

ANNEXUS

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of ‘citation pollution’: A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

Van der Walt, Wynand

Head Librarian: Technical Services
Rhodes University
Somerset Street, Makhanda, South Africa
w.vanderwalt@ru.ac.za
www.ru.zc.za

Willems, Kris A.

Executive Dean / CEO
Belgium Campus ITiversity / Botlhale Village
138 Berg Avenue, Heatherdale, 0182 Pretoria, Gauteng, South Africa
willems.k@belgiumcampus.ac.za
www.belgiumcampus.ac.za

Friedrich, Wernher

Senior Lecturer
Belgium Campus ITiversity
138 Berg Avenue, Heatherdale, 0182 Pretoria, Gauteng, South Africa
Friedrich.w@belgiumcampus.ac.za
www.belgiumcampus.ac.za

Hatsu, Sylvester

Senior Lecturer/Acting Director of ICT
Accra Technical University
P.O. Box GP 561, Accra, Ghana
shatsu@atu.edu.gh
<https://atu.edu.gh>

Krauss, Kirstin

Professor
University of South Africa (UNISA)
Preller St, Muckleneuk, Pretoria, 0002, South Africa
Kirstin.krauss@gmail.com
www.unisa.ac.za

Annex A: An analysis of 33 Retracted Covid-19 Papers

	Retracted research	Date published	Date of retraction	Journal	Pre-print server	Paper still available on publisher website (Y/N)	Google Scholar confirms retractions (Y/N)	Approx. No of Citations (Google Scholar, recorded between 14 to 22 Sept)	Authors' affiliation country
1.	Mehra et al., (2020a) (Ret)	2020-05-22	2020-06-04	The Lancet		Y	N	540	USA/Switzerland
2.	Mehra et al., (2020b) (Ret)	2020-05-01	2020-06-04	New England Journal of Medicine		Y	N	476	USA
3.	Wang et al., (2020b) (Ret)	2020-04-07	2020-07-10	Cellular & Molecular Immunology		Y	N	162	China
4.	Bae et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-06	2020-06-01	Annals of internal medicine		Y	N	109	South Korea
5.	Wang et al., (2020a) (Ret)	2020-02-17	N/A	Zhonghua er ke za zhi= Chinese journal of pediatrics		N (abstract only)	N	88	China
6.	Karami et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-11	2020-05-02	Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease		N	N	79	Iran
7.	Funck-Brentano and Salem (2020) (Ret)	2020-05-22	Replaced	The Lancet (Editorial)		N	N	22	France
8.	Zhuang et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-03-05	"A few days later"	Zhonghua liu xing bing xue za zhi = Zhonghua liuxingbingxue zazhi (Chinese Journal of Epidemiology)		N	N	22	China
9.	Beato-Vibora (2020) (Ret)	N/A	2020-05-12	Diabetes Technology & Therapeutics		Y	N	17	Spain
10.	Zeng and Zhen (2020) (Ret)	2020-02-24	2020-02-26	The Lancet Global Health		Y	N	13	China
11.	Luo et al. (2020) (Ret)	Early March	Mid-April	Practical Preventive Medicine		N	N	3	China
12.	Nouvier et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-13	2020-04-20	Bulletin de la Dialyse à Domicile		Y	N	2	France
13.	Kumar (2020) (Ret)	N/A	N/A	Journal of Molecular Pharmaceuticals and Regulatory Affairs		N	N	1	India
14.	Gormley and Ngan (2020) (Ret)	N/A	2020-04-06	Journal of the American Pharmacists Association		N	N	1	USA
15.	Tofade and Daftary (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-10	N/A	Journal of the American Pharmacists Association		N	N	1	USA
16.	Singh (2020) (Ret)	2020-07-08	2020-09-14	Korean Journal of Anesthesiology		Y	Y	1	India

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of 'citation pollution': A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

17.	Fioranelli et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-07-16	2020-07-24	Journal of Biological Regulators and Homeostatic Agents (Editorial)		N	N	0	Italy
18.	Oodendijk et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-08-15	2020-08-16	Asian Journal of Medicine and Health		N	Y	N/A	Belgium/France/Switzerland/East Timor
19.	Yang et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-02-11	2020-02-21		medRxiv	N	N	218	China
20.	Pradhan et al. (2020) (Ret)	2020-01-31	2020-02-02		BioRxiv	Y	N	39	India
21.	Chen et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-01-25	2020-01-28		BioRxiv	N	Y	31	China
22.	Raharusun (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-26	N/A		SSRN	Y	Y	31	Indonesia
23.	Patel (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-19	N/A		SSRN	N	N	14	N/A
24.	Patel and Desai (2020) (Ret)	April 2020	May 2020		SSRN	Y	N	10	USA
25.	Siyu et al., (2020) (Ret)	2020-02-25	2020-03-02		medRxiv	N	N	7	China
26.	Kim et al. (2020) (Ret)	2020-05-18	2020-06-14		MedRxiv	Y	N	4	Korea
27.	Davido et al. (2020) (Ret)	2020-05-11	2020-05-20		MedRxiv	N	N	2	France
28.	Gaibazzi et al. (2020b) (Ret)	2020-05-10	2020-06-13		MedRxiv	Y	N	2	Italy
29.	Parves (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-12	2020-04-16		BioRxiv	N	Y	1	Bangladesh
30.	Chu et al. (2020) (Ret)	2020-04-05	2020-04-20		BioRxiv	N	Y	1	China
31.	Gaibazzi et al. (2020a) (Ret)	2020-05-06	2020-06-20		MedRxiv	Y	N	1	Italy
32.	Cercy (2020) (Ret)	2020-05-26	2020-06-21		MedRxiv	Y	N	1	USA
33.	Mallick et al. (2020) (Ret)	July 2020	2020-06-17	ICML 2020 Workshop		Y	Y	0	USA

Annex B: Reasons and excerpts from official retraction notices

	Citation	Excerpts from official retraction notices
1.	Mehra et al., (2020a) (<i>Ret</i>)	Several concerns were raised with respect to the veracity of the data and analyses conducted. Authors would not transfer the full dataset, client contracts, and the full ISO audit report to their servers for analysis as such transfer would violate client agreements and confidentiality requirements. Reviewers were not able to conduct an independent and private peer review and therefore notified us of their withdrawal from the peer-review process
2.	Mehra et al., (2020b) (<i>Ret</i>)	This retract is related to Mehra et al., (2020a) (<i>Ret</i>). Because all the authors were not granted access to the raw data and the raw data could not be made available to a third-party auditor, we are unable to validate the primary data sources underlying our article.
3.	Wang et al., (2020b) (<i>Ret</i>)	The authors have retracted this article. After the publication of this article, it came to the authors attention that in order to support the conclusions of the study, the authors should have used primary T cells instead of T-cell lines. In addition, there are concerns that the flow cytometry methodology applied here was flawed. These points resulted in the conclusions being considered invalid.
4.	Bae et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	According to recommendations by the editors of Annals of Internal Medicine, we are retracting our article, "Effectiveness of Surgical and Cotton Masks in Blocking SARS-CoV-2. A Controlled Comparison in 4 Patients," which was published at Annals.org on 6 April 2020.
5.	Wang et al., (2020a) (<i>Ret</i>)	N/A
6.	Karami et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	The authors have withdrawn their manuscript whilst they perform additional experiments to test some of their conclusions further.
7.	Funck-Brentano and Salem (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Authors retracted and replaced the editorial.
8.	Zhuang et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Editor office's response for Ahead of Print article withdrawn The article "Potential false-positive rate among the 'asymptomatic infected individuals' in close contacts of COVID-19 patients" was under strong discussion after pre-published. Questions from the readers mainly focused on the article's results and conclusions were depended on theoretical deduction, but not the field epidemiology data and further researches were needed to prove the current theory. Based on previous discussions, the article was decided to be offline by the editorial board from the pre-publish lists.
9.	Beato-Vibora (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	The Editor of Diabetes Technology & Therapeutics is officially retracting the article entitled, "No Deleterious Effect of Lockdown Due to COVID-19 Pandemic on Glycaemic Control, Measured by Glucose Monitoring, in Adults with Type 1 Diabetes," by Beato-Vibora. After the Instant Online publication of the article, the journal editor received correspondence indicating that some portions of the paper may have been plagiarised . An internal investigation was launched into the accusation, and though the charge of plagiarism was not found to be compelling, it was discovered that the author's Institutional Review Board approval statements for the paper were secured after submission and publication of the article, and only after the publisher requested said documentation. The author explained that IRB approval was not secured due to her institution's closure because of the COVID-19 pandemic. Despite these unusual circumstances, it is a clear violation of proper and standard protocols for studies containing human subjects, and therefore the Journal officially retracts the paper.
10.	Zeng and Zhen (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	On Feb 26, 2020, we were informed by the authors of this Correspondence that the account described therein was not a first-hand account, as the authors had claimed, and that they wished to withdraw the piece. We have therefore taken the decision to retract this correspondence.
11.	Luo et al. (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	N/A
12.	Nouvier et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	By this letter we would like to retract our case report entitled "First viral replication of Covid-19 identified in the peritoneal dialysis fluid of a symptomatic patient" that we submitted to your journal one week ago. We indeed wanted to inform the renal community of a potential presence of Covid-19 virus in the peritoneal dialysis fluid in patients undergoing peritoneal dialysis treatment. However, the patient general status impaired and he was transferred to an intensive care unit for acute myocardial insufficiency. During this stay, he was re-checked for a number of other organs alterations. A total of 7 RT-PCR SARS-Cov2 tests , validated by the National Reference Center, were done ... A serological test was also performed. All tests were found negative.
13.	Kumar (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	This article have been RETRACTED by publisher. The wrong paper has been published due to some technical glitch. The information pertaining in this paper is misleading the readers and creating massive conflicts amid the scientific community.

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of ‘citation pollution’: A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

14.	Gormley and Ngan (2020) (Ret)	The Publisher regrets that this article is an accidental duplication of an article that has already been published. The duplicate article has therefore been withdrawn.
15.	Tofade and Daftary (2020) (Ret)	The Publisher regrets that this article is an accidental duplication of an article that has already been published. The duplicate article has therefore been withdrawn.
16.	Singh (2020) (Ret)	N/A
17.	Fioranelli et al., (2020) (Ret)	This article has been retracted at the request of the Editor. After a thorough investigation the Editor-in-Chief has retracted this article as it showed evidence of substantial manipulation of the peer review.
18.	Oodendijk et al., (2020) (Ret)	This article was retracted after reporting of serious scientific fraud.
19.	Yang et al., (2020) (Ret)	Our manuscript was based on surveillance cases of COVID-19 identified before January 26, 2020. As of February 20, 2020, the total number of confirmed cases in mainland China has reached 18 times of the number in our manuscript. While the methods and the main conclusions in our original analyses remain solid, we decided to withdraw this pre-print for the time being.
20.	Pradhan et al. (2020) (Ret)	This paper has been withdrawn by its authors. They intend to revise it in response to comments received from the research community on their technical approach and their interpretation of the results. If you have any questions
21.	Chen et al., (2020) (Ret)	This manuscript has been withdrawn as it was submitted without the full consent of all the authors.
22.	Raharusun (2020) (Ret)	N/A
23.	Patel (2020) (Ret)	N/A
24.	Patel and Desai (2020) (Ret)	N/A
25.	Siyu et al., (2020) (Ret)	The authors have withdrawn their manuscript whilst they perform additional experiments to test some of their conclusions further.
26.	Kim et al., (2020) (Ret)	The authors have withdrawn this manuscript because of the controversy about hydroxychloroquine and potential changes in results after peer-review, the authors intend to share their results in formal publication.
27.	Davido et al., (2020) (Ret)	The authors have withdrawn this manuscript and do not wish it to be cited. Because of controversy about hydroxychloroquine and the retrospective nature of their study, they intend to revise the manuscript after peer review.
28.	Gaibazzi et al., (2020b) (Ret)	The authors have withdrawn this manuscript at the request of their local IRB, because the objectives outlined in this study were not specifically approved by the IRB.
29.	Parves (2020) (Ret)	The authors have withdrawn this manuscript because of a violation of research ethics. Unknown to the first author, the corresponding author - the main designer of the project - did not obtain consent for the use of a data-set.
30.	Chu et al., (2020) (Ret)	The authors have withdrawn their manuscript whilst they wish to perform additional experiments to validate their conclusions further. Therefore, the authors do not wish this work to be cited as reference for the project
31.	Gaibazzi et al., (2020a) (Ret)	N/A
32.	Cercy (2020) (Ret)	The author has voluntarily withdrawn this manuscript because of questions raised about privacy issues in the conduct of this retrospective chart review. That issue is being contested by the author.
33.	Mallick et al., (2020) (Ret)	N/A

Annex C: Review papers citing retracted papers

	Citation	Approx. No of Citations (Google Scholar, recorded between 14 to 22 Sept)	Paper type	On the 'publication race'	Review paper	Submitted	Accepted	Date published	Authors' affiliation country	Publication speed
1.	Singhal (2020)	776	Journal		√	2020-02-23	2020-02-25	2020-03-13	India	less than a month
2.	Rodriguez-Morales et al. (2020)	689	Journal		√	2020-02-29	2020-03-11	2020-03-13	Several countries - Latin American Network of Coronavirus Disease 2019-COVID-19 Research	less than a month
3.	Zimmermann and Curtis (2020a)	331	Journal		√	n/a	2020-03-03	2020-05-05	Australia	2 months
4.	Sahin et al. (2020)	165	Journal		√	2020-02-11	2020-02-12	2020-02-12	Turkey	1 day to acceptance
5.	Ioannidis (2020)	136	Editorial	√				2020-03-12	USA	n/a
6.	Cao et al. (2020)	106	Journal		√	2020-03-11	2020-03-30	2020-04-03	China	less than a month
7.	Pascarella et al. (2020)	105	Journal		√	n/a	n/a	2020-04-29	Italy	n/a
8.	Elshafeey et al. (2020)	80	Journal		√	2020-04-20	2020-04-23	2020-05-17	Egypt	less than a month
9.	Ong et al. (2020)	49	Journal		√	n/a	n/a	2020-04-07	Singapore/Korea/Canada/Italy	n/a
10.	Zimmermann and Curtis (2020b)	48	Journal		√	n/a	2020-03-29	2020-06-06	Australia	2 months
11.	Kolifarhood et al. (2020)	46	Journal		√	Feb-20	Mar-20	2020-04-01	Iran	1 month
12.	Juan et al. (2020)	44	Journal		√	n/a	2020-05-17	2020-05-19	China/Spain/Hong Kong/UK	1 day to acceptance
13.	Majumder and Mandl (2020)	36	Journal	√		n/a	n/a	2020-03-24	USA	n/a
14.	Mackey et al. (2020)	35	Journal		√	n/a	n/a	2020-05-15	USA	n/a
15.	Simons et al. (2020)	18	Pre-print		√	n/a	n/a	2020-05-07 & 2020-09-04	UK	n/a
16.	Medford et al. (2020)	15	Pre-print	√		n/a	n/a	2020-04-07	USA	n/a
17.	Amawi et al. (2020)	15	Journal		√	2020-04-01	2020-04-22	2020-05-12	Jordan/Northern-Ireland/Australia	1 month
18.	Gajbhiye et al. (2020)	14	Pre-print		√	n/a	n/a	2020-05-05	India	
19.	Schünemann et al. (2020)	12	Journal		√	n/a	n/a	2020-05-22	Several countries	

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of 'citation pollution': A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

20	Gazendam et al. (2020)	8	Journal		√	n/a	n/a	2020-07-01	Canada	
21	Shamshirian et al. (2020)	7	Pre-print		√	n/a	n/a	2020-05-28	Iran	
22	Sattui et al. (2020)	6	Journal	√		2020-05-29	2020-07-03	2020-08-11	USA/France/Germany	3 months
23	Dinis-Oliveira (2020)	5	Journal	√		2020-04-18	2020-05-06	2020-06-10	Portugal	2 months
24	Naeem et al. (2020)	5	Journal	√		2020-06-04	2020-06-05	2020-06-05	Pakistan	1 day to acceptance
25	Matar et al. (2020)	5	Journal		√	2020-05-15	2020-06-13	2020-06-16	USA	1 month

Annex D: Detailed count of “second generation citations”

		First generation – citations per retracted papers	Sum of second generation citations per retracted paper, limited to approximately 20 highest cited papers per each of the top 16 retracted papers.
	Citations of retraction paper	Approx. No of citations according to Google Scholar, recorded between 14 to 22 September 2020	
1	Mehra et al., (2020a) (<i>Ret</i>)	540	367
2	Mehra et al., (2020b) (<i>Ret</i>)	476	1137
3	Yang et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	218	7053
4	Wang et al., (2020b) (<i>Ret</i>)	162	765
5	Bae et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	109	192
6	Wang et al., (2020a) (<i>Ret</i>)	88	2210
7	Karami et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	79	304
8	Pradhan et al. (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	39	327
9	Chen et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	31	210
10	Raharusun (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	31	44
11	Funck-Brentano and Salem (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	22	24
12	Zhuang et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	22	159
13	Beato-Vibora (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	17	3
14	Patel (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	14	8
15	Zeng and Zhen (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	13	132
16	Patel and Desai (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	10	18
	TOTALS	1871	12953

Annex E: Deeper analysis of selected review papers with more than 10 citations, citing retracted papers

	Citation	Approx. No of Citations (Google Scholar, recorded between 14 to 22 Sept)	Citing retracted research?	Acknowledges retracted research? (Y/N)	Paper type	On the 'publication race'	Review paper
1.	Singhal (2020)	776	Wang et al. (2020a) (Ret)	The author did not acknowledge the retracted paper, but as disclaimer, the paper says that "Since knowledge about this virus is rapidly evolving, readers are urged to update themselves regularly".	Journal		√
2.	Rodriguez-Morales et al. (2020)	689	Wang et al. (2020a) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
3.	Zimmermann and Curtis (2020a)	331	Wang et al. (2020a) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
4.	Sahin et al. (2020)	165	Chen et al. (2020) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
5.	Ioannidis (2020)	136		N	Editorial	√	
6.	Cao et al. (2020)	106	Wang et al. (2020a) (Ret)	This paper acknowledge the one retracted paper it cited in the text, but still incorporated it in the analysis.	Journal		√
7.	Pascarella et al. (2020)	105	Zhuang et al. (2020) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
8.	Elshafeey et al. (2020)	80	Karami et al., (2020) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
9.	Ong et al. (2020)	49	Wang et al. (2020a) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
10.	Zimmermann and Curtis (2020b)	48	Wang et al. (2020a) (Ret)	Cites a retracted paper, acknowledges it, but still incorporates it in the analysis.	Journal		√
11.	Kolifarhood et al. (2020)	46	Zeng and Zhen (2020) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
12.	Juan et al. (2020)	44	Karami et al., (2020) (Ret)	This paper acknowledge the one retracted paper it cited in the text, but still included it in the analysis.	Journal		√
13.	Majumder and Mandl (2020)	36	Pradhan et al. (2020) (Ret)	This review paper mentions the withdrawal of a retracted paper, but still included it in the discussion.	Journal	√	
14.	Mackey et al. (2020)	35	Mehra et al., (2020b) (Ret)	N	Journal		√
15.	Simons et al. (2020)	18	Mehra et al., (2020b) (Ret)	In a later version of the pre-print, the authors removed the reference to the retracted paper	Pre-print		√
16.	Medford et al. (2020)	15		N	Pre-print	√	
17.	Amawi et al. (2020)	15	- Patel and Desai (2020) (Ret) - Chen et al., (2020) (Ret)	In both instances the citation was not acknowledged as retracted	Journal		√

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of 'citation pollution': A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

18.	Gajbhiye et al. (2020)	14	Karami et al. (2020) (Ret)	N	Pre-print		√
19.	Schünemann et al. (2020)	12	Bae et al. (2020) (Ret)	N	Journal		√

Annex F: Journal lists linked to trial dataset (accessed July 2020)

	List acronym	Description
1.	Scopus	Scopus Source Titles List and Discontinued Sources (https://www.elsevier.com/solutions/scopus/how-scopus-works/content)
2.	DOAJ	Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ) Added and Removed Titles (https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/183mRBRqs2jOyP0qZWXN8dUd02D4vL0Mov_kgYF8HORM/edit#gid=1678073646)
3.	Bealls	Beall’s extended list (https://beallslist.net/)
4.	VABB-SHW	Flemish Academic Bibliographic Database for the Social Sciences and Humanities (VABB-SHW) (https://www.ecoom.be/en/data-collections/vabb-shw)
5.	SA-DHET	South African (S.A.) Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) list (https://libguides.library.cput.ac.za/c.php?g=628041&p=4382005)
6.	PubMed	PubMed (+MEDLINE) by National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) (ftp://ftp.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/)
7.	NORW-NSD	Norwegian Journals list (Norwegian Register for Scientific Journals, Series and Publishers) (https://dbh.nsd.uib.no/publiseringskanaler/KanalTreffliste.action;jsessionid=yeALj16pBJ6qGjFIQtBtyRNU.undefined?xs=&checkbox_bibsys=true&tv=true)
8.	BFI Series	Danish Ministry of Higher Education and Science BFI Series List (https://ufm.dk/forskning-og-innovation/statistik-og-analyser/den-bibliometriske-forskningsindikator/BFI-lister/bfi-listen-for-serier-2020.xlsx)
9.	WoS	Web of Science by Clarivate journal list – four subsets: ESCI, AHCI, SSCI, and SCIE (https://mjl.clarivate.com/mjl-beta/collection-list-downloads)
10.	CNRS	The CNRS (Comité National de la Recherche Scientifique) Categorization of Journals in Economics and Management (https://www.gate.cnrs.fr/IMG/pdf/categorisation37_liste_juin_2019-3.pdf).
11.	IRAN-BL	The Iranian Journal Black List is a list of journals blacklisted by the Ministry of Health and Medical Education in Iran (http://blacklist.research.ac.ir/)
12.	PHEC	Pakistan Higher Education Commission Recognised and Derecognised National Research Journals (https://www.hec.gov.pk/english/services/faculty/journals/Pages/default.aspx)

Annex G: Retracted papers in journal lists

	Citation	Journal title	Approx. No of Citations (Google Scholar, recorded between 14 to 22 Sept)	Scopus		DOAJ		Bealls	VABB- SHW	SA-DHET	PubMed	NORW- NSD	BFI Series	WoS	CNRS	IRAN-BL	PHEC		
				List ed	Dis con t	Ad ded	Re mo ved										Rec og	Der eco g	
1.	Mehra et al., (2020a) <i>(Ret)</i>	The Lancet	540	√					√	√	√	√	√	√					
2.	Mehra et al., (2020b) <i>(Ret)</i>	New England Journal of Medicine	476	√					√	√	√	√	√	√					
3.	Wang et al., (2020b) <i>(Ret)</i>	Cellular & Molecular Immunology	162	√						√	√	√		√					
4.	Bae et al., (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	Annals of internal medicine	109	√					√	√	√	√	√	√					
5.	Wang et al., (2020a) <i>(Ret)</i>	Zhonghua er ke za zhi= Chinese journal of pediatrics	88	√						√	√	√							
6.	Karami et al., (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease	79							√	√	√	√	√					
7.	Funck-Brentano and Salem (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	The Lancet (Editorial)	22	√					√	√	√	√	√	√					
8.	Zhuang et al., (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	Zhonghua liu xing bing xue za zhi = Zhonghua liuxingbingxue zazhi (Chinese Journal of Epidemiology)	22	√						√	√								
9.	Beato-Vibora (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	Diabetes Technology & Therapeutics	17	√						√	√	√	√	√					
10.	Zeng and Zhen (202) <i>(Ret)</i>	The Lancet Global Health	13	√					√	√				√					
11.	Luo et al. (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	Practical Preventive Medicine	3	THIS JOURNAL APPEARS ON NO LIST															
12.	Nouvier et al., (2020) <i>(Ret)</i>	Bulletin de la Dialyse à Domicile	2			√													

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of 'citation pollution': A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

13.	Kumar (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Journal of Molecular Pharmaceuticals and Regulatory Affairs	1	THIS JOURNAL APPEARS ON NO LIST														
14.	Gormley and Ngan (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Journal of the American Pharmacists Association	1	√							√	√			√			
15.	Tofade and Daftary (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Journal of the American Pharmacists Association	1	√							√	√			√			
16.	Singh (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Korean Journal of Anesthesiology	1	√		√					√	√			√			
17.	Fioranelli et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Journal of Biological Regulators and Homeostatic Agents (Editorial)	0	√						√	√	√	√	√	√			
18.	Oodendijk et al., (2020) (<i>Ret</i>)	Asian Journal of Medicine and Health	N/A	THIS JOURNAL APPEARS ON NO LIST														

Annex H: Review papers, citing retracted papers, in journal lists

	Citation	Journal title	Approx. No of Citations (Google Scholar, recorded between 14 to 22 Sept)	Scopus		DOAJ		Bealls	VABB-SHW	SA-DHET	PubMed	NORW-NSD	BFI Series	WoS	CNRS	IRAN-BL	PHEC	
				List ed	Dis con t	Ad ded	Re mo ved										Rec og	Der eco g
1.	Singhal (2020)	The Indian Journal of Pediatrics	776	√						√	√	√		√				
2.	Rodriguez-Morales et al. (2020)	Travel medicine and infectious disease	689	√						√	√	√	√	√				
3.	Zimmermann and Curtis (2020a)	The Pediatric infectious disease journal	331	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
4.	Sahin et al. (2020)	Eurasian journal of Medicine and Oncology (EJMO)	165								√							
5.	Ioannidis (2020)	European journal of clinical investigation	136	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
6.	Cao et al. (2020)	Journal of medical virology	106	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
7.	Pascarella et al. (2020)	Journal of Internal Medicine	105	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
8.	Elshafeey et al. (2020)	International Journal of Gynecology & Obstetrics	80	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
9.	Ong et al. (2020)	Pediatric Critical Care Medicine	49	√						√	√	√	√	√				
10.	Zimmermann and Curtis (2020b)	The Pediatric infectious disease journal	48	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
11.	Kolifarhood et al. (2020)	Archives of academic emergency medicine	46			√					√			√				

Retracted Covid-19 papers and the levels of 'citation pollution': A preliminary analysis and directions for further research

12.	Juan et al. (2020)	Ultrasound in Obstetrics & Gynecology	44	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
13.	Majumder and Mandl (2020)	The Lancet Global Health	36	√					√	√				√				
14.	Mackey et al. (2020)	Annals of Internal Medicine	35	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				
15.	Simons et al. (2020)	Pre-print	18	PRE-PRINT														
16.	Medford et al. (2020)	Pre-print	15	PRE-PRINT														
17.	Amawi et al. (2020)	Therapeutic delivery	15	√						√	√	√		√				
18.	Gajbhiye et al. (2020)	Pre-print	14	PRE-PRINT														
19.	Schünemann et al. (2020)	Annals of Internal Medicine	12	√					√	√	√	√	√	√				