their study appropriated aspects of societal culture in their repertoire, the nature of this appropriation was personally distinctive and contributed greatly to the improvement of the school. Similarly, Law (2012) found that principals’ choices of and the combination of leadership traditions between Chinese and Anglo-American traditions were ultimately a personal choice, although some influences were informed by societal values.

The challenge, when studying culture, is to decide at what level this should occur, since all levels are inter-related and cannot realistically be considered in isolation. At the fundamental level, groups are constituted of individuals and it is these singular elements that make up the “way of life”. Conversely, the group as an organism also has an influence on the individual’s way of life. This study will therefore look at aspects of culture at both group and individual level towards a multi-layered representation of societal culture.

Even at group levels, variations will occur. Fan (2000) notes that Chinese culture and values are diverse whilst Law (2012) finds the same about western cultures. Stereotyping all western culture is clearly an over-simplification. Employing Dimmock & Walker’s (2005) definition of culture as a “way of life” simplifies the search for differences between French and English cultures, both broadly classified as western. An obvious example is the difference between French and British cuisine. In this contemporary era, migration due to increased mobility has left few cultures claiming any kind of homogeneity (Dimmock & Walker, 2005).

The classical concept of culture has been tested by globalisation which has influenced the state, local institutions, values and even identities (see Fukuyama, 1992; Waters, 1995). From a cultural perspective, David (2002) defines globalisation as the process of harmonising different cultures and beliefs whilst Castells (2010) predicts the eventual erosion of cultural differences towards a global system of homogenous economic values. In the context of this thesis, this has been seen largely through the importation of western educational systems across the globe as discussed in detail elsewhere in this thesis.
As time passes and with influence of many other factors such as assimilation, migration and globalisation, cultures change. This dynamism is typified by the contact between cultures resulting in the exchange of ideas and symbols; in some instances, one culture completely usurps another. Intermarriage also contributes to this blurring of boundaries between cultures (Dimmock & Walker, 2005).

Central to the conceptualisation and planning for this study is the influence of western educational theories, practices and systems, including the establishment of satellite schools and university campuses, especially in the Middle East and the Far East. Cheng (1998) argues that a society which implements foreign educational policies and practices will experience a shift in its values system because of the different cultural premises that underpin and are imported alongside the school system. This is also seen in the evolved value systems of societies that had alien values thrust forcibly upon them through colonialism. That is why Sharpe & Gopinathan (2000:82), describe Singaporean culture as an “evolving mix of traditional and modernising cultures” due to a complex influence of dominant political and economic factors.

2.13.1 Conclusion
Based on the preceding discussion, there is no simple answer to the challenge of defining culture when examining its influence on EL. Differences between sociological and anthropological definitions add to the controversial nature of this concept (Dimmock & Walker, 2005). It may be worthwhile to apply Peshkin’s (1992) observation that a conception of culture to fit any purpose would be a fitting solution to this quandary.

2.14 Culture and EL
Criticisms of the Anglo-centric nature of leadership and management in the areas of business and education were initially raised in the 1980s, with emphasis on how Anglo-American intellectual and cultural frameworks dominated the field whilst the influence of other cultures is under-explored (Law, 2012; Dimmock & Walker, 2000b). Such criticisms point to a growing realisation that different contexts have a hand in shaping theory, practice, and research within leadership management in the respective contexts thus leading to an approach which fosters cultural considerations (Ribbins & Gronn,
2000). This has subsequently led to the study of leadership and management in non-western societies (e.g. Fidler, 2000b; Hallinger & Leithwood, 1998; Begley, 2013; Sharpe & Gopinathan, 2013) that illustrate the significance of societal culture in shaping leadership and management in different societies. Such studies also begin to highlight the differences in leadership culture and tradition between western and non-western societies.

Non-western public education systems have been influenced quite strongly by models developed in western nations such as France, Great Britain and the United States (Hallinger & Leithwood, 1998). This legacy, usually of the colonial era, is still evident in many countries across the world. In Francophone nations, French educational techniques and structures are still in use as is the holdover of the British curriculum in many former British colonies. Even today, the British curriculum- as exemplified by the Cambridge International Curriculum (CIE) and the National Curriculum of England and Wales- is the most widely used international curriculum in international and independent schools the world over. This phenomenon is also partly a consequence of globalisation and has encouraged the homogenisation of educational values, programmes and practices across the globe. Hand in glove with the foreign curricula and systems of education are the western methods of administration and leadership.

However, the “one size fits all” approach to education, its values and philosophies across the globe is being questioned in certain areas, as certain square pegs of imported educational systems have been proven not to fit into the round holes of the host cultures- and not only the schools but the communities they serve. In post-apartheid, South Africa, the banning of corporal punishment has been questioned by communities which still strongly believe in the adage, “spare the rod and spoil the child” and that teachers’ in loco parentis duties extend to caning as they (teachers) are viewed as members of the “village that raises the child”. Conversely, the caning of an American student in Singapore during the mid-1990s caused a cross-cultural conflict which reverberated across the world and strained relations between Singapore and the United States (New York Times, 1994). The issue of limiting access to information on the internet to students is another which has caused friction between imported educational systems and the prevailing national cultures of host nations. Bajunid (1996) hails this as
the increasing confidence of developing nations to chart their own futures and assert
the validity of their cultural values.

Investigations into cultural influences and educational administration have been an area
of concerted study since the almost simultaneous publications of articles by Hallinger
(1995) and Cheng (1995) drawing attention to the need for an understanding of the
construct of societal culture. Dimmock & Walker (2000) led a call for more studies into
this area with one of the purposes being to build a balanced and inclusive knowledge
base of EL in different contexts. This call has resulted in the recognition of societal
culture as integral in the study of EL. Hallinger & Leithwood (1998) refer to this area as
an “unseen force” and Cheng (1995) as “the neglected dimension.”

Whilst the study of culture and educational administration primarily sought to balance
the prevalence of western culture and recognise other cultural contexts, there are other
equally significant reasons for integrating this dimension. Dimmock & Walker (2000)
hold that societal culture has the potential to be a powerful analytical tool for
developing a new branch of EL, management and policy, predicated on cross-cultural
analysis. Their rationale is that societal differences need to be identified to understand
cultural variations and similarities. They further argue (Dimmock & Walker 2000b) that
the very definition of culture as collective values and beliefs lends itself to the notion
that values, and beliefs underpin organisational structures, processes and practices
which in turn influence organisational behaviour. Citing Schneider (1991), they
acknowledge culture’s influence at individual, organisational and societal levels. Similar
notions are suggested by Hofstede (1991), who suggests that organisational behaviour
is the consequence of a complex interplay between personality and motives of
individuals, societal and organisational culture and the generic characteristics of human
nature.

Another marked reason for conducting cultural investigations into EL is associated with
the reformation of educational systems worldwide. Most policies and practices in the
educational reform movement stem from western philosophies (Dimmock & Walker,
2000a) and are implemented without cognisance of the cultures within which they are
imported, - a phenomenon called “policy cloning”, characterised by adopting policy
blueprints, management structures and leadership practices from elsewhere (Dimmock
& Walker, 1999). Whilst it may be argued that this is merely a symptom of globalisation which eases the transfer and availability of knowledge and practice, Hallinger & Leithwood (1998a) counter by suggesting that this transfer may confront educational leaders in a totally unrelated setting. This is supported by Steingard & Fitzgibbons (1995) who note that globalisation cannot be viewed as a value-free phenomenon, whilst Whitty et al (1998) caution against the adoption of policies across cultures without the recognition of the distinctive historical and cultural dimensions of the host country. Such risks are equally possible even where cultures may appear similar, as Seddon (1994) remarks of Australia’s adoption of US and UK educational developments.

Other reasons for investigating culture and EL include the need for critical exploration of the appropriateness of many western theories in non-western settings, the comparison of similarities and differences between structures, values and beliefs and the examination of two-way cross-cultural fertilisation of ideas (Dimmock & Walker, 2000). Up to the present day, most studies in this area are more focused on mapping frameworks for comparative research (e.g. Cheong, 2000; Ribbins & Gronn, 2000; Walker & Quong, 1998; Dimmock & Walker, 2000) or identifying the contexts and issues of identified countries (e.g. Lee & Pang, 2011; Stott & Tin, 2000; Bajunid, 1996; Sharpe & Gopinathan, 2013). There are several studies which are focused on laying the groundwork for further studies into this area, such as Dimmock & Walker (1998; 1999; 2000; 2005), Hallinger (1995) and Hallinger & Leithwood (1998). Where studies focus on specific countries, the preponderance is on East Asian countries (e.g. Law, 2012; Cheong, 2000; Bush & Haiyan, 2000; Stott & Tin, 2000). Regarding the rest of the world, the pickings are slim indeed. Bartlett (2008) investigates the influence of culture on teacher appraisal in Barbados, Shah (2006) looks at EL and Islam, Kyriakides (2010) examines the influence of culture on school administration and pupil attainment in Cyprus and Borbara (2005) studies culture and school management in an Arab school in Israel.

2.15 The Complexity of Studying EL and Culture

Dimmock & Walker (2000:110) state that the study of culture and educational administration is “complex and confusing”. Whilst it is acknowledged that culture has a profound influence on leadership and management of schools and educational systems,
articulating these influences is complicated because of the “human, conceptual and methodological complexities which surround and pervade its presence” (p. 110). Ribbins and Gronn (2000) speculate that there may be as many interpretations of the realities of headship as there are individuals and suggest that approaching the study of school leadership contextually may result in very broad findings that differ with each scenario.

Adding to the complexity of understanding leadership from a cultural perspective is the varying, sometimes even dichotomous definitions and understandings of apparently similar beliefs. Begley (2000) defines these cultural isomorphs as social conditions or value postures that appear to mean the same thing across different countries but consist of different elements. This concept applies just as aptly in the EL context. Taking educational improvement as an example, the terms and processes across countries may be similar; Canadians and Russians may both refer to, “goal setting”, “shared objectives”, and “establishing consensus”. However, in Russia, consensus would be something handed down from a centralised authority, whereas in Canada, it would be established by a group of professionals working together locally. The Russian interpretation reflects collective cultural mores whilst the Canadian meaning reflects social emphasis on norms of personal and professional autonomy (Begley, 2000).

Dimmock & Walker (2000) are clear in pointing out that this is still an emergent area of enquiry in the field of EL that must be approached in a measured fashion. They admit that the path forward will not be easy and that many complex issues and pitfalls will inevitably be raised as time goes by. Years later, Walker (2014) continues to decry the complexity of research in this area, highlighting the need for more methodologically sound and internationally accessible studies.

2.16 The Evolution of the Study of Culture and EL

Educational administration is a latecomer to the study of culture and management. Hofstede (1976) is credited with having conducted the seminal work on culture and management and is acknowledged as a source of influence on the field of cross-cultural management (Hallinger & Leithwood, 1998). Employing empirical studies and incorporating others’ conceptual frameworks, Hofstede has examined international differences in work-related values using a survey of corporate workforces. Before
Hofstede, Getzels et al (1968) and Fidler (1967) recognised that leadership is contingent on the context within which it is exercised and that human interaction within social systems reflects the values and behavioural norms that underlie the surrounding culture. Getzels et al (1968) proposed that cultural values are instrumental in shaping followers’ perceptions of leaders and that these perceptions may vary across cultures.

However, the work of Hofstede across 50 nations led to an initial and still widely used conclusion that value patterns across countries vary along four main dimensions, namely individualism - collectivism, power distance, uncertainty avoidance and masculinity - femininity (Hofstede, 1983). These dimensions aided in construction of a range of social behaviours across nations, behaviours towards people of higher rank, behaviours towards the group, by gender and disposition towards uncertainty.

This seminal work has shaped subsequent studies, with the framework being used as the initial building blocks. The original doctrine evolved further with the introduction of a fifth dimension, labelled “long term versus short term orientation”, which examines people’s focus on the future, the present and the past (Hofstede, 1991) and has been used as a cultural explanation of the East Asian miracle (Hofstede & Bond, 1988). A sixth dimension, Indulgence versus Restraint has evolved the framework even further (Hofstede et al, 2010).

The GLOBE project (Global Leadership and Organisational Behaviour Effectiveness), conceived in 1991 by Robert J. House, is intended as a correction to Hofstede’s work (Minkov & Hofstede, 2011). Constructed on a global basis involving 170 investigators in 62 world cultures, the GLOBE project constitutes the first major departure from Hofstede’s original paradigm. In the subsequent book, House et al (2004) explain that the GLOBE project does not view societal cultures as “nations” because the researchers are thinking as social anthropologists rather than as political scientists. Hofstede (2006) rebuts this by pointing out that he does not view scientific constructs, such as dimensions of national culture, as having a real existence.

The following two sub-sections discuss the findings of the GLOBE project and Hofstede on leadership and culture in Zambia.
2.16.1 GLOBE Project findings on Zambia

The GLOBE project studies CEOs (Chief Executive Officers) and Top Management Team members across different countries, with an interest in how a society’s culture influences leadership behaviours expected in that culture and whether leadership success depends on a CEO matching his/her leadership style to these societal expectations. The project builds upon, borrows from and endeavours to correct Hofstede’s work (Minkov & Hofstede, 2011) on national culture and the dimensions used to compare leadership. It examines 9 dimensions instead of Hofstede’s 6 dimensions. The 62 countries involved in the study were grouped into 10 regional clusters. The sub-Saharan cluster comprised five countries, namely, Nigeria, Namibia, South Africa, Zimbabwe and Zambia. This section examines the findings on Zambia from the GLOBE project.

Zambia scores high on Power Distance, - a dimension originated by Hofstede (1983) which examines the degree to which members of a collective expect power to be distributed equally. This high score means the community accepts authority, power differentials, status privileges and social inequality. Members of such societies do not expect power to be distributed evenly among citizens. As would be expected in a hierarchical society, Zambia scores low on assertiveness, - the degree to which individuals are assertive, confrontational and aggressive in their relationships with others (House et al, 2004). This score indicates an avoidance of public conflict for fear of losing face. Those further down the hierarchy will rarely confront their superiors.

Zambia scores high in Group Collectivism, - the degree to which individuals express pride, loyalty and cohesiveness in their organisations or families (House et al, 2004, 2013). This reflects Zambian society’s pride in varying levels of groupings, from family to work organisations. Society maintains close family ties, there is a marked emphasis on relatedness within groups and a strong distinction is made between in-groups and out-groups.

On Gender Egalitarianism, - the degree to which a collective minimises gender inequality-, the score for Zambia is low, meaning there are tensions between gender-equality policies and cultural practices. There are few women in positions of authority and a high level of occupational sex-segregation. This low score also suggests lower
levels of female educational attainment; furthermore, women have little or no decision-making roles in community affairs.

Another low score is on Future-Orientation, defined as the extent to which individuals engage in future orientated behaviours such as delaying gratification, planning and investing in the future (House et al, 2004). This low score indicates that Zambian society has a propensity towards spending rather than saving and that investment in the future is low. Furthermore, organisations in such a society tend to be inflexible and maladaptive. Material success and spiritual fulfilment are viewed separately, requiring trade-offs.

The GLOBE Project (2004; 2016) finds that Zambia’s societal values differ considerably from its cultural practices. The report shows that Zambians’ desire to be more future and performance orientated; they would also like to see a decrease in power-distance, an increase in gender-egalitarianism and to have more control over an unpredictable future. Zambian leaders are found to be highly charismatic, with high expectations and motivational abilities. They score high on team and humane orientation, indicative of supportive, considerate and generous leaders. However, autonomous leadership prohibits productivity.

Although these findings from the GLOBE project were garnered from business leaders in Zambia, their relevance to this study of EL and culture is significant, primarily because they share some marked similarities. This is further discussed in the Findings and Discussion chapter of the thesis.

2.16.2 Hofstede on Zambia

The Hofstede website, Hofstede Insights (2018) explores the culture of Zambia through the lens of the 6-dimension model to give an overview of its cultural drivers relative to other world cultures. This section summarises these findings, which, like those of the GLOBE project, bear relevance to this study because of their similarities to findings in this thesis.

Zambia records a high score for the power distance dimension, indicating that it is a hierarchical society within which everyone has a place and no justification or warrant is needed to maintain the status quo. This reflects inherent societal inequalities where
subordinates expect to be told what to do and the ideal boss is a benevolent autocrat; decisions are made centrally. The country is considered a collectivistic society; this manifests through strong commitments to member groups such as families and extended relationships. There are strong societal relationships in which group members take care of each other; loyalty is key and overrides rules and regulations. In the workplace, employer/employee relationships are perceived in moral terms, like a family; hiring and promotion decisions take account of whether the employee is part of the collective.

Zambia is considered a feminine society, with the dominant values being caring for others and where standing out from the crowd is not an admirable trait. The purpose of work is to live, not to accumulate wealth or pursue luxuries. Conflicts are resolved by compromise rather than confrontation. An effective manager is a supportive one.

When measuring long-term orientation, Zambia is rated a normative society which maintains and has great respect for time-honoured traditions, viewing societal change with suspicion. The focus is on quick results and there is a low propensity to save for the future. Nationally, there is a culture of restraint rather than indulgence. People feel their actions are restrained by social norms and indulgence is wasteful.

Uncertainty avoidance examines how a society deals with perceptions of the future and whether it should attempt to control it or just let things happen. Zambia scores an intermediate score; thus, no preference can be predicted.

2.17 Distributed Leadership

2.17.1 Introduction

This section explores the concept of distributed leadership (DL) in its position as a popular yet controversial (Harris, 2008) model of school leadership. Of significance is the move away from positional authority (Bush, 2013) and top-down heroic orthodoxy (Woods & Gronn, 2009) where leadership is the preserve of senior roles, towards an interactive, participative process which can be deployed by anyone within the organisation (Woods & Roberts, 2016). Equally important is a major goal of DL, - social justice - and how it fares against traditional power and authority. The position of democracy vis-à-vis DL is also explored.
Exploration of DL is significant within this thesis for several reasons. Firstly, my experience of school leadership as a teacher and senior leader in the United Kingdom contrasts markedly with my experiences in Africa. I am therefore interested in investigating the reasons for this. Secondly, this review finds assertions that African school leaders have shown resistance to democratic methods of leadership in favour of culturally embedded practices. I therefore would like to engage critically with literature on DL both internationally and in Africa to explore different opinions. Finally, several areas within the findings in this thesis show the claim that school leaders are resistant to democratic leadership methods to be true; preferences are seemingly for power and authority to remain in the hands of the few at the apex of the system.

2.17.2 A brief overview of DL

Bennett et al (2003:4) equate DL with “shared, collaborative, facilitative and leadership.” Harris (2008) adds teacher, student and community leadership to her overview, whilst further overlaps can be found from Pearce & Conger (2003), shared leadership, Gastil (1997), democratic leadership, Vroom & Yago (1998), participative leadership and Wallace (2002), collaborative leadership. However, few venture a succinct definition. Harris (2008) forwards a definition of DL as any practice of devolved, shared or dispersed leadership with the core premise being that leadership does not rest with an individual; rather it is a fluid property within which decisions and organisational influence are governed by the interaction of individuals. It also has the distinctive characteristic of being an emergent property, enabled by interactions between individuals (Woods & Roberts, 2013a), - what Gronn (2002b: 3) terms “concertive action” as opposed to additive action. This happens within an organisational culture that embraces contributions from all within it by widening the conventional net of leaders (Woods et al, 2004). The result is improved organisational effectiveness engendered by involving varieties of perspectives and capabilities according to the situation (Woods & Roberts, 2016).

2.17.3 DL and Democracy

Four ways are identified by Woods and Gronn (2009), in which democracy is expressed; i) liberal minimalism, which is concerned with protecting the citizenry from arbitrary rule and oppression from other citizens, ii) civic republicanism which emphasises the
common good and citizen participation in decision-making, iii) deliberative democracy, - the collective search for normative agreement beyond diverse views and interests and, iv) developmental democracy, which draws from the preceding models and prioritises the realisation of human potential through extensive citizen participation.

Woods (2011:139) further defines democratic values as, “inclusive participation, transforming dialogue and growth as whole persons with a feeling of connectedness socially, ecologically and spiritually, in line with the concept of holistic democracy.” From these and other extant models of democracy, three core elements of the democratic idea are forwarded, namely self-governance, protection from arbitrary power and legitimacy grounded in consent (Woods & Gronn, 2009).

This would appear to be a goal of DL. Commenting on democracy in educational institutions, Woods (2004:4) suggests that it is a rich and challenging concept which “entails the right to meaningful participation and respect for and expectations towards everyone as ethical beings.” He cites Fullan (2003) who emphasises that good EL is in the service of moral purpose. Woods (2004) further favourably compares democratic leadership and DL, noting that they share similar characteristics. Firstly, both have an emergent character arising from varying “forms of co-ordination that gives rise to concertive action” (p.7). Secondly, both are dispersed activities, not confined to a single leader, - consisting instead of collaborative actions in which the sum is greater than the parts.

However, despite apparent continuities between democratic leadership and DL, tensions exist. An examination of power and authority within DL reveals that, although fairness, social justice and democracy may be the goals, they are not necessarily the consequent reality (Woods, 2016). At Heathvale School, for example, Woods and Roberts (2016) found that DL does not always involve everyone equally; this is especially so with support staff and students. This “marginalisation of voices” (Lumby, 2013: 592) poses a danger to the good intentions of DL, as do established power differences and unthinking acceptance of prevailing assumptions. However, Woods (2016: 159) provides a pragmatic defence for these authority differentials,
Hierarchies may emerge, based on different forms of authority...Not all organisational members will or should be accorded equality in each form of authority.

Grant et al (2010: 404) express similar sentiments, emphasising that DL does not render principals and their authority redundant. They cannot abdicate their responsibilities, but, in a democratic environment, must instead become “leaders of leaders”.

Nevertheless, the concept of democracy in DL is questioned extensively. Polka & Litchka (2008) point out that undemocratic practices can be created by unwise distribution of leadership; examples are creation of professional victims, potential for bullying and abuses of power. Harris (2013a) provides accounts of DL where authority has been abused by those to whom it has been devolved. Others view DL as delegation disguised as a democratic process or a mechanism for delivering undemocratic, top-down practices (Hargreaves & Fink, 2009), whilst others see an attractively packaged method of getting more work out of teachers (Harris & DeFlaminis, 2016).

Such observations lead Woods & Gronn (2009) to assert that DL entails a democratic deficit; they argue that civil societies and the complex organisations that inhabit them do not necessarily share similar bases. Societies may be democratically governed whereas organisations within them do not enshrine the principles of democracy. This dissonance is explained away by the citizenry’s contentment with non-democracy within organisations such as families and workplaces if political systems are democratic.

2.17.4 DL and Social Justice

Woods and Roberts (2016) define social justice as the lessening or elimination of unfair equalities in socio-economic resources, participation in decision-making, respect for personal identity and beliefs and opportunities for personal development. A consensus by commentators on social justice is that “it is about legitimacy, fairness and welfare” (Ryan, 2006:5). The four aspects of social justice are developmental justice (DVJ), participative justice (PJ), cultural justice (CJ) and distributive justice (DSJ), (Woods & Roberts, 2013). Scholars of DL (e.g. Ryan, 2004; Blackmore, 1999; Marshall, 2004) stress that it should not be approached analytically; rather that it must be about deeper moral purpose. Ryan (2006:4) emphasises that social justice is one such purpose, stating that
“schools must do their part in contributing to a world that is fair for everyone” whilst Stacey (2012) adds that emergent leadership is neither emancipatory nor wonderful since it can have good (democracy) or bad (dictatorship) results.

Increased attention to diversity in schools highlights the divisions between the advantaged and disadvantaged (Ryan, 2006). Power and resource differences between various stakeholders in an organisation give rise to restrictions in their capacity to influence decisions (Woods & Roberts, 2013); input into decisions that dictate policy tends to be exercised by a limited number of people. Such inequalities, argues Ryan (2006), are not random but informed by such distinctions as ethnicity, race, social class and gender. Ryan (2006: 7) adamantly points out that “leadership and social justice are not natural bedfellows” referring primarily to traditional concepts of leadership which vest decision-making authority with a few individuals and are inconsistent with social justice or inclusion.

The moral purpose of DL is to democratise leadership and infuse it with social justice, thus eliminating wider social hierarchies and injustices. In this vein, Elmore (2000) argues that DL provides conducive conditions for achieving equity, whilst Leverett (2002) recognises the advantages of collaborative leadership in creating a sense of purpose and mission as well as developing an organisational culture that sets high expectations for all.

Nevertheless, aspirations and reality do not always match; implementation of DL may not necessarily result in social justice but can in fact generate or widen disparities in power (Woods & Roberts, 2013). Within schools, students have been found to benefit the least from DL. Frost & Roberts (2016) attribute this disparity to traditional views of leadership roles which automatically exclude students, most teachers and support staff. Scribner & Bradley-Levine (2010) identify a “cultural logic” that affords some teachers more authority than others. At Heathvale School, Woods & Roberts (2016) find variables that affect levels of participation and voice, especially for support staff and students, with some feeling ill-placed for participation compared to their peers. They argue that hierarchical structures play an important role in curtailing the realisation of social justice in DL. Thus, students and staff feel far removed from the epicentre of respect, using
such phrases as “up the school” or being “at the bottom of the pyramid” to describe this distance.

The following section examines DL in African contexts.

2.17.5 DL in African Schools

Various searches for scholarly articles on DL in African schools have returned limited results. Some studies have been conducted in South Africa but very little has been conducted in the rest of the continent.

The difference with South Africa lies in the concerted bid after 1994 to avoid the pitfalls observed in recently independent countries such as Zimbabwe and Zambia. This was achieved through highly publicised legislation propounded on African values of togetherness and coexistence as epitomised by the principles of Ubuntu. The concept of Ubuntu is underpinned by such values as solidarity, respect, dignity, compassion and survival (Mbigi, 1997). Thus, the post-apartheid constitution is based on democracy, equal citizenship and the protection of fundamental human rights (Williams, 2011). The South African Schools Act (1996) is the basis of democracy and participation in the leadership of schools. It codifies the establishment of School Governing Bodies (SGBs) and School Management Teams (SMTs) in all schools, recognising the rights of teachers, parents, students and the wider school community in the shared administration of the school. Williams (2011) views the establishment of these systems as the early groundwork for DL.

No doubt the idea of a system of school leadership within which the “superhero image” (Sergiovanni, 2001: 55) of the head is relegated to the margins of history is an attractive one for educators and policy-makers alike. Headship in the 21st century has become more complex (Naicker & Mestry, 2011); any offers of assistance should ideally be embraced. South African teachers have embraced the notion of DL (see Grant et al, 2010; Sibanda, 2017; de Villiers & Pretorius, 2011) but findings indicate that DL has still not taken root despite moves at policy level towards participatory and emergent leadership. De Villiers & Pretorius (2011) report that teachers believe themselves through attitude, belief and values, to be ready for teacher leadership; however, they require further professional development to build leadership capacity. Furthermore,
the practice of leadership beyond the classroom is limited. Sibanda (2017) sees this limitation as a threat to DL and its benefits; she attributes this danger to new policies working against old systems. She blames the legacy of apartheid which still lives on “because the conditions that characterised the racially segregated schools during apartheid and their influence upon leadership still prevail.” (p. 567)

Moreover, it is not just the system but the people who have not evolved with the times. Having historically been the central authority, with minimal teacher participation, many principals in South Africa continue to be power-hungry (Wyk, 2010), a condition Naicker & Mestry (2013) believe emanates from fearing the loss of power; this creates an environment within which teacher agency in their own destinies will be frustrated (Williams, 2011).

However, head-teachers alone are not to blame; teachers’ perceptions of school leadership and DL contribute to the problem. Traditional and historical beliefs still place leadership firmly in the person of the principal. This was the case with schools during the apartheid era, with the purpose of separating educational systems with separate purposes, values and leadership styles. Pelser & Van Wyk (2016) argue that these characteristics are still operational in schools today. Taylor (2009: 19) believes South African teachers “have not transcended this dependence culture fostered by successive authoritarian regimes over the last three centuries”, still believing in the ultimate authority of the principal. Consequently, attempts to distribute leadership have been unsuccessful (Grant, 2008).

2.17.6 Conclusion

DL, not unlike culture, has the challenge of having myriad definitions, interpretations, practices and meanings (Woods et al, 2004). Whilst it has proven an attractive concept, opinions vary as to what it entails and how it is conceptualised and enacted (Harris & DeFlaminis, 2016). There is a lack of consensus about how DL is enacted in practice. Harris (2008) for example, celebrates the renewed emergence of teacher, student and community leadership with the advent of DL, but later denounces as convenient, the description of DL as “any form of shared, collaborative or extended leadership” (Harris, 2013: 547).
Furthermore, the shifts in the dynamics of power, authority and control predicated by DL can cause tensions, especially with principals in contexts where the personal accountability of the head-teacher for school performance is paramount. A further consideration is the need to understand and properly apply authority and control in the enactment of DL. Harris (2013) gives examples of the erosion of heads’ formal authority resulting from abuse of DL. However, Woods (2016) advocates understanding the complementary and competing authorities that attend DL, pointing out that DL does not mean an equal share in authority; rather, new hierarchies may emerge based on new authorities. These alternative authorities could include democratic, interior, rational and communal authority.

An examination of power and authority within DL reveals that fairness, social justice and democracy may be the goals but not the consequent reality (Woods, 2016). At Heathvale School, Woods & Roberts (2016) report that DL doesn’t involve everyone equally, especially support staff and students. This “marginalisation of certain voices” (Lumby, 2013: 592) poses a danger to the good intentions of DL as do established power differences and unthinking acceptance of prevailing assumptions. However, Grant et al (2010) counter that DL does not render principals and their authority redundant; they suggest that principals cannot abdicate their responsibility, but in a democratic environment, must instead become leaders of leaders.

Polka and Litchka (2008) point out some undemocratic practices that can emanate from unwise DL practices; examples are the creation of professional victims, the potential for bullying and abuse of power. Harris (2013a) provides accounts of DL where responsibility and authority have been abused by those to whom leadership has been devolved. DL is viewed by some as little more than delegation disguised as a democratic process with a warning that it may be a mechanism for delivering decidedly undemocratic top-down practices (Hargreaves & Fink, 2009). Others view it as an attractively packaged way of getting more work out of teachers (Harris & DeFlaminis, 2016). In South Africa, Msila (2008) provides a vignette where teachers felt they were being made to do the principal’s work when DL practices were introduced.
2.18 Gender Equality and EL

This section examines gender inequality both internationally and in Africa, with a focus on Zambia and its Southern African neighbours. I explore it because low gender egalitarianism is one of the findings discussed later in this thesis.

The study of gender equality and school leadership originates from the works of Schmuck (1975, 1987) and Shakeshaft (1981, 1987). The main theme is the under-representation of women in EL, - an issue which affects women in most countries. The main reasons for this are culturally underpinned with recognition that the teaching profession is generally feminised, yet stereotypical assumptions are that women are too delicate, emotionally unstable and indecisive to cope with the prolonged intellectual demands of headship (Ouston, 1993; Wilking, 2001). The need for women to take time off for childbirth and to raise children is viewed by many as a lack of interest in a career (Chipunza, 2003). Their role as homemakers is perceived as a drawback to their ability to take on additional responsibilities of EL, especially in societies deeply rooted in traditional culture (Saint, 1992). Linked to this is the traditional practice in patriarchal societies of placing men over women. In many societies, husbands are accepted as the main providers with wives expected to submit to them (Fan, 2000).

In some areas of England, Fuller (2009) comments that the female head-teacher is an endangered species. However, the transition towards greater representation of women among heads has been a slow but positive one. Fuller (2017) later reports a 14% increase in the proportion of female heads in the UK from 25% in 2001 to 38% in 2015, suggesting that gender parity may be achieved in 2040 at the current rate of progress. The US has also seen a bucking of the trend, with the National Centre for Education Statistics (2016) reporting that women account for 52% of principals in public schools. Nevertheless, Robinson et al (2017) find that the position of superintendent still eludes women, with men four times more likely to serve as superintendents than women.

However, studies of gender and EL surpass mere representational figures to encompass such areas as female heads’ experiences in different contexts (e.g. Robinson, 2014), socialisation and stereotyping (e.g. Cubillo & Brown, 2003), aspects of women’s lives and career paths (e.g. Moorosi, 2010) as well as casual factors influencing low
representation of women in EL. The area is a vast one; this literature review will focus on African women and women of colour. The following section examines some extant literature in this area. The significance of this literature stems from the focus on black women and women of colour in their quest to become school leaders; it reveals the chronic under-representation of this group of women in EL and the challenges they face when in leadership positions. It also illustrates how much more difficult it is for a woman of colour to attain headship and be recognised for more than her gender and race.

2.18.1 Black Women, Women of Colour and EL

International studies seem to have focused on white western women and less on black women and women of colour. Campbell-Stephens (2009) identifies this as an area requiring further investigation whilst Lane (2008) further espouses the need to dispel myths and stereotypes around race. Showunmi & Kaparou (2017) echo similar sentiments, commenting that theoretical and empirical studies on women and EL focus on English-speaking countries like the UK, the US and New Zealand. The connection between women across cultures as mothers and nurturers cannot be denied, but there is a paucity of literature representing and analysing the unique voices and experiences of black women (Curtis, 2017). Citing hooks (1984), she highlights the different life experiences of women of different races, particularly the advancement of black women into an environment which uses racist and gender stereotypes to define identity and behaviour. Such factors as accent, choice of dress and hairstyle separate black women from those dominant within their society.

Factors affecting black women’s advancement into EL are myriad and vary contextually, although the dominant position is the culturally underpinned one that men are the natural leaders and women should be mothers and homemakers (Coleman, 2005; Blackmore et al, 2006). Culture, race and ethnicity are the main factors affecting the appointment of women in South Africa and their chances of promotion continue to be affected by historical state controls, the patriarchal relations built into Bantu Education and cultural stereotypes (Mahlase, 1997; Moorosi et al, 2017). The lot of black women in South Africa remains largely unchanged. Their experiences are still compromised by cultural and traditional systems which permeate the school system, resulting in black female principals devoting emotional and intellectual energies towards fighting sexist
cultural attitudes instead of managing schools (Moorosi, 2010). The same is seen in the USA, where black female school leaders face uncertainty, lack of respect and public humiliation based their race and gender (Robinson, 2014). In the UK, an Afro-Caribbean head-teacher relates a story of how visitors to her school have often bypassed her in the belief that her white secretary is the head-teacher (Showunmi & Kaparou, 2017).

Showunmi & Kaparou (2017), in their study of Black British, Malaysian and Pakistani female principals attribute the masculine leadership characteristics displayed by their respondents to this treatment. Their freedom to be themselves is stifled by the required masking of their true selves to fit into a white, male-dominated society (Brown, 2014; Jones & Shorter-Gooden, 2003).

The situation in this introduction derives mostly from the UK, USA and South Africa. The next section examines the sparse literature on women and EL in Zambia. The status of women in African society is generally one of subservience to men, - a belief and practice stemming from the cultural conviction that men are dominant and entitled to lead family and other groupings. Although sparse, the literature reviewed in the following section illustrates how Zambian women are marginalised from leadership from the outset through denial of equal educational opportunities.

2.18.2 Gender and EL in Zambia
The marginalisation of Zambian women in EL requires an examination of a school system that has historically allowed the gender-gap to widen over the years, despite perceived state efforts to reverse it. The problem of Out-Of-School-Children (OOSC) is endemic worldwide, with approximately 263 million children reported to be out of school; 32.3% of these are in sub-Saharan Africa and 52.2 million are female (UNESCO, 2018). The United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF, 2014) estimates that there are half a million OOSC in Zambia. At secondary-school level over 44 thousand girls are out of school, more than double the number of boys. Over a quarter of women over 25 years of age have no education at all (tradingeconomics.com, 2018). Gender disparity in the country is attributed to the following factors; early sexual debut, intergenerational sex, teenage pregnancy, sexual abuse, early marriage, opportunity cost associated with educating girls, girl-unfriendly school structures, gendered roles and responsibilities and parental age of education.
At the end of the last century, Davies (1990) reported that women constituted 15% of head-teachers in Zambia. No current data is available. The Zambia Central Statistical Office (2015) reports that women make up 57% of the teaching workforce but account for less than half the student bodies at the country’s main universities; 44% at the University of Zambia (UNZA) and 24% at the Copperbelt University. The same report shows that women make up 15% of members of parliament and 17.4% of the cabinet.

In the teaching profession, the deployment of female teaching staff, particularly unmarried ones, has posed a challenge. Rural communities are especially reluctant to accept female teachers for religious and cultural reasons (UNESCO, 2016).

The government and aid organisations have made efforts to address these disparities. The National Policy on Education, entitled Educating Our Future (1996), committed to providing education for all Zambians and valuing them based on their personal worth irrespective of gender, ethnic origin or other discriminatory characteristics. Strategies included an equal quota system for boys and girls at grades 1, 8 and 10, boys’ only secondary schools were converted into co-educational institutions and a re-entry policy was implemented for girls who had left school to give birth. The National Gender Policy (2000) ensured equal treatment for women in all workplaces. With the assistance of some aid organisations, programmes for the retention of girls were established; these included the Programme for the Advancement of Girls’ Education (PAGE) and the Campaign for Female Education (CAMFED). Studies on the results are cautious, recognising that other factors, such as the construction of more schools may have contributed to increased enrolment and retention of girls in education (Nkosha et al, 2013).

Furthermore, other factors have been identified that show deliberate gender bias in schools. Mumba (2002) reports instances where girls have been made to feel inferior from an early age in school. Officially sanctioned school textbooks depict girls as delicate beings in need of rescuing while boys are strong, problem-solvers who always take the lead. Girls are made to feel less intelligent and at home, they are expected to take on more chores than boys. Bajaj (2009) reports on the success a Ndola school has had in attempting to undo gender by destabilising norms of gender subordination and gender-based violence.
2.18.3 Conclusion

In Zambia, the role, position and treatment of women is culturally ingrained and informs their status societally; EL is also affected, resulting in women’s under-representation. An exhaustive search shows no current data on the proportion of female head-teachers, - the most recent is from Davies (1990).

2.19 Models of EL and Culture

Several models have been forwarded. Two significant, though somewhat dated ones are Dimmock & Walker’s (2005) Cross-Cultural Framework for Comparative EL and Hallinger & Leithwood’s (1998) framework.

Hallinger & Leithwood (1998) propose a model of school culture based on interactions between school context, leadership, school outcomes and in-school processes. Drawing on Bossert et al (1982), they identify community and institutional contexts as societal factors influencing EL. These include socio-economic status, parental expectations, school location, degrees of decentralisation and institutional funding levels. Furthermore, citing Boyan (1998), Hallinger & Leithwood emphasise the significance of principals’ personal characteristics such as values, experiences and beliefs as pointers to the enactment of EL. These are sentiments echoed by other scholars (e.g. Leithwood et al, 1992; Dwyer, 1986; Cuban, 1988). The role of the principal is recognised as an evolving one, which should be studied from different angles, with an understanding that leadership processes are influenced by societal culture.

Hallinger & Leithwood (1998) recognise culture as an integral part of their model, particularly the school learning culture which includes vision, values and whole-school expectations. Additionally, stakeholder approaches to school outcomes are a key expectation. These include test scores, discipline and parent satisfaction. Certainly, exam scores are important in Chinese schools, whereas Canadian schools do not emphasise them. In Malaysia, schools prioritise culturally-based school outcomes (Bajunid, 1996).

Dimmock & Walker’s (2005) framework recognises a constant interaction between four elements, - leadership & management, organisational structure, curriculum and teaching & learning. The model recognises the core purpose of the school to be teaching
and learning and that curriculum provides guidelines for the delivery of knowledge, skills and attitudes. Curricular goals influence EL; for example, colonial goals for African schools were to educate indigenes to a level thought to be enough for menial labour (see Nwasosike & Onyije, 2011; Aissat & Djafri, 2011; Sherif, 2008). Post-independence Zimbabwe’s curriculum emphasised agricultural activity to improve food production at subsistence level (Mashingaidze, 1997). Adopting Hofstede’s (1980) dimensions, Dimmock & Walker (2005) compare such organisational dispositions as process or outcome orientation as well as task or people orientation.

2.19.1 Conclusion
Both models recognise the limitations of these initial proposals; Dimmock & Walker (2005) and Hallinger & Leithwood (1998) caution against wholesale adoption of their models because of myriad variables still to be investigated, such as relationships between institutions and societal culture and personal values. They also warn against oversimplifying and reducing culture.

2.20 Some investigations of Culture and EL
Most studies around EL and culture continue to be from East Asia, with China leading the way (Walker & Qian, 2015). However, it would be erroneous to assume that China holds the monopoly in this field of study. Some significant literature has also emerged from Singapore and Vietnam. The significance of these studies stems from these countries’ cultural similarities to Zambia in their approach to EL including centralised hierarchical structures, bureaucratic leadership styles, high power distance, strong socio-political controls and low levels of participation in decision-making. On the other hand, countries like Laos, Myanmar and Indonesia have contributed little (Hallinger & Bryant, 2013; Walker & Hallinger, 2015).

A wide range of approaches to various areas in EL have resulted in several findings touching on such areas as school improvement, leadership policy, staff development and pupil attainment. Of note have been studies on the influence of religion on EL (e.g. Shah, 2016; Samier, 2015) and many studies examining gender and EL globally (e.g. Shah & Shah, 2012; Carvalho & Diogo, 2018).
There has been an increase in cross-cultural studies as advocated by Miller (2016) and Walker & Hallinger (2015). Indeed, Miller (2016) argues that single-country studies limit opportunities for deep cross-cultural analysis; he further asserts that, two-country comparisons may also be inadequate. This position champions one research method over others. There is a place for the study of individual countries’ cultures and EL. Such approaches in China have made it a leader in the field as seen in section 2.11 on China in this literature review. Moreover, it is Miller (2016) who warns against juxtaposition of developed against developing countries, cautioning against the tendency to typecast practice in the latter as problematic and in need of improvement. An example is the denigration of paternalistic leadership (e.g. Jackman, 1994; Jermier, 1998) whereas other single-country studies have found redeeming features in this practice (e.g. Martinez, 2003; Cakar & Kim, 2015; Chou et al, 2015).

China has been examined in detail earlier in this review. The following section reviews and discusses single-country studies in Singapore and Vietnam because of the cultural parallels they share with Zambia.

2.20.1 Singapore

Using a post-positivist biographical approach, Boon & Stott (2003) investigate the influence of formative years on headship. They identify personal factors as definitive to the principals’ enactment of headship. They identify family background, religion, life experiences and work experiences as factors shaping the values and beliefs of principals in early headship. Chew et al (2003) recognise the influences of friends, teachers and other head-teachers as key to the development of principals in Singapore. Retna’s (2011) investigation of the importance of ‘personal mastery’ in Singapore principals practices shows positive correlation between principals’ ‘personal mastery’ and their ability to manage schools. Principals with high levels of self-reflexivity are found to shape their own beliefs, values and expectations whilst those with low levels, are shaped by their environment.

Contextual factors play an important role in shaping EL in Singapore. Stott & Low (2000) apply Hofstede’s four initial dimensions to assess contextual influences on school leaders. A crucial finding is the wide power gap between school leaders and their superordinates at district level, which reflects a centralised, hierarchical culture, with a highly
regulated socio-political framework. Stott & Low (2000) characterise Singapore as a masculine society, as seen in principal’s assertiveness. Sharpe & Gopinathan (2000) explain this juxtaposition with Confucian values by pointing out the mix between tradition and modernising cultures, negotiated and legitimised in terms of national interests. Ng et al (2015) investigate these tensions to find that, considering western-influenced reforms, principals allow for teacher-involvement in decision-making and change management. However, Lim (2006) argues that head-teachers are still hesitant to engage teachers in organisational change because they (heads) feel ultimately accountable for the school; they also do not want to be perceived as delegating excessively or abdicating their responsibilities.

2.20.2 Vietnam

Soviet influence on Vietnam’s education system has been a significant factor in EL since the fall of the Soviet Union. The bureaucratic nature of the Vietnamese education system manifests in several ways. Principals’ roles as state and party functionaries are reflected by their mandatory membership of the Communist Party and by their being referred to as ‘government officers’. The authority of the state and the party are intertwined in the administration of schools (Hallinger et al, 2015; Truong, 2013). Akin to the Chinese Party Secretary, Vietnam has People’s Committees which implement educational policy nationally under the government’s direction. Educational reforms have had little influence on the vertical relationship between state and school. Maintenance of political stability and cultural transmission are the system’s highest priorities, reflected by a strong focus on political and cultural values in schools (Tran, 2011, 2012; Truong, 2013; Trang, 2012; Hallinger et al, 2015).

Like China, Vietnamese culture has a strong Confucian influence, which reinforces high power distance through hierarchical authority and collectivism. Principals emphasise their political and managerial roles in school. Knowing one’s place and role is fundamental to building successful relationships (Truong, 2013) as is the importance of maintaining connections with supervisors (Bui & Nguyen, 2010; Truong, 2013; Nguyen, 2011). It is this social culture which shapes authority relations in principals’ role behaviour; they look ‘upwards and outwards’ (Hallinger et al, 2015: 454) and whilst they may recognise the value of teacher engagement, it remains limited. Confucian values
have fostered a habit of obedience and a desire to maintain group harmony among teachers. There is a reluctance by teachers to offer input into school decisions or to challenge leaders’ decisions whilst principals themselves demonstrate similar attitudes towards their superiors in political and bureaucratic authority (Truong, 2013).

2.21 Cross-Cultural Studies

Cross-cultural research into EL has increased recently. Miller (2016) brings together several investigations of culture and EL through different lenses; most though, cross-culturally examine gender and EL and are cited in section 2.18 (e.g. Showunmi & Kaparou, 2017; Moorosi et al, 2017).

Conway et al (2016) explore the role of school leaders in leading school improvement by comparing cross-cultural stories of practice in South Africa, Canada and Australia. They identify two main factors as contributory to principals’ perceptions of school leadership, namely context and the relationship between the school and the system. All participants share a positive outlook towards school improvement. South African head-teachers highlight the positive impact of the school evaluation process and how it uses teamwork and teacher engagement. In Australia, they appreciate the sense of ownership inculcated by the school improvement process and in Canada, participants highlight the development and maintenance of good relationships and collegial atmospheres built on trust. The main cultural difference between the developed and developing nations is decision-making; Australian and Canadian leaders acknowledge the importance of collaborative decision-making, which has developed greatly. However, in South Africa, the shared process stops shy of decision-making, which rests firmly in the hands of the principal, - a reflection of the hierarchical, paternalistic nature of the society.

Miller’s (2018) investigation of entrepreneurialism in sixteen countries shows that entrepreneurial leadership is becoming more common globally because of reduced government spending on education. With new challenges wrought by budget cuts, school leaders must operate in new ways to be resourceful, creative and business-like; entrepreneurial leadership culture emerges when schools must be resourceful to improve. This is newer to leaders in developed countries than in developing countries.
where it is the norm for the survival of schools. Head-teachers have, however, raised concerns that the amount of time spent on entrepreneurial activities takes away from the core activities of the school, whilst others accept it as the new reality.

In Tanzania, South Africa and England, an investigation by Middlewood et al (2017), of cultures of inter-school collaboration, aims to discover the instrumentality of head-teachers in forging these links. In South Africa, principals have embraced peer-to-peer collaboration, describing it as mutual-learning aimed at improvement. English heads take a more conservative view, insisting on bespoke solutions rather than wholesale adoption of the strategy. However, once ground-rules have been established and accepted, they report useful learning from the process. The Tanzanian context is fraught with challenges of geographical isolation, lack of resources, teacher absenteeism and low pupil achievement. Heads whole-heartedly embrace opportunities to liaise with peers, calling it a breath of fresh air, especially when they discover they face similar challenges. Furthermore, new principals appreciate learning from experienced ones.

Miller’s (2016) insistence on cross-cultural research allows for a level of comparability that has hitherto been missing from the field and the development of a body of evidence from multiple country contexts (Miller, 2018). Such levels of comparability and evidence from different country contexts have also informed my own thesis focus.

2.22 Conclusion

Considering this review of literature and the identification of the key arguments that underpin the focus of my study, I formulated the following research questions:

1. What cultural values, beliefs and practices influence EL in the school?
2. How do these cultural values, beliefs and practices influence the enactment of EL in the school?
3. How far does the concept of Ubuntu influence EL?

I turn in the next chapter to presenting the research design developed to generate data useful for addressing these research questions.
Chapter 3: Methodology

3.1 Introduction: The Research Questions Restated

This chapter presents the research design which I planned to generate, analyse and present the data to address the research questions. The research design was aimed at answering the following research questions;

1. What cultural values, beliefs and practices influence EL in the school.
2. How do these cultural values, beliefs and practices influence the enactment of EL in the school?
3. How does the concept of Ubuntu influence EL?

3.2 Interpretive Assumptions Underpinning the Study

The research questions which have shaped this study seek to interpret and understand leadership in Zambian schools from the starting point of the perspectives and accounts of experiences of Zambian school leaders in context of their day-to-day professional work (Gephart, 1999). The study has been informed by a set of interpretivist assumptions centred on the importance of the meanings, constructs and interpretations that Zambian leaders use to describe, account for and make sense of the personal and professional worlds of their exercise of leadership in their schools.

Using meaning-making, the richness of lived experiences and multiple interpretations as its primary foci, interpretivism is explicitly subjective (Saunders et al, 2016). Axiologically, in my role of researcher, my values and experiences influenced my interpretation of the research materials and the data and played an important role in the conduct of the research, the relationship-building at the heart of the process, and analysis and interpretation of the accounts developed with Zambian school leaders. Ontologically, I was open to the possibility that different participants in the study might articulate multiple meanings, convey different personal realities and bring different interpretations to their accounts of their experiences as Zambian school leaders. Giorgi (1992:121) explains, ‘even as one is accounting for a phenomenon, one is aware that arguments for other accounts could also be given.’ Epistemologically, claims to knowledge have been grounded in the detailed painstaking and iterative analysis of the stories and narratives that Zambian school leaders were so generous in sharing with me.
The emphasis of this study was on the accounts of subjective perspectives and personal interpretations constructed by my key informants. Their accounts provided access to personal portrayals of their understandings of culture and leadership practices. More positivist assumptions of an underlying reality of order and universalism (e.g. Saunders et al, 2016) were not influential in my planning and design of the research I report in this thesis.

3.3 An Inductive Mode of Analysis

Because my starting point for understanding school leadership in the distinctive Zambian context was the perspectives, practices, constructs and language which school leaders in Zambia used in developing their accounts, my mode of analysis was inductive; it was the language, constructs and meanings of the leaders themselves that laid the basis for understanding themes and categories and relationships between them. Working with my data inductively in this way, I deliberately rejected any a priori frameworks from the wider literature. The risk here would be to colour my analysis with constructs developed in another, quite foreign and (considering arguments developed in my literature review) most likely western context and understanding of leadership. The focus of the analysis needed to be unambiguously on the meanings expressed by leaders in situ in Zambia. Therefore, while acknowledging the usefulness of more generalised knowledge of extraneous theory and research literature, the inductive approach to analysis I adopted aimed to amplify and give full recognition and representation of the meanings expressed by Zambian school leaders in their accounts of leadership (Saunders et al, 2016).

As a starting point for investigating the influence of culture on EL, I chose to focus on interactions at one school in Zambia in the form of a case study. My rationale for using this research method were informed by several factors. I subscribed to Yin’s (2014) position that case study research is used to contribute to knowledge of individual, groups, organisational and complex social phenomena. In formulating my research questions, I recognised that I was seeking to “explain some present circumstances” as is indeed what case studies set out to do. Additionally, this project encapsulates the definition of case study in that it studies specific contextual conditions (Trochin, 2001; Yin, 2014; the context here is one school in Zambia. Stake’s (1994) contested definition
of case study as a choice of object to be studied, applies in that the school qualifies as
the “functioning specific” object of study. Furthermore, the condition that the
boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clear (Johnson, 1994; Yin, 2009)
lends itself to this project because phenomenon and context are not always
distinguishable in real-life situations. This research design also concurs with Bassey’s
(2002) assertion that case study is an explanation of the unknown; to my knowledge,
there have been no studies into the influence of culture on EL in Zambia.

Therefore, based on the research questions, the phenomenon (culture), and the context
(school) around which informants’ roles and functions could be drawn (Bassey, 2002;
Hitchcock & Hughes, 1995), I considered case study to be the appropriate means of
conducting my small-scale exploratory study. I set out to gain a deep understanding of
the specific context of the school and worked hard to develop a great deal of contextual
and exemplified detail as well as thick description in my collection of data (Hammersley,
1992). That way, I had more confidence in the authenticity and trustworthiness of my
findings, if they were developed through analysis of such detailed and richly
contextualised data from multiple-sources of information (Cresswell, 2013).

3.4 A Constructivist Approach to Case Study Research

Case study research has generally been supported through often indiscriminate citation
for the differing philosophical perspectives these methodologists bring to case study
(Boblin et al, 2013); Yin (2003, 2009, 2014) adopts a post-positivist approach whilst
Stake’s (1994, 1995, 2005) is constructivist. My research project has been developed
using the constructivist approach.

The constructivist ontological position treats truth and reality subjectively; in fact, the
constructivist view is that truth and reality are understood and rendered through the
perspectives and understanding of human agents (Boblin et al, 2013; Crabtree & Miller,
1999).

This thesis focuses on uncovering hitherto unknown elements of cultural influence on
Zambian EL rather than proving or disproving existing hypotheses. My methodology
relied on discovery and interpretation to occur concurrently in a naturalistic paradigm,
through which I sought happenings, with interpretation being the primary method of understanding (see Stake, 1995, 2005; Boblin, 2013).

In conducting this study, I believed the best results could be achieved by lessening the distance between myself as the researcher and the respondents, - a constructivist approach aimed at supporting informants’ contextualised accounts of their lived experiences. I felt my quest for authentic data, bias-laden or not, would be limited by detachment, neutrality and independence from the research matter.

3.5 Benefits and Limitations of Case Study Research

Case study methodology received methodological perspective in the 1980s, with the evolution of qualitative research methods (Merriam, 2009). Despite its large following, there are criticisms of limited scientific value (Elman et al, 2016; Merriam, 2009) although Gerring (2004) counters that many scientific works are generated by case studies, despite the method being held in low regard, a sentiment echoed by Cronin (2014) who champions the legitimacy of case study research. Understandably, case study research has its fair amount of advantages and disadvantages.

3.5.1 Advantages

A strength of case study research is its ability to “take on real-life situations as they unfold in practice” (Flyvbjerg, 2006: 235; Zaidah, 2007), thereby obtaining detailed, relevant data in context (Jacobsen, 2002) and allowing for detailed analysis in individual cases. Merriam (2009) elaborates that researchers can get closer to their areas of interest through direct observation in the natural environment. Data is thus examined within the context of its use, not as the artificial isolation of a phenomenon as obtains in experiments (Gomm, 2000; Yin, 1984).

Another advantage is the broad catchment area for information provided by case study research, as opposed to the narrow focus of experiments and surveys (Merriam & Nillson, 1994); often, unanticipated information can be caught in this wide web, allowing for the creation of hypotheses, helping to structure future research and advancing the field’s knowledge-base (Jacobsen, 2002; Merriam, 2009). Shields (2007) adds that case studies make no attempts to retain or eliminate data, nor do they simplify
what cannot be simplified. The embracing of paradoxes in case studies acknowledges that there are no simple answers.

Humanistic understanding benefits from case studies by adding to existing experiences (Stake, 1978); furthermore, this research method allows investigators to retain a holistic view of real-life events by investigating multiple variables (Yin, 2009). It also has a non-prejudicial ability to handle multiple kinds of data collection methods (Eisenhardt, 1989; Murphy, 2014), meaning both qualitative and quantitative analysis of data can be conducted.

In response to the criticism that single-unit case studies do not provide a broad sample, Stake (2005) counters that much can be learned from a single unit, citing the strength of the researcher’s narrative description, which Eisner (1991) says, can create an image. Erickson (1986) contends that the general lies in the particular, - what we learn in specific cases can be transferred to similar situations. Stake (2005) and Eisner (1991) further advocate that readers be allowed to determine what can and cannot apply to their own contexts.

3.5.2 Disadvantages

The main challenges facing case study research are reliability and validity (Flyvbjerg, 2006). Murphy (2014) asserts that the findings and recommendations of case studies can neither be confirmed nor denied in terms of utility and veracity, suggesting that it should be used simply to tell the individual story. Soy (1997) avers that a small number of cases cannot offer grounds for establishing generality of findings, whilst Solberg Soilen & Huber (2006) believe case study areas are often too narrow to be able to draw scientific conclusions. Such criticisms inform detractors’ decisions to question the external validity of case study research, with recommendations that it be limited to exploratory phases of investigations.

All too often, the subjective nature of case study research leads to criticisms of rigour. The researcher’s freedom from systematic procedures leads critics to believe evidence to be dubious or biased (Yin, 2009). Likewise, the researcher’s independence from the results is questioned because he/she plays an interactive role instead of acting at a distance, - essentially becoming a part of the research, able to predict results and guide
participants (Garger, 2013). This self-fulfilling prophesy causes case study research to be of doubtful scientific value (Flyvbjerg, 2006). Should such behaviour exist, it becomes what Guba and Lincoln (1981) term “an unusual problem of ethics.”

Further limitations to reliability, validity and generalisability stem from a lack of representativeness and a lack of rigour in collection, construction and analysis of empirical materials (Hamel, 1993). Miles (1997) argues that analysis during case-writing is intuitive, primitive and unmanageable, leading to invalid conclusions. Furthermore, the labour-intensive task of data collection and analysis is stressful to the researcher. The quest for thick, rich description and analysis of a phenomenon can be expensive and time-consuming, leading to the production of a document too detailed and involved for busy policy-makers to read and use (Yin, 2009; Merriam, 2009).

3.6 Case Study and Generalisation

Generalisation is defined as the degree to which research findings apply to other populations or samples (Polit & Hungler, 1999; Ryan & Bernard, 2000) whereby broad conclusions are drawn from particular instances allowing “inferences about the unobserved from the observed (Polit & Beck, 2010). Grbich (1999:66) adds that generalisation involves the “usefulness of one set of findings in explaining other similar situations.”

Interpretivist researchers are divided about generalisation; there are those who insist it is impossible to generalise in interpretive research. Denzin (1983) rejects generalisation, arguing that different individuals can attach different interpretations to the same actions, a position echoed by Schenrich (1997) who posits that generalistic reality rests squarely in the researchers’ minds and nowhere else. Denzin (1983) adds that it is not the goal of interpretivism to generalise. Guba & Lincoln (1994) concur, suggesting that data garnered from interpretivist inquiry develops an idiographic body of knowledge that ultimately describes an individual case. Wainwright (1997) highlights the context-specificity of qualitative research as a limitation to generalisation. Usher (1996) simply adopts the extreme position of totally dismissing generalisation from social sciences.

The opposing camp argues equally vociferously; Williams (2000) postulates that generalisation is inevitable in interpretivist research, citing the works of Geertz (1979)
and Fisher (1993) as good examples of generalisation in interpretivist research. Falk & Guenther (2007) agree that people do generalise from qualitative research, adding that generalised decisions based on qualitative research are sound, valid and reliable. It is the dense, detailed and contextualised description conducted at a micro-level, argues Williams (2000), that allows the researcher to paint a picture of that wider society; specific instances are used to infer the characteristics of a wider social backdrop. Deviations in observer interpretations do occur (Geertz 1979), - a phenomenon described as “working hypotheses” (Guba & Lincoln, 1982).

For a case study informed by an inductive exploratory mode of enquiry, - as is the case with my project-, statistical generalisation is inappropriate. As Bassey (2001) aptly puts it, the educational researcher has the problem of many variables and little data, rendering him unable to employ scientific generalisations. Analytical generalisations could be applicable in that links are made between key ideas and general conceptual frameworks (Yin, 2009); however, having avoided an approach based on a priori theories, this method may not fully apply to this study. In keeping with Stake’s (1995) constructivist approach, naturalistic generalisation of contextualised, detailed, rich and multi-layered data allows readers to make links between their personal experiences and the findings developed in this study. Nonetheless, Hammersley (1992) cautions against naturalistic generalisation, in which researchers draw conclusions on the sample alone; he warns that it is redolent of “theoretical inference” whereby conclusions are drawn from the data about the necessary relationships amongst categories of phenomena.

Sampling poses the most significant challenge to generalisation in interpretivist research, because the sample is “the bearer of the characteristics that are inferred to a wider population” (Williams, 2000: 216). If generalisation is a legitimate goal (Williams, 2000), then the sample needs to be representative of the relevant characteristics of the wider group. Some suggestions (e.g. Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2005; Silverman, 2001; Mayo & Pope, 2000) advocate mixed methods research, including quantitative measures of population, purposive sampling and theoretical sampling for more rigorous research and justifiable generalisation. However, in this study, I have depended on enough thick, rich description for the readers to make their own judgements on the applicability of findings to similar settings (Mayo & Pope, 2000), with the setting having
also been chosen based on typicality. My immersion in the setting reveals itself through this detail and allows the reader to make sense of the situation (Firestone, 1987).

Despite these criticisms and limitations, case study research is a method used by many researchers to develop multi-layered, multi-perspectival studies of phenomena of interest. Wider relevance is an important characteristic and aspiration of case study research. Statistical notions of generalisability involving the use of probability theory to infer characteristics about a population from a sample drawn from that population do not apply to small scale research. (Woodside, 2010) argues that the objective of case study research is to develop theory by linking ideas developed through the case study to broader analytic insights from the relevant literature. Yin (2009) refers to this as analytic generalisation. In similar vein, Ritzen et al (2016) suggest that case study research ought to be generalisable to theoretical claims, not populations. Stake (1995) contributes ‘naturalistic generalisation’. Wider relevance of case study research is established when readers make links between their context of practice and the case study and it is the researcher who is the agent of generalisation.

3.7 The School
Phiri Basic School began as a primary school in a peri-urban area of a town in Zambia. The establishment of a mine a few kilometres away saw the town expand; the school was subsumed into the town limits, with a major shopping mall and housing estate developed near the school. National restructuring of the provision of primary and secondary education saw the school upgraded to basic school status, which meant it extended from its grade 7 offering to offer grades 8 and 9 as well. The student population grew to approximately 1200 students who attend school in three sessions of roughly three hours each because the infrastructure has not been upgraded to match the upgrade of the school.

3.8 The Participants
The two senior leaders are Mwanza, the head-teacher and Bupe his deputy. The middle leadership tier comprises five senior teachers who have responsibility for various subject areas and year groups. There are fifty teachers, of whom five are male and forty-five are female.
I conducted in-depth interviews individually with the head and his deputy. Seven teachers volunteered to participate in the focus group discussion.

3.9 In-Depth Interviews and Grounded Theory

In this sub-section, I detail how I developed and analysed the interview schedule using grounded theory.

In concurrence with ideas propounded by Lambert & Loiselle (2008) and Moore (2006), I combined two data collection methods, individual interview and focus group interviews. With the two senior leaders, Bupe and Mwanza, I used in-depth interviews and employed focus group interviews with seven teachers at Phiri School. Data analysis was conducted through Grounded Theory (GT), which Charmaz & Belgrave (2013) define as a systematic method for constructing theoretical analysis from data with explicit analytic strategies and implicit guidelines for data collection. This inductive, iterative and interactive method (Charmaz, 2006) involved subjecting data to rigorous comparative analysis that eventually moved from studying realities to gaining conceptual understanding from the data. The pivotal strategy was simultaneous data collection and analysis; to conduct analysis after all data had been collected would have run the risk of weakening analysis by curtailing the iterative, comparative process that fundamentally defines GT (Charmaz & Belgrave, 2013).

Commensurate with Tuckman’s (1972) description of the interview as a means of gaining access to informants’ personal perspectives, I chose in-depth interviews as a data collection strategy to elicit detailed life stories from informants. I also subscribed to Holstein & Gibrium’s (1995) position that interview data is useful for GT studies that address social worlds, organisations and individual experiences. My aim was to learn participants’ implicit meanings of their experiences, to build a conceptual analysis of them.

Because of the emergent nature of GT, I could not provide informants with specific interview questions beforehand; however, I briefed them on my research title and purpose, thus allowing them reflective space to focus on routine aspects of leadership practice they may not have given conscious thought to in a while (Sanders, 2016). Bupe and Mwanza are known to me, as a fellow school leader; they were thus eager but
apprehensive to provide me with useful information. Consequently, there was a risk of them offering stories they thought I wanted to hear rather than authentic narratives. I minimised this risk by careful framing of questions to avoid loaded, leading and multi-response questions. Moreover, the iterative process of GT analysis provided a check on misleading claims.

My interview schedule developed with iterative data collection and analysis, - the fundamental strategies of GT. The schedules can be found in Appendix A and Appendix B of this report. As suggested by Charmaz & Belgrave (2013) I started by eliciting Bupe and Mwanza’s stories. Following initial analysis, I filled the stories out by asking probing, open-ended questions as advocated by Scheibelhofer (2008) and Maines (2001). I adopted the constructivist method of GT analysis, which places priority on the studied phenomenon and sees both data and analysis as created from shared experiences and relationships with participants (Witz, 2006; Mills et al, 2006; Bryant & Charmaz, 2007; Clarke, 2009). I cannot be objective since I do not view my researcher-self as a neutral analyst, nor do I view the social world I am studying as knowable in measurable, knowable scientific terms (Glaser, 2002). I have thus used guidelines advocated by Charmaz (2002) to frame constructivist interview questions, to study processes in individual experiences, thoughts, feelings and actions. The interview schedule eventually emerged as a division of initial, intermediate and ending questions developed because of analysis after the initial stories.

Confidence in authenticity and trustworthiness of accounts came from probing strategies aimed at supporting Bupe and Mwanza develop accounts characterised by contextual detail, exemplification of accounts of general claims and experiences, clarification of vague terms and congruence of accounts. Iterative GT analysis of these responses allowed for construction of tentative inductive abstract categories that explained and synthesised basis social processes found within the data. The flexibility of this process gave me control over the construction of data as well as analytic control over my material. The respondents and I were engaged in “detailed conversations” (Lofland & Lofland, 1995), with their concerns and comments shaping the direction of the dialogue. I was able to support informants develop a sense of the accounts they made, and the significance of such incidents, - the “reflective experience” (Valle & King
which entails viewing an incident at a later stage through a linguistic and cultural framework.

The data developed from these interviews gave me a life-history narrative for both informants, from childhood accounts to experiences as teachers and school leaders. These were dense narratives, yielding thick descriptions showing a true explication of the school leaders and the organisations they manage (Van Der Mescht, 1996). Throughout these recollections, accounts sometimes shifted towards the anecdotal, making for longitudinal, dynamic pictures of their leadership which allowed for extraction of dominant themes. Starratt (1995) suggests that such narratives, characterised by captivating stories, can resonate with readers through processes of identification that Stake (1995) calls naturalistic generalisation.

I reached theoretical saturation with Bupe and Mwanza at different stages; with Mwanza, it was after two, 80-minute interviews and with Bupe, after a third one. By theoretical saturation, I refer to the phase of analysis in which I continued sampling and analysing data until no new data appeared and all concepts in the theory were well-developed (Morse, 2004; Glaser & Strauss, 1967). In reaching theoretical saturation, I was cognisant that categories could not simply assure their place in the study until my analysis revealed that these constructs demanded inclusion, the practice and process of theoretical sensitivity; an example of such categories is gender (Morse, 2004). It required further sampling, once such constructs had appeared, to achieve theoretical saturation, eventually gaining these categories a place in the theoretical scheme (Glaser, 2002).

Theoretical saturation has been criticised for being nebulous and lacking in systematisation (Bowen, 2008; Rowlands et al, 2015). Some critics (e.g. Beiten, 2012; Guest et al, 2006) argue that the concept has been poorly operationalised in specific research contexts, providing no clear account of how the point of saturation can be determined. Rowland et al (2015) recommend a numerical method of ascertaining theoretical saturation; however, this entails the use of data analysis software. In this study, I subscribed to Glaser & Strauss’ (1967: 62) commendation to combine the “empirical limits of the data, the integration and density of the theory and the analyst’s theoretical sensitivity” to determine when theoretical saturation is reached.
3.10 Focus Group Research with the Teachers

Focus group interviews are increasingly used as a tool for GT in social sciences, in combination with individual interviews (Lambert & Loiselle, 2005; Moore, 2006). They are an effective means of data collection when a significant gap exists in status between researchers and participants (Madriz, 1995), - as was the case in this project. Furthermore, they are an efficient data collection tool when researchers face limited resources for qualitative work (Morgan, 2002).

Having gathered data from the head-teacher and his deputy, I sought to explore the other side of the coin by investigating teacher perceptions of leadership and culture in their school.

Opinions differ as to the ideal number of participants in a focus group discussion, with minimum numbers going as low as four and maximum numbers as high as twelve (e.g. Kitzinger, 1995; Gibbs, 1997). I chose to take the advice of Bozkurt et al (2012) which says focus groups are better conducted with smaller groups, arguing that groups of more than ten may affect the group dynamic and make it difficult to control the discussion. I settled on seven participants as a workable number, in which each participant would have opportunity to contribute their perspectives and express accounts of their experiences of leadership.

I recruited seven volunteer participants from the school staff of 48, excluding the head and his deputy. After a brief presentation at a staff meeting, during which I explained the purpose of my research, seven teachers came forward and I identified another two teachers to stand by in case any of the seven volunteers chose to stop participating in the research. There was no need to call upon them over the three months during which I met with the group. I was acutely aware of the need to be careful of the motives behind volunteering, such as an opportunity for revenge against a school leader for a perceived wrong of some kind (Cohen et al, 2009). I made it clear to the group that such motives could taint the findings and asked them to speak in as transparent a manner as possible from their own personal perspectives.

The informants were teachers who worked across different phases of the school from grade 1 to grade 9. The discussions were held from July to September of 2016 on three
Saturday mornings and ranged in duration from 70 to 90 minutes. Table C below provides some information on the participants.

**Table C: Focus Group Participants**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age Range</th>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Years of Experience</th>
<th>No. of Years in the school</th>
<th>No. of Previous Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T1</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>5 years</td>
<td>5 years</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>7 years</td>
<td>3 years</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>13 years</td>
<td>4 years</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>17 years</td>
<td>2 years</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T5</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Senior Teacher</td>
<td>20 years</td>
<td>13 years</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T6</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>11 years</td>
<td>4 years</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T7</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>11 years</td>
<td>11 years</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Names have been replaced with codes to protect informants’ anonymity

One reason for selecting focus group discussion was the central characteristic of communication between informants. I was looking for a collegial atmosphere within which participants could talk freely, comment on each other’s contributions and even exchange anecdotes (Watts & Ebutt, 1987). Having worked together for some time, participants could speak freely about shared experiences and their shared work environment.

Having gathered information through one-on-one interaction with school leaders, I sought to move away from one-sided accounts to multi-faceted ones. I capitalised on the advantages of teachers exploring and clarifying their thoughts and views through interaction with each other, - a feature that would have been impossible to achieve in the traditional interview setting (Stewart & Shamdasani, 1990; Robinson, 1999). In a bid to obtain a holistic view of teacher perspectives on various issues, I pursued a range of interpretations and opinions of the same events, a phenomenon that Spinelli (1989) describes as cognitive and affective biases, whereby individuals’ understanding of a so-called shared experience may not be the same.

I also sought to benefit from the different ways in which participants could share their personal stories, either to illustrate a point or to seek affirmation from fellow focus group colleagues. The one-on-one interaction does not always offer this opportunity since the interviewer and the interviewee might be total strangers. In this case, although I had done a lot of work with the school in question, I barely knew at least four of the contributors. As things turned out, after a slow start during which we got to know each
other better, the atmosphere warmed up and there was a flow of views, recollections, affirmations and disagreements brought on by the fact that participants knew each other and were comfortable engaging in discussions with each other. Other forms of communication came into play, such as teasing, arguing and anecdotal jokes. Kitzinger (1995) suggests that such communication adds depth and validity to the data, since knowledge and attitudes are not always encapsulated in reasoned response to direct questions as would normally happen in one-on-one interviews.

Having followed a probing strategy identical to that used with the leaders in their one-to-one interviews, I am confident in the authenticity and trustworthiness of the accounts elicited from the focus groups. I also found that the collective environment of the focus group could be used to advantage by freeing up more introverted informants who may not have offered as much perhaps, as they would have contributed in an individual interview. One such teacher, -as Gavin (2008) states-, found such a forum to be more suited to her ability to speak freely in a collective setting within which she felt relaxed.

Whilst there were many advantages to the focus group discussion as a data collection tool, I was fully cognisant of the limitations too. Leonhard’s (1975) argument against focus groups may be slightly dated but it still resonates to this day. His primary argument is the fallout between group dynamic sessions and focus groups; he argues that ‘focus groups have made a mockery of research by reducing scientific methods of group research to forced answer confrontation.’ His analogy of comparison between the two leaves the reader in no doubt as to his opinion on focus group research. For him group dynamic sessions are the gold standard. Kitzinger (1994a) and Morgan (1997) also caution against the subjective findings that may emerge from focus groups, through the biased reporting of the researcher. Similar concerns about the unnatural control of the moderator on the research findings are raised by Barbour & Kitzinger (1993) and Litosseliti (2003). However, Morgan (1996) points out that this is not the only type of research that could be subject to researcher influence on the findings, citing Fowler and Mangione (1993) in their discourse on survey research and Mischler (1986) on individual interviewing.
A further limitation could come from the contributors themselves; there is a possibility that a naturally emergent leader of the group may influence the contributions made during the discussions by helping the moderator in a positive focus group discussion or detracting the moderator in a negative discussion. Eskenazi (2011) recommends eliminating such dynamics by conducting discussions online whilst Livingston (undated) advocates early identification of emergent leaders to anticipate their influence.

The flexibility of the focus group as a data collection tool was of benefit to me because I could adjust my questioning based on the way the discussion was proceeding. I could use probing questions to optimise clarity and to turn to other members of the group for affirmation or negation of a participant’s contribution. Moreover, I could change my approach to ensure that the focus of the group remained on the objective and purpose of the research.

3.11 Ethical Considerations

As I started work on this project it was with the full understanding that for my work to be accepted as an original contribution to the body of evidence on culture and EL, I needed to be strongly committed to honesty, firstly by avoiding any form of plagiarism and secondly by ensuring that the confidentiality of identities of my informants and their school were fully protected and that they were fully informed of the purpose and objectives of the study.

Having lived in this Zambian town for the last four years whilst working as the headmaster of a prominent international school meant that I was known to many educators in the town. I was especially well known to educators working with the educational foundation that had been established by the mine as a trainer of teachers and head-teachers. Phiri School is the closest school to my school and is a close partner in many activities that we do. I have spearheaded fund-raising projects for infrastructural upgrades at Phiri and am well acquainted some of the staff. Some knew that I was engaged in studies for my doctorate, so when I approached the school leaders and staff to take part in my research project, there was no undue alarm. Our relationships were unaffected during and after the data collection phase of the project. I bore in mind Busher’s (2002) observation that a researcher’s organisational status can
influence the amount of information disclosed by participants, how they present it and their level of willingness to share it. I had anticipated some reserved behaviour from some staff during the focus group discussions because of the power dynamics between a school leader and teachers, albeit from a different school. Perhaps because I was from a different school, the status gap was not an impediment to the efficacious conduct of the discussions.

In my informed consent letter, I stressed the following points to all participants as outlined by Diener & Crandall (1978);

- Voluntarism, which ensured that participants had the freedom to choose whether to take part in the research or not, including being free to discontinue their participation at any stage,
- Providing as much information on the research project as I could, including the title, the objectives and the research questions,
- Their competence to make the right decisions when they had full access to the information about the research project.

I was fully aware of a certain culture of fear by informants about their contributions being exposed. I endeavoured to put them at ease by meeting with them prior to the first data collection exercises and presenting my undertakings on how I would protect their anonymity and privacy as well as giving assurances that no harm would come to them because of their contributions to this research project. Basing my solemn undertakings on Busher’s (2016) guidelines on research ethics in educational institutions, I assured them of my protection in the following ways,

- By being a responsible researcher who would protect participants from harm,
- By collecting only data that was relevant to my study,
- By ensuring that my participants knew the ethical practices to which I subscribed and knew when to request for the digital recorder to be paused and when to start it again,
- By keeping my views to myself, even when participants asked for my opinions,
- By not passing on any gossip to those outside the research context,
• Ensuring that the location for interviews and discussions was safe from eavesdropping and inadvertent overhearing,
• By storing data in such a way that the anonymity of participants was preserved as well as the identity of their institution,
• By writing in such a way that the identity of the participants and the institution was anonymous.

My interviews with Bupe made me realise the challenge of cloaking her identity and ensuring that this cloak remained intact. As things stood, it would have been possible for readers of my thesis to use ‘deductive disclosure’ (Boruch & Cecil, 1979) to identify the school and eventually some of the individuals within the study by reconstructing and combining data. I resolved to assign arbitrary numbers to all focus group participants and aliases to the school leaders; even the names of individuals whose names came up anecdotally were assigned aliases (Lee, 1993). Also, in the interest of non-malfeasance, I chose to mask the name of the province and the town within which the school is located. Informants’ biographical information was limited to avoid the possibility of deductive disclosure. One identity factor I had to maintain was the country within the study took place, - Zambia.

Because the school is a state school, I had to seek permission from high up the bureaucratic chain before the head of the school would grant me his permission.

Recordings and transcripts of the data were stored in my study on my private laptop on a password protected file and only I had access to it.

The following chapter presents the findings from the data analysis, starting with the school leader interviews and followed by the focus group discussions with teachers.
Chapter 4: Findings

4.1 Introduction

This chapter is primarily aimed at telling the stories of the informants within this study. Firstly, there are the stories of the head-teacher and his deputy and how they have evolved into the leaders they have become today, as viewed through the lens of culture. Secondly, there are the stories of the teachers within the school which are examined through their thoughts, experiences and opinions about how they are led, not only at school level but from the various levels of the bureaucracy that make up the Ministry of General Education (MOGE).

To preserve the anonymity of the participants in this study, individual and place names have been anonymised and biographical detail has been excluded.

To start with, I will examine the stories of the two school leaders through the various themes that have been elicited by the analysis.

4.2 An introduction of each school leader

4.2.1 Mwanza: Head-teacher

Mwanza is in his early fifties. His story begins in a small Zambian mining town, where his father worked as a miner and his mother was a housewife. He was an able learner from an early age and was selected to attend a well-regarded secondary school on the strength of his good primary school-leaving results. He is of the opinion that this selective system of the first Zambian republic was superior to the prevailing inclusive one. From his story, it is also quite clear that the system during that period placed a premium on boys’ education than that of girls,

... we had form 1:1...that is only for boys...and then form 1:2 was a mixed class...and then form 1:3 was for girls only. So, you found that when you are put in 1:1, then you are the cream.

He candidly admits that his first career choice upon completion of secondary school was not teaching but nursing. However, such choices were governed more by the need to begin earning as soon as possible and contribute to the family coffers, than as a calling,
And before that I had even applied... you know... we were desperate... I had even applied for this casual mining... emerald mining in Lufwanyama area.

Upon completion of his teaching certificate, Mwanza applied for a teaching post that would keep him close to family and friends. However, because of the centralised controls exercised on the deployment of all civil servants, he was deployed to another province instead. At the time, he was unhappy about this development; it meant that he would be separated from his family and be thrust into a different culture altogether. He would also struggle to support his family whilst establishing a new home far from them. However, with hindsight, he believes this was a fortunate turn of events,

I am saying fortunately because things have turned out well. There are certain friends of mine, with whom I trained... you find that maybe where they have gone... it’s congested, and they are still class teachers... they have not progressed.

4.2.2 Bupe: Deputy Head

Bupe is also the child of a miner father and a housewife mother. Also born in a mining town, she found herself in another province because of her parents’ wish for her to be raised and educated by her sister and brother-in-law, who was a teacher. She too attended a well-regarded school. Her choice to go into teaching was primarily influenced by the family members with whom she lived,

...because of staying with my in-law, who was a teacher, I was interested in that.

She worked as a classroom teacher and a middle leader in several schools within the province. After more than 20 years of teaching, she came to the Phiri School as the deputy head-teacher.

The following section examines the various themes that have been highlighted in the analysis of the participants’ narratives.

4.3 A Strong Hierarchical System

Both Mwanza and Bupe have vivid recollections of the significance of power and positional authority within the work environment. Bupe recalls her first posting as a deputy head and how she had to shoulder both her responsibilities and those of the head-teacher,
She would not come to school. One day she may come for thirty minutes...then another time...two days out of school.

These tendencies by the head-teacher were soon noticed by members of the community, who began to make comparisons between the head and the deputy. Added to this were the frequent monitoring visits by various local and national government officials to the school, which found the head-teacher absent on many occasions. One such visit would prove fateful, as the officials insisted that Bupe step in and respond in place of the absent head of school. The information she provided pointed to the irregular conduct of the head-teacher. However, at the end of it all, despite having played no part in the irregularities, it was Bupe who was relocated from the school, against her will.

Mwanza had a similar experience a short while after he returned from upgrading his teaching qualification from a certificate to a diploma, which at the time, was a high qualification possessed by very few teachers. The education ministry had introduced basic schools and policy dictated that such schools have principals with the minimum qualification of a teaching diploma. Mwanza was thus appointed to the headship of a basic school. Unfortunately, his euphoria at being promoted was short-lived. His appointment was rescinded after the incumbent at Zondi exerted his influence on administrators.

4.4 A Bureaucratic and Autocratic System

Both school heads’ stories show that the education department is a slow-moving, cumbersome apparatus. There are four levels of bureaucracy above the school level. Directly above the school is the District Education Board Secretary (DEBS) who reports to the Provincial Education Officer (PEO), the local representative of the Teaching Service in Lusaka; the Office of the Permanent Secretary oversees provincial operations and is directly answerable to the Minister of Education.

This bureaucracy is the reason Mwanza’s promotion predicament only came to the attention of the Teaching Service almost two years after his original promotion. Even upon his resumption of duties as a classroom teacher, he continued to be recognised as
a head-teacher by the Teaching Service for some years. This was the case even when he was appointed deputy head of Dhlamini School.

Upon his appointment as deputy head of Dhlamini School, he was immediately confirmed in this new position without going through the processes required to permanently confirm the appointment,

> How can I be receiving a letter confirming me as a deputy head-teacher when I have never been an acting head in that capacity? Who has seen my confidence and fitness?

Bupe comments that the isolation of some areas within the various levels of the ministry is being challenged as new people move into some senior positions. When recently faced with another attempt at an unsolicited transfer, she received support from the new incumbent of the DEBS office, who promised to straighten matters with the PEO,

> He said, ‘I am the one who controls the district. The PEO controls the province. There is no way he can direct me to transfer people at district level.’

Nonetheless, the transfer did go through for her replacement, meaning the bureaucratic process had not caught up with events. It took almost six months to unravel the mess.

Shortly afterwards, the PEO revoked all pending transfers, to investigate how the process was conducted.

Bupe and Mwanza both have stories that amply illustrate an autocratic and bureaucratic style of management within the system. The picture painted is one of a top-down approach where each subsequently lower tier is the recipient of orders from above, which must be obeyed without question.

Although Mwanza’s initial promotion to headship was ostensibly a recommendation from the provincial office to the Teaching Service, policy development at the time suggests that the PEO had no say in that decision. This is evidenced by the reaction of senior leadership within the province to Mwanza’s appointment. Had they been part of the decision-making process, such an uproar would not have occurred. Secondly, a national policy had just been enacted which established basic schools and required that principals of such schools be teachers with the minimum qualification of a diploma in
education. As Mwanza relates, the directive passed through all the different levels of the department without being challenged,

*It passed through all the channels, from the service to the PEO, who signed...endorsed to say he had seen it and agreed, then to the DEBS...endorsed, and then to my head, who also signed before calling me to inform me.*

Whilst some lip service is paid to the illusion of choice regarding where teachers prefer to be deployed after graduation, the reality is that the Teaching Service will post people to where it is felt they are needed. Both respondents requested posts on the Copperbelt out of a desire to be close to their families; however, they were sent to Ntshonalanga Province with little recourse for an appeal. This is once again a repetition of the colonial pattern of dividing families which has the effect of breaking up value systems.

It is not only the making and passing of decisions which is autocratic but the lack of action too. Lack of action by senior officials results in bottlenecks which affect lower strata within the system. Bupe narrates her frustration at slow movement by her superior, which she feels contributes to the poor work ethic and lack of discipline amongst staff and pupils. A challenge she faces within the school is chronic staff absenteeism from class and from school. She recalls her first day at Phiri School,

*We had inspectors and many people were missing. I later wrote to them and asked them to exculpate themselves since they had missed the first day of school. I got very funny answers. Someone just wrote, ‘I missed work yesterday because I overslept!’ I took it to...the head, but he did not do anything.*

There are several occasions in Bupe’s story in which her attempts to instil a more responsible work culture have been stymied by lack of supervisorial support. On one occasion, having recently arrived at the school, she was insulted by a pupil. Her appeals for help from the head fell on deaf ears. She later discovered that the child’s parent was influential within the community.

Escalation of issues above school level can only be done by the head-teacher,

*So, it takes time for the DEBS to know what is happening in a school. It’s the system. It’s the head who is supposed to report. Because if any teacher here reports something*
to the DEBS, they will not be taken seriously. It should be signed by him before it goes there. And even if the paperwork from the head does make it to the DEBS, the process has only just begun. The working culture is that the paperwork can stay a long time with the DEBS before it is actioned. Sometimes it even gets lost.

Mwanza feels that addressing disciplinary issues with teachers, particularly in a public forum, risk being construed as anti-social,

As an administration, we have said we cannot do that because we do not want to segregate. We do not want to finger point...‘but you know yourselves...you are here.’

So, what is important is change. But the issue of grouping them together will not work.

On matters of autocracy and bureaucracy, he feels that each tier within the system has its responsibilities and limitations and things should remain that way,

I am the spokesman for the school...on government policies. I cannot talk to the press when it comes to matters of policy...I will refer them to the DEBS. And again, the DEBS...when it is issues to do with the province, he cannot make a press statement...he refers them to the PEO. So, there is that bureaucracy. I report to the DEBS and the DEBS reports to the PEO and he refers them to the permanent secretary.

This style of management permeates every level of the system and contributes towards inconveniencing stakeholders. If, for example, teachers are called to a meeting by the DEBS or the PEO, they are expected to drop everything and act with alacrity. Bupe recalls one such occasion,

...last term, they just turned up and told us we had to attend a meeting at the resource centre about the new curriculum. The inspector just said all of us had to come and hear about the new curriculum. So, we sent the children home and attended the meeting. Of course, the children were happy.

Government policy is passed down and all intervening levels are expected to cascade it down to grassroots for implementation. Bupe views this as a recent development,

I remember in Kaunda’s time, we had books which we never changed. Now, when Kaunda was out...Oh! It’s nearly every term...change of books.... change of books...change of books!
Recent changes to the curriculum are a source of great frustration to Bupe, who would like to see the inclusion of final implementers when new policies are proposed. The introduction of practical examinations in ICT and Science is a bone of contention,

*I remember in parliament...one of the MPs asked the minister of education, 'If you the minister of education have introduced computer lessons in schools, do you know which letter comes before K on the keyboard?' The minister failed to answer. Then the other parliamentarians said, 'You see! There is no way you can introduce computer lessons in Zambia, because most of the schools in Zambia are not electrified; and the computer needs electricity. And two...most of the schools do not have computers.*

In science, the new policy stipulates that pupils should conduct practical investigations in schools. However, there are no science laboratories and science equipment in most schools. She does point out that some urban schools may have the equipment and infrastructure, but most rural schools are in dire straits,

*They do not practice practically for exams whilst in class...it's not fair to the children. They just go and do it, like when they came to use your labs at your school...for some of them, that was the first time to do the practical exams...at your school...which is not fair.*

Mwanza on the other hand feels that such an autocratic system is fair, orderly and efficient; those complaining are making too much of it, he feels,

*We do not want to exaggerate things. I would say it is a fair system. If it was left to everyone to make their own system, I think there would be a lot of confusion. I'm sure the system is okay because if we start talking about national policies and everyone interprets them the way they feel, then I think there will not be any harmony.*

He accepts that he cannot question decisions from above,

*I cannot just come up with my own decisions. Whatever I announce to teachers...it is either we have had a briefing with my leadership colleagues or maybe it is a directive from the DEBS or PEO. Because if there is a circular, I will just announce that this decision is like this...we will be doing this.*
He is content to have control of the few school-level policies and projects, such as the building of the new school block. He is also happy to follow the prescribed channels in dealing with national policies by raising such issues at district level. He does, however, concede that some responses from higher tiers can be quite vague,

*We have meetings with them where we raise these issues; those are the things we discuss. And it’s either they will say, ‘These are national issues. We have taken note of your concerns.’ They will not give you a straight answer.*

4.5 Power, Position and Responsibility

Mwanza views himself as an accommodating, democratic leader who endeavours to bring together a cohesive group of professionals within his school. However, he has come across a few challenges, primarily from a group which he believes wants to distance itself from him for no apparent reasons. He sees himself as an integral part of a team; his primary function is to facilitate communal thinking and decision-making through different forums. At leadership level, he encourages candour aimed at addressing professional challenges,

*I always tell them, ‘Please, here now it is management. Let us discuss our weaknesses... the weaknesses you see in me and the weaknesses I see in you.’ Then we discuss.*

Similarly, in whole staff meetings, he cautions against personal issues encroaching on the work environment, whether related to their home lives or matters of ambivalence between colleagues. He views staff meetings as a collegial platform, with nobody considering themselves a fountain of all knowledge. However, he acknowledges that every workplace will have nay-sayers and gossips,

*There are certain teachers, including our fellow administrators, who want to see your downfall. They are always challenging you and want to take your post.*

Mwanza has strong views about his position as head of the school and what it entails,

*Me as a head...I’m supposed to be an overseer. Then the one who is supposed to run the school is the deputy.*

Bupe agrees that the day to day running of the school falls to the deputy head and doesn’t challenge this premise. However, she feels that her superior’s support is
required for policies to be implemented and enforced. She sees the varying ways in which staff are treated as a cause of this,

*The situation at this school is that, when you want to discipline this one, she will go to the head and he will say, ‘Ah! Just ignore her!’ You see such things? So, what do you do?*

There is also a blurring of the lines as to where some responsibilities lie. One area is the granting of permission to staff for time off. Mwanza believes his deputy is reluctant to refuse a request, so she can be viewed as a “good person”,

*When you go to the deputy and she refuses to grant you permission and refers you to me, then she has just refused.*

Perversely, Bupe agrees with Mwanza but attributes different reasons to this situation. She feels it is the head’s reluctance to face controversial issues that causes these tensions. On one occasion, she brought some pertinent issues to his attention,

*He said, ‘I do not want politics!’ Now with him being the head…if he says that, who am I to go ahead? I do not have the powers.*

On the few occasions when Bupe has tried to act independently, she recalls finding herself on the receiving end of a bureaucratic tug-of-war,

*An example is when I charged a teacher… I was told that as a deputy, I am not supposed to do this. The teacher called the union. They said I am not supposed to charge; the head is the one supposed to charge that teacher.*

### 4.6 Political Clout and Societal Status

Mwanza and Bupe’s stories contain accounts of their treatment at the hands of people with positional authority. Such experiences are found in teacher deployment, especially to desirable urban schools, as well as appointments to senior positions.

Both informants have witnessed instances in their careers where political clout, societal status and influence have been used by those in authority for career progression, desirable deployment and access to courses for either themselves or those over whom they have patronal responsibility. Mwanza and Bupe have adopted pragmatic, fatalistic
attitudes to this practice of patronage, with the hope that their opportunities will arise someday.

4.7 Face

On several occasions in their narratives, it has emerged that the protagonists in the stories have gone to extraordinary measures to avoid public conflict and public loss of face.

Mwanza’s very first posting was to the hinterland of the Ntshonalanga Province, something not to his liking at all. He tried all within his power to have the posting changed, much to the frustration of the official responsible for deploying teachers. However, this senior official was at pains to hide his true feelings and to avoid a public confrontation with Mwanza,

_He kept calling me ‘my boy’ and asked me to see him later._

It was only upon his return that evening that Mwanza realised how frustrated the man was, when he overheard a conversation in his office,

_As I was in the corridor, I heard him saying, ‘These teachers are being difficult. They do not want to go to their designated posts. When you load them up, take their luggage and unload it when you get to their stations. I’m sure they will follow their goods and stay there._

However, when Mwanza walked into the office, he was greeted as ‘my son’ and had his hand held as he was led to a chair. Similarly, during the initial promotion debacle, one of the senior officials put on a diplomatic face,

_He was telling me stories, calling me ‘my boy’ and trying to explain that I could not just jump to headship like that. ‘We are trying to groom you as a good leader. You cannot skip a stage.’_

The gloves then came off at the subsequent indaba, resulting in Mwanza requesting to be reinstated as a class teacher.
4.8 Who Influenced Them?

Bupe and Mwanza each consider paternal leadership figures from early in their careers to be great influences on their professional and personal conduct. Mwanza recalls the great welcome he received from his first head-teacher, Mr Junza when he arrived as a newly qualified teacher,

*From inception, the way he received me...he received me like a parent and from then on, he regarded me as a son.*

Bupe views her first head as an inspiration. What matters most to her is Mr Nchinga’s human face and his role as a father-figure in her life. She recalls approaching him with some personal financial problems,

*Each time you went there, he would not say, ‘The school has no money.’ He would ask you what you needed, and he would help you as a daughter.*

His parental mien stretched beyond the school and his teachers. When Bupe and her husband found themselves in financial dire straits, Nchinga came to their rescue.

Mwanza’s first encounter with Junza taught him to avoid stereotyping. On his first day, a jaded senior official introduced him as ‘another troublemaker from the city.’

*I liked what he said to the DEBS, ‘We cannot generalise issues like that...just because this one is from a city...he may be different from others.*

Mwanza admires the man’s democratic leadership. Further elucidation suggests that Junza’s democracy stretched beyond participatory and collaborative management to how he approached infractions and dalliances,

*Whatever mistakes I would make in terms of work, he would call me and advise me. And where I had done well, he would praise me.*

Bupe refers to similar positive characteristics in Mr Nchinga,

*He could accommodate everyone. He did not segregate. Even when you had a personal issue, he would attend to it as a father*

Reflecting on their own practice, both school leaders believe they have endeavoured to emulate these paternal figures. Bupe says she always looks back and recalls how her
former head-teacher dealt with certain situation that she now faces as a leader and tries her best to do the same. One challenge, she finds, is that teachers’ work ethic differs at Phiri, which frustrates her,

They do not work. In short, they are not committed.

Mwanza particularly admires the way in which his former head never allowed work matters to become personal issues,

He never used to hold a grudge, provided you went and did the right thing.

4.9 Age and Gender
Both leaders believe an elder person should be respected as is the cultural norm across Africa. They also acknowledge that age should not be a factor in the appointment of school leaders,

Mwanza: The age doesn’t matter. But what matters is the way you conduct yourself.

Nevertheless, he believes age, experience and the number of years in the service are fundamental building blocks for a leader. He recalls the retirement of an elderly lady teacher some years ago,

We felt that it had been a demotivation for us to see her retire at that age as a simple class teacher, especially looking at the impact she had on the school. Because she was a hard worker, it was unfair that she retired as a class teacher. At least she could have been a deputy or a senior teacher.

He does, however, recognise that there are some ‘young but mature people and some old, immature people.’ He also acknowledges that some elder and senior people do take advantage of the almost unconditional respect they receive from their younger colleagues. He recalls how, as a young teacher, he though an older gentleman in the district office was a senior official, - he turned out to be an office orderly,

He was trying to push me to sign the form. We did not know at the time that some of these older people were just orderlies. They seemed like important people because they were older than us. And these were the people who were giving us instructions.

Bupe believes a person’s position and not just age should be respected,
Because of your post, even if you are young, they will respect you.

However, recent experiences with some of the younger teachers have not filled her with much confidence,

The only challenge with the younger teachers is when it comes to preparation of work...I do not know whether it’s laziness or what! The two older ladies...I have no problems with them. Like Twasanta...she is hardworking and ever on time...always in class.

On the issue of gender and school leadership, Bupe believes women are under-represented amongst the country’s school leaders. Whilst she has noticed a change in the local statistics, she blames the traditional belief that women should not be educated to the same extent as men,

Our elders believe that a woman will just waste that education because she will marry and just stay at home. They boy will look after his family even when he is married. Up to now there are far fewer degree and diploma holders who are women than men.

Mwanza views the preponderance of female teachers as a problem in schools, mostly because of absenteeism,

Today, they’ll come with an excuse...tomorrow, another excuse. Hence you find that there is no consistency in working.

He believes some of his female colleagues even begin to compete to see who has taken more days off in a month,

After two days, ‘My child is ill.’ Then the other one will come and say, ‘My husband is not well.’ But for gents it’s rare for them to be absent because of their wives being ill.

4.10 Idea Generation and Decision-Making

An image of the legkotla, reminiscent of the practices of Ubuntu, is painted by both administrators when they describe the participatory planning and decision-making processes within the system. Mwanza describes a scenario where all staff congregate to discuss matters of pertinence following a senior leadership team meeting. At this
school-wide forum, ideas are generated; some are rejected whilst some are adopted for implementation.

Mwanza claims he cannot act autocratically within the school,

*I cannot just come up with my own decisions. Whatever, I announce to teachers...we will already have had a meeting with my colleagues.*

Bupe concurs that ideas and decisions should be the result of a participatory process involving the whole staff. She champions the idea of ‘throwing it to the house’ and ‘letting the majority decide and then working on it.’ She also acknowledges that on occasion, the head may be obliged to veto an idea. She is however quick to point out that what she has described is fanciful,

*But in this school, it’s not like that!*

She believes there is a reluctance by the school leader to engage comprehensively in planning and idea-generation. She recalls how he snubbed the planning process leading to the purchase of a new photocopier,

*You could tell that he was not interested. Even the person who brought the machine was surprised at his attitude.*

An idea to approach some businesses in town for financial aid to purchase paint was met with equal nonchalance and a comment that ‘he did not like the idea of going out begging the public for handouts.’ Bupe has repeatedly suggested the need to schedule planning meetings to tackle some challenges the school faces. This has not materialised.

The spirit of collaboration is also defeated by the endemic absenteeism that afflicts the school. In his eleven years at Phiri School, Mwanza does not recall a single meeting which was attended by the full staff complement. He does not think there has ever been a day when the entire staff has been in school.

4.11 Community

Both school leaders recognise the community as an integral part of the school and its management. They understand issues that are important to the community and endeavour to be accommodating. One such issue is farming, which at a subsistence
level, requires whole-family involvement. Pragmatism and diplomacy are needed when addressing these matters,

*Mwanza: You need to sensitise them on the importance of education. You cannot run away from farming, but let it be done at a certain time.*

He encourages students to rush home after school to help with home duties,

*...so that when it is time to return to school and you ask your parents for a pen, they will willingly buy it for you because the money has been made.*

Both Mwanza and Bupe understand that community events and festivals are no respecters of school time. It is by respecting these ceremonies that they can influence the community to reschedule them. Bupe recalls attending a funeral whilst at Naledi; she endeavoured to follow the customs, some of which were alien to her. Significantly, she ate the traditional fare along with the other mourners,

*Everyone was watching me, whispering amongst themselves, ‘The deputy is eating our food.’ Now if anything comes up and they discuss us, they will say, ‘That madam is a good woman. She even ate the village food we cooked. She is part of us.’*

She advocates sending representative of the staff to attend traditional ceremonies and funerals. A lot of goodwill is generated by such acts, especially contributing funds collected from staff towards event costs. In her opinion, the school manages to influence the community to hold events at the weekend to avoid disruption to school attendance. The community reciprocates by supporting school activities,

*When we called meetings, people would come. They would encourage each other to come because they would say we are good people and we are part of them.*

Mwanza too advocates for community engagement whilst highlighting the importance of school engagement. He recalls persuading a parent to reschedule a traditional ceremony for his son,

*He asked for permission to take his son for the circumcision ceremony far away in the bush. I told him it was wrong, and he should wait until school had closed. He took my advice and waited.*
However, formalised community engagement between the school parents is an area requiring further work. The school leaders struggle to get parents to attend PTA meetings. Such apathy seems to stem from parents’ engagement with more important matters,

*Mwanza: They will confirm that they will come but...two or three will turn up. The rest will not even give an excuse.*

However, Mwanza sees a positive shift in parental attitudes towards children’s performance; he believes the arrival of different socio-economic and ethno-linguistic groups from the rest of the country, as the town grows, is a contributing factor.

### 4.12 Conclusion

Having considered the narrative stories, perceptions and opinions of the school leaders, I now turn to the findings from the focus group discussions conducted with teachers at Phiri School.

**Focus Group Findings**

#### 4.13 Planning, Idea Generation and Decision-Making

Most participants believe strategic planning within the school is done at management level. By the time staff are included in planning dialogue, all important decisions have been made, with little teacher contribution; they feel excluded from this process and have no ownership of it,

*T1: Planning is done by the administrators. From there they call us as teachers...they do not ask us...they do not give us a chance to be free to discuss so that we can come up with a concrete thing. They just say, ‘Oh, we have called you teachers...there is this...now we want to do this.’*

In some instances, there are no explanations for certain strategic directions being taken. T1 explains her understanding of the process,

*T1: It comes from the ministry and is trickled down so that even those at the top there at district level do not know. Now they bring it to our managers...they also do not know...they bring it to us...we do not know. (laughter)*
T2 sympathises with school heads, whom she has seen scrambling to comprehend different initiatives that have been handed down to them,

_ I have seen heads running up and down at the DEBS and PEO’s office because of the same._

However, some within the group recognise that such exclusionary behaviour by school leaders may not necessarily be displayed by all. T3 has worked in a few different schools before Phiri,

_ Like at the school where I was in Kafue…the head-teacher who was there would first ask all the teachers, ‘What is it that you want to do? What can we achieve this year?’_

She says this approach did not mean that all ideas and plans would be accepted and implemented. The head could still exercise his veto but would attempt to explain his decision,

_ …the head would be able to tell the staff that, ‘On this one…according to the money that we have, we will not be able to do it…maybe we can take it to another year.’_

T5 agrees that participatory planning also differs between heads, depending on their leadership styles,

_ The ones we are used to come out in the open and involve teachers. ‘We are going to have this. What do you think? What should we do? This is the money we have.’_

Teachers believe the planning process is neither rigorous nor time-bound,

_ T5: What we can achieve in a week is not laid down. There is no programme. It can just come, maybe as I report for work…just on short notice._

Members of the group feel very strongly about their inability to fully participate in the planning and decision-making processes of the school. T5 opines that the prevailing system is a contributory factor to the lack of progress and development that characterises the school. He attributes such an environment to leaders wanting to ‘hang onto their own decisions,’ and not wanting to listen to others. In many instances, the first inkling staff have that a decision has been made is when they see things happening,
T3: Even for that building, I just saw something going on there! I had to ask my colleagues, ‘What is going on over there?’

The building she is referring to is a new staffroom, - their tangible example of ad-hoc planning,

T5: Really, there is no written plan! Of where the materials will come from. Where cement will come from. Where the money will come from.

Teachers discuss the negative reception that greets plans that are generated by some subordinates;

T6: Each time that positive ideas are presented, sometimes you find that such a one will be considered as challenging the superior.

T5 concurs and attempts to restate the prevailing situation,

Somehow, it’s difficult to bring in ideas to the smooth running of the system...it’s a situation where one would feel defeated if he takes on an idea from someone and it works. It would rather come from him or her.

Strict government guidelines govern decision-making in schools; committees have been formed to ensure democratic processes and transparency. However, respondents feel such committees merely pay lip-service to regulations whilst decisions are made by the few,

T7: Sometimes you are told you are part of a committee...in a meeting when you try to contribute...the supervisor thinks you’re becoming a threat in your contributions. Then next time when there is a meeting...you are not allowed to air your views...because the supervisor is maybe afraid that your contributions may be taken by the house.

As a newcomer, T3 sums up her initial impressions of the planning, idea-generation and decision-making in the school;

For some of us joining the school...if I find that this is the culture here...I cannot just bring my own new ideas, whereas I can see that others are not doing it. How do I bring in new ideas to such a situation? So now, the new building going on there...we were
just told that it was the new staffroom… and we accepted because that is the culture we found here; just accept things. Yes! Yes! Yes!

4.14 Change

Prompted by the discussion on planning, the conversation turns towards a sore point amongst the many teachers within the sector, - the archaic lesson planning format. Many believe it has outlived its usefulness and has become a millstone around their necks.

T2 admits that the attitude towards this format is generally fatalistic,

_We have an agreed format for planning as a school, which we have accepted…okay…because it is said that this is what has been in place for a long time and what must be followed._

Lesson planning is an onerous chore rather than the guidelines to and preparation for a lesson. The format is long and contains areas that they feel are irrelevant to lesson delivery and student outcomes,

_T2: There are some parts, (sighs)...you know when you start writing those parts, it’s almost half a book, (laughter). Yes! It’s called the Rationale and it can cover five or six pages or thereabouts._

_T3: Some of us are not even for it because of these many stages...they are unnecessary..._  

_T4: I feel like it is a repetition and a waste of time...spending time on that instead of important things._

Because of these attitudes, teachers plan sporadically, viewing planning as an impediment to the business of teaching. Added to this is the insistence by their line managers to include fabricated references to resources they do not have, to impress inspectors,

_T2: As you plan, you know you do not even have the books and supporting resources, but you still must plan like this for all the subjects._

T7 has devised a way of recycling plans for inspector visits,
Even if I wasn’t prepared to teach that thing on that day...because I have heard the inspector is coming, I will give him those four or five lesson plans...I will use one of them and then he will say, ‘Very good teacher!’ (laughter)...because I have planned the way he wants me to and he has seen the documents.

Indeed, school leaders’ enforcement of this format is aimed at satisfying inspectors. Teachers are convinced that school leaders fear to buck the trend,

*T5: The leadership says, “No! Just do it because it has already come from the top and it is already there.”*

Many are frustrated by school leaders’ failure to forward their concerns to higher offices. Leaders are thus viewed as part of the problem of resisting change,

*T7: The leader has not taken the views of the teachers to say, “The teachers have complained about this. Let me take it back to the standards officer or the inspector...that this is the complaint I have brought.”*

Newly qualified and newly arrived teachers are often surprised to find archaic practices still very much in evidence at the school. Whereas newly qualified teachers are eager to exercise their recently learned teaching methodology, they find that the prevailing attitude from management is a resistance to new practice. T4 recalls her experience at the hands of her head of department upon her arrival at the school,

*T4: I came up with my own lesson plan according to what we had learned at UNZA. Somebody said, “No! This is not the way we are supposed to do things here.”*

What followed was a reluctant capitulation to the way of the establishment, followed by a gradual loss of enthusiasm for the job as she was forced to work in a way she knew would be ineffective,

*T1: If your superiors do not like the way you are working, it makes you divert from what you know, whether it is good or not. You even throw away what you’ve learned and start doing things you know are not good practice.*

Ironically, poor pupil attainment is blamed on the teacher although the status quo is partly responsible for the low attainment,
4.15 Management Styles

The group is unanimous in describing the management of the education system as autocratic, typified by a top-down approach. This behaviour can be traced all the way to the very top of the education system.

A lack of financial resources is given as one of the reasons leading to the genesis of such conduct. Because the ministry is perpetually short of funds, it relies heavily upon the donor community to provide resources and consequently, donors have become quite influential in dictating policy within the state education sector,

T7: The ministry goes out there to find donors to fund certain projects. The donors come with their own programmes and bring their own conditions.

On many occasions, the teachers say, some initiatives have been accepted and launched indiscriminately, causing confusion as conflicting projects run concurrently or one is shelved mid-life in favour of the latest one. The participants’ vexation is evident in their commentaries,

T5: Immediately you find another donor has also come with his own ideas...they bring it to Zambia, and we will accept... before you finish with what you started, you’ll just leave it hanging...they’ll bring another one.

T3: Today they bring this. Before you understand it...you are even struggling with the first one, another thing will come.

The effect on the teachers at grassroots level is that, these initiatives are autocratically passed down through the tiers of the system. In the lower tiers, there are no consultative opportunities for teachers to scrutinise and decide on the merits or limitations of an idea; they are simply expected to do as they are told,

T3: We receive programmes monthly, (others call out; ‘Yes! Monthly!’) we just have to do it. The head-teacher will be on you...you just must complete it, whether it is bearing fruit for the learners or not.
In some cases, these donor-sponsored projects have begun to bear fruit but been shelved as the next one comes along. Respondents agree that the children are the ones to suffer,

_T1:_ You will find that those people are just told what to tell us...So, it will start from there...commanding...'This should be done!' Until it reaches our stage. We have no option...we respect the people up there, so we just follow. The boss has said, 'Do this!'

However, there is some sympathy for the leaders who are also under pressure and being forced to toe the line despite any misgivings they may have,

_T2:_ The way teachers are dancing to the head-teachers, is the same way the head-teachers are dancing to the DEBS...the DEBS to the PEO and all the way to the top in Lusaka. The head is dancing somewhere...he’s dancing to someone above, who is saying,’ If your teachers are not going to do this, you and them are going to be in trouble.’

Participants are convinced that those at the top do not know what is happening at the bottom, with the implementers and the end-users, the students. Teachers feel let down by those who are meant to support them, especially the head-teachers and the district and provincial inspectors, who come in a judgemental capacity, causing widespread panic throughout the school,

_T7:_ You know this is an issue when the head-teacher is on your head also, forgetting that he is meant to support you. He is panicking, “Madam, we need these things done!”

_T4:_ They do not mind if things have worked out or not. What they want is to just write a report to say they did A, B, C. Whatever happens at school doesn’t come into it.

4.16 Apprehensions about Public Perception
Respondents face many challenges, but they are apprehensive about escalating their dissatisfaction to higher offices. They cite a trepidation of unknown consequences,

_Q: Of what?
T2: Of what could happen. Because if I talk too much, I do not know what will happen to me (laughter).

T4 believes this apprehension is ingrained,

*Naturally, we have a fear of the old people...people who are superior to us...actually, it is in us.*

She adds that fear about tarnishing her reputation among colleagues gives her pause about complaining,

*I do not want to be known as having a problem. If every time, I do not have a book, I complain but others do not, I will be labelled as a problem. So, to keep my name clean...I will keep quiet sir.*

T1 sees fear of loss of face in school leaders, who are equally anxious about being labelled as incompetent by district officials when they escalate problems,

*They also fear that when they go there, they’ll be blamed that they are doing nothing.*

T5: *He knows that if he takes the matter to the DEBS, they will say, ‘This headmaster is a problem. Every time he comes here, he brings problems.’ So, he sees it is better to keep that name, ‘That I am a good man, who doesn’t have problems.’*

4.17 Leadership Ideals

Participants have common ideals of how they would like to see their leaders behave,

*T1: A leader should be...able to face someone. If I do something wrong, he should be able to come to me and say, ‘Hey madam! What you are doing should not be done like this.’*

*T4: A leaders should be able to stand on his two feet; if he says, ‘No,’ it’s No.*

In summary, they are describing a strong, principled and impartial person.

T5 points out that, it’s leading by example and acting as role models which they value more in a leader than anything else. T3 and T1 regard consultation and participative decision-making as paramount characteristics of a leader;
T3: Better you call people, sit down and plan together if there’s something new that you want to be done. At least when you involve them in decision-making, you will be able to work well with them.

T1: When you are a leader, you are responsible for making decisions…but you cannot just wake up and say, ‘I am going to do this.’ First you sit down, even with the same colleagues, ‘What do you feel if we do this?’

The group also values courtesy from school leaders. They are sensitive to the way they are treated by leaders, when an infraction has been committed, especially if a dressing down occurs in public,

T2: If I have made a mistake despite what has been agreed as a staff, there is a good way to communicate. Maybe you can call me and not just shout at me in front of everyone, ‘Hey! You’re late!’ That is not a good way to talk to your juniors. There should be respect even though someone has done something wrong. You can call that person and talk quietly. And when you walk out of that office, people will not even notice that you were in trouble.

4.18 Age

The group is unanimous in the need to acknowledge and respect elders within society; these values translate into the professional work environment. However, they are adamant that respect should be reciprocal between elder and younger members of the work environment. T1 is in the relatively unique position of being one of the older members of staff within the school, having trained as a teacher after almost twenty years working as a nurse; she qualified as a teacher just five years ago. She does not take her age to mean she should insist on respect from her younger colleagues. Instead, she understands the need to be equally respectful to everyone or risk being ridiculed,

For them to respect me, it must start with me. The way I portray myself towards them…the way we relate and share ideas…I should also respect them, even though they are younger than me. If I respect what they advise me, there will be a bond between us.
Regarding age and leadership, all participants agree that greater age should not necessarily be synonymous with being a leader. T4 points out that nowadays, the appointment of young school leaders is not uncommon, especially in a system which places qualifications before merit. The autocratic nature of the system also means that appointees can rarely question the decisions of the Teaching Service,

*When you are told from up there that you are the head...whether you are young or old, you must go and be the head.*

T5 further notes that these new developments have necessitated a rethink of the prevailing power dynamics within the workplace that operate from the premise that older members of the organisation are usually the leaders.

Everyone agrees that age does not matter in the school leadership. What matters most is the way leaders conduct themselves within their roles. In their (respondents’) experience, most leaders tend to throw their weight around, - an undesirable trait, 

*T5: This is where we are saying age doesn’t matter. What matters is the way you conduct yourself and the way you relate with others, especially your subordinates.*

Participants point out that greater age and wisdom are not necessarily correlative. T3 opines that a display of the knowledge and skills required for the position is more important than age,

*There are some people who are old enough to be in certain positions; and when you look at them you would agree that they are fit to be head-teachers or deputies. Yet, looking at their ability to do the job, you would give them some question marks (laughter)...when you rate them, they are not good leaders.*

T5 agrees and points out that some older colleagues can be quite immature,

*Someone may look old but behave like a young person. We have seen some people who are old but up there (points at his head) ...what they do is contrary to what we expect them to do as role models.*

Whilst all participants agree that seniority in age is not a prerequisite for leadership, respect for age is still an integral part of the Zambian workplace. When a young teacher
is appointed to a leadership position, he needs to remember that age must still be respected, whether the older person displays wisdom or not. The grey hair is a basis for respect, so one must be careful in how they treat older subordinates,

T4: From my culture, I am taught to respect elders, so I cannot just speak anyhow to my older subordinates. There will be a way that I will talk to my elders.

Young leaders must walk a tightrope when dealing with elders within the workplace, which ensures a balance between their positional authority and the cultural status of those who are senior by age. T5 uses percentages as an analogy,

For the young leader, there is a percentage of him being a leader and the rest relies on his interaction with others within the institution despite his status. In that way, he will be able to learn from those people who have been there before him.

Posturing by the young leader will result in strong opposition,

T5: If he feels he is the leader and he can do whatever he feels, and everyone should listen to him...that is where the challenge comes in...and it becomes difficult.

Social mores dictate that young people should recognise the wisdom and experience of age and defer to the advice given by elders. This might not be in the professional arena. There is an unofficial authority that can be wielded by an elder person who is not a formal leader; it’s a sagacity born of years of experience,

T1: When I am working with younger girls...maybe three or four years in marriage...they look to me for wisdom. I should know how to talk to them and what we discuss should be between us. These days there is HIV. Someone could want to share their status with you. I have no right to go and preach to others and say, ‘this one is sick...even her marriage is not stable.’

It is generally agreed and understood by the group that leadership is generally the premise of those who are senior by age,

T2: Most appointments in higher positions have considered...thinking that this one has been in the service and the system for a long time, so it’s better he is elevated to a higher position.
The Teaching Service mandarins recognise that the appointment of school leaders based on their long years of service will ensure ‘that things will be well in that institution,’ says T5. The feeling amongst the long serving staff is that if they put in the requisite years, they will automatically be promoted at a certain stage. It is this culture of entitlement without effort that causes older teachers to react negatively when younger, dynamic and better qualified teachers are appointed above them;

T5: A younger leader will face opposition from whoever is oldest in that set-up.

Such behaviour stems from bitterness at being passed over;

T3: I think some people do it out of frustration. Because maybe they were expecting themselves to be appointed to certain positions and they find that somebody who is younger than them is the one who has been put in that position.

T7 agrees that frustrating younger leaders is institutionalised within schools and similar organisations. In Zambia, teachers make up most of election officials. She recalls how, as a newly appointed election supervisor, a group of older colleagues frustrated her attempts to address them at a pre-election symposium,

There was so much noise. They were like, ‘We have been doing elections for a long time. We haven’t seen her around. What does she understand about elections?’ They were forgetting that, for me to be there in that position, I had undergone training. I had the knowledge and the skills. All they saw was this young person, ‘lecturing us, who have been returning officers and presiding officers!’

However, she understands the deep-seated traditional beliefs that underpin this behaviour,

In that manner...speaking traditionally, they may feel that the younger person is trying to look down on the elder.

4.19 Gender

In a predominantly female focus group, the consensus is that women are still very much under-represented in school leadership. Within urban Zola, participants can identify just two female head-teachers,
T6: The head of Thokoza Secondary School is a lady. She was the deputy here before she went there. There is also that new madam at Tladi Basic School.

T4: You’ll find that where women are in management, they are senior teachers or deputies. Especially here in the Ntshonalanga Province, there are few women in management. It’s better in Lusaka and the Copperbelt.

T5: But still, it’s usually men.

T1 has a ready response as to why this remains prevalent,

Where a woman is given a senior position where there are men, the men still have that attitude that a woman is not capable of holding that position...it’s only men. She opines that men still view women as inept within the professional environment. They (men) bring their traditional beliefs into the workplace and act as if female leaders’ abilities are not worth calling upon,

There is this thing that the man is always the head, so they think they know everything...so they tend not to consult women.

The women in the group have faith in the ability of their gender and are convinced that women provide a much more robust support structure within the organisation, often not receiving the credit for a job well done,

T3: It’s very rare that women do not offer their support, but it’s the male boss who will normally get all the praise.

The women believe, very often, observers will keep a close eye on a female school leader, eagerly anticipating her failure and downfall. Derogatory comments will then be quick to follow,

T3: If she makes one mistake, the whole world will know! You will hear things like, ‘She is a woman! What did you expect? What do you think she can do? A woman is a woman!’ They just look at a woman and think she cannot do the job.

In fact, the female participants in the groups are convinced that, in comparison, women make much more progress as school leaders and generally work harder than their male counterparts to compensate for the male superiority complex,
T1: I have seen women...when they are in positions of power and authority, things have worked out well. Because women would want to work harder to be at the same position as those men who think they are better than women. I have even seen women presidents like that one from Liberia. There were men there and there was conflict...people fighting. But now there is a woman...there is peace.

She argues that a contributory factor to the success of women in leadership is their innate capacity for empathy, compassion and love,

A woman has a heart for everyone. I do not think a woman has that heart for saying she will keep a grudge for a very long time. You forgive and forget! You go ahead!

T5 agrees, suggesting that women may have more propensity to engage in participatory decision-making to engender a communal feeling of involvement and ownership from stakeholders,

When Mrs Musinje was here as deputy, she would interact with people from the community. She would want to involve them. And even when she knew the answer, she would ask anyway, so that ideas came from everyone.

4.20 Tribal Tension

The group identifies that, of the seventy-three ethno-linguistic groups in Zambia, there are seven dominant tribes, and of these, there is one which they feel has an agenda of national dominance and pre-eminence above the rest. This is a constant source of irritation, tension and conflict within many workplaces. The appointment of a leader within the institution from a so-called minor tribe can cause tribal tension,

T7: So, if you find a situation where the one who comes from an inferior tribe becomes a leader...hah! Then those ones who feel they are from a superior tribe will give this one hell, because they feel they are the ones who should ever be on top and not the other.

Instances of such superiority complexes are observed across different levels of the organisation. Even auxiliary staff have been known to look down on teachers simply because they (auxiliaries) are from the so-called superior tribe,
T7: Even if this person is very junior, maybe...sorry to say, maybe he is just a cleaner...the way he will behave in that institution...the whole world will think this one is the boss.

This dominant attitude can also be seen in the reluctance of the ‘superior tribes’ to speak or teach in another language other than their own, although Zambian law stipulates that zonal languages must be used when teaching,

T2: Some people will just come and say that they will not teach in that language. But they are here and are supposed to use it. They will not bother to learn that language.

Instead, they want the people they found in that place to learn that language.

Tribal tension is also seen in promotions or appointments for continuing professional development. T7 believes belonging to an ‘inferior’ ethnolinguistic group affects one’s chances of being chosen for career enhancing opportunities,

T7: ...like when I came here, I was already trained in this thing called THRASS...and I was good at it. Even the PEO would be brought to my classes...brought by the head...to come and watch me teaching it. And he would be telling the PEO, ‘we are very proud of her and how she teaches this thing.’ Now, when they needed someone to go to provincial to train other teachers, they do not pick me. He picks his tribal cousin.

Imagine! And I am the one who taught her when I came here.

4.21 Pull Him Down!

Participants describe the pull-him-down phenomenon as the sabotage of a colleague, - usually one who is senior to those pulling him down. It may occur when envy drives others to subversion to forestall a colleague from excelling. T7 gives one example,

Someone is in that position already, but you do not want to see him flourish...to grow in whatever they are doing. For example, the deputy-head has been assigned to take care of a certain section of the school, and people are supposed to be in class at a certain time. Because people want to pull her down, they will not attend their classes when they are supposed to. Instead they will still be in the staffroom, chatting, so that when she comes to remind them, she will look bad.
Whilst the above example would be expected to be commonplace, most pull-him-down tactics are exacted as revenge against superiors who have not treated their subordinates fairly. An example is the way in which subordinates are spoken to or treated in public by their superiors. Throughout the discussion, focus group participants have made it very clear that they are averse to being publicly harangued because of the resultant loss of face. T5 elucidates,

*Just because I am a senior teacher does not mean I should shout and make a scene. ‘Hey you! Why are you wearing sandals like that?’ The time at which I am talking to that person and the environment…it matters. And in turn, people would want to pull me down because maybe I started it myself. So, they would say, since I am behaving towards them in that manner, they will also react in a certain way to ensure my downfall. You know, man is a complicated animal. So, shouting, ‘Hey! You are late!’ from a distance…all those things can be brought together and make someone be brought down.*

T6 recalls hearing through the grapevine that his head-teacher had made light of his illness whilst he had been in hospital with a severe eye infection. In the school, based in a refugee camp on the border with a war-torn country, T6 had taken it upon himself to ring a reveille bell at 6 am for pupils. The benefits went beyond the children to the community, who appreciated being roused in the morning so that they could go about their business, since they had no way of telling the time. Upon hearing, what the head had said about his illness, T6 decided to stop ringing that morning bell,

*After two days or so with no bell, people came to the school and asked, ‘Where is the teacher who rings that bell? Has he gone? That man must continue ringing that bell. He has helped the community.’ They do not have watches and things like that, so as soon as they hear the bell, they also wake up and go for their various schedules.*

T6 says he did not stop ringing that bell out of spite but because he felt demoralised by the negative things that had been said about him when he had been unwell. He expected sympathy and understanding during his illness; instead he had been ridiculed by his superior.
Having stated and exemplified the findings, I will turn in the next chapter towards discussing the findings by subjecting them to scrutiny and comparing them to the extant literature.
Chapter 5: Discussion

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I critically discuss the research findings and answer the research questions. Table D below is a summary of the cultural values, beliefs and practices that influence EL in the school. This is in response to Research Question 1 which states;

What cultural values, beliefs and practices influence EL in the school?

Table D: A Summary of the Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reverence for Age</th>
<th>Respect for Authority</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender Inequality</td>
<td>Patriarchy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paternalism</td>
<td>Colonial Influences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ubuntu</td>
<td>Ethnocentrism and Tribalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Influences</td>
<td>Paternalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Face</td>
<td>Collectivism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communalism</td>
<td>Over-Reliance on Aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worshipping Traditions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the following ten sub-sections (5.2 to 5.12) I will critically discuss the findings listed above in Table D, and answer Research Question 2 which states;

How do these cultural values, beliefs and practices influence the enactment of EL in the school?

5.2 Reverence for Age and Respect for Authority

In this sub-section, I discuss the cultural beliefs of Reverence for Age and Respect for Authority and how observing these beliefs influences the enactment of EL in the school.

Modern western liberal thought and notions of meritocracy have some influence on thinking in the school. Moreover, policy dictates that teachers should no longer be promoted on age and years of experience but on qualifications as was the case with Mwanza when he was promoted to headship of a basic school. Teachers have expressed how they value other characteristics in school leaders such as respect and ability to do the job; these matter more to them than age and seniority. It is clear from participants’ contributions, that some elders have displayed signs of immaturity not commensurate with their age; this results in loss of respect, since as Onwubiko (1991) asserts, elders
have a duty to reciprocate the respect they expect. This resonates with Conton’s (1966) insinuation that, sometimes, the only thing to respect may be the grey hair.

However, this does not take away from the cultural belief and practice that elders must be respected, regardless of their characteristics. This stems from African hierarchical culture which places the aged in positions of reverence to such a point that they are viewed as living ancestors (Masango, 2006) who must be respected because it is mandatory and divine to do so (Joshua, 2013). Respect for elders and their position within African society is deeply ingrained; thus, the tendency is for elders to be in authority. This thinking cannot easily be shifted by the advent of western meritocratic norms and still relates to the understanding that a good elder will become a great ancestor (Masango, 2006). In the Nguni tradition, it is common for elders to be called dlozi lami, which translates to ‘my ancestor’ although the person still lives. This reverence for age is also emphasised in some non-western societies; Gong (1989: 367) quotes the saying, “If you do not listen to your elders, you will come to grief.”. The embedding of such beliefs begins at an early age (Dimmock & Walker, 1998), with the natural extension being that children will accord the same respect to their teachers.

The words ‘elder’ and ‘leader’ are easily interchangeable in African society as stated by T3 when she says, “we respect the old people up there”. Smith (1984:60) adds ‘wisdom’ and ‘learning’ as the preserves of the elderly when he describes how a young author is derided by those with traditional views on wisdom and learning,

‘Who are you to write a book?’ Lookout’s voice was openly scornful. ‘You are too young. Book writers are great and learned people.’ Like all barely literate

Africans, he had an almost superstitious awe of the printed word and reverence
for the grey hairs of age.

The general result in schools is that leadership positions are occupied by the older people in the school; Mwanza and Bupe are indeed the oldest at Phiri. This is the system that has always been in operation both within the community and within the civil service; those who have worked their way through the ranks expect to be rewarded with a senior position when it arises and would be understandably upset when a younger person is placed above them. This was the reason for T7 facing opposition when
she was placed in a position of authority above older colleagues during the elections and indeed was Mwanza’s experience some years earlier.

Of course, traditionally, in line with the values of Ubuntu, the elders are considered to be the repositories of wisdom and responsible for passing on tribal lore through proverbs and oral retelling. The ancestor is not dead but lives on for a while longer to pass on a lifetime of vast experience to the young within the community. These are good reasons for calling the chief’s advisory body the ‘council of elders’ as he relies on his wise old men to help him run the chiefdom. So, viewed from the standpoint of the elders, it may be understandable, -though inexcusable- that they set out to frustrate or bully the young leader into giving up.

Nevertheless, younger, qualified people may also be promoted meritoriously but they must still show respect for elders. They walk a tightrope, with everyone watching them closely. Disregard for these mores will result in unpleasant consequences from everyone within the school community. However, in many cases, age supersedes positions, as is the case with T1’s informal leadership position as a mother-figure to the young female staff. Her experience in marriage and life has younger staff gravitating towards her to seek advice. As a respected elder, albeit one with fewer years of teaching experience, her younger colleagues feel comfortable enough to entrust their marital problems and other secrets to her.

There are advantages and limitations to reverence for age influencing EL. As a belief connected to the concept of Ubuntu, reverence for elders forms an integral part of African culture related to society’s hierarchical structures and the belief that wisdom is gained through years of experience. The understanding here is that elders are better placed to lead because of their experience. Whilst this may be true, the disadvantages can be detrimental to school leadership. Firstly, there is the risk of resistance to change that is usually associated with elder people in society. The introduction of innovations and improvements into EL thus becomes more difficult since elders tend to be stuck in their ways. Secondly, because there is the expectation that one simply needs to await their turn to become a leader, further risks can be inherent with respect for age. On one hand, teachers do not feel the need to develop themselves to advance in their careers because they will naturally progress with the passage of time. Furthermore, this belief
creates a culture of entitlement in which teachers expect to advance without earning the right to do so; Mwanza felt strongly about this regarding a teacher who retired without being promoted. His troubles during his first promotion also stemmed from similar sentiments expressed by his elders.

5.3 Gender Inequality and Patriarchy

In this sub-section, I discuss the traditional belief and practice of patriarchy, how it is enacted and results in the marginalisation of women in EL. This discussion is linked to the findings and the extant literature.

Some advances have been made by the Zambian government to improve the lot of women since independence; these include increasing educational access for girls and the introduction of legislation which affords women equal opportunities in politics, business and the workplace. Taylor (2006) acknowledges this progress for Zambian women due to the collision of the modern with the traditional, the growth of the media, Maoist influences and globalisation. Indeed, in some western societies, the trend has even begun to reverse, with women accounting for a higher proportion of school leaders than men (see Fuller, 2017; National Centre for Educational Statistics, 2016).

However, the power of tradition and culture in African society is responsible for the under-representation of women in EL. Whilst data from Davies (1990), which places female school leaders in Zambia at 15% of all school leaders may be outdated, my personal observations are that very little has changed, although women account for 57% of teachers. At Phiri, women constitute 90% of the teaching staff, yet just one of them is on the senior leadership team of the school, - this is Bupe, the deputy head-teacher. Focus group respondents say this is the case across the district, with very few women being found in school leadership positions. This is equally the case in non-western societies like China where communist doctrine dictates that women be viewed as equal partners, whilst the reality is that society remains mired in traditional practice (Bush & Haiyan, 2000). A wife is still expected to submit to her husband or the paterfamilias (Fan, 2000; Cleverley, 1991; Hsiao et al, 1990).

Taylor’s (2006) observation that Zambian politics, culture, economics and tradition still assign a typically subordinate role to women still rings true. Male attitudes are a major
contributing factor. Mwanza, like the male Chinese heads in Coleman et al (1998), is dismissive of women’s ability to lead. In line with the utterances of a male head in Ribbins & Zhang (2006), he too believes that women are physically unfit to lead, citing their emotional instability and indecisiveness as mentioned by male heads in Ouston (1993) and Wilking (1993). This belief in women’s emotional and physical unsteadiness has led to some selection panels in African countries deliberately excluding women from head-teacher shortlists ‘on the basis that women do not possess leadership qualities such as competitiveness, aggression, rationality, forcefulness and independence’ (Ngcobo, 1996:10). The prevailing attitude of men is that they should be the dominant ones in schools, with women subservient to them (Coleman, 2005; Blackmore et al, 2006). Bupe certainly felt ostracised when she arrived at Phiri, even by female colleagues and was made to feel unwelcome for some time; she felt that her gender clashed with the notion of males in leadership.

Unfortunately, many women share the belief that they are not destined for leadership. They view themselves as home-makers, whose primary role is to raise children and submit to the demands of their husbands. Leadership of schools is unattractive to many because the remuneration for headship in Zambian state schools is very low. Many also find themselves in these teaching positions out of necessity rather than calling because teacher training, like nurse training, is relatively cheap for parents to pay for a female child. Moreover, like the Chinese (Fan, 2000), they leave leadership to their men so they (men) can save face.

The strength of patriarchal leadership is quite evident in schools because tradition dictates so. Bupe and Mwanza both cite elderly men, Messrs Nchinga and Junza, as their leadership role models, giving similar reasons for their admiration, namely benevolent paternalism. So, the picture of the elder male as leader continues to be enacted due to cultural and traditional norms.

EL in Zambian schools is affected negatively by the perpetration of this stereotype, as is certainly the case at Phiri where the only female leader is the deputy-head, who feels disenfranchised in her position because of the male head-teacher’s behaviour and her other colleagues’ attitudes. Students are deprived of the unique characteristics of women as leaders, namely their nurturing quality (Coleman et, 1998) as well as what T1
views as their (women’s) focus on education instead of conflict and their ability to take better care of children. Additionally, there is a loss of productivity as female school leaders devote emotional energies and intellectual energy towards fighting sexist cultural attitudes, lack of respect and public humiliation (Moorosi, 2010) instead of leading. If Salukatula’s (2010) findings about Zambian women’s contributions to EL hold true, then there is the loss of democratic and consultative ability that women bring to EL, a characteristic that is often not found at Phiri. Female students are also deprived of good female leadership role models, who can inspire them to similar heights and who can show them that it’s possible to have a career and be a home-maker. As has been seen in this study, teaching is a last resort for many women. Should the continued traditional hegemony of men continue, then the profession runs the risk, -certainly in Africa- of being treated by women as a part-time pursuit between motherhood and other business activities. The system also loses effective school leaders as noted by Chonya-Mfula (2006), Halyonda (2008) and Salukatula (2010). The diversity of approaches to school leadership suffers too, as the few women in EL emulate male leadership characteristics (Showunmi & Kaparou, 2017; Brown, 2014; Jones & Shorter-Gooden, 2003) thereby stifling the freedom to lead as women may be inclined to. Ultimately, this is the fate of Phiri school, which has low gender egalitarianism as noted by Hofstede (2018) and the GLOBE project (House et al, 2004, 2013).

5.4 Paternalism

I discuss in this sub-section how benevolent paternalism is a prevalent practice informed by dominant cultural beliefs and the values of Ubuntu which place the man as the leader. I link the findings from the study of paternalism to extant literature; I also examine the positive and negative influences of paternalism on EL in the school.

Whilst Jackman (1994), Padavic & Earnest (1994) and Jernier (1998) may denigrate paternalism as an outdated, undemocratic management style, the reality in Africa and Far Eastern countries like Taiwan and China is that this is not only an accepted but culturally appropriate and respected approach to leadership. African cultural beliefs and practices tend towards male-dominated leadership as do those of most Asian countries as well as Turkey and Mexico (Martinez, 2003; Chou et al, 2015; Lu et al, 2017). Stemming from hierarchical relationships, the important aspects of paternalism in these
societies are benevolence, morality and respect (Morris & Pavett, 1992; Martinez, 2003). The roots of paternalism are not sinister either; Chinese paternalism for example, originates from Confucianism and a culture of filial piety in which reverence for the paternal figure is reciprocated to the family and organisation (Cakar & Kim, 2013). Since it is culturally accepted for a father-figure to oversee family affairs, this is not a situation that usually results in rebellion. Rather, this style of leadership has been generally embraced (Liu et al, 2017; Morris & Pavett, 1992) and is informed by cultural values of respect, family and personal relationships. And because it is traditionally ingrained, those experiencing it will tend towards similar benevolent practices when they too become leaders. This is the case at Phiri and in the Zambian education system at large, where the leadership of men is accepted and rarely questioned, -certainly not in public. The language used by focus group respondents and the two interviewees indicates quite clearly that traditional male leadership is the traditional norm.

However, the advent of globalisation and shared knowledge through various media as well as exposure to western thinking has contributed to conflict between democratic, participative leadership styles and traditional paternalism. Whilst, as has been found in this study, the general attitudes still tend towards the traditional, it is much more commonplace to question such practices, especially if they are viewed as self-serving and undemocratic. As noted by Hofstede (2018) and the GLOBE Project (2016), Africans accept prevailing power differentials and social equality. Most tend to be content with the status quo, - they do not expect to be equal participants in power-sharing, preferring a consultation and contributory process that still leaves veto power in the hands of those in positional authority. Democratic leadership practices, as seen in western nations, serve to cause confusion because they clash with culturally accepted practices. This is seen in the Chinese struggle to inculcate suzhi jiaoyu. Similarly, in Africa, Ubuntu values of reverence for age and paternalistic practices are at odds with western practices of DL and social justice. T1’s conviction that a female leader such as former Liberian president Ellen Johnson Sirleaf is better for the formerly war-torn country is indicative of these changes in attitude and resonates with Chonya-Mfule (2006), Halyonda (2008) and Salukatula’s (2010) findings that Zambian female principals are more effective school leaders.
Whilst Ubuntu may be referred to by academics (e.g. Msila, 2008; Prinsloo, 1998) as a departure from hierarchical structures towards cooperative forms of leadership, the reality is that authority is usually willingly placed in the hands of a father-figure, who through benevolence, respect and morality will exercise authority. He will generally be left to lead, if this is done benevolently; failure to do so will result in loss of respect. In this study, instances abound where the head of Phiri is subtly denigrated, although some of his colleagues are outspoken in their lack of respect for him. This, in their opinions, results from the feeling that he is autocratic rather than benevolent in his paternalism. Ubuntu, in this respect, is thus not cut and dried (Msila, 2008) especially where there is conflict between traditional and new western-informed practices.

5.5 Colonial Influences

I discuss in this sub-section, the connections between colonial management practices and current leadership practices as I seek to correlate the influence of the former on the latter in the enactment of EL today.

Zambia’s history as a former colony continues to have an influence on EL today. The mechanisms of government remained unchanged when power changed hands from the colonisers to the inaugural indigenous government (Gumede, 2012; Prew, 2006; Steyn, 2003); this is the case across most African states. This includes the practices of bureaucracy and authoritarianism, which remain firmly in place decades later. Policy and decision-making mechanisms are entrenched centrally despite attempts to reverse this. Whilst the reintroduction of the cultural beliefs and practices of Ubuntu in South Africa have been lauded internally and internationally, evidence suggests that colonially promulgated practices of bureaucracy, autocracy and authoritarianism are difficult to dislodge (see Mattson & Hosley, 2002; Prew, 2006; SADe, 2000, 2004; Brijraj, 2004; Mohammed, 1999; Prinsloo et al, 2006; Thurlow, 2003; Mnisi & Prew, 2001). Evidence from this study shows that policies are still passed down bureaucratically and autocratically through similar education systems as existed during the colonial past.

An example is the constant changes in the curriculum which are done without engaging implementers at grassroots level. At school level, systems of management reflect state bureaucracy from the colonial era; decisions are cascaded to staff with expectations that
they will be obeyed without question, a cultural aspect of Zambia noted by Hofstede (2018) and House et al (2004). Authority is firmly in the hands of the head-teacher, empowering him to hand down decrees without recourse to participative processes. Like African principals of the colonial era, head-teachers do not consider themselves teachers but managers, who conduct administrative tasks and have little to do with teaching (Naidoo, 1992). However, teachers at Phiri School are not opposed to the hierarchical structure, as found by Taylor (2009) and Pelser & Van Wyk (2016), who note that traditional beliefs still place leadership firmly in the person of the principal. Their desire is for a system like the *legkotla*, a bastion of the concept of Ubuntu, which allows them to listen and comment on important decisions, with an understanding that the leader still has the final say (De Liefde, 2003).

A state of neo-colonialism of the mind, practiced by Africans themselves has taken the place of the former dispensation. Where before, colonialists were responsible for taxing indigenes through hut tax (Colclough & McCarthy, 1980; Tlou & Campbell, 1984), African leadership perpetrates similar practices on its populations through poor economic policy and remuneration, which forces people away from their homes. In the same way that parts of Southern Africa were denuded of productive people (Gann, 1958; Roberts, 1976; Tlou & Campbell, 1984), many productive Africans are being forced away from their homes through centrally managed posting to undesirable places, leaving their villages or hometowns unmanned. Colonially favoured strategies of divide and rule amongst different ethno-linguistic tribal groupings (Mulinge & Lesetedi, 1998; Cockerham, 1995; Brass, 1985) continue; respondents in this study have been quite vocal about how tribal divisions (as described by Posner, 2003; Moyo, 2009, Compagnon, 2011) play a central role in governance, politics and economics. There is also ample evidence that African values continue to suffer in ways similar to the colonial past when they (values) were deliberately eradicated in favour of western ones (see Gumbo, 2014; Shizha, 2004). Where once African schools suffered in favour of white schools (Mungazi,1985, 1989; Giliomee, 2009; Fiske & Ladd, 2005; van Der Berg, 2007; Nkomo, 2011), the new practice is for rural and inner-city schools to suffer the same fate, this time at the hands of their own democratically elected leaders. A worrying development in Zambia is the introduction of basic schools, which unwittingly relegate
many students to menial occupations, not unlike the colonial situation of producing semi-skilled labourers for the benefit of colonisers (Mungazi, 1989; Addo, 2004; Armah, 2006) or colonisers’ strategy to retard the advancement of Africans by denying them a good education (Mungazi, 1985; Giliomee, 2009; Cook, 1930).

Attempts at decentralisation and distribution of leadership to school and teacher level have met with failure because historical and traditional beliefs are firmly entrenched. As noted by Sibanda (2017), the colonial legacy is to blame because the same colonial conditions, - as seen by Gumede (2012)- have an influence on EL today. This contributes to educational leaders fearing to lose their power (Wyk, 2010; Naicker & Mestry, 2013) and the system remaining unchanged. Decentralisation has largely failed in former colonies (see Brijraj, 2004; SADE, 2004; Mohammed, 1999; Thurlow, 2003; Prinsloo et al, 2006). In Zambia, Sikayile’s (2011) examination of attempts to decentralise the country’s educational system shows failures due to resistance towards democratic and transparent organisational structures.

EL is affected by marked power distances between teachers, students and their leaders, which, whilst it may be the cultural norm for teachers to expect to be told what to do (Reeves & Ralph, 1999), has the effect of widening the gap, so that more voices are marginalised (Lumby, 2013; Woods & Roberts, 2016). The aims of democratic leadership and DL, social justice, - protection from arbitrary power, inclusive participation (Woods & Gronn, 2009), Fullan’s (2003) moral purpose and Woods & Robert’s (2013) participative justice - such as they may be in the African context, become an unattainable ideal with this increased power distance. What then rings true is the assertion that leadership and social justice cannot be bedfellows because decision-making is vested in a few individuals (Ryan, 2006). Some teachers have more power than others in this cultural logic (Scribner & Bradley-Levine, 2010) and students benefit the least in their positions as the least influential people at the base of the triangle (Woods & Roberts, 2013).

Furthermore, a distorted interpretation of DL ensues, where it is simply delegation rather than an emergent process working from the bottom upwards (Grant, 2008). Teachers and students are thus unable to transcend the prevailing dependence culture (Taylor, 2009) and remain stuck in a time-warp where they do not understand the
purpose and values of DL. The effect is one where power remains firmly in the hands of
the principal, who hands down decrees without recourse to participative processes as

De Gruy-Leary’s (2005) observation of some of the descendants of slaves in the USA
resonates with those of Mohammed (1999) and Reeves & Ralph (1994) in the African
context, that these behaviours have been wrought by hundreds of years of a top-down
culture, schooling in colonial ideology and passive acceptance of instruction.

5.6 Political Influences

In this section I discuss the similarities between politically influenced leadership
practices found in Zambia with those found in countries like China, Vietnam and
Singapore. I link these points to the bureaucratic nature of EL at Phiri and in the Zambian
education system and how school heads are more state and political functionaries than
independent school leaders. I further discuss how the goal of politically motivated EL is
aimed at embedding a culture of obedience through indoctrination of pupils, staff and
school leaders.

Whilst colonial influences are felt to this day in EL, the influences of major powers in
Zambia’s liberation are felt too. The liberation of sub-Saharan was achieved with strong
support from communist China and the USSR (Shubin, 2008) and some leadership traits
have been retained. For example, single-party dominance is the norm in Zambia,
Zimbabwe and South Africa, as is the case in China. Kenneth Kaunda’s and Robert
Mugabe’s one-party state systems were an emulation of Chairman Mao’s political
strategies in China.

At systemic level, the Zambian education system is highly bureaucratic, like the Chinese
one (Si, 1997), with several administrative levels external to the school. This has the
effect of high-power distance (Hofstede, 2018; Dimmock & Walker, 1998). This system
is an echo of the Chinese and Vietnamese education systems which are hierarchically
structured with principals’ decisions generally framed by central government (Walker &
Qian, 2012). School leaders and focus group participants from Phiri School have, on
several occasions, bemoaned similar practices in their school and education system. As
in China (see Moyles and Lin, 1998) and Vietnam (see Hallinger et al, 2015; Truong,
2013), the power of the state is felt throughout the educational system. In emulation of communist influenced structures found in China and Vietnam (see Zhu, 2008; Chen, 2007), the positional authority of the principal means he is rarely questioned because he is essentially a government official tasked with implementing centrally promulgated educational policies.

Again, as in the Chinese situation (Walker & Qian, 2011), EL reforms barely receive lip service. Sikayile (2011) reports that attempts at decentralisation, democratic leadership styles, transparency and accountability have not succeeded. Most appointments of senior education officials, including head-teachers are centrally managed, as in Vietnam (see Tran, 2011; 2012) and China (see Zheng et al, 2013; Huang et al, 2016), meaning they are more political functionaries and managers than educators. At Phiri, as is the case in most Zambian schools, the term ‘School Manager’ is more commonly used than the words ‘principal’ or ‘head-teacher’.

A system geared towards obedience is created, which in turn fosters autocratic management where decrees are handed down with the expectation that they will be unquestionably obeyed. A system of indoctrination begins for the population at a young age in school, which combines African values of filial piety with politically influenced dogma, emphasising obedience to the state and those who run it. This is like the Chinese practice of combining Confucian moral culture and communist culture, to emphasise the obedience of children in school, teach them to love their homeland and the Communist Party (Cleverley, 1991; Bush & Haiyan, 2000), whilst head-teachers are required to be staunch party supporters who adhere to dominant political ideology (Jia, 2007; An, 2006; Hu, 2007) through compulsory political education courses (Wang & Wang, 1999) and the conditions of service (Sun, 1999).

In combination with colonial influences which brought about stringent bureaucracy, autocracy and central management systems, albeit for ostensibly different reasons, these political influences on EL are at odds with innovative methods of school leadership; they stymy teacher initiative and participation and silence pupil voices. There is rhetorical acceptance of new strategies, but they are not in harmony with traditional African hierarchical systems or culturally accepted leadership practices. In China, this is seen in the conflict between suzhi jiaoyu and traditional leadership
methods as well as the conspicuous consumerism and degenerate behaviour of political leaders (Carney, 2008; Walker, 2012). Some Zambian educators and school leaders are also questioning these politically motivated leadership styles because some cultural beliefs and values are not being respected by the country’s leaders; these include self-control, communalism, and ethical self-cultivation, which the populace do not see reflected in the behaviours of their leaders. Faced with under-resourced schools, inadequate infrastructure, poor facilities and low remuneration for their work, politically motivated leadership is being increasingly questioned.

5.7 Collectivism and Communalism

Communal existence and collectivism are discussed in this section and linked to the findings. I also discuss their negative and positive influences on EL at Phiri School.

A positive aspect of communalism in African society is that people live within a communal, collective environment characterised by support for each other, harmony, peaceful co-existence, generosity and compassion, - the values of Ubuntu (Tutu, 1999; Luhabe, 2002). These values stem from the ingrained African desire to be part of a community with the fundamental belief that one cannot exist in isolation, hence the Zulu maxim, Umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu. This and other African sayings (see Falade et al, 2009; Mbiti, 1969) is seen in the constitution of African societies as inter-dependent groupings within which all can rely on each other in times of need. It is rare to see an African family existing in solitude; all funerals, celebrations and festivals will be well-attended. In rural Africa, fences are meant to keep wild animals out, not to exclude neighbours, and the upbringing of a child is a communal undertaking.

At Phiri School, communalism manifests in different ways which include the following; i) the support for younger teachers by older ones, ii) financial aid in times of need, iii) the ringing of bells not only to call children to school but as a community service to raise everyone, iv) people being freed up to attend funerals, v) communal support for bereaved colleagues, vi) working together to make bricks for a new school building. These practices are commensurate with findings of the GLOBE project (2016) and Hofstede (2018) which view Zambia as a feminine society whose dominant values are caring for others and in which prominence in society is a negative trait.
Like Chinese society (see Hsu, 1985), these characteristics show that school society thrives on commitment to the larger self, *dawo*. Colleagues show loyalty towards each other and have pride in belonging to the collective, like *jaoyanzu* in China (Wang & Mao, 1996). These strong relationships are characterised by strong relationships within the group and respect for societal rules such as confidentiality and submission to the collective. Breaking these rules leads to shame and loss of face.

EL is influenced both positively and negatively due to communalism and collectivism. Strong supportive relationships engender loyalty, thus building strong teams within the school. A school in which such positive values are paramount will no doubt thrive as all work towards a larger goal. However, the ‘we’ mentality (Head & Sorensen, 1993) may have a negative influence on individual initiative, with narrow-minded consensus and conformity sometimes being championed as positive universality (Louw, 2010). This mode of thinking thus begins to work against Ubuntu, which does not set out to stifle individual expression (Gyekye, 2002). There is also the risk of insularity and factionalism brought on by collectivism and communality to the exclusion of anyone else. New colleagues or school leaders may find it difficult to crack this mould when they attempt to introduce new ways of thinking.

5.8 Ethnocentrism and Tribalism

This sub-section discusses how tribal divisions are a real part of African life and how this influences EL at Phiri.

Communalism as one of the cultural values underpinning the concept of Ubuntu emphasises the inextricable, interdependent links between all members of a community; Ubuntu itself is based on communal cultural life (Tambalasi & Kayuni, 2005) and the belief that one is truly human as a member of society (Lutz, 2009; Koster, 1996) in which people provide physical and spiritual support to each other in the understanding that all belong to a greater whole (Tutu, 1999). Furthermore, African society is collectivist in nature, with individuals taking pride in being part of a collective (Hofstede, 2018).

Unfortunately, it is this pride in one’s grouping, - tribal in this instance, - which contributes, along with other factors, towards divisions within national groups in
Zambia and the rest of the continent. The inward-looking repercussions of such groupings, as described by Opio (1996), Lutz (2009) and Sono (1994) contribute towards tribal divisions and conflicts which manifest themselves in nepotistic tendencies, superiority complexes, escalating to war and genocide as seen in some parts of Africa (see Kalunga, 1985; Day, 1980; Mazrui & Tidy, 1984). Smith (1984) recognises tribalism as one of Africa’s oldest maladies and the reason for divisions within African civil society; he calls tribalism, ‘the tragedy of Africa, the barriers that divides this mighty continent...containing all the seeds of violence and disaster...a single incurable disease that infects them all.’ (p. 60)

In Zambia, one ethnic group gained supremacy over other tribal groupings during colonial times because of its proximity to the Copperbelt, which rendered the group a target for labour in the colony’s copper mining operations (Taylor, 2006). This, compounded with their dominance in numbers, led to them being more educated, modern and economically superior to others (Posner, 2003). This group’s language has become the widest spoken in the country, - spoken by 25% of a nation of 73 ethnolinguistic groups. This privileged status has resulted in political and economic disparities which have exacerbated tribal tensions and resentments in Zambia (Moyo, 2009; Mulinge & Lesetedi, 1998). Their presence is prevalent in parliament and the civil service. Ntshonalanga Province is not the home province of this dominant group, but their language is much more widely spoken than the indigenous ones; this is because they make up a significant proportion of miners and civil servants in this mining hub.

It would be erroneous to lay the blame for tribalism firmly on colonialism, although colonisers did take advantage of these divisions. As Smith (1984) observes, ethnocentric divisions are a part of African existence which predates colonialism; Kasomo (2011) relates Africa’s current ethnocentricity to historical preferences, attitudes, politics and geographical divisions, suggesting that the modern manifestation is an ideal perpetuated over hundreds of years. With over three thousand ethnolinguistic groups in sub-Saharan Africa, there is a high probability of tribal tension and conflict (Moyo, 2009; Collier & Hoeffler, 2002). Examples are the Hutu-Tutsi conflict in Rwanda (Mamdani, 2001; Mazrui & Tidy, 1984) and the Shona-Ndebele conflicts in Zimbabwe (Day, 1980) which predate the arrival of colonisers.
But respondents in this study feel very strongly about this tribal division and how, because of implicit state sponsorship, it affects EL in their schools and the educational system. Those from ‘lesser’ tribal groupings feel marginalised by the school leaders, who are from a dominant group; this marginalisation manifests in exclusion from influential school committees such as the finance committee and not being appointed to attend seminars, among other things. T7, for example, feels resentful of school management’s failure to nominate her for a promising secondment as a teacher trainer of THRASS (Teaching Handwriting Reading and Spelling Skills) at the provincial education department. This has been handed to a less qualified colleague who happens to be of the same tribal grouping as the school manager.

There are currently no studies of these state-sponsored divisions in Zambia, but its neighbours provide ample evidence. In Botswana, the dominant Tswana tribe has attempted to ‘convert’ smaller tribes such as the Kalanga and Baswara into Tswanas through state-sponsored mechanisms (Nyati-Ramahobo, 2008) and the Mbundu in Angola benefit more than other tribes from their positions of political and economic dominance (Malaquias, 2000).

So, in addition to the resentment that ethnocentric division has on EL, there are other impacts. Nepotism and favouritism in recruitment, promotion, advancement as well as recommendations for scholarships, training programmes and seminars are rife (Opio, 1996). Factionalism engendered by this favouritism then ensues, leading to groupthink (Lutz, 2009) which further frustrates potential progress (Nnadozie, 1998; Sono, 1994). The lack of transparency brought on by this insularity is also a fertile breeding ground for corruption.

5.9 Worshipping Traditions

In this sub-section, I discuss the normative nature of Zambian society, which manifests in respect for old traditions and a reluctance to move from them. I link this discussion to my findings and examine how EL is influenced by this.

Zambia is a normative society which maintains and has great respect for time-honoured traditions, viewing most societal changes with suspicion (Hofstede, 2018). For example, like Chinese society (see Coleman et al, 1998; Ribbins & Zhang, 2006; Bush & Haiyan,
2000; Huang & Wiseman, 2011), Zambians generally subscribe to the traditional mores that women’s professional aspirations are subordinate to those of their men, that men are the ones who must achieve in their careers whilst women continue in their traditional roles as homemakers. The societal position of women remains generally unchanged, with their experiences primarily affected by historical state controls, patriarchal relations and cultural stereotypes. All this, despite official national and international efforts to afford women equal treatment in school, the home and the workplace (e.g. The National Gender Policy, 2000; The Campaign for Female Education, 1999), whilst in China, communist doctrine gives women equal opportunities in politics, society and the economy (Constitution of the People’s Republic of China, 1999).

However, as seen in the GLOBE Project (2016), Zambia’s societal values differ considerably from its cultural practices. The report notes that Zambians would like to see more gender egalitarianism, yet the practice is significantly removed from the values. At Phiri School, Mwanza, like the Chinese (see Ribbins & Zhang, 2006; Coleman et al, 1998), believes women are troublemakers, not equipped to lead because of physiological and psychological traits.

The hierarchical nature of Zambian society has changed little over the years due to an intransigent adherence to traditional and societal mores. There is conflict between modernistic, western influenced meritocratic ideals and deeply ingrained practices that create unequal power relationships. Even when government champions democratic leadership styles, it is difficult to shift prevailing societal beliefs when society endorses predominant authority, power differentials and status privileges which engender social inequalities (GLOBE, 2016). In this study, respondents have contradicted themselves over such issues; for example, they have championed the concept of merit over age for leadership but returned to traditional positions where elders (usually male) are the expected leaders.

The worship of traditions spreads to long-established but inherited practices such as bureaucracy and authoritarian leadership which are a legacy of colonialism and communist ideology. These historically accepted patterns of behaviour, hierarchies of power and norms of interaction that shape EL are deeply ingrained structures that reflect historically constructed codes of behaviour (Gordon, 2002). Even when it is
universally accepted that such behaviours are reprehensible, school leaders keep to them (e.g. Prew, 2006; Steyn, 2003; Brijraj, 2004; Mohammed, 1999).

However, not all traditions are negative. The concept of Ubuntu with its attendant values, such as respect for elders, harmony, peaceful existence, diligence and industry (Awoniyi, 2015) contributes towards building a better society. Our identity as African shines through some of these values; we still insist on caring for our aged, our ancestors whom we revere for their age and wisdom. This is a value we adhere to despite the growing trend in the west of sending elders to homes when they cannot look after themselves. There are few such establishments in Africa. Communal existence, with its positive aspects is more the norm than an exception in African society; the strong sense of ‘we’ still influences African communal life. The isolated African family is a rarity.

Nevertheless, the intransigent worship of certain traditional beliefs and practices can negatively influence EL. Cases in point, as discussed, are gender inequality and insistence on maintenance of some colonial leadership practices. This refusal to evolve for the better has the effect of stagnating progress and development of the educational system.

5.10 Face, Shame and Embarrassment

This section explores how the concepts of face, shame and embarrassment influence EL at Phiri and Zambia in general.

Face as an African cultural construct, together with shame and embarrassment have not received much academic attention compared to Asian society. Amaoko-Agyei (2009) lists face as an integral part of African culture in the business world. While it may not have enjoyed the depth of scrutiny which has made it a cultural phenomenon in Asian society, face is innately understood in African society. A cognate of face that is better understood in Africa is shame or embarrassment as universally proposed by Brown & Levinson (1978, 1987), Modigliani (1968, 1971) and Miller (1978); there is no doubt these concepts are powerful driving forces for societal behaviour. Commensurate with Lin & Yamaguchi’s (2007) definition, Africans value their public image and by extension, the reputations of their families, organisations and their wider community such as their villages, which consist mostly of extended family. Shame is widely understood in these
settings. For example, a girl’s premarital pregnancy brings shame upon herself, her family and the community; she will be vilified by all within that community.

Elaborate hierarchical structures in African society, predicated by age, gender, seniority and other status factors, inform the role of face and shame in relationships. Respondents’ stories in this study illustrate behaviours aimed at saving face and ameliorating shame for some actors. This would be the case when men or older individuals react negatively to the placement of women or younger people above them. Shame occurs when they feel passed over for senior positions by these ostensibly junior colleagues. Their peers suffer empathetic embarrassment (Goffman, 1955; Miller, 1987) and will work together with the malefactor to reverse incidents that have caused this shame. The behaviour of the older men when T7 was appointed to train them shows their loss of face at being led by a younger female. Similarly, there is loss of face when a junior colleague is praised above his superordinate, perhaps for generating ideas that are well received or producing better results than his seniors. Bupe narrates several incidents when ideas generated by herself or junior colleagues have been negatively received by the head-teacher. Similar stories are told by members of the focus group, some of whom say they have given up on being proactive because of the poor reception their ideas receive. The fear here by the superordinate, is of perceptions by society that one is less able to lead than his juniors or even a woman. Thus, there is always strong resistance to such appointments as also seen in the US (Robinson, 2014), South Africa (Moorosi, 2010; Moorosi et al, 2017; Ngcobo, 1996) and China (Coleman et al, 1998; Ribbins & Zhang, 2006).

Avoidance of shame, loss of face and embarrassment can be positive when aimed at mitigating the public image of an institution brought on by the potential negative behaviours of some individuals within the collective. There are thus, strong drives aimed at improving the school’s public image, such as improving attendance, reducing teenage pregnancy and ensuring that staff and pupils are good ambassadors. It is when saving face is self-serving that the negative consequences become apparent. Should it continue in this vein, then saving face can be harmful. For example, where senior appointments are made to alleviate loss of face for older people or males, merit and qualifications will continue to play second fiddle to tradition, - a dangerous situation for a school’s
progress. Similarly, decision-making and idea-generation could stagnate because of a shallow talent pool caused by existing leaders ignoring contributions from younger colleagues or women.

5.11 Patronalism

In this sub-section, I discuss how patronal relationships, as found in this study, are analogous to the Chinese concept of *guanxi*. I discuss how this practice has degenerated into corruption and nepotism.

The term ‘patronalism’ is not in common use; I found it regularly used in two contemporary scholarly works, namely Hale (2015) and Downs (2011) who defines it as distribution of services by a senior figure or patron to his subordinates. From respondents’ accounts in this study, there are advantages to be gained from cultivating the right relationships with senior civil servants, union officials, politicians and influential parents. It is through patronal relationships, that union officials are first in line for vacant headships or that the children of influential stakeholders are not sanctioned for rule infractions in school.

An altruistic definition of *guanxi*, - a patronal practice based on Confucian principles - emphasises the values of mutual care and understanding through a hierarchical relationship between a paternalistic figure and his deferential, obedient and loyal subordinate (Davidson et al, 2017; Chen et al, 2014). However, in China, *guanxi* has lost this altruistic gloss because of abuse and misrepresentation for personal gain (Han, 2016), causing Chinese president Xi Jinping to launch a crackdown on corruption resulting in dismissal, loss of office and jailing of thousands of officials (Zhang, 2013). Similarly, the African practice of gift-giving described by Sylla (2013) and Mulinge & Lesetedi (1998) can no longer be said to be in widespread practice for its original purpose, which was to maintain peace and harmony in the society.

Hale’s (2015) description of patronal leadership as individuals using their political and business clout around personalised exchanges of concrete rewards through chains of acquaintances is a more accurate depiction of current practice as is the more pragmatic *wasta* of the Middle East which literally translates to ‘who you know’.
Evidence of patronal relationships abounds in stories narrated by the respondents at Phiri. Mwanza was a victim of such practices when he was deprived of his first headship. Bupe believes her transfer from Naledi School was the result of someone leveraging strong patronal relationships to their advantage and Bupe’s detriment. Similarly, T7 believes the teacher sent instead of her on secondment to the provincial education office enjoys a patronal relationship with a school leader or provincial education department official.

EL is affected both negatively and positively by patronal relationships. An advantage is the material benefits a school may receive, such as access to additional funding, educational resources, facilities and infrastructure when its leader has patronal relationships with influential stakeholders; Yau (2006) and Li (2005) have found this in Chinese contexts. However, the imbalance of power between supervisor and subordinate affects the minor person when they are expected to perform favours that they find difficult or reprehensible, such as being forced to accept children of influential people into their schools. Despite the values-backed justifications for patronal relationships like guanxi, the reality is that favours are dispensed because of relationships between two parties, to the detriment of other factors. For example, the promotion of an individual may not factor in educational qualifications, experience or creativity, considering instead, old school tie connections, union affiliations and other relationships. The dangers of such an appointment are myriad; productivity suffers and students, - our clientele- do not get the best service.

5.12 Over-Reliance on Aid

This sub-section discusses the integral nature of aid on Zambian education and its influence on EL. The influence of aid on Zambian education is significant because the system relies heavily on aid to meet some of its obligations. However, it is the frequent launching of diverse educational initiatives in schools from different donors which causes the most frustration for teachers and educational leaders.

Pragmatists may argue that the denigration of international aid to the third world is akin to looking a gift horse in the mouth. After all, some good has come out of this in Zambia. There has been increased girl-child access to education through such initiatives as PAGE
and CAMFED. Transition of students from primary to secondary school has increased, 49% in 2015, and more pupils, 68.8% in 2016, have completed basic education to grade 9 level. Additionally, more than 13,000 teachers have received teaching qualifications through international aid (GPE, 2015, 2016).

However, after 54 years of independence, myriad opportunities to reverse the educational inequalities of colonialism and hundreds of millions of dollars in aid, there has been no reduction in the demand for and acceptance of international aid. Furthermore, the same ills continue to plague Zambia’s education system. The continuation of such programmes as PAGE and CAMFED means the problem of female access to education remains an unresolved problem. According to Nationmaster (2018), Zambia ranks 99th out 129 on the educational gender parity index, 83rd out of 110 for total population literacy and 89th out of 96 for high school enrolment. Government spending on education is ranked 122nd out of 124. The UNICEF (2014) data which reveals that there are over half a million Zambian children out of school is equally alarming, as are the statistics that 25% of women over the age of 25 have no education at all (tradingeconomics.com, 2018). This fall in standards despite aid is a development bemoaned by many scholars (e.g. Riddell & Nino-Zarazua, 2016; Masino & Nino-Zarazua, 2016; Chishala, 2015). Slumping standards are not only at primary and secondary but at tertiary level as well. Oxford University recently downgraded Zambian universities to college status for post-graduate admission purposes.

Capacity-building of teachers may be a positive step; nevertheless, thousands of trained teachers are unable to obtain employment in Zambia. 2000 vacancies arise in the state sector annually for over 85,000 unemployed qualified teachers (Phoenix FM, 2018). And yet the international community continues to hear of qualified teacher shortages in Zambia (Mungambata, 2018).

Moyo (2009) and McPherson (2004) are thus justified in questioning the role of government if its strategic plans to address inadequacies in education rely heavily on foreign aid. Their conclusion that most aid has surely been wasted is equally justified.

The teachers at Phiri are mostly concerned about the carousel of educational initiatives they must countenance annually. Chief amongst these concerns is the inconsistency
that ensues when new projects are launched before they complete existing ones. Conditionalities of aid affect school leaders because they run counter to the spirit of education. As T3 states, sometimes it is no longer about teaching and learning but about meeting donor demands of generating reports to prove you’ve done something.

The positive effects of foreign aid have been addressed. There however seem to be more disadvantages on EL. Governments have no incentives to look inwards for solutions to their educational problems, nor to implement democratic reforms that could address bad governance and poor transparency. Moreover, donors dominate the administration and implementation of aid initiatives, making staffing decisions, procurement choices and imposing conditionalities that may adversely affect national education systems (Moyo, 2009; Easterly, 2003, 2006, 2009; McPherson, 2004a, 2004b; Langdon & Draman, 2005; Whitfield & Fraser, 2008).

5.14 Ubuntu

The following section addresses the third research question, which reads;

How far does the concept of Ubuntu influence school leadership in the school?

As has been seen in the preceding section of this Findings chapter, the concept of Ubuntu overlaps into other cultural factors in EL; such cognates are also found in other cultures. Confucian values, for example, uphold principles of collectivism, respect for elders and authority, worship for traditions and hierarchical systems based on feudal systems and ancestral worship (Cleverley, 1991; Wang & Mao, 1996; Gong, 1989). In Ubuntu, such virtues as respect for elders, hierarchical structures, peaceful existence, courtesy, harmony and others highlighted by Blake (1993), Tutu (1999), Luhabe (2002) and Awoniyi (2015) are the positive values that respondents in this study desire to see in educational leaders throughout the system in Zambia.

As evidenced by the strong community ties within Phiri School along with the attendant values of family, cooperation and harmony, communalism is a strong pillar of Ubuntu, which contributes towards coherence within the teaching body and spreads out into the community at large; this is exemplified by members of the community making bricks to build new classroom blocks. Respecting these values creates a harmonious community;
furthermore, it is the recognition of others’ humanity at Phiri School which forms a strong community.

Mutual support is a highly desirable principle of Ubuntu which is practised at Phiri. This is seen in older staff advising younger ones on marital matters and in the strong community support at bereavements. The trust and loyalty engendered by such selfless acts also contributes towards building a stronger community.

However, the good intentions of Ubuntu can oftentimes be misinterpreted, leading to its misapplication or abuse. House et al (2004; 2016) find that values and practices can differ considerably; thus, for example, Zambians’ desire to be more future and performance oriented, to see a decrease in power distance and to increase gender egalitarianism are not reflective of reality. This is seen in the value of reverence for elders, who dominate leadership in most institutions. Because of a misplaced sense of entitlement brought on by such beliefs as the divine culture of respect for elders, some are known to ignore reciprocal obligations they have in the relationships. This validates Onwubiko (1991) and Conton’s (1966) caution about displaying wholesale respect for elders because it can be taken for granted. In this study, respondents have mentioned the failure of some elders to respond to a greeting, -one of the ways in which respect is shown in African society. Elders should also be the guardians of communal cultural practices; the legkotla, an inclusive, participative method of management, is often abandoned in favour of bureaucratic, authoritarian management structures (Prew, 2006; Steyn, 2003; Brijraj, 2004). Similarly, paternalism, an African cultural method of leadership tends towards authoritarianism. Moreover, conviction of their position in society as ‘living ancestors’ (Masango, 2006) and purveyors of wisdom (Gumbo, 2014) causes elders to believe in their infallibility. Younger staff are often frustrated by these attitudes because their contributions are ignored, or they are not given an opportunity to contribute, as is seen with curriculum, which has been created from above with little input from below. In such instances, Ubuntu is more about obedience than consensus.

Communalism can also be misapplied to become constrictive in nature (Sono, 1994), demanding an oppressive conformity from the group (Louw, 2010). Such thinking frustrates individual initiative, and anyone thinking divergently risks ostracism. In an educational environment, this defective communalism (Lutz, 2009) creates an aversion
to creative thinking and standing out from the crowd for fear of being labelled as one who is opposed to communal morals (An Afro-centric Alliance, 2001; Nnadozie, 1998) which value modesty and restrained personality whilst demanding obedience, - a habit fostered for the maintenance of group harmony (Dimmock & Walker, 1998; Wang & Mao, 1996, Gong, 1989).

Ubuntu stresses the importance of group collectivism, especially society’s pride in various groupings such as family and work organisations (Awoniyi, 2015; House et al, 2016); this is also found in Chinese society (Hsu, 1985; Gong, 1989; Head & Sorenson, 1993). Loyalty and integration into strong cohesive groups are key characteristics of the collective. Unfortunately, some leaders view this as an opportunity to engage in nepotistic appointments, since in traditional African society, one’s neighbours tend to be family (Opio, 1996); nepotism would predominantly be based on tribal affiliations, resulting in ethnocentric tensions and resentment. Nepotism is characterised by lack of trust, job stress, poor organisational loyalty, poor performance with a further risk of hindered internal controls (Mustafa, 2008; Keles et al, 2011). In schools, education is negatively affected when unsuitable staff are appointed to senior positions or when favoured colleagues are sent for professional development.

These misinterpretations of Ubuntu are caused primarily by its vague definitions which open it up to abuse for personal gain (Lutz, 2009). Tambulasi & Kayuni’s (2005) account of Malawian President Muluzi’ s actions, illustrates how the meaning of Ubuntu can be applied indiscriminately.

Therefore, in answer to the third research question, findings from this study and personal experience show that Ubuntu does indeed have a strong influence on EL in the school. Positively, there is generosity, care, hospitality, compassion, trust, sympathy, mutual support and reverence for age to mention but a few characteristics. However, like religious values, the misinterpretation of Ubuntu can result in many negative results.
Chapter 6: Conclusion

6.1 Summary of Findings

This study aimed to investigate the influence of culture on the enactment of EL in a Zambian school. This was achieved by eliciting narratives and opinions from school leaders and teachers through exploratory qualitative research methods. I set out to understand how leadership practices of school leaders have developed from their early days as teachers and how this is enacted in their current roles. The teacher focus-group discussions entailed investigation of their perceptions of the leadership practices within the school as they experienced them; these included, planning, decision-making and the organisational structure, amongst others. I then inductively analysed these qualitative data to develop and conceptualise themes that are grounded in the accounts of informants. These themes articulate and portray from the perspectives of these leaders and teachers the inter-relationships between culture and EL.

This study finds that EL is influenced by traditional, cultural, societal and historical influences. African culture, encapsulated as Ubuntu, has a significant influence on EL and societal relationships, primarily through its values which are underpinned by communalism, -an identification of all within communities as members of a wider group and the maxim, Umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu, which places Africans within the community and their humanism as recognition of the humanity in others (Luhabe, 2002). It is through communal existence that hierarchical structures, reverence for age, respect for authority, collectivism, paternalism and patriarchy exert an influence on how society and by extension, schools are led. Traditional behaviours are not just those influenced by culture, but those influenced by history and societal thinking. These include practices such as bureaucracy and autocratic leadership which are a legacy of colonial and political influences. A significant, culturally influenced reality is the marginalisation of women in EL.

The study also finds comparisons between African and other cultures, particularly Chinese culture, although similarities are also found in Singaporean and Vietnamese culture. Belief in filial piety, respect for age and authority, communalism, collectivism, face or shame and practices introduced by socialism are analogous here.
I also found that some cultural beliefs and practices, such as those influenced by the concept of Ubuntu are open to misinterpretation, resulting in abuses. Thus, for example, communalism can be corrupted into factionalism; nepotism and collectivism can be used to stymie the progress of some individuals within a collective.

I believe this investigation has shed light on the relationship between culture and Zambian school leadership. Furthermore, the study could be a precursor to research into the area of culture and EL in a larger number of schools in different regions of Zambia and in other African countries.

In this chapter, I will list the contributions to knowledge of this thesis, discuss the implications and recommendations arising from the study, after which I will evaluate the research and then propose suggestions for further research.

6.2 My Contribution to Knowledge from this Thesis

Staff at the Phiri School may not consciously consider cultural values, beliefs and practices in their day-to-day operation of the school. However, based on their accounts and perceptions, I developed the following statements, which I believe encapsulate my original contribution to knowledge;

The concept of Ubuntu plays an important role in school leadership, - that of uniting members of the community. Togetherness, peaceful coexistence and mutual support underpin this concept. Within the community, elders are revered for their wisdom born of experience and tend to be the leaders; this is especially the case for males, who take on paternalistic roles. They represent authority and are respected for their formal leadership positions. Whilst women may be marginalised in this patriarchal society, older women, such as T1, are informal leaders who perform a motherly function within the community, such as providing marriage counselling to younger colleagues.

The values of Ubuntu such as harmony, forgiveness, unity, cooperation, generosity, hospitality and loyalty are found abundantly in formal and informal leadership of the school. Different tiers of the school community contribute towards its development, as seen in villagers volunteering to make bricks to build more classrooms or members of staff taking the time to aid a bereaved colleague by providing moral support and contributing towards funeral costs. Unfortunately, the precepts of Ubuntu can be
misinterpreted in EL. For example, communalism can be warped to become nepotism. One of the consequences of such practices for EL is stagnated, group-thinking organisations, characterised by sycophancy and an unwillingness to question the leader. Another example is the sense of entitlement that elders within a community may have towards being respected and viewed as leaders. Whilst age will always be revered in Zambian society, there is a risk of the school being led by an unsuitable individual simply because he/she is the eldest and has more years within the system.

Patronal relationships, - the equivalents of guanxi in China and wasta in the Middle East- are used by leaders and their subordinates for personal advancement. This is achieved by individuals cultivating relationships with their superiors with the expectation that the latter will use their influence to promote the interests of the former. The unselfish origins of these relationships are a rare occurrence; they are commonly used for personal gain. These nepotistic practices may result in unqualified school leaders, which will in turn stymie school progress and development.

Because of the paternalistic culture found in Africa, few women, compared to men, are found in positions of authority. This makes for a low gender egalitarianism in school leadership and for an unequal education sector at large. The school is thus deprived of the unique characteristics that female leaders bring to the profession such as a nurturing nature. Similarly, female students do not have strong female role models as they see mostly men in positions of authority within the school.

Historical tribal tensions and conflicts influence relationships within the workplace, resulting in nepotism, favouritism and factionalism. There is a tendency for ethnic nepotism, characterised by educational leaders surrounding themselves with colleagues from their own tribes, whilst disenfranchising others from ‘lesser’ ones. Moreover, opportunities for advancement and further training are afforded to one group over another. This factionalism can lead to group-think and a lack of diversity in the school. Ethnocentric practices also lead to resentment between colleagues, further escalating tribal tensions, especially when this superiority is openly flaunted.

Leaders feel the need to maintain a positive public persona. This influences their actions as they work towards maintaining face. The consequences of maintaining face at any
cost can have a negative impact on EL and the school. An example is school leaders studiously ignoring the contributions of junior colleagues because they are afraid to be perceived as less able than their subordinates. Such behaviour affects the quality of school leadership and stagnates school development as limited ideas are generated by a chosen few people.

Legacies of the colonial past, such as bureaucracy, centralisation and autocracy are the methods of operation in idea-generation, decision-making and policy-making. A significant consequence of this method of operation is increased power distance between management and staff. Nationally, bureaucracy causes multiple tiers between educational leaders in central government, provincial representatives, district officials, school leaders and teachers, resulting in leaders not knowing what is happening at grassroots, causing them to make ill-informed decisions. Power is centralised in the hands of the few and decisions are handed down without recourse to participative processes. This causes resentment from those on the receiving end of these decisions. Ultimately, centralised, autocratic leadership leads to the marginalisation of the voices in school.

Some contemporary initiatives such as legislative bans on corporal punishment and laws advancing the position of women cannot gain traction because of resistance to this change and preferences to adhere to traditional beliefs and practices. Traditional beliefs and practices such as relegating women to subordinate positions in society, - predicated by a paternalistic culture- and violent punishments for children’s perceived misbehaviour are far stronger than any laws promulgated to outlaw said practices. Consequently, the rights of women and children in school are still a cause for concern, since they only receive lip service.

6.3 Additional Issues Found in The Study

There are other issues at the heart of schools that are important to teachers and leaders alike, which I have not seen mentioned in any article or model of school leadership and culture. They are as follows:

Teachers and school leaders are quite concerned about where they are posted to work by the Teaching Service. They usually want to stay near family and friends in a place
where the local language spoken is their own, to take full advantage of the communal and collectivist values they have become accustomed to in their home communities.

The centralised posting of teachers to anywhere in the country is reminiscent of an autocratic system as epitomised by colonial management of the education systems; it works actively against the values of Ubuntu since the affected teachers become rootless and may find their value systems eroded within their new locations. These teachers can be likened to their predecessors during colonial times, - working away from home and expatriating money home like the hut tax of yore, whereas they would benefit more from injecting the fruits of their labours directly into their communities. During colonial times, this movement of educated professionals from their homes formed part of the divide and rule strategy in that different tribal groupings would view the newcomer with suspicion, thus hobbling the person’s ability to foment political activity (Mungazi, 1985, 1989). Such a strategy, among others, would have given Andrew Skeen, Jan Smuts and Hendrick Verwoerd the confidence to state that African political advancement would never happen (see Mungazi, 1989; Giliomee, 2009; Cook, 1930).

Once settled, teachers tend to desire stability by remaining in the same place because they will have established roots by building homes, making friends, establishing businesses and feeling comfortable in their work environments. However, Zambian teachers cannot always hope for this stability; they can be transferred at any time to elsewhere in the country. In early 2018, the government conducted mass transfers of teachers, resulting in widespread chaos across the country as teachers were forced to abandon established homes, families were destabilised or separated, some staff were deployed to take subjects or classes they were not trained to teach, sometimes in languages they could not speak and many other consequences (The Zambian Observer, 2018; Zambia Reports, 2018; Zambia Daily Mail, 2018). The education minister reportedly urged everyone to comply or ‘risk being put off payroll and be replaced by teachers on the waiting list’ (The Zambian Observer, 2018), - an example of centralised leadership, far removed from happenings on the ground.

Secondly, the entrenched culture of obedience engendered by acceptance of power differentials of the hierarchical structures means most teachers will comply with prevailing policies and the conduct of their leaders despite dissatisfaction with said
conducted. They will respect authority and follow protocol along the set bureaucratic lines. To save face, they will avoid confrontation and actions that may have them labelled as troublemakers.

Lastly, it is the belief of staff, that should they bide their time and keep out of trouble, they will be up for promotion when the opportunities commensurate with their experience arise. Such beliefs are brought on by the prevailing situation within schools and the civil service, where staff have seen promotions handed primarily to the longest serving staff, - giving credence to the elders being leaders in society. They are in turn convinced that obedience and cultivating the right relationships with senior officials will land them their desired positions in due course. School leaders aspire towards positions at district or provincial level and teachers hope to move up the ladder within the school for a start.

6.4 What understandings about culture are reflected in my findings?

Having spent some time studying societal culture and education, it behoves me to add to the myriad voices of my predecessors in restating that culture is indeed a complex subject to define and fully understand. It has been a challenge to differentiate between the different levels as they have been defined, primarily because values and beliefs tend to permeate across all strata. In many instances, I have found that values and beliefs may not be shared by all within a defined group.

Significantly, I have come across beliefs and practices that pervade a large proportion of the population, but which have never been formally identified as culture. I refer here to such practices as ethnocentrism and colonial influences which, according to the findings in this study, are deeply embedded in societal practice and belief. Does this mean they cannot be defined as culture?

The nature of culture is another bone of contention. Culture has been defined as shared values within a collective (Tierney, 1996; Giddens, 1989). The word ‘value’ refers to positive principles and standards of behaviour and my assumption would be that when one refers to culture, then reference is only made to the positive aspects of a society. What then of the preponderance of negative practices and attitudes that are found in just about any society?
I have taken cognisance of the shifts in the way that the word ‘culture’ has been used in this modern era and applied it to my understanding of culture to give meaning to my findings. Thus, such a phrase as ‘a culture of obedience’ has taken on a meaningful spectre in this research, since it is clear from the findings that these are everyday issues that participants deal with regularly. In concurrence with Sharpe & Gopinathan (2000) and Dimmock & Walker (2000), I have not allowed the Hofstedeian framework to define and limit my perception of culture in school and school leadership. I have allowed for culture to interact with economic, political, historical and sociological factors to make for a more holistic understanding of it and to shape the interpretation of culture that has emerged in this study.

Instead of a one-dimensional definition, I have employed Dimmock & Walker’s (2005) submission that culture includes dress, cuisine, customs, religion and art. I have also embraced Giddens’ (1989) definition of culture as a society’s values that distinguish it from others. I have incorporated Mitchell & Willower’s (1992) assertion that culture is ‘a way of life’ because this definition allows me to draw some heretofore unremarked practices into the realm of culture.

Finally, I have viewed culture as a dynamic concept which evolves in response to internal and external stimuli such as economic change and globalisation. I have taken Peshkin’s (1992) advice and conceptualised culture to suit the purpose of my study into EL and culture.

6.5 Evaluation of the Research

By opting to work with just one school in Zambia, I conducted a detailed study through the employment of a series of in-depth interviews with both school leaders and their staff. The qualitative data was rich, allowing me to develop many themes from the recounts, descriptions and opinions of informants. The resultant case study report forms a launchpad from which further similar studies can be conducted. Ideally, this would be across mores schools to get more representative findings.

The lessening of distance between myself as the researcher and respondents, meant that interpretation of data was based on my values and therefore, cannot be viewed as objective; this caveat is also highlighted by Garger (2013). I did however, gain insular
views of informants’ lived experiences which I could not have garnered as a detached researcher. Furthermore, the sample size, - seven teachers and two school leaders from the same school- was neither large nor representative enough to embody the relevant characteristics of all teachers and school leaders in the country (Williams, 2000).

Whilst conducting the case study, I was faced with a few challenges, the most significant of which was the subjective nature of my findings based on my role as an interactive researcher, using the constructivist approach. However, I found that, if I was seeking rich, thick authentic descriptions, whether they were biased or not, I would need to immerse myself in the research. I was initially concerned about how the narrow nature of my research would limit my ability to draw generalisable conclusions, given that it was in just one school with nine staff. However, as the project progressed, I was glad to note that the small size of the sample was an advantage, not a limitation as I was able to conduct rigorous data collection and analysis and work to a timeline which suited my profile as a single researcher. A bigger sample would simply have delayed me. I was also able to save time by conducting focus group discussions instead of individual interviews with teachers.

Another advantage was my ability to investigate real-life situations and generate contextualised real data. As suggested by Merriam and Nilsson (1994), the case study approach allowed me to generate a wider range of information. I found unanticipated information with this method, as recounted in section 6.3. This ability of case study research to neither retain nor eliminate data gave me the initial materials required to structure future research and advance knowledge in the field of EL (Jacobsen, 2002; Merriam, 2009; Shields, 2007).

The single-unit study may not have provided a broad sample, but I learned a lot from the Phiri School as can be seen in this report. I believe my narrative description has created a story that illustrates the real-life situation of the interaction of culture and EL in the school.

My ultimate position is that the findings from this study should be viewed as preliminary steps intended to stimulate further research in the field of culture and EL in Zambia and the region.
6.6 Utilising Findings from This Thesis

I believe the findings from this study can be useful in addressing the enactment of leadership in Zambia. In this section, I briefly outline how I plan to use the knowledge from these findings to reach a wider audience and begin to influence EL in my community.

1. Upon approval of the final thesis, I intend to publish a condensed version of it in a recognised peer-reviewed journal. The challenge will be to condense it from around 55,000 words to meet the specific standards of the journal.

2. I also intend to develop from this thesis, materials for a series of workshops aimed at building capacity for EL. The main aim of these workshops would be to develop the conditions for educational professionals to work with parents to protect and empower students, to optimise students’ learning and to build democracy in education for equity and renewal.

3. I would like to share this thesis with my sponsors and colleagues.

6.7 Suggestions for Further Research

The introduction and the literature review showed quite clearly that there is a dearth of studies and an evidence base around EL and management in Zambia. Based on my findings and on other issues that have emerged through this study, the following areas can be researched to add to the body of evidence;

- Empirical studies into EL styles in Zambia and the region.
- Investigations into the effect of various forms of corruption on schools and education in Zambia and the region.
- Empirical studies into gender and EL in the country and the region.
- Investigations into the influence and impact of aid and donor agencies on the curriculum and pupil outcomes.
- An examination of centralised bureaucracy in the hiring and posting of teachers within the civil service.
- An in-depth analysis of Ubuntu and education in the region.
In March 2017, Mwanza was transferred to a rural school several kilometres outside town. The head-teacher whom he replaced was sent to Phiri School in what was effectively a direct swap. This was the beginning of a nationwide swathe of teacher transfers which began in earnest in January 2018 targeting teachers who have been *in situ* for more than five years. Most teachers at Phiri School have been affected. Bupe remains in her position as deputy head-teacher but has expressed her disappointment at not being considered for the school’s headship. However, she says she will bide her time and remains confident that she may receive an appointment in the coming round of promotions. T1 has been appointed as senior teacher in charge of the pre-school department of the school. T7, who was initially transferred to a rural school, has returned to town and been seconded to the provincial education office to oversee the implementation of the THRASS (Teaching Handwriting Reading and Spelling Skills) programme which is jointly funded by the Canadian government and USAID.
Appendix A (Interview Schedule: Mwanza)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Tell me your story, - how you find yourself in this position today.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>If you recall, how would you describe what was going on your life then?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>When, if at all, did you decide to follow teaching as a pathway? Was there a driving influence?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>You mentioned that you now view yourself as more fortunate than your peers who were posted to the Copperbelt where you initially wanted to be posted yourself. Why do you say this?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Can we go back to your first posting as a head; the one which no one was happy about. Could you tell me about your thoughts and feelings when you found that everyone was opposed it? By everyone, I mean the top brass at the district education office.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>A similar incident happened just before you were posted here to Phiri. By that time, you had matured a lot more and had some experience as a school leader. Can you talk me through how you felt about that experience and how you dealt with it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>You tell me that these are things which happen all the time; this kind of influence on postings and so on. With your experience within the system, how have you learned to handle this kind of behaviour and conduct by your superiors?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Looking back again, as an experienced person within the system, how do you feel about the people who did this to you?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Let’s look back at your time as a young teacher and how it influenced your leadership practice today. Who would you say influenced your leadership practice?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>What did you like about him?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>So, how does this translate into how you enact your leadership practice today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>How would you describe yourself as a leader?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>You say there is a big distance between yourself and your subordinates. Can you describe for me what you mean by this?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Why do you think this is so?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>What would you say are the biggest challenges you face as a leader?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>You mention personal matters as a big challenge. How do you deal with them?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Do you not think your comments on women as teachers might be viewed as prejudicial? Surely, they have no control over their monthly cycles?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>What are your views on age and seniority within the school?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Looking back at your career, there have been highs and lows. In your opinion, how would you say they have shaped you as a school leader?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Do you have any questions for me?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B (Interview Schedule: Bupe)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Tell me your story, - how you find yourself in this position today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>You say your in-law influenced your decision to become a teacher. Looking back at the many options available to you at that time, would this still be the same thing you would have done?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>You were posted to a rural setting after you got married, - alone, without your husband. How did this affect your marriage?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Tell me a little more about life in the chief’s village as a deputy head. How you interacted with the locals. How you got on with their rituals and ceremonies, - their culture in general.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Let’s go back to your first deputy headship. How did you handle finding yourself in the position of single-handedly running the school, considering that the head was hardly around?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5a</td>
<td>If you can recall, tell me about how you felt, when, instead of being praised for your hard work, you found yourself being attacked by the head?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Your experiences with the head and the DEB officials when you faced the transfer must have been quite stressful. How have they influenced the way you view those in authority?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Looking back at that time and those experiences, how would you say you feel about those people today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Has that experience influenced or shaped the way in which you lead?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>During your time as a younger teacher, who would you say had a profound influence on the way you enact your leadership today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>How would you characterise your relationship with your subordinates?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>You mention community now and have spoken about it as important at your last school. Could you explain why you believe community is a significant factor in your leadership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Can you describe a typical day as a deputy head?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Looking at your position in the school and what you do on a daily basis, do you think it is an influential position? Why do you say so?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>How would describe yourself as a leader today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>You mentioned your former head as an influence. How have you emulated him in your practice?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>What are your biggest challenges as a school leader?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>What would your ideal leadership situation be?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>You’ve been through quite a lot here and in your last posting. What lessons have you learned from these experiences?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Tell me about your strengths that you have discovered throughout all the challenges you have faced in your career.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>After taking this journey down memory lane, is there anything else you would like to add?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Do you have any questions for me?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bibliography


171


Carvalho, T., Diogo, S. (2018) Women rectors and leadership narratives: the same male norm. Education Sciences, 8 (75), 1-14


Chafwa, F. (2012) Impact of management styles exhibited by school heads on staff performance in selected high schools in Kawamba district of Luapula province. Master’s dissertation, University of Zambia


Christian Education South Africa v Minister of Education 2000 (4) SA 757 (CC)


Eskenazi, J. (2011) How to fix the most common mistakes in focus groups. Retrieved from https://uxmag.com (accessed on 16/08/2016)


Gann, L. H. (1958) *The birthplace of a plural society: the development of Northern Rhodesia under the British South Africa Company.* Manchester: Manchester University Press


Harris, A. (2008a) Distributed Leadership through the looking glass. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 46 (2)

Harris, A. (2008b) Distributed Leadership: according to the evidence. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 46 (2), 172-188
Harris, A. (2013) Distributed leadership: friend or foe? *Educational Management Administration and Leadership*, 41 (5), 545-554


samhällsvetenskapliga områden. Lund: Studentlitteratur

Administrative Science Quarterly, 43, 235-256

Jia, H. L. (2007) Investigation on leadership effectiveness of primary and secondary
head-teachers. Journal of Teaching and Management, 12, 12-13

Jideonwo, C. (2017) The irony of the youth-led frustration that keeps electing old men
into office across Africa. Quartz Africa, 7 February 2017. Retrieved from
ghana-as-70-year-olds-leading-young-electorates/ (accessed on 13/12/2016)


Jones, T. (1998) Interpretive social science and the native point of view. Philosophy of
the Social Sciences, 28, 132-168

organisational behaviour in Asia. Organisational Sciences, 9 (4), 522-534


Kabeta, R.M., Manchishi, P. C., & Akakandelwa, A. (2015) Instructional leadership and
its effect on the teaching and learning process: The case of head-teachers in selected
basic schools in the Central Province of Zambia. International Journal of Science and
Research, 4 (4), 1876-1884

Review, 11 (4), 30-44

District, 1891-1938. African Studies review, 28 (1), 57-72


Mitchell, J. T., & Willower, D. J. (1992) Organisational culture in a good high school. *Journal of Educational Administration, 30* (6), pp 6-16


Reeves, C., & Ralphs, m. (1994) The struggle to teach. Johannesburg: Maskew Miller


Shi, Z. Y. (2007) Principal values leadership. School Management, 7, 4-6


The Zambia Education Curriculum Framework (2013) Prepared and published by the Curriculum Development Centre


Zhao, Y. (2007) On the idea and tactics of the principal’s instructive leadership in our country. Master’s dissertations, Southwest University, Chongqing, China
