

Criteria for site selection analysis + Navigus commentary

November 2013 Consultation - Summary of further analysis undertaken by Cllr Baillie, opinion of our consultant, Navigus Planning, and Council position

1. Relative importance of one community benefit over another

Summary of further analysis and recommendation

- 93 respondents showed a preference for the Wilbrahams site, 93 for the Mulberry site.
- Point 1: 'The figure of 92% used is not a true reflection of the support for a link route from the A5199. There is concern about the validity of the use of this figure in the site selection argument, and the priority that was placed on this community benefit in the proposal.'
- Point 3: The benefits that Spratton Primary School would gain if the Mulberry site were to be selected need to be considered as a package, not looked at on an individual basis. This includes the benefit of off-road parking for school traffic along with a school drop-off which received significant support.
- Point 4: There would be benefits that would be gained by the EVC if the Wilbrahams site was selected. These need to be considered alongside the other community benefits offered by the Wilbrahams site.
- Point 5: Short term non-planning considerations e.g. drainage, utilities etc. are not considered as part of the site selection process.
- The Parish Council should consider undertaking further consultation to ask about site preference using their agreed list of deliverable community benefits as a basis for the consultation.
- The data which supports placing one community benefit above another needs to be irrefutable.

Navigus opinion

- 'It is simply not a sound approach to make assumptions about an individual's site preference (if any) when they have not been explicitly asked to state this preference.'
- 'My opinion therefore is that the analysis does throw doubt on the ability to support the view that 92% of respondents were in favour of a link road.'
- In respect of the matters raised in points 2 to 5, the analysis has merit in informing the site assessment process.
- Further consultation was recommended.

Parish Council position

- Both the Project Manager and Councillor Baillie had previously made a *qualitative* assessment that there was an equal split between respondents.
- For a number of reasons, of which one was the apparent lack of support for a relief road to the Wilbraham site, from residents thought to have been most affected by the current traffic issues, the Project Manager withdrew his recommendation ahead of discussion on 15 July.
- Further consultation is taking place.