

ONLINE APPENDIX

Experimental Evidence on the Long-Term Effects of a Youth Training Program

Pablo Ibarrarán, Jochen Kluge, Laura Ripani, and David Rosas Shady

Table OA.1. Representativeness of the Long-Term Follow-Up Sample, Characteristics at Baseline, Only Treatment Group

<i>Characteristic</i>	<i>Mean</i>		<i>p</i> value
	Sample 2014 = 0	Sample 2014 = 1	
Age	21.56	21.55	0.87
16 to 19	0.34	0.34	0.80
20 to 24	0.43	0.44	0.47
> 24	0.22	0.22	0.56
% Women	63.81	62.64	0.37
% Married	24.05	24.23	0.88
Number of people in household	4.35	4.50	0.00
Number of children	0.71	0.71	0.96
% Currently attending school	0.23	0.25	0.12
Incomplete elementary	0.21	0.19	0.08
Complete elementary	0.05	0.05	0.74
Incomplete high school	0.54	0.58	0.01
Complete high school	0.04	0.03	0.71
More than high school	0.00	0.00	0.15
Missing education	0.15	0.14	0.18
Fraction with prior work experience	0.16	0.17	0.13
Worked during past two years	0.22	0.21	0.54
Currently employed	0.05	0.04	0.20
Currently salaried worker	0.02	0.01	0.38
Currently unemployed	0.53	0.53	0.97
ICV Score (0 to 100) ^a	62.89	62.67	0.42
Rosenberg (0 to 30) ^b	23.93	23.98	0.59
Urban areas	0.90	0.88	0.15
Lives in Santo Domingo	0.33	0.31	0.11
Receives remittances	1.89	1.90	0.49
Owns home	0.06	0.06	0.34
Concrete, brick, or wood walls	0.97	0.96	0.25
Concrete or zinc ceilings	1.00	1.00	0.54
Cement, ceramic, or wood floors	0.98	0.98	0.89
% Connected to aqueduct	50.08	48.82	0.35
% Proper sanitation	98.61	98.80	0.55
% Garbage collection	83.73	84.84	0.26
% Refrigerator	70.40	71.20	0.52

% TV	88.35	88.21	0.88
% Wash machine	71.49	72.63	0.35
% Car	14.85	15.26	0.68
% AC	1.76	1.85	0.80
% Computer	8.40	8.51	0.89
% Electricity generator	8.24	8.41	0.82
Observations	3,750	2,163	5,913

Source: Authors' long-term follow-up survey, baseline survey.

Notes: The "Sample 2014 = 1" group denotes the long-term follow-up sample available for analysis. The "Sample 2014 = 0" group comprises the remaining observations from the full cohort of 9,692 youths who formed part of the random assignment in 2008.

^a The ICV is the acronym of the Quality-of-Life Index (Indice de Condiciones de Vida in Spanish). It is a proxy means test used by the Unified Beneficiaries System (SIUBEN) to target the beneficiaries of social programs in the country. The ICV combines 17 variables related to household characteristics (e.g., basic services, dwelling, etc.) that best predict household welfare. It yields a score from 0 to 100, where a higher score indicates higher quality-of-life / better living conditions.

^b The Rosenberg Scale is a tool used in clinical-psychometric practice to measure self-esteem levels. It was first introduced in 1965 and revised in 1989 (see Rosenberg 1989). Higher scores on the scale indicate greater self-esteem.

Table OA.2. Representativeness of the Long-Term Follow-Up Sample, Characteristics at Baseline, Only Control Group

<i>Characteristic</i>	<i>Mean</i>		<i>p</i> value
	Sample 2014 = 0	Sample 2014 = 1	
Age	21.53	21.44	0.44
16 to 19	0.35	0.36	0.57
20 to 24	0.43	0.43	0.93
> 24	0.22	0.21	0.44
% Women	62.27	61.47	0.63
% Married	24.27	23.66	0.68
Number of people in household	4.37	4.57	0.00
Number of children	0.70	0.69	0.79
% Currently attending school	0.22	0.24	0.13
Incomplete elementary	0.21	0.19	0.09
Complete elementary	0.05	0.05	0.59
Incomplete high school	0.54	0.57	0.09
Complete high school	0.03	0.03	0.68
More than high school	0.00	0.00	0.73
Missing education	0.16	0.16	0.90
Fraction with prior work experience	0.17	0.16	0.53
Worked during past two years	0.21	0.22	0.24
Currently employed	0.04	0.05	0.38
Currently salaried worker	0.01	0.02	0.29
Currently unemployed	0.53	0.51	0.28
ICV Score (0 to 100)	63.02	62.66	0.29
Rosenberg (0 to 30)	23.77	23.88	0.42
Urban areas	0.90	0.88	0.18
Lives in Santo Domingo	0.34	0.31	0.05
Receives remittances	1.89	1.90	0.74
Owns home	0.05	0.06	0.45
Concrete, brick, or wood walls	0.97	0.97	0.44
Concrete or zinc ceilings	1.00	1.00	0.14
Cement, ceramic, or wood floors	0.98	0.98	0.83
% Connected to aqueduct	49.91	49.64	0.88
% Proper sanitation	99.08	99.55	0.13
% Garbage collection	83.09	84.86	0.17
% Refrigerator	71.31	72.40	0.48
% TV	86.84	87.19	0.77
% Wash machine	71.95	71.33	0.69
% Car	13.64	14.70	0.38
% AC	2.05	1.97	0.88
% Computer	9.25	8.42	0.41

% Electricity generator	8.55	8.87	0.74
Observations	3,276	1,116	4,392

Source: Authors' long-term follow-up survey, baseline survey.

Notes: The "Sample 2014 = 1" group denotes the long-term follow-up sample available for analysis. The "Sample 2014 = 0" group comprises the remaining observations from the full cohort of 9,692 youths who formed part of the random assignment in 2008.

Table OA.3. Representativeness of the Long-Term Follow-Up Sample, Characteristics at Baseline, Only Sample with Information on Rosenberg

<i>Characteristic</i>	<i>Mean</i>		<i>p</i> value
	Sample 2014 = 0	Sample 2014 = 1	
Age	21.54	21.50	0.57
16 to 19	0.35	0.35	0.95
20 to 24	0.43	0.44	0.39
> 24	0.22	0.21	0.33
% Women	62.84	61.98	0.42
% Married	23.94	23.90	0.97
Number of people in household	4.37	4.53	0.00
Number of children	0.70	0.70	0.99
% Currently attending school	22.38	24.39	0.03
Incomplete elementary	0.21	0.19	0.02
Complete elementary	0.05	0.05	0.25
Incomplete high school	0.54	0.58	0.00
Complete high school	0.03	0.04	0.84
More than high school	0.00	0.00	0.49
Missing education	0.15	0.15	0.32
Fraction with prior work experience	0.16	0.17	0.41
Worked during past two years	0.21	0.21	0.82
Currently employed	0.04	0.04	0.79
Currently salaried worker	0.02	0.01	0.87
Currently unemployed	0.53	0.53	0.84
ICV Score (0 to 100)	62.91	62.59	0.15
Rosenberg (0 to 30)	23.85	23.95	0.25
Urban areas	0.89	0.88	0.11
Lives in Santo Domingo	0.33	0.30	0.01
Receives remittances	1.89	1.90	0.33
Owns home	0.06	0.06	0.23
Concrete, brick, or wood walls	0.97	0.97	0.54
Concrete or zinc ceilings	1.00	1.00	0.19
Cement, ceramic, or wood floors	0.98	0.98	0.98
% Connected to aqueduct	49.83	48.90	0.39
% Proper sanitation	98.83	99.03	0.38
% Garbage collection	83.54	84.85	0.10
% Refrigerator	70.57	71.32	0.45
% TV	87.51	87.82	0.66
% Wash machine	71.83	72.22	0.69
% Car	14.40	15.12	0.35
% AC	1.80	1.81	0.99

% Computer	8.73	8.37	0.55
% Electricity generator	8.28	8.46	0.76
Observations	6,596	3,096	9,692

Source: Authors' long-term follow-up survey, baseline survey.

Notes: The "Sample 2014 = 1" group denotes the long-term follow-up sample available for analysis. The "Sample 2014 = 0" group comprises the remaining observations from the full cohort of 9,692 youths who formed part of the random assignment in 2008 and provided information in the Rosenberg test.

Table OA.4. Baseline Characteristics of Subgroups Defined by Lottery Assignment and Participation: Long-Term Follow-Up Sample, Only Sample with Information about Current Job Status

<i>Characteristic</i>	<i>Mean</i>							<i>p value</i>	
	A	B	C	D	AB	CD	ABC	AB/CD	ABC/D
Age	22.03	22.27	21.94	21.98	22.06	21.96	22.04	0.472	0.695
Age 16 to 19	0.19	0.19	0.20	0.23	0.19	0.22	0.19	0.072	0.041
Age 20 to 24	0.53	0.53	0.54	0.49	0.53	0.51	0.53	0.234	0.068
Age > 24	0.28	0.27	0.26	0.28	0.28	0.27	0.27	0.779	0.831
% Women	62.88	63.48	59.73	63.20	62.95	61.88	62.43	0.571	0.727
% Married	24.82	25.65	23.47	23.27	24.92	23.34	24.69	0.348	0.469
Number of people in household	4.49	4.50	4.47	4.62	4.49	4.56	4.49	0.356	0.150
Number of children	0.70	0.82	0.65	0.72	0.71	0.69	0.70	0.579	0.754
Currently attending school	0.25	0.23	0.24	0.24	0.24	0.24	0.24	0.883	0.966
Incomplete elementary	0.21	0.23	0.21	0.22	0.21	0.21	0.21	0.977	0.732
Complete elementary	0.06	0.05	0.05	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.983	0.513
Incomplete high school	0.65	0.64	0.65	0.65	0.64	0.65	0.64	0.967	0.978
Complete high school	0.04	0.03	0.05	0.03	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.889	0.388
More than high school	0.01	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.01	0.421	0.244
Missing education	0.04	0.05	0.05	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.04	0.897	0.727
Fraction with prior work experience	0.17	0.18	0.16	0.16	0.17	0.16	0.17	0.483	0.550
Worked during past two years	0.21	0.23	0.23	0.22	0.21	0.22	0.21	0.341	0.588
Currently employed	0.04	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.263	0.803
Currently salaried worker	0.01	0.01	0.02	0.02	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.218	0.176
Currently unemployed	0.52	0.54	0.50	0.51	0.53	0.51	0.52	0.367	0.625
ICV Score (0 to 100)	62.66	62.55	62.61	61.99	62.65	62.23	62.64	0.285	0.155
Rosenberg (0 to 30)	23.99	23.86	23.98	23.69	23.97	23.80	23.98	0.252	0.105
Urban areas	0.89	0.87	0.85	0.90	0.88	0.88	0.88	0.802	0.119
Lives in Santo Domingo	0.31	0.30	0.27	0.33	0.31	0.31	0.30	0.878	0.264
Receives remittances	0.10	0.08	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.916	0.921
Owns home	0.06	0.08	0.05	0.07	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.892	0.554
Concrete, brick, or wood walls	0.96	0.95	0.97	0.97	0.96	0.97	0.96	0.120	0.300

Concrete or zinc ceilings	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.060	0.175
Cement, ceramic, or wood floors	0.98	0.99	0.99	0.98	0.99	0.98	0.99	0.945	0.746
% Connected to aqueduct	49.36	45.22	45.07	50.83	48.86	48.62	48.25	0.902	0.259
% Proper sanitation	98.71	99.57	99.73	99.34	98.81	99.49	98.96	0.076	0.396
% Garbage collection	84.60	83.91	82.67	85.81	84.52	84.61	84.22	0.951	0.336
% Refrigerator	71.60	64.78	71.20	71.29	70.79	71.25	70.86	0.796	0.837
% TV	88.99	86.09	88.27	86.30	88.65	87.05	88.59	0.209	0.122
% Wash machine	71.72	74.35	70.93	70.46	72.03	70.64	71.85	0.432	0.499
% Car	14.11	19.13	13.60	13.53	14.71	13.56	14.53	0.403	0.534
% AC	1.99	1.74	1.07	2.31	1.96	1.83	1.82	0.815	0.430
% Computer	8.37	7.39	8.53	7.59	8.26	7.95	8.30	0.776	0.570
% Electricity generator	8.31	6.09	8.00	8.42	8.05	8.26	8.04	0.846	0.764
Observations	1,708	230	375	606	1,938	981	2,313		

Source: Authors' long-term follow-up survey.

Notes: Groups as defined by lottery assignment and participation: A = beneficiaries, B = no-shows, C = replacements, D = controls. See also the Random Assignment and Survey Instrumentation text and Table 1 in the article. ABC = treatment group according to random assignment, D = control group according to random assignment; these groups are used to identify ITT program effects. AC = all youths who actually received the treatment, AC vs D used to identify ATT program effects. Sample includes only observations with information about current job status.

Table OA.5. Baseline Characteristics of Subgroups Defined by Lottery Assignment and Participation: Long-Term Follow-Up Sample, Only Sample with Information about ICV Scores

<i>Characteristic</i>	<i>Mean</i>							<i>p value</i>	
	A	B	C	D	AB	CD	ABC	AB/CD	ABC/D
Age	22.04	22.23	21.80	22.01	22.06	21.93	22.02	0.323	0.960
Age 16 to 19	0.20	0.19	0.22	0.23	0.19	0.22	0.20	0.067	0.110
Age 20 to 24	0.52	0.55	0.54	0.49	0.53	0.51	0.53	0.489	0.133
Age > 24	0.28	0.26	0.24	0.28	0.28	0.26	0.27	0.379	0.812
% Women	62.81	64.25	62.09	63.24	62.99	62.79	62.84	0.920	0.859
% Married	25.13	24.43	25.55	23.17	25.04	24.09	25.13	0.585	0.334
Number of people in household	4.49	4.55	4.40	4.67	4.50	4.56	4.48	0.406	0.041
Number of children	0.72	0.82	0.65	0.76	0.73	0.72	0.71	0.839	0.303
Currently attending school	0.25	0.22	0.23	0.24	0.25	0.24	0.25	0.428	0.877
Incomplete elementary	0.20	0.21	0.18	0.20	0.20	0.20	0.20	0.748	0.774
Complete elementary	0.06	0.04	0.05	0.07	0.06	0.06	0.05	0.799	0.289
Incomplete high school	0.59	0.57	0.58	0.58	0.59	0.58	0.59	0.683	0.835
Complete high school	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.500	0.234
More than high school	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.265	0.336
Missing education	0.11	0.14	0.15	0.12	0.11	0.13	0.12	0.150	0.954
Fraction with prior work experience	0.16	0.19	0.15	0.17	0.16	0.16	0.16	0.683	0.846
Worked during past two years	0.20	0.25	0.23	0.22	0.21	0.22	0.21	0.362	0.647
Currently employed	0.04	0.04	0.06	0.05	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.048	0.526
Currently salaried worker	0.01	0.01	0.02	0.02	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.073	0.100
Currently unemployed	0.53	0.55	0.53	0.51	0.54	0.52	0.53	0.352	0.308
ICV Score (0 to 100)	62.66	62.75	63.21	62.31	62.67	62.66	62.76	0.984	0.312
Rosenberg (0 to 30)	23.95	23.75	23.98	23.76	23.92	23.85	23.93	0.622	0.342
Urban areas	0.88	0.87	0.85	0.90	0.88	0.88	0.88	0.953	0.123
Lives in Santo Domingo	0.31	0.31	0.27	0.32	0.31	0.30	0.30	0.677	0.365
Receives remittances	0.10	0.08	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.989	0.826
Owns home	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.507	0.576
Concrete, brick, or wood walls	0.96	0.96	0.97	0.97	0.96	0.97	0.97	0.199	0.319

Concrete or zinc ceilings	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.472	0.608
Cement, ceramic, or wood floors	0.98	0.99	0.98	0.98	0.98	0.98	0.98	0.680	0.608
% Connected to aqueduct	48.49	45.25	45.05	50.70	48.10	48.51	47.59	0.838	0.185
% Proper sanitation	98.56	99.55	99.73	99.30	98.68	99.47	98.85	0.054	0.346
% Garbage collection	84.48	84.62	83.52	86.76	84.50	85.50	84.34	0.488	0.150
% Refrigerator	71.42	63.80	71.15	71.60	70.49	71.43	70.60	0.608	0.639
% TV	88.94	85.97	88.46	85.89	88.58	86.89	88.56	0.195	0.080
% Wash machine	72.05	74.21	70.05	70.91	72.31	70.58	71.93	0.338	0.627
% Car	14.51	18.55	14.84	14.11	15.00	14.39	14.97	0.669	0.604
% AC	2.07	1.81	1.37	1.57	2.04	1.49	1.93	0.312	0.568
% Computer	8.10	7.69	9.07	6.62	8.05	7.57	8.22	0.656	0.205
% Electricity generator	8.61	5.88	7.69	8.71	8.27	8.32	8.18	0.970	0.680
Observations	1,592	221	364	574	1,813	938	2,177		

Source: Authors' long-term follow-up survey.

Notes: Groups as defined by lottery assignment and participation: A = beneficiaries, B = no-shows, C = replacements, D = controls. See also Random Assignment and Survey Instrumentation text and Table 1 in the article. ABC = treatment group according to random assignment, D = control group according to random assignment; these groups are used to identify ITT program effects. AC = all youths who actually received the treatment, AC vs D used to identify ATT program effects. Sample includes only observations with information about ICV scores.

Table OA.6. Baseline Characteristics of Subgroups Defined by Lottery Assignment and Participation: Long-Term Follow-Up Sample, Only Sample with Information about Rosenberg

<i>Characteristic</i>	<i>Mean</i>							<i>p value</i>	
	A	B	C	D	AB	CD	ABC	AB/CD	ABC/D
Age	21.98	22.19	21.73	22.05	22.01	21.92	21.96	0.497	0.579
Age 16 to 19	0.19	0.19	0.23	0.22	0.19	0.22	0.20	0.045	0.189
Age 20 to 24	0.54	0.55	0.54	0.49	0.54	0.51	0.54	0.175	0.054
Age > 24	0.27	0.26	0.23	0.28	0.27	0.26	0.26	0.766	0.327
% Women	62.06	64.14	58.92	62.87	62.32	61.33	61.75	0.594	0.603
% Married	24.23	23.51	23.72	23.24	24.14	23.43	24.07	0.658	0.662
Number of people in household	4.50	4.53	4.48	4.63	4.50	4.57	4.50	0.336	0.112
Number of children	0.69	0.82	0.63	0.73	0.70	0.69	0.69	0.740	0.386
Currently attending school	0.25	0.21	0.24	0.25	0.24	0.24	0.24	0.934	0.782
Incomplete elementary	0.19	0.20	0.17	0.20	0.19	0.19	0.19	0.865	0.568
Complete elementary	0.05	0.04	0.04	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.05	0.741	0.688
Incomplete high school	0.58	0.56	0.56	0.58	0.58	0.57	0.58	0.571	0.959
Complete high school	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.636	0.366
More than high school	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.641	0.341
Missing education	0.14	0.16	0.19	0.14	0.14	0.16	0.15	0.114	0.842
Fraction with prior work experience	0.17	0.19	0.16	0.16	0.17	0.16	0.17	0.587	0.631
Worked during past two years	0.20	0.24	0.23	0.22	0.21	0.22	0.21	0.246	0.477
Currently employed	0.04	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.04	0.05	0.04	0.249	0.846
Currently salaried worker	0.01	0.00	0.02	0.02	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.116	0.144
Currently unemployed	0.53	0.55	0.51	0.51	0.53	0.51	0.53	0.344	0.479
ICV Score (0 to 100)	62.64	62.50	63.06	62.21	62.62	62.53	62.69	0.825	0.282
Rosenberg (0 to 30)	23.99	23.88	24.10	23.74	23.98	23.88	24.00	0.469	0.111
Urban areas	0.88	0.86	0.86	0.90	0.88	0.88	0.88	0.958	0.154
Lives in Santo Domingo	0.30	0.30	0.28	0.31	0.30	0.30	0.30	0.818	0.499
Receives remittances	0.10	0.08	0.09	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.10	0.787	0.788
Owns home	0.06	0.07	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.06	0.778	0.969
Concrete, brick, or wood walls	0.96	0.95	0.97	0.97	0.96	0.97	0.96	0.214	0.472

Concrete or zinc ceilings	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.272	0.675
Cement, ceramic, or wood floors	0.98	0.99	0.98	0.98	0.98	0.98	0.98	0.754	0.820
% Connected to aqueduct	49.14	44.22	46.94	51.33	48.53	49.62	48.27	0.568	0.168
% Proper sanitation	98.66	99.60	99.76	99.38	98.78	99.52	98.94	0.045	0.317
% Garbage collection	84.85	84.46	83.62	85.80	84.80	84.95	84.60	0.911	0.450
% Refrigerator	71.92	64.54	72.13	71.76	71.02	71.90	71.20	0.605	0.780
% TV	88.64	84.06	87.78	87.05	88.07	87.33	88.02	0.551	0.503
% Wash machine	72.59	74.10	71.39	70.98	72.78	71.14	72.55	0.337	0.432
% Car	14.87	17.53	15.65	14.51	15.20	14.95	15.27	0.855	0.630
% AC	1.84	1.20	1.71	2.03	1.76	1.90	1.75	0.774	0.640
% Computer	8.52	8.37	9.54	7.18	8.50	8.10	8.68	0.697	0.222
% Electricity generator	8.64	5.98	9.05	8.58	8.31	8.76	8.43	0.668	0.904
Observations	1,795	251	409	641	2,046	1,050	2,455		

Source: Authors' long-term follow-up survey.

Notes: Groups as defined by lottery assignment and participation: A = beneficiaries, B = no-shows, C = replacements, D = controls. See also Random Assignment and Survey Instrumentation text and Table 1 in the article. ABC = treatment group according to random assignment, D = control group according to random assignment; these groups are used to identify ITT program effects. AC = all youths who actually received the treatment, AC vs D used to identify ATT program effects. Sample includes only observations with information about Rosenberg scores.