

Report on cooperation 2015-2018 between Rafto Foundation for Human Rights and Central European University

Damages of Hate Speech and Tools for Improved Responses

The Rafto foundation for Human Rights, Bergen, Norway, is a non-profit, non-denominational, non-partisan foundation dedicated to the promotion of the full scope of human rights, funded partly by public and partly by private means. We have since 1987 awarded the *Thorolf Rafto Memorial Prize* for exemplary contribution to the promotion of human rights world wide. The foundation provides assistance to improve the security, capacity, and impact of our laureates. We provide human rights education for youth in Norway. We have also in the period 2015-2018, organized the three thematic programs to promote *Women's Network* promoting women's rights in predominantly Muslim countries; *Business Human Rights Responsibility*; and the use of *Free Speech to Overcome "Hate Speech"*.

Rafto Laureates 1989 *Péter Molnár* (CEU adjunct free speech scholar and activist), 1997 Professor *Ian Hancock* (Romani scholar at University of Texas and activist), and 2011 *Frank Mugisha* (Director of Sexual Minorities Uganda) together gave birth to the idea of the *Free Speech to Overcome "Hate Speech" Program*, which among its various activities has included the *Damages of Hate Speech and Tools for Improved Responses Colloquia and Conference Series*.



The Rafto Foundation wants to express its gratitude for the contributions of various departments at the CEU for making this work possible. Our fresh *Laureate of 2018* is *Ombudsman for Human Rights in Poand, Adam Bodnar*, a CEU graduate, and concerned with many of the issues relating to freedom of speech, protection of rule and law and democracy, and fundamental rights of minorities. We hope this selection of might offer opportunities for future cooperation.

Objective, content and context

The main aim of the colloquia and conferences has been to secure a qualified exchange of information, critique, and mutual support, between academics analyzing freedom of speech and hate speech, and activists working to protect the former and overcome the latter. This work has from the start aimed to maintain awareness of ways in which the free speech paradigm may invite hate speech, and ways in which hate speech may constrain free speech, either directly by excluding speakers from access to public space, or indirectly by motivating measures that, even if intended to combat hate speech, may also constrain free speech. We have from the start employed a broad concept of hate speech, covering a scope reaching from entirely legitimate expressions of hate, to incitement of violent or otherwise unlawful actions, and legally sanctioned discrimination and exclusion of targeted individuals or groups from equal recognition of fundamental rights.

The work has paid particular attention to two ongoing developments in the geographical region we have covered, Europe including Russia and Turkey. On the one hand, we have focused on how hate speech and limitations of free speech has affected especially vulnerable groups, such as sexual, religious, and national minorities – and

with particular attention paid to sexism, islamophobia, and anti-Semitism. On the other hand, we have focused on how pedestrian hate speech, increasing formal and informal constraints placed on the media, and governmental policies of various kinds serve to contract democratic space, and scapegoat minorities for social ills, across the entire region.

It will not be an exaggeration to say that the empirical material has grown fast, and that the challenges experienced by activists defending freedom of speech and human rights from a minority position, have multiplied during these three years. The pressure exercised on the CEU itself is obviously part of the picture. It is with great regret that we have observed these developments. Independently of the colloquia and conference series, we have noted the Norwegian government's concern, and also confirmed that we share their worries.

Some numbers and highlights

With limited administrative resources available, the series of events has secured

- Close to 70 contributing speakers from 15 countries (covering developments in about as many)
- An audience of approximately 350 physically present persons
- Pioneering human rights defenders and Rafto laureates Peter Molnar, Ian Hancock, and Frank Mugisha
- Participation from important contributors to public debate in Europe and beyond such as Timothy Garton Ash, Kenan Malik, Rashad Ali, Iyad El Baghdadi, John Shattuck, Michael Ignatieff, Dunja Mijatovic, Monica Bobako
- A broad selection of the most resourceful researchers on relevant subjects from the CEU and other universities in Europe and the USA.
- A broad selection of activists working in the most, and increasingly, exposed positions in Europe
- Coverage in radio, newspapers, and diplomatic reports

It has been essential for the series to include as much as possible activist speakers who themselves represents the interests affected by the issues discussed, according to the dictum "Nothing about us without us", coined by Professor and Roma Scholar Ian Hancock of the University of Texas. Our colloquium on free speech and the terror attack on Charlie Hebdo centered on the experience of a former Islamist radical, Rashad Ali. Our conference on Roma issues gathered almost exclusively Roma scholars and activists. Similarly, our conferences on the broader patterns of hate speech and dehumanization across Europe was predominantly featuring speakers who are citizens of the countries discussed. The speakers on misogyny in Turkey were female Turkish scholars and activists.

It has also been essential for us to address how hate speech and exclusion may be reflected internally in the discourse within affected groups, and how the efforts to overcome hate speech may become counterproductive in various ways. An important example of such challenges discussed, and described as a first instance of raising the issue in public by several of the contributors, was the internal silencing and suppression of sexual minorities within the larger Roma community. Another case addressed in various presentations is the failure of European institutions such as the Council of Europe to address governments effectively on issues involving formal commitments undertaken as member states in such institutions, and proposed or established legislation aimed at combatting hate speech, which appear dangerously similar in form to legislation enacted in various countries to secure the privileged treatment of majorities and sidelining of minorities.

We are bold enough to take some credit for initiating the conversation with Timothy Garton Ash that secured his participation at President's Seminar series, part of the "Rethinking Open Society" project, with his lecture "Free Speech and the Defense of an Open Society", February 23, 2017,

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eqSlx2h_1oE

The events

Part I *The Content and Context of Charlie Hebdo* discussed in the perspective of the book *The Content and Context of Hate Speech Rethinking Regulation and Responses*, eds. Michael Herz and Peter Molnar, Cambridge UP 2012,

Rafto Foundation in cooperation with Peter Molnar, Index on Censorship, Institute for Strategic Dialogue, and Vivarta Open Minds Online, United Kingdom, at Free Word Center, London, February 13, 2015

<https://www.freewordcentre.com/events/detail/the-content-and-context-of-charlie-hebdo>

Part II Launch and discussion of *Free Speech and Censorship around the Globe* ed. Peter Molnar, CEU Press 2015; Rafto Foundation in cooperation with CEU Center for EU Enlargement Studies CEU, Budapest, November 30, 2015

<https://cens.ceu.edu/events/2015-11-30/free-speech-and-censorship-around-globe>

Part III *The Damages of Anti-Gypsyism and Tools for Improved Responses*,

Rafto Foundation in cooperation with CEU Center for European Neighborhood Studies and CEU Roma Access Program, at CEU, Budapest, March 17, 2016

<http://cens.ceu.edu/events/2016-03-17/damages-anti-gypsyism-and-tools-improved-responses>

Part IV *Damages of "Hate Speech" and Tools for Improved Responses in Poland, Hungary, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, Bulgaria and Romania*; Rafto Foundation in cooperation with CEU Center for European Neighborhood Studies & Roma Access Program, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung Budapest, Vera and Donald Blinken Open Society Archives, the Polish Institute and the Slovakian Institute, at CEU, Budapest, May 19, 2016

<http://cens.ceu.edu/events/2016-05-19/damages-hate-speech-and-tools-improved-responses-poland-hungary-czech-republic>

Part V *"Hate speech" and responses in Turkey*

Rafto foundation in Cooperation with CEU Center for European Neighborhood Studies CEU, Budapest, December 7, 2017

<http://spp.ceu.edu/events/2017-12-07/hate-speech-and-responses-turkey>

Part VI *Dehumanizing the Other: Responds to Islamophobic, Anti-Semitic, Anti-Roma and Anti-Refugee Speech*

Rafto foundation in Cooperation with CEU School of Public Policy and Department of History

CEU, Budapest, June 4-6, 2018

<https://www.ceu.edu/event/2018-06-04/dehumanizing-other-responding-islamophobic-anti-semitic-anti-roma-anti-refugee>

Contributing speakers

CEU contributors:

- Péter Molnár, Research Affiliate on Freedom of Speech, CEU Center for European Neighborhood Studies
- Aslı Karaca, PhD candidate in Comparative Politics at CEU
- Balazs Trencsényi. Professor and Head of CEU Department of History
- Francisca de Haan, Professor of CEU Department of Gender Studies
- Istvan Rev, Director Open Society Archives and Professor at CEU Department of History
- Iulius Rostas, Assistant Professor and Chair of Romani studies, CEU Institute of Advanced Studies
- Jelena Jovanovic, Research Affiliate, CEU Center for Policy Studies
- John Shattuck, President and Rector of CEU
- Julius Horvath, Professor and Head of CEU Department of Economics
- Maria Kronfeldner, Professor CEU Department of Philosophy
- Martin Kahanec, Professor and Head of CEU School of Public Policy
- Michael Ignatieff, President and Rector of CEU
- Miklós Haraszti, Professor and Director of Research on Human Rights, CEU Center for European Neighborhood Studies
- Péter Balázs, Professor and Director at CEU Center for European Neighborhood Studies
- Prem Kumar Rajaram, Professor CEU Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology and Head of CEU Open Learning Initiative
- Vera Messing, Research Fellow, CEU Center for Policy Studies

Other academic contributors:

- Ian Hancock, Rafto Laureate 1997, Professor at University of Texas at Austin, USA
- Anna Sledzinska, Assistant Professor at University of Wroclaw, Poland
- Bence Ságvári, Research Fellow, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Budapest, Hungary
- Dezső Máté, Junior Research fellow, Hungarian Academy of Sciences Centre for Social Sciences - Institute for Minority Studies, Budapest, Hungary



RAFTO

- Didem Ünal Abaday, Junior Thyssen Fellow at Institute for Advanced Study CEU/City University of New York, USA
- Dmitry Dubrovsky, Professor Center of Independent Social Research, European University at St. Petersburg, Russia
- Henriett Dinók, Junior Research Fellow, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Centre for Social Sciences, Institute for Legal Studies, Budapest, Hungary
- Leo Lucassen, Director of Research at International Institute of Social History and Professor of Social History at Leiden University, Netherlands
- Max Steuer, PhD Candidate, Comenius University, Department of Political Science, Bratislava, Slovakia
- Monika Bobako, Assistant Professor Poznan University, Poznan, Poland
- Timothy Garton Ash, Professor of European Studies at Oxford University, United Kingdom
- Torgeir Skorgen, Associate Professor of History, University of Bergen, Norway

Contributors representing civil society and international institutions:

- Péter Molnár, Rafto Laureate 1989, writer, slam poet, activist, radio host, Budapest, Hungary
- Ian Hancock, Rafto Laureate 1997, Professor at University of Texas at Austin, USA
- Frank Mugisha, Rafto Laureate 2011, Director at Sexual Minorities Uganda SMUG, Kampala, Uganda
- Adrian Marsh, International Romani Studies Network, Istanbul, Turkey
- Adrian Szelmenczi, Project Manager at ActiveWatch, Antidiscrimination Department, Bucharest, Romania
- Ágnes Daróczi, Roma Elder intellectual and activist, Budapest, Hungary
- Andrei Richter, Special Advisor to OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media
- Annegret Ehman, Memorial and Educational Centre House of the Wannsee Conference in Berlin, Germany
- Balazs Denes, Director at European Civil Liberties Project, Open Society Foundations, Budapest, Hungary
- Bernard Rorke, Editor and researcher at European Roma Rights Center, Budapest, Hungary
- Dunja Mijatovic, OSCE Representative for Freedom of Media
- Eduard Nazarski, Director Amnesty International Netherlands, Amsterdam, Netherlands
- Gábor Daróczi, Director at Romaversitas and Chairman of the Board of Chance for Children Foundation, Budapest, Hungary
- İdil Engindeniz, Advisor of Hrant Dink Foundation's Media Watch on Hate Speech project, Istanbul, Turkey
- Iver Ørstavik, Senior Advisor at Rafto Foundation for Human Rights, Bergen, Norway
- Iyad El Baghdadi, Writer, entrepreneur, activist and Fellow at Norwegian Think-Tank Civita, Norway
- Jaroslav Cerman, Analyst, Hate Free Culture Project, Prague, Czech Republic
- Jodie Ginsberg, Director at Index on Censorship, London, United Kingdom
- John O'Sullivan President, Danube Institute, Budapest, Hungary
- Jostein Hole Kobbeltvedt, Director at Rafto Foundation for Human Rights, Bergen, Norway
- Juan Barata, Principal Advisor to OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media
- Kenan Malik, writer, lecturer and broadcaster, United Kingdom
- Lubica Stanek, Open Society Foundation, Bratislava, Slovakia
- Marian Mandache, Executive Director at Romani CRISS, Bucharest, Romania
- Michael J. Horowitz, Director of Hudson Institute's Project for Civil Justice Reform and Project for International Religious Liberty, Washington D.C., USA
- Nadir Redzeqi, Executive Director Roma Education Fund, Budapest, Hungary
- Nick Thorpe, BBC Central Europe Correspondent in Budapest, London, United Kingdom
- Orhan Galjus, Radio Patrin, Amsterdam, Netherlands
- Orsolya Reich Advocacy Officer, Civil Liberties Union for Europe, Berlin, Germany
- Peter Kreko, Director, Political Capital, Budapest, Hungary
- Petőcz Kálmán, Chairman of the Slovakian Helsinki Committee, Bratislava, Slovakia
- Raluca Negulescu, Executive Director at Policy Center of Roma and Minorities, Bucharest, Romania
- Rashad Ali, Senior fellow Institute for Strategic Dialogue and Director of Anti-Radicalization initiative CENTRI, London, United Kingdom
- Rumian Russinov, Director, Public Policy Advocacy Centre, Sofia, Bulgaria
- Sean Manion, Researcher, Dangerous Speech Project, USA
- Senada Sali, Legal Trainee at European Roma Rights Centre, Budapest, Hungary
- Solveig Moldrheim, Head of Education at Rafto Foundation for Human Rights, Bergen, Norway
- Stefania Kapronczay, Executive Director, Hungarian Civil Liberties Union, Budapest, Hungary
- Stefania Kulaeva, Executive Director at Anti-Discrimination Centre Memorial in Brussels, Belgium/Russia
- Tatjana Peric, Adviser on Combating Racism and Xenophobia at OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights



RAFTO

- Tímea Junghaus, Art historian and Curator, Budapest, Hungary
- Timothy Garton Ash, Writer, Director of freespeechdebate.com, Oxford, United Kingdom
- Zuzanna Warso, Lawyer at Polish Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights, Warsaw, Poland

Artistic contributors

- Péter Molnár, Rafto Laureate 1989, writer, slam poet, activist, radio host, Budapest, Hungary
- Gábor Tamás Indiana, Budapest, Hungary
- Németh Péter “MC Zeek”, Budapest Hungary
- Valencia James, performance artist, Barbados
- CEU students performing “Hate speech monologues” slam poetry

Some publications

- Kenan Malik, The Observer, July 1, 2018: Hostility to migrants is not born of rising numbers but a failure of hope, <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/jul/01/european-union-migration-crisis-survey-on-attitudes-to-migrants>
- Kenan Malik, The Observer, June 10, 2018: How we all colluded in Fortress Europe <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/jun/10/sunday-essay-how-we-colluded-in-fortress-europe-immigration>
- Ingrid Brekke, Aftenposten, March 29, 2017: Oppgjør med en av verdens rikeste menn George Soros kan stenge Ungarns mest anerkjente universitet (Showdown with among the world’s richest men George Soros may close Hungary’s most recognized University) <https://www.aftenposten.no/verden/i/paaVW/Oppgjor-med-en-av-verdens-rikeste-menn-George-Soros-kan-stenge-Ungarns-mest-ankerkjente-universitet>
- Ingrid Brekke, Aftenposten, April 5, 2018: Viktor Orbán: Den liberale helten som ble de liberales fiende (Victor Orban: The liberal hero who became the enemy of the liberals) <https://www.aftenposten.no/amagasinet/i/a27Pyd/Viktor-Orbn-Den-liberale-helten-som-ble-de-liberales-fiende>
- Speakers Max Steuer in conversation with Peter Molnar, Café Babel, August 8, 2016: Governments Speak By Their Silence, Too <https://cafebabel.com/en/article/governments-speak-by-their-silence-too-part-ii-5ae00b3df723b35a145e7491/>
- Iyad El-Baghdadi, Twitter, January 29, 2016: Radicalization and Otherization, compact intro https://twitter.com/iyad_elbaghdadi/status/693079702823526404
- Jaroslav Cerman, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, May 19, 2016: HateFree Culture, http://www.fesbp.hu/common/pdf/Hate_Speech_Cerman_20160519.pdf
- Kálmán Petőcz, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, May 19, 2016: Hate speech as a tool in the hands of "standard" politicians http://fesbp.hu/common/pdf/Hate_Speech_Petocz_20160519.pdf
- Adrian Szelmenczi, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, May 19, 2016: The Consequences of the anti-Hungarian discourse in the Romanian society. Institutionalizing the Stigma against the Hungarian community, http://fesbp.hu/common/pdf/Hate_Speech_Szelmenczi_20160519.pdf
- Henriett Eva Dinok, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, May 19, 2016: Dimensions of hate in Hungary http://fesbp.hu/common/pdf/Hate_Speech_Dinok_20160519.pdf
- CEU, March 22, 2016: Education on All Sides Is Key to Eliminate Anti-Gypsyism, Panelists Say <https://www.ceu.edu/article/2016-03-22/education-all-sides-key-eliminate-anti-gypsyism-panelists-say>
- Speaker Senada Sali on Roma rights in Albania <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7HeMRulOXJY>
- Speakers Peter Molnar and Senada Sali in Radio conversation <https://tilos.hu/episode/gondolatbatorsag/2016/03/14>
- A hostile presentation from Magyar Idők: <https://magyaridok.hu/belfold/migranssimogato-konferenciat-rendezi-a-ceu-3167854/>

Senior Advisor Iver Ørstavik
Rafto Foundation for Human Rights